Exploring Quality Feedback in Practice Education

Supporting Practice Educators: Inter-Disciplinary Practice Education Study Day

Dr Mike Wride
Academic Practice and eLearning (CAPSL)

Date 21/06/18

@WrideMike
Learning Outcomes

By the end of this session participants will be able to:

- Consider an holistic, ‘responsibility-sharing’ approach to feedback in the context of student centred and active learning

- Appreciate the role of Practice Educators as mentors and coaches in giving feedback

- Contextualise the role of feedback in learning (assessment for learning, assessment as learning, assessment of learning)

- Appreciate some effective ways of delivering feedback and ensuring students act on feedback

- Appreciate how self- and peer-assessment and reflection are both essential for giving and receiving feedback

- Formulate approaches for facilitating effective feedback in their teaching
Reflecting on Feedback

1. What does the word ‘feedback’ mean to you?
2. Reflect on some feedback you received which had a damaging effect on you.
3. Reflect on some feedback which spurred you on to greater heights.

5 mins

Think-Pair-Share

Think and make some notes
Pair up with your neighbour
Share the stories – tell & listen!
“Interesting. When we give feedback, we notice that the receiver isn’t good at receiving it. When we receive feedback, we notice that the giver isn’t good at giving it.”

Stone and Heen (2014)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feedback Types</th>
<th>Delivery Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Handwritten comments</td>
<td>Use statement banks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Word-processed comments</td>
<td>Face-to-face individual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-mail comments</td>
<td>Face-to-face whole class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model answers</td>
<td>Any others?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attachment sheets</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written class report</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Effective Feedback

Gibbs and Simpson (2004); Boud and Molloy (2013); Carless et al., (2011; 2017)

- UK National Student surveys and the Australian Course Experience Questionnaire: students least satisfied with assessment and feedback than any other aspect of their course.

- Effective feedback is vital
  - praised good work,
  - learn from mistakes,
  - improve work
  - enable learning.

- Enhancing feedback promptness, levels of detail, clarity, structure and relevance have failed to solve this problem.

- Build trust and honesty: empower students to take more control of their own learning
Models of Feedback
Engineering and Biology

Homeostasis: maintenance of equilibrium

Engineering model:
- Room temperature → Thermostat → Turns furnace on → Temperature rises

Biological model:
- Body temperature → Temperature receptors → Brain
- Constriction of skin capillaries
- Heat loss
- Shivering
- Heat production
- Sweating
- Heat loss
Feedback for Learning (Feed-Forward)
Developmental Feedback

Teacher and students regulate learning through feedback which promotes development (feedforward).

Positive feedback

Critical Feedback

First Year

Graduate

Student + Environment
Definitions of Feedback

“information presented that allows comparison between an actual outcome and a desired outcome”

Poulos and Mahony (2008)

“All dialogue to support learning in both formal and informal situations”

Askew and Lodge (2001)

“… feedback needs to be provided to you so you can actually make a change … if you can’t make a change from what’s provided then it’s useless.” Student quote

Poulos and Mahony (2008)
Example of Bad Feedback

Mark = 30%

This essay is abysmal. There is no evidence whatsoever that you (1) read and understood the assignment topic with due care, (2) read the accompanying guidelines, or (3) read anything at all on the debate between X & Y or any of the supplied notes either. Hence the mark for this long, rambling piece of ‘work’. Considerable additional effort is required for a pass standard or higher to be obtained.

What are the problems here?
Feedback Works Badly When it...

saps students’ confidence;

directs students’ activities in inappropriate directions;

fails to suggest ways of improving performance;

fails to relate clearly to evidence of achievement of the assessment criteria;

relates only to what is easy to assess rather than what is at the heart of learning;

focuses on failings rather than achievements.
Example of Good Feedback

Mark = 64%

This is a good effort, the main topics have been addressed and the paper is organised in a logical manner. In addition, the references are appropriate and reasonably comprehensive and some nice ideas have been developed; e.g. the relationship between X and Y. It would be a useful exercise to reflect on how much of the assignment was more descriptive rather than critical analysis. Having said that, some interesting issues are discussed, which could be developed further. Well done!

