



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

**XX = Board relevance**

**Trinity College Dublin  
The University of Dublin**

**A meeting of the University Council was held on 8 February 2023 at 11.15am in the Trinity Board Room, Trinity Business School.**

*Present* Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Vice-President for Global Engagement, Dean of Students, Senior Tutor, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Dean of Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor L. Carson, Professor P. O'Grady, Professor D. Romelli, Professor G. Watson, Professor J. Coleman, Professor J. Wyse, Professor L. O'Driscoll, Professor B. Daly, Professor AM. Malone, Dr. O. Gobbo, Mr. M. McAndrew, Ms Z. Cummins, Mr E. Gilroy, Mr S. Lysaght.

*Apologies* Registrar, Professor B. Fitzgerald, Professor K. Neenan, Ms. D. Alexander, Ms. E. Sweeney, Mr. O. Horgan.

*In attendance* Chief Operating Officer, Secretary to the College, Librarian and College Archivist, Academic Secretary, Assistant Academic Secretary.

*Observers* -

**SECTION A.1: Policy Matters**

The Provost welcomed everyone to Council and requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest relating to the agenda. The Secretary to the College noted that Professor L. O'Driscoll had declared a conflict of interest for item D23 Selection Committee for SFI Professor of Neuroimmunology, as she was listed as a possible member of the selection committee. On the recommendation of the Secretary to the College, and with the agreement of Professor O'Driscoll, it was agreed that she should withdraw from the meeting for discussion of the item. Later in the meeting Professor B. O'Connell also declared a conflict of interest in relation to the same item, D23, and, with his agreement, it was agreed that he too should withdraw for the discussion of the item.

**CL/22-23/106 Minutes**

The minutes of the meeting of Council on 18 January 2023 were approved and signed.

**CL/22-23/107 Matters Arising from the Minutes**

The Secretary to the College referred Council to minute CL/22-23/090 on changes to the Statutes relating to Trinity governance structures. A proposal on this will be circulated to Board for discussion at its meeting on 22 February 2023. Changes are not proposed to the academic committees of Council, however, there are proposed changes relating to the principal and compliance committees of Board, which may result in six principal committees of Board rather than five, and a tidy-up of the compliance committee structure.

The Secretary to the College noted that the reform of researcher assessment indicated under minute CL/22-23/094 features on the agenda as item 11 under section A2.

#### **CL/22-23/108 Academic Integrity Update**

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies informed Council that three sub-groups have been established under the Academic Integrity Working Group (AIWG) to progress initiatives relating to the promotion of academic integrity and the prevention of and response to academic misconduct. He briefed Council on recent developments which include:

- The appointment of a Research Integrity and Ethics Officer in the Office of the Dean of Research.
- A review and development of roles and processes for investigating research integrity issues.
- A communication issued to the College community in relation to assessment on CHATGPT/Artificial Intelligence text generation.
- Research funding awarded by Quality and Qualifications Ireland (QQI) for a proposal focused on 'Measuring Attitudes Towards Academic Integrity in Irish Higher Education', which will include a cost-benefit analysis of using the ICAI-McCabe Survey to measure beliefs and knowledge about Academic Integrity in Higher Education.

He noted that the administration of the ICAI-McCabe Survey would commence soon, and informed Council that a new post, funded by the Higher Education Authority (HEA) through the Strategic Alignment of Teaching and Learning Enhancement in Higher Education (SATLE) initiative to support the work of Academic Integrity has been recruited, and a review of policy and processes for responding to academic misconduct is underway.

The Provost thanked the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies and invited questions and comments. Responding to a comment from a member, the Dean of Graduate Studies remarked that the AIWG sub-group 'Responding to Academic Misconduct' will be progressing work on streamlining processes concerning the management of plagiarism. The SU Education Officer, noting the large increase in plagiarism hearings, emphasised the importance of robust assessment design to mitigate against the risk of academic misconduct and plagiarism.

#### **CL/22-23/109 Dean of Research Annual Report 2021-22**

The Dean of Research presented his annual report for 2021-22, which comprises four sections, namely: 1) progress on the Living Research Excellence Strategy; 2) #researchMATTERS; 3) Research in numbers; and 4) Looking ahead to 2022/23. He outlined progress achieved to-date across the four sections.

