UNIVERSITY OF DUBLIN

Trinity College

EQUALITY COMMITTEE

Minutes of a meeting held on 11 June 2009 at 2pm in the Board Room, House 1.

Present:	Dr S Ryan, Ms A FitzGerald**, Mr D Treanor, Ms L Power, Ms A Murphy (GSU), Ms R Torode, Ms C Hannon, Ms C Byrne, Prof C O'Morain*, Ms K Campos McCormack.
Apologies:	Vice-Provost, Prof E Drew, M T Moloney, Ms O Foley (SU), Ms A Taylor, Mr D Quinn, Dr O Doyle.
In attendance:	***Michelle Garvey (TIC Project)
Present for:	*Eqal/08-09/34-41, **Eqal/08-09/30-37, ***Eqal/08-09/36

The Chair thanked the Committee for its work over the year, and thanked Ms Foley for her contribution during her term as SU Welfare Officer.

Items for Board attention are denoted XXX

Eqal/08-09/30 Minutes The minutes of the previous meeting, 4 March 2009, were approved and signed.

Eqal/08-09/31 Matters arising are minuted below.

Section A – Policy issues

Eqal/08-09/32 **Accessible Information Policy** Mr Treanor circulated a revised version of
XXX the Accessible Information Policy (Eqal/07-08/05) for the Committee's approval. Mr Treanor advised the Committee of the scope of the accessible information requirements under the Disability Act 2005 and the need to expand the policy in a context where information technology and new media are increasingly central to teaching, to include the areas of:
- print communication;
- College web pages;
- e-Learning;
- person to person communication
- information technology

The Committee welcomed this revised document, which has been prepared in consultation with the Web Office, IS Services, CAPSL, the Secretary's Office and other relevant parties. The Committee was advised that websites on the central College server comply with a high standard of accessibility; and noted the role the Web Office in ensuring the standards of new sites and monitoring compliance.

Mr Treanor advised the Committee of the steps being taken to communicate the policy to Schools and staff, and that this would be further progressed in coordination with the Trinity Inclusive Curriculum (TIC) project and the Bologna process. Mr Treanor reported that the default setting on College computers will be re-set over the Summer months to a sans-serif font, and that the College Calendar was print compliant and available in alternative formats. Ms Campos welcomed the guidance on event organization contained in the policy, and noted the continuing difficulty in securing accessible venues in College. Ms Torode suggested the benefits of there being a contact to advise on compliance with certain aspects of the policy.

ACTION:

- Ms Campos to submit to Board the Accessible Information Policy with the minutes for approval.

Eqal/08-09/33 Annual Equality Monitoring Report 2008 Ms Campos thanked the
XXX Monitoring Advisory Group for its input in the preparation of this report. The Committee welcomed this report as a resource to College to track changes, inform strategic decisions and raise awareness on gender imbalances in different areas of activity in College. Ms Campos advised that UK data had been used as a comparator for student and staff statistics given the scarcity of comparable data from the higher education sector in Ireland. Ms Campos brought the Committee's attention to the key findings in the report:

- Gender segregation along traditional employment lines in support staff areas. Gender segregation across different academic disciplines.
- Under-representation of women at senior levels in all areas (administrative and academic).
- Student body gender profile similar to UK average (56% female). Nearly 50% of students are concentrated in FAHSS.
- 16% of students are international (EU and non-EU), in line with UK average.
- College achieving 15% target of non-traditional students at admissions. Non-traditional students now make-up 9% of student body.
- International profile of applicants to employment (33% EU and 23% non-EU).

The Committee discussed the data incorporated by the recruitment monitoring pilot for employment applicants covering the nine equality grounds. Ms Campos noted that equality monitoring of new staff would be developed in line with e-recruitment. Ms Campos advised the Committee that data consistency (in definitions and dates) was an issue when collating College staff and student data, and addressing this would be a priority for future reports. In addition, the advisory group would be examining the gender and discipline profile of students and researchers in greater depth. Ms FitzGerald commended the Equality Officer on the quality of data in the report and noted that this report represented an important step in fulfilling the recommendations of the HEA Report of the High Level Group on University Equality Policies (2004).

ACTION:

- Ms Campos to submit this report to Board and Council (Section C).

Eqal/08-09/34 **Gender and Promotions Report** Ms Campos circulated the Gender and
XXX Promotions report which had been prepared at the Provost's request to
examine the low number of women applying to promotion and submitted to
Executive Officers. Ms Campos advised that targets had been agreed by EO
[see Appendix 1 to these minutes] and a draft action plan was currently
being considered by the Deans and VP/CAO. The report provides an update
on the progress of previous report recommendations on the career
progression of women academics discussed by this Committee
(Eqal/August2002/5)(Eqal/April2003/4)(Eqal06-07/19), includes further
consultation with relevant parties in College and a good practice review. The
report found that women academics were currently not applying for
promotion (Senior Promotions and the Merit Bar) in proportionate numbers
with the eligible pool, and that a similar imbalance was evident in the
recruitment to Chair and to permanent lecturing positions. Ms Campos
suggested the need for the College to implement positive measures to
promote gender balance with a view to ensuring the development and
retention of talent and legal compliance.

