



## Minutes of the Capitation Committee

23 September 2021

At 12.00pm via Zoom

**Present:** Chair – Prof Eoin O’Sullivan, Secretary – Aidan Marsh, FSD – Shumane Cleary, Student Life – Catherine McCabe, DUCAC – Jemil Saidi, DUCAC – Aoife Simm, CSC – Ben McConkey, CSC – Ronan Hodson, CSC – Alice Lennon, CSC – Claire Stafford (In place of Vince Casey), SU – Leah Keogh, SU – Sierra Mueller-Owens, SU – Bev Genockey  
GSU – Gisèle Scanlon

**Apologies:** CSC – Vince Casey, Publications – Grace Gageby (In Attendance)

**In Attendance:** DUCAC – Aidan Kavanagh, CSC – Joseph O’Gorman, CSC – Lucy O’Connell, GSU – Dr Sarah Alyn Stacey, SU – Simon Evans,

Professor Eoin O’Sullivan as Chair of the Capitation Committee opened the meeting.

---

The GSU President addressed the committee on the subject of the report from the GSU Board, and the actions that the GSU took in relation to the concerns which had been raised in relation to the running of the GSU AGM in April of 2021.

The GSU President informed the Capitation Committee that the GSU had commissioned an independent external report on the matter, which they had provided to the Capitation Committee Chair prior to the meeting. The report had not been provided to the Committee in general due to concerns that the confidentiality of the report might be compromised.

The Chair acknowledged receiving the report, but did not believe that the Committee could consider it as it had been sent to the Senior Dean on short notice as eyes only.

The Chair asked what criteria was used to determine the investigator and was informed that criteria had been designed based on legal advice and that this criteria would be provided to the Capitation Committee.

The GSU President noted that she felt that the statement of the Board lacked the additional context of the report that was provided to them, and that the Board should have presented a redacted copy of the GSU’s report to the Capitation Committee alongside their summary report. Prof. Alyn Stacey noted that it would be disingenuous to think that the previous GSU Board had not had time to consider the independent report as correspondence indicates it received it on 2 July and it sent its report to the GSU as late as 20 July. She clarified that this was not a criticism of the previous GSU Board but undoubtedly an indicator that it was aware its term of office was about to expire (on 5 July 2021).

A query was raised as to why the GSU did not circulate a redacted report to the Capitation Committee themselves. GSU representatives repeated that they felt that the report should have been circulated by the GSU Board

The Dean of Students noted that, while the focus of the meeting's discussion thus far had been on a single issue, the matter of concern was greater than that single issue and she did not feel that the Capitation Committee had been provided with sufficient evidence to not uphold the decision of the previous Chair. There was general agreement on this from representatives of the CSC, SU, and DUCAC, with the CSC Honorary Treasurer commenting that it was futile to zone in on one specific matter of unclarity when the situation as a whole was a matter of concern to the Capitated Bodies.

The SU President expressed concerns to the Committee about how this matter was affecting the student body. They were supported in this by the GSU President.

Prof Alyn Stacy asked that discussion be brought back to the matter for discussion at the meeting as highlighted in the email circulated to the Capitation Committee by the Secretary. The Chair asked the Committee if they wish to defer the matter under discussion, specifically whether to uphold the decision taken in the summer by the previous Chair regarding withholding the GSU moiety.

Representatives of the CSC, DUCAC and SU felt that it was preferable for a decision on the matter to be taken at the meeting, rather than deferring to a later time. The SU President further requested that a redacted copy of the GSU's report be presented to the Committee so that it may be considered at future discussions.

The Chair asked the Committee if, based on the existing evidence before the Committee, there was a consensus that the decision of the Senior Dean should be upheld.

The GSU noted their objection. The GSU further noted that they believed that no decision should be made without review of the independent report.

A general consensus was reached, with objection from the GSU representatives present, that the decision of the previous Senior Dean would be upheld and that another meeting would be convened in two weeks time to allow the GSU to present new evidence to the Committee.