Trinity College Dublin

The University of Dublin

Minutes of the People and Culture Committee

Online via Zoom

Thursday, 13th February 2025, 2pm to 4pm

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Prof. Darryl Jones (Chair)

Ms. Susan Maguire (Secretary – Interim Director of HR)

Dr Rachel Moss (College Staff Member) Mr. Andrew Duffin (Group of Unions rep) Mr. David Treacy (Undergraduate Student)

Ms. Kathryn Whyte (External Member – Head of Corporate Services, Office of

Public Works)

Ms. Neha Deshmukh (Postgraduate Student) Ms. Paula Hicks (College Staff Member)

Prof. Lorraine Leeson (AVPEDI)
Prof. Sylvia Draper (Dean of STEM)
Ms. Gillian Connolly, secretarial support

ATTENDEES FOR SPECIFIC ITEMS:

Ms. Fidelma Haffey, Head of Talent

Ms. Grace Bosonnet, Organisation Design and Development Manager

Ms. Anne Marie O Mullane, Deputy Secretary to the College

APOLOGIES:

Prof. Eoin O'Sullivan (Senior Dean)

Mr. Lucky Khambule (External Staff Member)

Section A1

PPC/24-25/32 Minutes of previous meeting

Action: It was recommended that future People and Culture minutes should include more action points to ensure clarity on tasks and follow-ups. It was agreed that the minutes from the last meeting on 28th November 2024 would be updated to include the relevant

action points from the meeting.

Mr. Andrew Duffin highlighted that he previously raised a point at last People and Culture committee meeting in November 2024, that was not reflected in the meeting minutes. He mentioned a point regarding the scope of maternity leave and the funds allocated by the department would be available for adoptive leave parents. He questioned whether this would extend eligibility to a

broader range of genders than previously envisioned. Noting that this is under the college's EDI initiative, he asked whether maternity leave should be made available to all.

Ms. Kathryn Whyte mentioned that maternity leave is a legislative requirement and confirmed that both maternity and adoptive leave will always be provided.

Action:

It was noted that the minutes from the last People and Culture meeting on 28th November 2024 were missing some points raised from the previous meeting discussion. It was agreed that these would be updated to ensure that the minutes fully reflect the last meeting.

Section A2

PPC/24-25/33

Matters arising from the Minutes:

The Chair mentioned that TrinityINC will be raised at the next Board meeting which is taking place on the 26th of February 2025. TrinityINC had not been raised since the last People and Culture meeting at Board as there was not a Board meeting held in January 2025.

Action:

The Chair advised that he would contact People and Culture Committee members to ensure that concerns raised about TrinityINC are addressed at the next board meeting on the 26th February 2025.

Prof. Lorraine Leeson highlighted the positive engagement with the Senior Lecturer's Office regarding the migration of the UDL module. She advised since the last People and Culture committee meeting, the HEA has issued a call for submissions under Path 4 funding, focused on Universal Design. EDI, Disability, TAP, the Senior Lecturer's Office, and Trinity Teaching and Learning have collaboratively developed a proposal for submission. She explained that this proposal aims to provide supplemental support over the next 18 months for initiatives previously undertaken, by TrinityINC but it does not comprehensively cover all aspects of the previous work. Prof. Lorraine Leeson mentioned that the Senior Lecturer is expected to submit the proposal to the HEA by the end of March 2025.

No further matters arising.

Section A3

PPC/24-25/34

Presentation on the Gender Pay Gap data for Trinity College.

Ms Grace Bosonnet, Organisation Design and Development Manager entered the meeting

At the last People and Culture meeting on November 28th 2024, the former Director of Human Resources provided an update on the gender pay gap, which sparked an engaging discussion. She proposed that a further session on the topic be held to go into more detail.

To further this discussion, the Chair welcomed Ms. Grace Bosonnet, Organisation Design and Development Manager, to contribute to the discussion. Ms. Bosonnet acknowledged that the Director of Human Resources had received queries from committee members regarding methodology and calculations behind the gender pay gap data.

The Chair invited Ms. Bosonnet to present an overview of the key findings in the gender pay gap report. Ms. Bosonnet provided a comprehensive overview of the gender pay gap data, outlining the legislative requirements for reporting. She explained that Trinity College must report both the mean gender pay gap—the difference between the average hourly earnings of female and male employees—and the median gender pay gap, which represents the midpoint of hourly earnings for each gender, noting that at Trinity, the median gender pay gap currently stands at 11%.