Ms Campos outlined some of the key barriers identified including: a male
dominated environment; issues raised around the relative valuing of
research, teaching and pastoral contributions in the promotions process;
lack of career guidance and exclusion from informal networks; and the need
to accommodate non-linear career paths and caring responsibilities. The
recommendations include the introduction of targets and the development of
Faculty strategies to address the barriers identified, particularly regarding
work-life balance measures and mentoring.

The Committee discussed the proposed targets for Professorial Chairs and
applications to Junior and Senior Promotions, and expressed a concern that
progress towards the achievement of these targets should be borne
equitably by the three Faculties. Ms Campos advised that an individual
strategy would be developed with each Faculty taking into account its
distinct gender profile in order to achieve these college-wide targets, and
confirmed that the use of targets was contemplated by equality legislation as
a positive measure. Ms Torode suggested that the expectations as to the
profile of appropriate candidates for promotion or Fellowship needed to be
addressed to promote greater diversity. The Committee discussed the
career progression graph for administrative staff, which showed a marked
gender reversal in senior grades. The Committee also discussed the
complex paperwork involved in the promotions process and suggested this
be considered by the Promotion Committees.

The Committee welcomed this report and expressed its concern that the
implementation of the recommendations and targets should progress
despite the current recruitment moratorium. The Committee suggested this
report be made publicly available to the College community.

ACTION:
- Ms Campos to report to the Committee on the development of the
gender targets action plan.
- Ms Campos to consult with the Provost the communication of this
report within College.

Eqal/08-09/35 **College Access Strategy** Ms Hannon circulated the 2009-2013 Access
Strategy approved with recommendations by Council (CL/08-09/154). Ms

Hannon advised of the increase of the non-traditional student intake target to 22%, which has been agreed against a previous College target of 15% and a HEA recommended target of 30%. The Committee discussed the implications of this target across the three Faculties with their varying student profiles, and the need for each Faculty to take steps to reach the target.

The Access Plan incorporates provisions for an Academic Liaison Officer (ALO) in each School to co-ordinate access activity in the School, raise awareness on access activities, and bring perspectives to the School Executive. Other recommendations included the development of alternative FETAC entry routes for non-traditional students, the review of matriculation requirements, that College Access data be incorporated in the College's e-strategy, and the development of a system of certification for extra-mural courses to enhance life-long learning. The Committee was also advised of the new student survey devised by the HEA to collect data on student social background, and the relatively low response rate achieved in College in its first distribution at registration. Mr Treanor and Ms Hannon noted this data will be linked to HEA funding in the future.

Section B – Implementation issues

Eqal/08-09/36 Trinity Inclusive Curriculum Project (TIC) Ms Garvey outlined the key activities of the SIF funded TIC project, which aims to embed inclusive principles in the College's mainstream teaching activity. The principles of Inclusive Curriculum are: to view the student holistically, flexible approaches to teaching methodology and materials, and student-centred teaching. The Committee noted that the TIC project is a response to the growing student diversity in terms of non-traditional students (mature students, students from disadvantaged backgrounds and students with disabilities) and international students. While specialist supports have been in place for some time, TIC aims to mainstream an inclusive delivery of teaching which will benefit all students.

Ms Garvey advised that Phase 1 had been completed involving a collation of student statistics, review of practices and a student survey. The review of practices had assessed School handbooks and developed an inclusive handbook template. The student survey of nearly 500 non-traditional students explored their experiences in relation to College facilities, School communications, course materials and support services. Overall, respondents were positive about their experience in College and discussed the impact of being a non-traditional student in terms of advantages (greater maturity or experience in some cases) and challenges (lack of confidence, isolation or stigma). The Committee noted that Phase II would consist in developing an inclusive curriculum website and online curriculum evaluation tool, which would tie in with the Bologna process course review and would function as a quality assurance symbol for participating Schools.

Eqal/08-09/37 Disability Act 2005 Ms Campos advised the Committee that the College's
XXX return in relation to the Disability Act 2005 3% public sector employment target had been submitted to the HEA as agreed by the IUA. The Committee noted the response rate to the all-staff census had been 30% (1094 valid responses), which is high by the university sector standards but still far from the 100% goal of a census. Ms Campos advised of the data collection

methods (online and paper census) and the measures in place to store and update this data confidentially in order to produce annual reports. Ms Power drew the Committee's attention to the concerns raised by the IUA Equality Group around the validity of the data and flaws in the data collection process recommended by the NDA: principally the voluntary and self-declaratory nature of the census; restrictions of the definition used, and the low level of response and disclosure across the sector. The Committee discussed the need for this exercise to be tied in with measures that would benefit staff with disabilities in practice.

