

The University of Dublin
Trinity College

Minutes of Research Committee Meeting, 24 May 2016

Present:

Professor John Boland, Dean of Research (DoR), Chair
Professor Martina Hennessy, Associate Dean of Research (ADoRMH)

Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences
Professor Sam Slote, Director of Research, School of English
Professor Micheál Ó Siochrú, Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities
Professor Roja Fazaeli, Director of School of Languages Literatures & Cultural Studies
Professor Mark Bell, Director of Research, School of Law
Professor Lorraine Leeson, Director of Research, School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences

Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science
Professor Doug Leith, Director of Research, School of Computer Science and Statistics
Professor Aoife McLysaght, Director of Research, School of Genetics and Microbiology (part meeting)
Professor Adrian Bracken, Director for Research (2016/2017), School of Genetics and Microbiology
Professor Sergey Frolov, Director of Research, School of Mathematics
Professor Jane Stout, Director of Research, School of Natural Sciences
Professor Martin Hegner, Director of Research, School of Physics

Faculty of Health Sciences
Professor Seamus Donnelly, Director of Research, School of Medicine
Professor Lorraine O'Driscoll, Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences

Professor Mani Ramaswami, Director, TCIN
Professor Orla Hardiman, Director, TBSI
Professor Orla Sheils, Director, TTMI
Professor Aideen Long, Dean of Graduate Studies
Ms Katie Crowther, President, Graduate Students Union

In attendance:

Dr Oonagh Kinsman, Trinity Research & Innovation, Rapporteur to the Committee
Ms Doris Alexander, Research Development Manager, Trinity Research & Innovation
Dr Geoff Bradley, Head of Academic Services and Operations (IT Services)

Apologies:

Professor Ruth Byrne, Director of Research, School of Psychology
Professor Carol Newman, Director of Research, School of Social Sciences and Philosophy

Professor Trevor Spratt, Director of Research, School of Social Work and Social Policy
 Professor Andrew Pierce, Director of Research, School of Religions, Theology and Ecumenics
 Professor Geralyn Hynes, Director of Research, School of Nursing and Midwifery
 Mr David O'Shea, Projects Accounting Manager, Financial Services Division

Not present:

Dr Diarmuid O'Brien, Director of Trinity Research and Innovation, Secretary
 Professor Peter Gallagher, Associate Dean of Research (ADoRPG)
 Professor Brian Lucey, Director of Research, School of Business
 Professor Jane Alden, Director of Research, School of Drama, Film & Music
 Professor Stephen Minton, Director of Research, School of Education
 Professor Daniela Zisterer, Director of Research, School of Biochemistry and Immunology
 Professor Isabel Rozas, Director of Research, School of Chemistry
 Professor Luiz Da Silva, Director of Research, School of Engineering
 Professor Gary Moran, Director of Research, School of Dental Science
 Professor Stefano Sanvito, Director, CRANN
 Professor Jane Ohlmeyer, Director, Trinity Long Room Hub
 Mr Michael Cooke, Acting Chair, Trinity Research Staff Association

Actions arising / on-going:

Agenda Item	Owner	Action	Status
RS/14-15/78	Dean of Research	Feedback on the reconsideration of the sustainability of TRIs and their value to Schools	<i>In progress</i>
RS/15-16/50	Dean of Research	Progression of the document on Measuring Research Productivity and Excellence	<i>In progress</i>
RS/15-16/39	Dean of Research	Consult VP/DOR group of the IUA to see if all Irish universities were using ORCID identifiers and if any unintended consequences had arisen.	<i>In progress</i>
RS/15-16/49	Dean of Research	Raise concerns with Research Career framework policy document with Mary Shire, University of Limerick as IUA VPDOR chair	<i>In progress</i>
RD/15-16/57	Dean of Research	Seek information on number of PhD students paying EU and non-EU fees and the source of funding	<i>In progress</i>
RD/15-16/62	Associate Dean of Research	Report to the Research Committee with policies on biobanking, data retention and stem cells	<i>In progress</i>
RD/15-16/64	All Directors of Research	Provide comment on Dean of Research annual report	<i>In progress</i>
RD/15-16/65	Dean of Research	Consider the attendees at the Research Committee for the next academic year	<i>In progress</i>