In line with the Gender Pay Gap Information Act 2021, Trinity College published its Gender Pay Gap Report in December 2024. The gender pay gap in Trinity College in 2024 is 7.6%.

Ms. Bosonnet further clarified that the gender pay gap reporting includes all staff categories, including temporary and part-time employees. Additionally, she highlighted that the legislation mandates the college to report on pay quartiles, dividing staff into four equal groups based on hourly earnings. Ms. Bosonnet provided an overview of gender pay gap data across various staff categories, including Academic Medical, Academic Staff, Building & Services Staff, Overtime & Allowances, Occasional Staff, Administrative Staff, and Research Staff.

The topic was opened to the committee members for discussion:

The Dean of STEM queried whether Teaching Fellows are included under the Academic Staff category in the gender pay gap report.

In response to this, Ms. Grace Bosonnet advised that Teaching Fellows are within the Academic Staff category however, in the

interest of time she did not categorise them under their separate pay scale heading within the slide deck.

Ms. Susan Maguire, Interim Director of Human Resources, suggested that Ms. Bosonnet revisit this query for further clarification.

In response, Ms. Bosonnet noted that the analysis was conducted in June 2024 and she has all of the data on file, she confirmed that Teaching Fellows are accounted for within this cohort and she could send on a revised slide with the Teaching Fellow cohort split out from the main figures following the meeting.

The Chair queried about the basis for calculating the hourly rate, specifically whether it is based on a 37-hour work week.

Ms. Bosonnet explained that every staff member listed in Trinity's HR Core system has a defined number of weekly working hours. Hourly rate is the gross annual contracted salary (plus any allowances if applicable) divided by the contracted weekly working hours. Where an individual has worked overtime the Core HR system has record of both the gross amount of payment and the hours worked. In which case these are added to the gross annual salary and contracted hours, respectively.

Ms. Bosonnet further explained that, in addition to this, individuals on unpaid leave on the data capture date of June 30 every year are not included in the gender pay gap. However, if they were on unpaid leave during the preceding year but were present at work on June 30, their annual salary and hours worked are prorated based on their time in work during that year.

Mr. Andrew Duffin sought clarification on how the hourly rate denominator is calculated for individuals receiving allowances or working additional hours. He referred to Ms. Bosonnet's earlier explanation, noting that the calculation is based on an individual's contracted hours. He queried whether the total hours are adjusted for those receiving allowances or if the contracted hours remain unchanged in the calculation.

In response, Ms. Bosonnet explained that for individuals receiving allowances, their contracted hours remain unchanged, as allowances are not directly linked to hours worked. She provided an example of electricians at Trinity, who receive a tools allowance. This allowance is a payment intended to support their work but is not tied to any specific number of hours worked. She further clarified that while allowances are added to an individual's gross annual pay, they do not impact the calculation of hours.

The Chair requested further information on the finding that predominantly female positions are paid less than positions occupied predominantly by males.

In response to this, Ms. Bosonnet advised that the approach to occasional work rates is not made on an individual basis. She explained that Trinity has established set hourly rates for occasional work, as recommended by the finance committee in 2020. These rates are available on the Trinity website. She provided an example, explaining that the table specifies that administrative work is paid at €14 per hour, along with a list of other approved occasional work categories. When a school or department engages an individual for occasional work, they typically refer to this list as the primary guideline for setting pay rates. She highlighted that males are agreeing to engage in casual work that is paid at a higher rate.

Ms. Susan Maguire, Interim Director of Human Resources, highlighted that from an HR perspective, one of the key benefits of the gender pay gap report and associated reporting obligations is that they help identify discrepancies in pay. She acknowledged that there is work to be done in addressing these differences. Ms. Maguire mentioned that this issue will be addressed as part of the ongoing People Projects, particularly in relation to contract types and working patterns. She emphasized that this presents an opportunity to gain a deeper understanding of these disparities and to work towards the standardisation of pay rates for occasional workers.

