UNIVERSITY OF DUBLIN TRINITY COLLEGE MINUTES OF THE CAPITATION COMMITTEE Thursday 10th April 2014 at 10am, Elizabethan Room, House 6

PRESENT: Prof. Mike Jones (deputising for Prof. Moray McGowan, Chair/Senior Dean), Bernadette Banahan (Committee Secretary), Anne-Marie Moore (Financial Services Division), Ronan Hodson(CSC), Caitriona Sheil (CSC, Secretary), Cyril Smyth (DUCAC), John Lumsden (DUCAC), Conor Traynor (DUCAC), Ryan Kenny (GSU), Sally Gaynor (GSU), Jennifer McCahill (Pubs), Tom Lenihan (SU), Stephen Garry (SU), Jack Leahy (SU).

APOLOGIES: Eanna Drury (CSC) received.

IN ATTENDANCE: Joseph O'Gorman (CSC), Caroline Duggan (DUCAC), Simon Evans (SU)

Bernadette Banahan, Committee Secretary circulated the attendance sheet for members' signature.

Prof. Mike Jones opened the meeting and reminded members that he is deputising on behalf of the Senior Dean, who has been absent due to illness. Prof. Jones also reported to members that Prof. McGowan is progressing well in his recovery, but it would still be some time before he would be returning to College.

Item 1. 'Minutes of the Committee's meeting held on 28 November 2013':

The draft minutes were originally circulated to members on 10th December 2013, for their review.

• Under Item 6, 'Allocation for 2013/14' refer to Page 5: The following edit was agreed: 'Annemarie Moore advised that unless otherwise contested the portion of funding to the GSU from the carried forward surplus would remain at the same level as in previous years. Once the Committee were advised of the surplus arising from the Trinity Ball 2013, the allocation of same to the Capitated Bodies would be determined. This was acknowledged and agreed by the members of the Committee.' Subject to these changes the minutes were approved.

Item 2., 'Matters Arising from Minutes of the Committee's meeting on 28 November 2013':

- Under Item 4, 'Presentation of Accounts', refer to page 3 'Publications': Prof. Jones queried if all the outstanding advertising income for 2012/13 been collected. Jennifer McCahill, Treasurer of Publications advised that they are not able to recoup outstanding advertising income from previous years. However she assured the Committee that measures have been put in place to prevent this incident from re-occurring and that to date the new procedure in place is working well. She confirmed that she would be continuing her role in Publications next year and that this should ensure continuity.
- Prof. Jones reported that Annemarie Moore had proposed a number of amendments to the minutes, namely: Under Item 6 'Allocations for 2013/14' refer to bottom of Page 5: 'The Committee however believes that due process was not carried out transparently and legitimately on this occasion.' Annemarie Moore said that she would like it to be recorded that she disagreed with the statement and said that that the decision by the Planning Group to reduce the baseline allocation had followed due process and that the issues raised are mainly around the lack of transparency and the lack of communication of the decision to cut the baseline allocation.

Other members of the committee expressed their concern that they should not dilute the strength of members' reaction and upset expressed at that meeting.

From the chair Prof. Jones suggested that because the majority of members agreed that 'due process was not followed on this occasion' the minute should remain unchanged, but that Ms Moore's disagreement with this statement should be recorded.

There were no other matters arising from Minutes of 28th November 2013.

Item 3. 'Minutes of the EGM of 4th March 2014':

John Lumsden, Hon. Treasurer of DUCAC requested the following edits to the EGM Minutes:

- Under Item 1. 'Revised Capitation Allocation for 2013/14', refer to page 1, 2nd last bullet point. 'A number of members pointed out that imposition by College authorities of the above current proposal, did not imply acceptance by the Committee of that proposal.'
- Under Item 1. 'Revised Capitation Allocation for 2013/14', refer to page 2, 4th bullet from top of page. It was suggested that the last sentence be deleted. The Minute should read: 'The Committee notes that the Vice-Provost has already reported to Board that there was a reduction from 5% to 3.75%, in order to give the capitated bodies working budgets.'
- Under Item 2. 'Proposed Allocation for 2014/15', refer to page 2, 2nd last bullet point. 'One member referred to the fact that this year's proposed allocation cut is most importantly, linked to Item 2 of today's Agenda (i.e. proposed allocation for 2014/15). In this regard the member suggested that a brief meeting with the Provost should be requested. This would be a good opportunity to brief the Provost on the realities of the progressive reduction in the budget of the Capitated Bodies and to impress upon him directly, the Committee's case for the activities of the Capitated Bodies being exempt from the proposed cuts.'

