## UNIVERSITY OF DUBLIN TRINITY COLLEGE MINUTES OF THE CAPITATION COMMITTEE EGM

## Tuesday 4th March 2014 at 10am, Elizabethan Room, House 6

PRESENT: Prof. Mike Jones (deputising for Prof. Moray McGowan, Senior Dean), Bernadette Banahan (Committee Secretary), Anne-Marie Moore (Financial Services Division), Ronan Hodson(CSC), Cyril Smyth (DUCAC), John Lumsden (DUCAC), Conor Traynor (DUCAC), Lucy O'Donoghue (DUCAC), Ryan Kenny (GSU), Jennifer McCahill (Pubs), Tom Lenihan (SU), Stephen Garry (SU), Jack Leahy (SU), Prof. Kevin O'Kelly (Dean of Students, Student Life Committee).

APOLOGIES: none received.

IN ATTENDANCE: Joseph O'Gorman (CSC), Caroline Duggan (DUCAC), Simon Evans (SU), P.J. Moloney (Pubs)

Prof. Mike Jones deputising on behalf of the Senior Dean as Chair of the Committee, introduced himself and opened the meeting.

Prof. Jones proposed and it was agreed by the members, that the Minutes of the Committee's last meeting (28 November 2013) would not be reviewed at this EGM. That item would be on the Agenda for the next Committee meeting planned for Thursday 10<sup>th</sup> April 2014.

He was asked to call this EGM in order that the Capitation Committee may address the two important items as per today's Agenda:

- 1. The revised Capitation Allocation for 2013/14, i.e. post meeting with the Vice Provost (Document previously circulated 'Aid Memoire of Meeting of representatives of Planning Group and Capitation Committee 15<sup>th</sup> January 2014').
- 2. To discuss how the Committee wishes to proceed with the proposed allocation for 2014/15 (Documents previously circulated 'Proposal for Capitation to be included in the ABC process, dated 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2014' and 'Capitated Bodies A Strategic Statement').

Prof. Jones introduced Annemarie Moore (Financial Services Division) and asked her to address item 1 of today's Agenda.

## 1. Revised Capitation Allocation for 2013/14

Annemarie Moore tabled revised proposed allocations to reflect the proposed budget reduction of 5% to 3.75% as detailed in the 'Aid Memoire of Meeting of representatives of Planning Group and Capitation Committee 15<sup>th</sup> January 2014'.

Detailed and extensive discussion followed, with the following main points being made:

- A number of members pointed out that imposition by College authorities of the above current proposal, did not imply acceptance by the Committee of that proposal.
- Members wish to communicate to the Vice Provost that they are unhappy with the 'revised reduction'. Members do not understand the logic behind reducing the 5% budgetary cut by 25% to 3.75%.

- One member queried why the Committee was being asked to give its 'acceptance' of this revised proposal, when in fact the members have been participating in and giving feedback via the Working Group of the Presidents/Chairs of the Capitated Bodies.
- One member noted that on the previous occasion that a change was made to the procedure whereby the annual Capitation Fund was determined i.e. the move from the Committee's setting the Capitation Fee annually, to the 30/70 pay/non-pay formulary approach the Finance Committee presented the new determinative procedure to the Capitation Committee for its approval prior to onward presentation to Board and eventual implementation. He further noted that this fact constitutes recognition that the Capitation Committee's approval is required prior to any change in the procedure whereby the annual Capitation Fund is determined, and on this basis, the Provost's recent intervention in the determination of the Capitation Fund is illegitimate.
- In answer to a question, Annemarie Moore clarified that the distribution of the allocation was not formally staged in quarters. To date, the payment of the requested instalments of the annual allocation to each of the Capitated Bodies had not been delayed. The Capitated Bodies would continue to receive funding up to the maximum allocation which was calculated on the basis of the reduction of 3.75%. This has been done to allow the Capitated Bodies to continue functioning in the immediate future and be better positioned to plan for the remainder of their financial year.
- The Committee notes that the Vice Provost has already reported to Board that there was a reduction from 5% to 3.75%, in order to give the capitated bodies working budgets.

Discussions continued, which led to addressing Item 2. of today's Agenda:

- 2. 'To discuss how the Committee wishes to proceed with the **Proposed Allocation for 2014/15** (Documents previously circulated 'Proposal for Capitation to be included in the ABC process, dated 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2014' and 'Capitated Bodies A Strategic Statement').
  - The document 'Proposal for Capitation to be included in the ABC process, dated 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2014', contained the following proposals:
    - 1. A joint meeting of Capitation Committee and SCCG is convened in March 2014 to discuss the funding requirements for Capitation for 2014/15-2016/17.
    - 2. A separate ABC meeting is held in April 2014 for Capitation allocation.
    - 3. Following on from the ABC meeting the outcome can be delivered to the Capitation Committee in May.
  - One member referred to the fact that this year's proposed allocation cut is most importantly, linked to Item 2 of today's Agenda (i.e. proposed allocation for 2014/15). In this regard the member suggested that a brief meeting with the Provost should be requested. This would be a good opportunity to brief the Provost on the realities of the progressive reduction in the budget of the Capitated bodies and to impress upon him directly, the Committee's case for the activities of the Capitated Bodies being exempt from the proposed cuts.
  - Another member confirmed that the Presidents of the SU and GSU last week
    presented the Provost with the 'Capitated Bodies A Strategic Statement' document
    and therefore at least the Provost has been made aware of the Capitation Committee's
    case. However a follow-up meeting with the Provost to obtain feedback would be
    very useful.

- A number of members suggested, and it was agreed, that the Senior Dean with representatives of the Committee should meet with the VP for Global Relations to discuss building sustainable capitation funding into the GRS non EU incentivisation model. This could possibly be an opportunity for future funding / support. However in determining if the Capitation Committee was due to receive any funding from the Non EU incentivisation scheme, there was confirmation from Ronan Hodson (Global Relations Regional Officer and Hon. Treasurer of CSC) that there would be no funds forthcoming for 2013/14.
- Tom Lenihan, President, Students Union wished to have a point noted in today's minutes. He said that he has the privilege of being a paid sabbatical officer unlike his fellow student reps on the Capitation Committee, that have been waiting since November for a resolution to this issue, and given all of that, they deserve an immediate response. If there was no change in this status by the next Board meeting of 26th March then the SU will have to raise this and pursue direct action.

On the instruction of the Committee, the Chair agreed to action the following items:

a) Revised Capitation Allocation for 2013/14

Prof. Mike Jones to send a communication to the Vice Provost along the following lines: 'The Capitation Committee notes the proposed revised allocation for 2013/14 from 5% to 3.75%. The Committee does not see this as a formal acceptance of the cut, but as a basis to work from. The Committee maintains its prerogative to dispute the substance of this cut'.

b) Proposed Allocation for 2014/15

Prof. Mike Jones to request a meeting with the Provost to discuss and obtain feedback on the 'Capitated Bodies – A Strategic Statement' document. The Senior Dean, the 5 Chairs and Presidents of the Capitated Bodies to attend.

c) Proposed Allocation for 2014/15

Prof. Mike Jones to send a communication to the Chief Financial Officer, Ian Matthews to request further information on the ABC process as it might apply to the Capitated Bodies and to clarify how the Capitation Committee would inter-act with the ABC process.

Prof. Mike Jones, as Chair, thanked all members of the Committee for their participation.

There being no other business the meeting adjourned at approx. 11:15 am.

NOTE: Next Committee meeting planned for Thursday 10th April 2014.

Signed

Date