Prof. Lorraine Leeson agreed with the points raised by Ms. Maguire. She highlighted that certain roles, such as administrative or technical have a fixed hourly rate, teaching and lecturing roles follow a minimum, mid, and max point pay scale. Prof. Leeson suggested that it may be worth exploring an approach similar to the discussion on researchers, where pay scales are mapped to the Irish Universities Association (IUA) rates. She mentioned that adopting a structured scale could be beneficial in addressing some of the unintended consequences identified in the gender pay gap report.

Mr. David Treacy queried if the occasional category takes into account the occasional work of students in the social media area or shops that would be run in the Students' Union.

Ms. Grace Bosonnet responded to Mr. Treacy by clarifying that when she conducted the analysis, she could only see individuals listed as occasional workers without access to their specific backgrounds. She advised that the analysis only indicates that these individuals have received payment for occasional work. If students are engaged in paid work, it is reflected in the report.

The Chair asked Ms. Grace Bosonnet to pause her presentation while Mr. Fidelma Haffey, Head of Talent entered the meeting to present on item B1.1- Procedure 46X. Ms. Haffey could only present at this time slot due to Junior Academic Promotions Committee taking place at the same time.

Ms Fidelma Haffey, Head of Talent enters the meeting

Section B 1.1

PPC/24-25/35

Procedure 46X

Ms. Susan Maguire informed committee members that Human Resources was advised just the day before that IFUT had requested further consultation on Procedure 46X. She confirmed that Human Resources will accommodate this request. As a result of this, new considerations from the consultation with IFUT may need to be brought back to the People and Culture Committee following Ms. Fidelma Haffey's presentation.

Ms. Fidelma Haffey informed committee members that IFUT was notified about this last week. Due to timing constraints, they had not yet had the opportunity to review it fully. She clarified that the delay was not due to IFUT not being informed.

Ms. Haffey advised that People and Culture committee members are asked to consider and approve the discontinuation of Procedure 46 X. This procedure was to be stood down in 2019 when Board approved Procedure 46A, The Tenure Track Procedures for New Assistant Professor, this new policy was to supersede Procedure 46X. However, Procedure 46X remained in operation on the Human Resources website to complete the review of the remaining First Round Ussher Assistant Professors on 5-year Fixed Term Contract hired in 2011-2012 for conversion to established posts in circa 2016-2017. The reason for this was that some of the Ussher Assistant Professors from this round commenced in post later than originally planned due to the readvertising of some of the posts and/or occurring as replacements for resignations. It was always intended that Procedure 46A, The Tenure Track Procedures for New Assistant Professors would supersede Procedure 46X and that it would cease to operate when these reviews of academic staff were completed. Timeline included in memo to illustrate where we are at now.

The topic was opened to the committee members for discussion:

Mr. Andrew Duffin mentioned that he had been informed that the original funding for this comes from discontinued or vacated roles. He asked Ms. Haffey to provide clarification on this matter.

Ms. Haffey responded by clarifying that the original Ussher appointments were intended for established posts. She explained that established posts refer to core-funded positions, which would become available through retirements or resignations. At the end of their five-year fixed-term contracts, these individuals would be placed into such positions, with most being assigned to roles where a retirement was expected.

Mr. Andrew Duffin stated his understanding that funding from the salaries of staff members from other cohorts who retired or resigned was reallocated to the academic salary. He mentioned that there was a situation where management indicated that a position could not be filled as the funding had been allocated for something else.

Ms. Haffey advised that this was not the case, she explained that the position were academic posts. These roles were identified in anticipation of an individual's retirement or resignation and were always intended to remain within the academic category.

The Dean of STEM asked Ms. Haffey to clarify if that there is no connection between the HCI and assistant professors who are fixed term.

Ms. Fidelma Haffey responded by advising that she does not believe this to be the case under the terms of the HEA. She clarified that the HCI positions were designated for a specific purpose, and at the end of the contract term, the school determined whether the post should continue, and if that were the case, an open competition process would be required. Any individual wishing to remain in the role would need to apply and compete in said competition.

Ms. Paula Hicks queried if there were any cases within the College looking to avail of Procedure 46X.

Ms. Fidelma Haffey informed committee members that at EOG, she was asked if there were any current cases in the College. She explained that she consulted with Faculty Deans and HR Partners about this and found that there is a potential case in AHSS.