Joseph O'Gorman, (Strategic Development Officer, CSC) and Annemarie Moore, (FIS representative) requested the following edits to the EGM Minutes:

See under Item 1. 'Revised Capitation Allocation for 2013/14', refer to page 2, 2nd bullet from top. Presently reads: 'One member indicated that until the Provost's recent intervention the proposal for annual allocation had been brought to the Capitation Committee by the Finance Committee before going to Board for approval. It was therefore recognised that the Capitation Committee's acceptance of the proposal was necessary, prior to applying to the Board for permission to implement the system.'

This Minute was discussed with members by Joseph O'Gorman and Annemarie Moore.

Annemarie expressed concern that the Minute is incorrect and could be misconstrued as the Allocation Process did follow procedure i.e. to Planning, then Finance and finally to Board. It has also been acknowledged that the appropriate ABC meeting with the Senior Dean did not take place, which led to the breakdown in communications on this issue. It was therefore agreed that Joseph would provide an edited Minute, which would better clarify the point he raised and send this on to Bernadette Banahan, Secretary for inclusion in the revised Minutes.

PBME Ledit**

PBME Le

Item 4. 'Matters arising from EGM Minutes of 4th March 2014':

Prof. Jones addressed the following action items from the EGM Minutes –

b) Proposed Allocation 2014/15 – request meeting with Provost: The Provost's response to the Chair's request for a meeting with members, suggested that in the first instance the representatives should meet the Vice-Provost and involve themselves with the ABC process. The Provost also suggested that the Dean of Students be included in the discussion. In the meantime, Prof. Jones had separately been in communication with the Vice-Provost regarding setting up a meeting. He suggested that the meeting with the Vice-Provost, should help clarify what is involved in the ABC process and whether it can accommodate the needs of the Capitation Committee.

However, Committee members felt that it is still worthwhile pursuing a separate meeting with the Provost. It was agreed that Prof. Jones as Chair, would respond to the Provost's communication with a suitably worded email to keep the issue at the Provost's door.

c) Proposed Allocation 2014/15 – request meeting with Chief Financial Officer: Prof. Jones had made contact with Ian Matthews' office. However Prof. Jones was referred on to the Vice-Provost, who is organising a meeting to cover the ABC process and Allocation issues.

Prof. Jones said he would continue to follow-up on these proposed meetings on behalf of members and will be in touch with members, as soon as information/dates confirmed.

Under Item 2. 'Proposed Allocation for 2014/15', refer to page 2, point no. 1:

- Ryan Kenny, (President GSU), queried if there has been any progress on the proposed meeting between the Capitation Committee and the SCCG (Student Charges Consultative Committee). Prof. Jones confirmed that he has received no communications regarding such a meeting. Capitation Members also indicated that they have had no contact either. It was confirmed that the Dean of Students, Prof. Kevin O'Kelly is the Chair of that group. Prof. Jones agreed to make contact with Prof. O'Kelly regarding same.
- Tom Lenihan, (President, SU) mentioned that the Capitation Committee should still seek a
 meeting with the Vice President of Global Relations. Prof. Jones agreed to follow-up same.

There were no other matters arising from EGM Minutes.

Item 5. 'Any Other Business':

Trinity Ball 2013

Simon Evans (SU) reported to the Committee that there is a surplus from the Trinity Ball 2013. He indicated that the accounts are to be finalised before the next scheduled meeting of the Capitation Committee occurs. Therefore he asked members if they would give permission for the surplus to be released forthwith to Annemarie Moore (FIS) – All members agreed to same.

Annemarie also asked members whether they are in agreement to proceed with the distribution of the surplus as in previous years' arrangement – All members agreed to same.

There being no other business for discussion, the Chair called the meeting closed at approximately 11am.

Signed NOS 07-0

Date 49/5/2014

BB 12/5/2014 - Page 3 of 3