Eqal/08-09/38 Dignity and Respect Policy Ms Power reported on the launch of the Dignity and Respect Policy to all staff by means of e-mail and letter. Ms Power advised the Committee on the college-wide communication programme including: Training for investigators; Supervisor training; School meetings; Tutor training; and Student counselling and S2S collaboration.

Ms Power also advised the Committee of the forthcoming recruitment of four new Contact Persons to the panel. The Committee discussed the possibility of providing guideline time-lines in the policy for the investigation of formal cases, while noting the particular constraints of the College academic year. The Committee noted that in order to protect the College's vicarious liability steps were being taken to communicate the policy to service providers and build awareness of the policy into procurement and placement processes.

Eqal/08-09/39 IUA Equality Group Legacy Funding Ms Campos advised the Committee of the progress in the two actions co-ordinated by the IUA Equality Group with funding from the European Year of Equal Opportunities for All Legacy funding. Ms Campos reported the completion of two workshops under Action 1 (Establishing a learning network for equality officers to support LGBT staff): the first workshop focussed specifically on staff LGBT networks in private enterprise and higher education, and a second workshop hosted in Trinity exploring the function of staff networks for other groups of staff. This workshop had explored the drivers of successful networks in relation to gender networks, parental groups, disability networks, pre- and post-retirement and return to work, looking at existing models in the university sector. The Committee discussed the benefits of expanding networks to be inclusive of staff who might not belong to the particular group but wish to be supportive. Ms Campos advised that the facilitator of both sessions (Dr Jane Pillinger) was preparing a report which would be launched by the IUA group in several formats, upon the reception of the second tranche of funding from the Equality Authority.

The Committee noted that under Action 2 the Challenging Stereotypes Creative Competition local and intervarsity competitions had taken place with increased participation this year. Ms Campos thanked the local judging panel and advised the Committee of the TCD winners Rosaleen McDonagh (student category), Helen Fisher and Florence Dowling (staff category).

Section C – Matters for noting

Eqal/08-09/40 Parental Group Ms Power invited the Committee's attention to the progress of the Parental Group in implementing its recommendations, and to the possibilities for change in the Group's structure and remit. The Committee discussed the benefits of its advisory function as a sub-committee of the Equality Committee, and the possible advantages offered

by a network structure that would increase participation. The Committee suggested further consideration would be required on this matter.

ACTION:

- Ms Power to report on the options for developing the Parental Group following further consultation.

Any Other Business

Eqal/08-09/41 Equality Fund Ms Campos advised the Committee that eight projects had been completed successfully in the six month period, and five more had requested an extension.

ACTION: Ms Campos to provide full report upon completion of the remaining projects.

Signed   …………………………………………

Date   ………………………………

Appendix 1 – EO/08-09/116

EO/08-09/116 Gender and Promotions The Equality Officer, present by invitation, invited Officers' attention to a Report on Gender and Promotions which she had prepared at the request of the Provost and which had been circulated. She advised Officers that the purpose of the Report had been to identify the reasons for the low number of women academics applying for promotion and the barriers to their career progression and to present recommendations for consideration by the College to address current imbalances. Following an outline of the Report's findings, the Equality Officer presented recommendations which addressed:
- Targets for recruitment and promotion
- Gender mainstreaming
- Mentoring and career guidance
- Transparency in the promotions process
- Work-life balance issues

In considering the issue of targets, the Equality Officer invited Officers' attention to a paper which had been circulated outlining proposed recruitment and promotion targets and identified those responsible for their achievement.

In the course of a discussion, Officers noted that the Staff Office has developed procedures for mentoring all staff which, if implemented, would address some of the issues identified in the Report. It was also noted that there is an inconsistency within the College as to how part-time working is handled and that there needs to be greater flexibility in relation to this and other work-life balance arrangements. The Staff Secretary advised Officers that, while it is a relatively straight-forward task to refine existing policies, managers need support in implementing part-time and other flexible work arrangements.

Officers, noting how progression above the Merit Bar differs from other promotional situations and the need to address similar issues in the administrative and service areas, agreed that the targets for promotion and recruitment, as proposed, would be adopted and that the Equality Officer would draw up an Action Plan to assist in their implementation and monitoring. (The Targets are included as an Appendix 1 to these minutes).

Appendix – Targets for the recruitment and promotion of female academics

Target: 25 % female Professors (currently 12% f).

Responsibility: EOG.

The timescale will be dependent on the rate of recruitment, promotion and turnover. It could be implemented in 5 years of active recruitment and promotion (when embargo not in place). 25% is the current EU target for senior research and professorial positions.

Actions

1.   External Applications to Chair/Professorship:

Responsibility: Deans/Search Committee to ensure 25% female applications.

2.   Promotional applications.

Responsibility: Deans to ensure proportionate applications from female and male academics in relation to eligible pool.

	Target applications (f)
Professor	25%
Associate Professor	35%
Senior Lecturer	40%
Merit Bar	50%