The Chair queried what happens to the potential case in the College, does this mean that the policy will need to be remain active until this potential case is rectified.

Action:

In response to this Ms. Haffey advised that she should be able to advise on this after IFUT complete the local consultation. She will await to hear from IFUT and AHSS to resolve this before it goes to Board.

The Chair asked Ms. Haffey to clarify, in terms of academic contracts, if there would only be tenure-track and specific-purpose contracts.

In response to this Ms. Haffey advised that in terms of academic contracts, where appropriate there are tenure track contracts, merit bar contracts and a limited number of permanent appointments.

Action:

The Chair informed committee members that this will need to be presented again at People and Culture when discussions with IFUT are concluded.

Section A3

PPC/24-25/36

Presentation on the Gender Pay Gap data for Trinity College.

Ms. Grace Bosonnet continued to present on the remaining categories in the Gender Pay gap report, Administrative Staff, and Research Staff.

The topic was opened up for discussion:

The Dean of STEM highlighted a discrepancy in the report, noting that slide 4, which summarises gender gaps, indicates that the gender pay gap for occasional staff was 4% in 2023 and 3% in 2024, whereas slide 11 states the 2023 gender pay gap as 5.6%.

Ms. Grace Bosonnet acknowledged the error and confirmed that the correct figures for the occasional staff gender pay gap are 4% in 2023 and 3% in 2024.

The Dean of STEM queried if senior admin is included in the Admin category.

Ms. Grace Bosonnet advised that senior admin is included in the management job category that is SA03 up to SA01.

Ms. Paula Hicks queried if the research cohort includes post doc to senior research fellow, as the hourly rate looks low.

^{*}Fidelma Haffey leaves meeting*

Ms. Grace Bosonnet confirmed that the data includes post doc to Senior Research Fellow in this cohort. She further explained that Senior Research Fellows are amalgamated into the research fellow category.

Ms. Grace Bosonnet concluded her presentation by noting some measures that could be taken to remediate the gender pay gap, she mentioned targeted recruitment campaigns, changing the language in certain job specs, making certain roles more attractive to either females or males. She also mentioned that the college could engage in cultural audits of specific groups of workers, then mentioned work-life balance, family life, career development, and payscales. She noted that the occasional staff payscales could be regularised referring to 2023, when an exercise took place to put researchers on the IUA payscales.

Ms Paula Hicks queried if Adjunct Teaching Fellows and Teaching Fellows are all incorporated under the one cohort.

Ms. Grace Bosonnet explained that salaried Teaching Fellows are noted under the academic job category whereas non-salaried Teaching Fellows are included in the occasional staff member numbers.

Ms. Paula Hicks queried whether the Teaching Fellow cohort was incorporated into the figures under the academic category as they did not appear under a separate heading.

Ms. Grace Bosonnet responded to this to explain that when she was compiling this data back in June, she did not give them a specific heading as there wasn't enough room on the slide. Teaching Fellows are included in the overall figures.

Mr. Andrew Duffin queried the quartiles slide, referring to the upper quartile noting 53% vs 47%, and queried if administrative staff are upper or middle quartile.

Ms. Bosonnet explained that the upper quartile and each quartile includes a mixture of all types of staff with a representation from the different grades. She raised the point that the only exception is the occasional staff as they are not regular workers in Trinity. She would estimate that the majority are in the lower quartile. She further explained that most likely some administrative staff would be included in the upper quartile, noting that she didn't do analysis into how each quartile was divided up.

Mr. Andrew Duffin asked Ms. Bosonnet to clarify if upper quartile referred to payscale.

Ms. Grace Bosonnet explained that upper quartile means staff in general at Trinity, mentioning this can be a mixture of job categories. Their hourly rate is within the upper quartile, she referred to slide 16 and the technical calculations behind the figures.

The Dean of STEM mentioned that there are three cohorts she would like further information on: Teaching Fellow pay scale, Senior Management category and Technical category.

Action:

Ms. Bosonnet advised that she has the details of these cohorts and that she will share these slides with the committee members after the meeting.

Ms. Kathryn Whyte suggested that it might be useful for this committee to assist in recommending actions to diminish the gender pay gap, suggesting analysis could be undertaken in relation to male take up of parental leave as men less likely to take up part time roles, analysing how many females applied for senior appointments or promotions and received them, and looking at terminology terms of job advertisements.