What is good about this?
Feedback Works Well When it…

- Encourages teacher and peer dialogue around learning
- Makes students want to learn through encouraging positive motivational beliefs and self-esteem (importance of considering emotional impact of feedback)
- Helps students critically reflect on their work to make realistic evaluations of their own abilities and achievements
- Helps students take action to improve their learning - closes the gap between current and desired performance
- Helps students Provides information to teachers that can be used to help shape their teaching
Effective Feedback

Race (2009; p 51)

**Feedback Delivery should be:**

**Timely** - the sooner the better.

**Personal and individual** - fits each student’s achievement, individual nature and personality and accurately relates to the student’s work.

**Clearly articulated** - Students should not have to struggle to make sense of feedback. **Empowering** - should strengthen and consolidate learning not demotivate students

**Manageable** – balance between sufficient and excessive feedback.

**Developmental** – should encourage students to improve on their work; generalizable by the student to other future contexts (Orsmond et al., 2011).
Feedback Sandwich

**First**, give them the good news

**Second**, give them the bad news – and tell them why it’s bad and what to do about it

**Finally**, end on a note of encouragement/ what they can do to improve next time
Approaches to Giving Feedback: Pendleton’s Rules

1. Ask the student what went well
2. Tell them what you think went well,
3. Ask them what can be improved
4. Tell them what you think can be improved.

Encourages reflection and self-assessment and is well balanced, but can be a rigid and formulaic approach for what should be a dynamic process.
Approaches to Giving Feedback: BOOST

Balanced, Observed, Objective, Specific and Timely.

‘Balanced’ - focuses on strengths and weaknesses to reinforce good behaviour and support development.

‘Observed’ - or for which evidence is available.

‘Objective’ - avoiding personal judgements and focusing on the task or behaviour in a descriptive, rather than evaluative, manner.

‘Specific’ - providing examples of good or poor practice and avoiding vague generalisations such as “always”.

‘Timely’ - to ensure that the event can be recalled easily and the feedback is still relevant.

But may not easily facilitate two-way interaction
Figure 2. The temporal dimension of student engagement with assessment feedback.
Student Centred Learning
Reflection

I have taught Snoopy to whistle
Contrasting Approaches: TCL Vs SCL

**Teacher-led**

- Transmitting knowledge (expert to novice) via content
- Supports students taking passive and ‘surface’ approach to learning
- Focus on what lecturer does
- Students seen as individuals: positivism, behaviourism
What kind of Practitioner Educator Are You?

- The stern one
- The easy marker
- The sociable one
- The humorous one
- The challenging one
- The concerned one
- The despairing one
- The encouraging one
- .....????

How do you get the best out of your students?

Does your practitioner-student relationship mirror your practitioner-client/patient relationship?
The Paradigm Shift
Thomas Kuhn 1922-1996

The Structure of Scientific Revolutions

paradigm shift
definition
a fundamental change in approach or underlying assumptions.

Is moving from TCL to SCL a paradigm shift?
Is it something you’re doing already?
Or is it about a personal shift?
Student Centred Learning Emphasises Student Participation

Seeing: Perception plus Cognition.

Active Student engagement

Feedback should help the student see something new.

Image: J Bortoft
“giving us the **tools** to be able to go out and **find out for ourselves**”

“I just think it gets people **more motivated** and more into the subject, and **you get positive feedback**, and you feel better about yourself, and then you do more work.”

“I feel factory farmed. I am an educational bulimic. They make me binge and purge all of this knowledge without any time to absorb or digest it, and I think to be truly student centred you have to make a space for the individual in that and the way the system currently works there isn’t the space for us as individual people.”

“**Talking to fellow students makes it easier because people say that if you can explain it to someone else, then you’re going to learn it better.**”

Coaching and Mentoring
Teaching as coaching or mentoring

- Coaching and mentoring are both central elements of workplace learning for developing skills and techniques.

- Both engage in ‘conversational learning’ through a ‘dyadic relationship’ (a pair of individuals).

- They are similar (both enable learning from experience and involve reflection, experimentation and integration; Kolb), but they are distinctive.

  - Coaching is more focused on attaining peak performance (the product).
  
  - Mentoring is more focused on progressive development and change (the process). A key role therefore for Feedback!

Both concerned with moving from competence (minimum requirements to practice) to excellence (aspiring to be the best we can be).
Processes for coaching/mentoring

- Asking good questions and active listen
- Three stage framework for reflection and action:
  - What is working?
  - What is not working?
  - What (if anything) can you do differently?

“….when faced with high-stress contexts, there is a tendency to close down and look for certainty. A more sustainable approach is to open up to possibilities.”