RS/15-16/60 Matters Arising from the Minutes

The document on the Trinity Visiting Academic Programme has been reworked and recirculated (RD/15-16/55)

An analysis of PhD fees for EU and non-EU students and the source of funding is underway (RD/15-16/57)

The concerns with the Research Career Framework will be raised with Mary Shire, University of Limerick at the next IUA meeting (RS/15-16/49)

RS/15-16/61 Update from the Dean of Research

The DOR expressed concern about the absence of a ministerial appointment for Skills, Research and Innovation. Damien English is now Minister for Housing and Urban Renewal. There is no action yet to separate the role of Chief Scientific Adviser from the delivery of funding. These issues were to be raised at the IUA VP/DOR meeting but Tom Molloy believes that we should take action unilaterally. The DOR asked if anyone had personal contacts that could be of use. One suggestion is to sponsor a breakfast for TDs in Boswells Hotel. The Director of the Long Room Hub also expressed concern and informed that Richard Bruton who is Minister for Education and Skills had no Junior Minister and that John Halligan has been given the skills brief.

The issue of overhead recovery from Irish funders will be revisited. A working group has been set up within the IUA and a first meeting has been held with the Chief Financial Officers of each university. The DOR reinforced the fact that the funding system is broken as undergraduate fees are insufficient and research overheads are insufficient.

The proposed bid for the Wellcome Trust Institutional Strategic Fund required 50% matched funding. Three strands are under discussion: start up packages for entry level academic posts; an international collaboration stimulus programme; and an interdisciplinary public engagement programme.

RS/15-16/62 Update from the Associate Dean of Research

The ADoRMH circulated a working document on Bio-Banking which had been prepared by the Research Ethics Policy Committee. Additional documentation on use of stem cells and data retention will be provided in due course. The Bio-Banking definitions refer to EU and US guidelines. The draft document includes specific recommendations on governance, maintenance and quality assurance, protection of samples and data and guidance on demise and disposal.

The Director of TTMI emphasised that as there were a number of biobanks across College that a coherent set of guidelines were necessary. The DoR queried if the guidelines applied to clinical samples held at St James' Hospital as part of Biobank Ireland. The Director of TTMI added that this was part of the hospital cancer tissue collection and that there additional sustainability issues. It was appreciated that circulation of this working document is part of an awareness process in College, that

the current biobanks are somewhat ad hoc in places and not all repositories were held at the same rigour. A Bio-Banking working group has been set up to address some of the known issues. The DoR asked how other universities managed this process. The Director of Research, School of Medicine explained that Rockefeller University had an internal intranet listing biobanks to ensure ease of access and accountability. The Director of TCIN commented that control of access was often held by clinicians. The DoR commented that these resources should be part of the bridges between TBSI and the clinicians in the hospitals. The Director of TTMI also confirmed that such bridges were included in the mission of TTMI.

The Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities was aware that data storage is an issue and there is a need for secure storage for research data and a policy on storage including on the cloud. The Head of Academic Services and Operations in IT Services added that funding for data storage and data management will need to be considered. The Research Development Manager reviewed the Open Data policy being put forward by the European Commission and being piloted in some H2020 projects. The HRB is holding a meeting on 27-28 July on open science and how Irish funding agencies might comply. The Head of Academic Services and Operations in IT Services drew attention to changes in data protection laws and that the Good Research Practice policy revised in 2014 will need review.

Action: ADorMH will revert to the Research Committee with policies on biobanking, data retention and stem cells.

RS/15-16/63 Research Quality Productivity and Metrics Review

The Director of Research, School of Genetics and Microbiology reported that the metrics for Ussher output for the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science was agreed however the document on Measuring Research Productivity and Excellence which had been circulated was still under discussion within the Faculty. She summarised the proposed scoring which was adapted for different career stages. Definitions included those that were used in the HEA compact and promotion criteria. The DoR asked if it was needed for exceptions to be noted, for example industry reports as outputs. The document include additional 0.5 points for a publication with an international collaborator or industry collaborator or open-access publication. The Research Development Manager pointed out that as there was now a move to open-access as standard that this additional point may not be relevant.

The Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences informed that the metrics for the Faculty of Health Sciences was still under discussion, that different Schools had different approaches but that a draft should be available in mid-June.

The Director of the Long Room Hub asked how the metrics would be monitored and if there was a role for more research analytics and development of the Research Support System. The DoR reported that an analytical tool was being piloted and could be used by Schools. The Director of Research, School of Physics noted that multi-disciplinary and

applied research may need to be considered. The Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities emphasised that measures should reflect outputs and not activities. There was a discussion on the reporting period of citations. This was 4 years with a set back of 6 months from the date of publication to evaluate the first citation. The Director of Research, School of Medicine was in favour of the template but asked if there was any monetary consequences of the use of the metrics eg overheads returning to the School. It was discussed that quality may have been reducing from past use of metrics. The Director of TCIN emphasised that this should be a guiding document and exceptions must be included. The Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences noted that the type of research funding in her School is more limited and may include government funding. The DoR noted that these measures were a best effort but he still had concerns on how to measure industry engagement where outputs were not as readily publishable.

The Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities reviewed the document on Research Output Metrics for the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Science which included 15 categories of outputs and suggested that co-authorship should not result in fractionalisation to encourage collaborative work. They had taken into account robust international standards and best practice. He commented that there was consensus across the Schools which was very welcome and that the process will need to be kept under review to see how it is working. The Director of Research, School of Genetics and Microbiology emphasised the difference between activities and outputs. The DoR noted that from the theme review that scholarship was very good and that publishing in recognised international journals or publishers may not be so relevant in some Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences areas. He agreed that these documents would be signed off at Faculty level but that cross-talk was needed.

RS/15-16/64 Dean of Research Annual Report

The near final version had been circulated. The intention of this report was to provide examples of research activity in an attractive format that could be provided externally and internally. He indicated that Schools should be able to communicate some research stories effectively and that they should compete for space in this publication. For the next report (2015/16) such items will be requested by 1 December 2016. The Director of Research, School of English asked how topics relevant to themes might be represented. The DoR replied that he was interested in good vignettes from as wide a range of activity as possible. The Director of the Long Room Hub noted that the date was 2016 (this will be revised to reflect the year 2014/2015) and as such the anniversary of 1916 should feature and that the Library was not represented in this meeting. It was noted that some content submitted was not used. Dialogue with those submitting content would have been useful. Additional content or comments should be sent to the DoR and the final version will be signed off in 3-4 weeks.

Action: All to submit comments on content current version to DoR

RS/15-16/65 Self-assessment of Research Committee structure and function and topics for future consideration

The DoR had suggested the reduced number of attendees where half the Schools were represented to aid better discussion. It was intended that pairing could take place and substitution where necessary would take place. Faculty Research Committees were also now in operation. However a number of the committee commented that this necessitated communication between Schools and cascading information was more onerous and that they preferred representation by all Schools. The DoR agreed to put this to vote by email after the meeting. Feedback on other aspects of the committee function had been collated from a circulated survey

Action: The structure and attendees at the Research Committee will be reviewed following a vote by email

RS/15-16/66 AOB

The DoR clarified that any increase in PhD fees was proposed by Faculties and Financial Services Division and agreed at Executive Officers. He was not in favour of any increase as this had direct impact on internal resources because of the limit to fees imposed by Irish funding agencies

The Director of the Long Room Hub asked who was leading the Researcher Night programme and how this was being communicated internally. Dr Shane Bergin who was the lead is moving to UCD so Prof Peter Gallagher had taken the lead with input from Dr Bergin. It was also noted that accessibility should be reviewed this year.

The Director of the Long Room Hub also noted that Trinity College had not taken part in the US-Ireland Research Innovation Awards jointly awarded by the Royal Irish Academy and the US Chamber of Commerce. The DoR will bring this to the attention of staff for 2017.