The Dean of STEM highlighted that on slide 16, the lower table for females in the quartiles slide isn't correctly reflecting the figures mentioned, referring to the 987 females out of 1500. She mentioned that this number (987) equates to approximately 63% females. She highlighted 63% of females is in the lower table, the percentage and the figures aren't aligning.

Ms. Grace Bosonnet confirmed that the graph is correct, 987 females to 577 males.

Prof. Lorraine Leeson mentioned that some of the actions that Ms. Kathryn Whyte suggested are included in our institutional university Athena Swan action plan, particularly encouraging male uptake of parental leave, female applications of roles and promotions.

Section A4

PPC/24-25/37

Public Sector Duty and Human Rights Duty Statement

Ms. Anne Marie O Mullane, Deputy Secretary to the College enters meeting

Ms. O Mullane presented on the legal obligation of the institution under Section 42 of the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission

^{*}Ms. Grace Bosonnet leaves the meeting*

Act 2014. She explained that there are two elements to the duties placed on the College as a public sector body, which are:

- Section 42 (1) of the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission
 Act 2014 places a statutory obligation on public bodies such as
 Trinity College Dublin to eliminate discrimination, promote equality
 of opportunity and protect the human rights of its members, those
 to whom they provide services and staff when carrying out their
 daily work. It is a duty of process and an ongoing functional duty –
 must be embedded into our day-to-day activity.
- Section 42(2) is a strategic duty. It requires the University to include human rights and equality in the University's overall strategy, planning and reporting cycles and to publish specific documents.

Ms. O Mullane further explained the purpose of the Public Sector Equality and Human Rights Duty Statement. The Statement seeks to be the opening statement of the University's approach to the implementation of the Duty and communicating our need to embed the Duty into everything that we do in the University.

The EDI Sub-Committee considered and endorsed the draft statement at their meeting on the 28 January 2025. The focus of their discussion was on the action planning element that will be required, how this will be drafted and collated.

People and Culture committee are asked to consider and approve the draft Public Sector Equality and Human Rights Duty Statement for publication on the Secretary's Office website.

The topic was opened up for discussion:

Prof. Lorraine Leeson mentioned that it is very important to be clear that we have an obligation to have a statement in a publicly visible space to be deemed to fulfil our public sector duty to be compliant. She mentioned that at present we are not compliant to our obligations because we don't have a statement online, and because we don't have a reference to the public sector duty within our college strategy. Prof. Lorraine Leeson thanked Ms O Mullane for working closely with colleagues in EDI.

Ms. Maguire raised the point that it is an obligation that we are required to fulfil as a public sector body. Ms. Maguire acknowledged the work that Ms O Mullane and EDI colleagues have done in terms of producing this statement. She mentioned that they sought lots of inputs, including from HR.

Ms. O Mullane noted that the statement is light in detail due to the absence of a clearly defined statement within our strategy. She further highlighted that all other responsibilities under Section 42

are derived from this strategy. She acknowledged that further work is required in this area.

The Chair noted that the statement is abstract and sought clarification on whether the actions referenced have yet to be formulated. Specifically, the Chair referred to page 2 that Trinity will take positive action measures (see appendix 1 of the policy, Definitions) to support particular groups who may be disadvantaged or under-represented in accessing education, employment or career progression where appropriate.

Ms. O Mullane confirmed that this is the case, noting that discussions are currently underway regarding the next strategic plan and the wording to be included in this section. She mentioned that other public sector bodies have incorporated similar statements into their strategic plans, using them as a framework to drive their respective action plans.

Ms. Kathryn Whyte advised that she is happy to approve and that Prof. Lorraine Leeson's significant work is reflected in this and a lot of good work happening in this space.

Ms. Paula Hicks inquired whether the dedicated resources mentioned on page 3 could serve as a means to secure permanent funding for Professor Lorraine Leeson's work in the future.

Ms. O Mullane advised she cannot comment on that aspect and suggested that Prof. Leeson might be able to answer.

Prof. Leeson advised that this initiative supports her work and aligns with their annual reporting obligations to the HEA. She further noted that, following the previous People and Culture meeting, additional requests are being prepared for submission to the planning group for the Head of EDI role to be made permanent rather than being funded for a particular period.