Grey, Garvey & Lane (2016); page 86.

Importance of asking open questions.
The Role of Feedback in Assessment & Learning
Feedback should not be seen as a judgement but as a tool for learning
Staff vs Student Perceptions

“Students saw a distinction between mark and feedback and disliked feedback that just provided justification of the grade.”

“Staff and students both expressed a belief in the longitudinal developmental function of feedback, but ....[t]he coupling of formative and summative assessment [results in] feedback [being] interpreted as a justification of the mark awarded, thereby limiting its developmental effect.”

“[S]tudents often considered feedback from staff to be vague and ambiguous because they could not immediately apply it to another piece of work. Instead, students were often looking for explicit instructions about how to do better next time, and much feedback did not conform to this wish.”

Feedback and Action

Students don’t read feedback or don’t act on it

Feedback and action are linked:

‘Action without feedback is completely unproductive for the learner’
Price et al. (2011).

‘Feedback is often not implemented at all....feedback information needs to influence the learner to act..... commonly, ‘feedback’ is really a surrogate for ‘hopefully useful information’.
Boud and Molloy (2013)

A distinction between ‘Being’ (readiness to engage) and ‘Doing’ (an action in response to an event; e.g. receiving feedback)
Handley et al (2011)
“I read through it when I get it and that’s about it really. They all go in a little folder and I don’t look at them again most of the time. It’s mostly the mark really that you look for”

“I’m personally really bad at reading feedback. I’m the kind of person, and I hate to admit it, but I’ll look at the mark and then be like ‘well stuff it, I can’t do anything about it’”

“Because it’s at the end of the module, it doesn’t feed into our future work.”

“I read it and think ‘Well, that’s fine but I’ve already handed it in now and got the mark. It’s too late’”.

And staff also had concerns

“When I first started [providing feedback], I cared more and then I thought ‘Are they actually taking any of this in? Are they making a note of my progress or anything?’”
Sustainable Feedback

- **Student must be motivated to engage with feedback, reflect on it, apply it in the short term (to that particular task) and be able to generalise it to future tasks**

- **Students develop a meaningful relationship to their work :**
  - The assessment needs to be authentic / ‘real world’ / relevant / meaningful to the student
  - The student needs to have a sense of ownership of, and therefore value, their completed assignments and the feedback they receive
  - Students develop ‘self-efficacy’/’self-regulation’: being able to reflect on, assimilate/embody and productively apply the feedback they receive and enjoy the process
Feedback and Self-Regulation

“[S]elf-regulation of learning involves more than detailed knowledge of a skill; it involves the self-awareness, self-motivation, and behavioral skill to implement that knowledge appropriately.”

Zimmerman (2002)

Self-efficacy: belief in one's ability to succeed in specific situations or accomplish a task

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Self-efficacy

Nicol & Macfarlane-Dick (2006)

 Responsibility Sharing: A Cultural Shift

**Figure 1** | Distributions of responsibility for tackling barriers to proactive recipience.

Nash & Winstone (2017)
Action Following Feedback

Q13 I use strategies to monitor students' response to feedback, (e.g., feedback log).

Answered: 47  Skipped: 7

The importance of relationship-building and dialogue with students.
Promoting Dialogue through Peer Feedback
What is Peer Feedback?

Active engagement of students in their learning.

- Fits with the move from a teacher-centred to a student-centred mode of education;
- Emphasises learner responsibility, metacognitive skills and a dialogical, collaborative model of teaching and learning;
- Learners provide feedback on and assess each other’s work;
- Using and/or developing assessment criteria takes students deeper into their learning (assessment for learning);
- Enables feedback and reflection on learning and sharing of meaning.
Questions

1. Discuss some peer feedback activities that you are:
   
   (i) aware of in theory or (ii) already using in your teaching.

2. How can you foster more peer feedback in your teaching?

3. What graduate attributes/skills do you think peer feedback can develop in students?

Think-Pair-Share
Trinity Graduate Attributes

To Think Independently
- I have a deep knowledge of an academic discipline
- I can do independent research
- I can think creatively
- I can think critically
- I appreciate knowledge beyond my chosen field
- I can analyse and synthesise evidence

To Act Responsibly
- I act on the basis of knowledge and understanding
- I am self-motivated and able to take responsibility
- I know how to deal with ambiguity
- I am an effective participant in teams
- I have a global perspective
- I am ethically aware

To Develop Continuously
- I have a passion to continue learning
- I build and maintain career readiness
- I am committed to personal development through reflection
- I am building confidence to take measured risks
- I am capable of adapting to change

To Communicate Effectively
- I am able to present work through all media
- I am expert in the communication tools of my discipline
- I can connect with people
- I can listen, persuade, and collaborate
- I have digital skills
- I have language skills

5 mins
Why Use Peer Assessment?