Ms O Mullane concluded and raised the point that this is a responsibility that we need to embed across the college, mentioning that part of the action planning will need to reflect how do we bring the duty to life for everyone.

Action:

Committee members approved the Public Sector Equality and Human Rights Duty Statement.

Section B1

PPC/24-25/38

EDI Sub -Committee minutes of 5th of November 2024

Prof. Lorraine Leeson provided an update on the EDI Sub-Committee, advising that they have received 33 staff nominations to join the Sub-Committee and need to convene a group to review them. The formation of this group has been delayed due to staff leave and illness.

Ms. Paula Hicks queried whether outreach had been made to the Group of Unions regarding the staff representative.

In response to this, Prof. Lorraine Leeson noted that following the last People and Culture meeting on the 28th of November 2024, she spoke with the Equality Officer, leading this process. The Equality Officer had consulted with Ms. Mary Leahy, the Head Of Employee Relations, and it was agreed that self-nominations would be widely promoted, encouraging applicants to highlight any relevant background that they could bring to the committee, including union representation. They did not designate specific vacancies for union representatives.

Mr. Duffin recalled that it was agreed in the previous meeting that a union representative position would be included and that the minutes should reflect this.

Prof. Lorraine Leeson clarified that no action had been taken on this matter yet and confirmed that it can still be addressed.

Prof. Lorraine Leeson mentioned that they had three-year funding for the Head of EDI role, but they are working with Academic Services Division to prepare a submission to Planning Group to make the role permanent.

The HEA Equality Enhancement Project and the challenges faced in the USA regarding Equality, Diversity, and Inclusion (EDI) were discussed. Through the Irish Universities Association, efforts are underway to collectively reaffirm the commitment to EDI. Professor Lorraine Leeson noted that a counterpart from another university had encountered aggressive messaging in response to their EDI work. She emphasised the importance of supporting those engaged in this work, particularly in the current climate.

Prof. Lorraine clarified that TCD staff have not been affected by this behaviour yet, but other universities have been affected. She further mentioned that on the 5th of March 2025, the Race Equality Action Plan will be launched by the Provost. She also mentioned that the Race Equality Officer role is currently being advertised internally, with closing date of 14th February 2025.

Prof. Leeson mentioned that a review took place of the accessible bathroom assistance alarm calls system, referring to the Public Sector Duty, highlighting that this is work that needs to be done to

Action:

help us meet our Public Sector Duty and obligations under the Disability Act. Other accessibilities such as lifts need to be addressed as part of the College masterplan. She further mentioned that there is a HEA-funded project called 'HEI's as Places for People' that had just commenced working with RCSI, TU Dublin and Galway, looking at managing accessibility in the context of built heritage.

Action:

Prof. Lorraine Leeson updated that the staff disability working group of People and Culture, await confirmation of a HR nominee for co-chair position. HR to consider and revert.

Prof. Lorraine Leeson noted that the University Athena Swan Committee's TOR include a trade union representative in its membership. She highlighted that the membership has been broadened to ensure a wider scope aligned with Athena Swan Ireland. She further stated that the University Athena Swan Committee minutes are included as part of governance, ensuring that the themes outlined in the Athena Swan Action Plan are being actively followed up and integrated into discussions within the People and Culture Committee. Prof. Leeson mentioned her appreciation to the Chair for the opportunity to present these matters to the People and Culture Committee and for facilitating their progression to the Board.

Professor Lorraine Leeson concluded by mentioning the European Commission's SHE Figures, a mechanism for tracking data related to gender equality in research and innovation, where relevant publications are made available.

Section C

Any other business

Mr. Andrew Duffin clarified that, initially, it was stated that there would be three staff representatives. However, the EDI Sub-Committee minutes from November 5th (under item A8) refer to only two staff representatives. He noted that while the previous minutes were correct in substance, they were inaccurately recorded. The agreement was for one designated staff representative and two additional staff members.

Ms. Kathryn Whyte asked if the College has hired for the Director of Human Resources position.

Ms. Susan Maguire, Interim Director of Human Resources confirmed that a new Director of Human Resources will be starting in the college in March 2025.

No further items were raised, and the meeting was concluded.

1/any due
 Signed:
Date:15/05/2025