- builds on a natural process of development from early life (learning from others);
- encourages collaborative learning through consideration of what constitutes ‘good work’ and promotes development and improvement;
- aligns with and supports tasks encouraging peer learning and collaboration (i.e. assessment should motivate students to partake in these activities and have a ‘sense of ownership’ of the assessment process);
- students gain a more sophisticated understanding of the gaps in their learning and gain a better grasp of the learning process;
- enhances conversation around the assessment process.
Peer Feedback

- Does not enhance staff workload to the same extent that giving individual feedback does.
- Staff should discuss the assessment criteria with students so that it reliably informs the peer feedback given.
- Students evaluate and make judgements about each other’s work and provide written (or oral) feedback.
- Students produce and receive feedback thereby enhancing their own learning.
- Students can peer review and feedback on posters, presentations, lab reports, essays etc.

Peer Feedback Example

- Student prepares a draft essay and may self-assess it.
- Student receives feedback from multiple peers as well as feeding back on the work of one or more peers.
- Essay is revised and submitted it to the teacher for grading.
- Provides structured opportunities to immediately apply the feedback received as well as to take into account the work of peers to which feedback was given.
- Process engages students in multiple acts of evaluative judgements about the work of their peers and through reflection on their own work.
- Face to Face or online; e.g. PeerWise, TurnItIn PeerMark™, WebPA (peer marking of group work)
Peer Feedback:
Pharmacy Communication Skills


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2. Evaluating</th>
<th>Table 3. Student Written Critique Questionnaire Used for Role-playing Sessions in the Communication Course</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professionalist and Empath</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Briefly describe the central theme or goal of the role-playing session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Describe the strengths of the role-playing pharmacist</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Describe the weaknesses of the role-playing pharmacist</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Describe how the student pharmacist could improve his/her communication skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Select a chapter in our textbook and describe how this role-playing session relates to what you have read</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Please do NOT mention the names of your peers. Thank you
Feedback on the Feedback

My Feedback Practices Questionnaire

Q30 I provide students feedback on the quality of the peer and self-assessments.

Answered: 43    Skipped: 11

[Bar chart showing responses to Q30]
Self Assessment and Feedback to promote reflection
The Importance of Reflection

Reflection enables us to:

- Be conscious of our potential for bias & discrimination.
- Make the best use of the knowledge available.
- Challenge & develop the existing professional knowledge base.
- Avoid past mistakes.
- Maximise our own opportunities for learning.
- Make our thoughts and feelings explicit.

‘*We learn through critical reflection by putting ourselves into the experience & exploring personal & theoretical knowledge to understand it & view it in different ways.*’

Reflecting and Acting on Feedback

We do not learn from experience... we learn from reflecting on experience.

- John Dewey
Kolb’s Learning cycle

Kolb (1984)

growth in knowledge, depth of understanding and improved practice.

Integrate feedback from others
Self-Assessment

“Self-assessment is about students developing their learning skills. . . . It is not primarily about individuals giving themselves marks or grades. And it is not about supplanting the role of teachers”.

Boud (1995; p 17).

1. What student self-assessment activities are you using already?

2. What are the challenges to implementing student self-assessment?

3. If you are not doing it already, how could you implement student self-assessment into your teaching practice?

Think-Pair-Share
Two Scenarios to Discuss

Taking into account what you’ve learned about feedback today discuss in pairs ONE of the two scenarios provided:

From: Paul et al., 2013, Socio-cultural considerations in feedback.

**Scenario 1: The ‘quiet’ non-participating student.**

**Scenario 2: The ‘over-confident’ student.**

Task – in each case:

- Deconstruct and discuss the scenario in terms of learner performance.
- How would you structure a supportive and constructive feedback session to promote future learning?

10 mins
Thank You!
References


References


References


Zimmerman, B.J. (2002). Becoming a self-regulated learner: An overview. Theory Into Practice, 41 (2), 64-70