- (i) Speaking to progress on the Living Research Excellence Strategy, he drew Council's attention to the Post-Doc Academy, the Research Impact Pilot, the launch of a Research Boost Programme, and the HEA COVID-19 Costed Extensions Fund.
- (ii) Speaking to #researchMATTERS, he highlighted research communication outputs, and having secured Horizon Europe Marie Curie Actions funding for European Researchers Night events in 2022 and 2023 in partnership with ADAPT and RCSI with Trinity as the lead coordinator and grant holder.
- (iii) Speaking to research performance in numbers, he showed an increase in research grant activity and expenditure by 17% from 2019/20 to 2021/22, and a research grant income of €125 million to Trinity for the year 2021/22. He noted the high reliance on Science Foundation Ireland (SFI) grant income. Referring to the data on Scholarly Output, he reported that the data is based on the Scopus database and does not cover material that

falls outside of this. While the data indicate an increase in outputs in 2020 and 2021, which is also present across comparator institutions, this may be attributed to the COVID-19 pandemic. Strong field weighted citation impact performances were reported in some disciplines such as Medicine, Immunology and Microbiology, and Economics.

The Dean of Research also addressed University Rankings, noting that the landscape is more competitive year on year and that Trinity operates in an environment where international competitors have access to greater financial resources resulting in Trinity putting considerable effort into maintaining its current rankings.

Reporting on Trinity Innovation, he informed Council that there were 18 Intellectual Property (IP) licence agreements in 2021/22; significant investment in Trinity Campus Companies including Biologit, Danalto, and OneProjects and Proverum; and noted the extensive engagement of Trinity researchers with a diverse range of industry partners with 150 plus agreements executed involving over 70 lead PIs representing over 15 Schools.

Concluding his update on Research Performance in Numbers, the Dean of Research highlighted Trinity recipients of National Research Awards in 2021 and 2022, which included the RIA Gold Medal, IRC Researcher of the Year, SFI Researcher of the Year, and the SFI International Engagement Award.

Finally, (iv) Looking Ahead to 2022/23, the Dean of Research commented on the strong research performance in 2021/22 noting that it is important to address issues that inhibit research progress and to liaise with administrative units to make it easier to conduct high-quality research at Trinity. There is a recognition that there are challenges to establishing an environment in which research thrives. High-level objectives will aim to address four key questions, namely; how research structures can be more coherently organised, how academic talent can be fostered, how research infrastructure can be improved, and how best to engage with policy-makers, government and funding agencies to provide a balanced funding landscape.

The Provost thanked the Dean of Research and invited questions and comments.

A discussion on scholarly outputs and citations per publication took place with a member remarking that there had been a decrease in the number of Trinity researchers featuring in the Clarivate Highly Cited Researchers list and a steady decrease in Trinity researcher citations per publication, a trend which started prior to the COVID-19 pandemic. The Dean of Research noted that while there had been a decrease in citations per publication, Trinity was performing well in field weighted citation impact, which had seen an increase year-on-year over the past five years. There was a consensus that while individual research units are performing well, there is a need for greater communication and co-ordination of activities across units and for research structures to be more cohesively organised. It was remarked that greater agility in the recruitment process is required as the burden of work falls on the PI, taking time away from research activity. The Dean of Research highlighted the need to review research structures and infrastructure to generate increased capacity over the coming years and to provide post-award support to grant recipients. Responding to maintaining Trinity's position in the rankings, he advised that some of the elements that determine rankings are not in Trinity's favour, such as the staff to student ratio, and the student body composition, largely undergraduate, which further disadvantages Trinity in the rankings relative to some peer institutions.

**Decision:**

**CL/22-23/109.1:** Council approved the Dean of Research Annual Report 2021-22.

Professor Lorraine Leeson, Associate Vice-Provost for Equality, Diversity and Inclusion, and Dr. Siobán O'Brien Green, Acting Equality Officer, joined the meeting.

**CL/22-23/110 Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Governance Review**

XX

Speaking to the Equality, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) Governance Review, the Associate Vice-Provost for Equality, Diversity and Inclusion (AVPEDI) explained that the review was prompted by internal organisational changes, which saw the establishment of the EDI office in 2019, as well as external circumstances. Providing an overview of the latter, she informed Council that Trinity operates in an environment that is subject to statutory obligations around equality and human rights, including the Public Sector Quality and Human Rights Duty; Athena SWAN a national equality framework, which will from 2022 require the incorporation of an intersectional view in EDI plans; and the Department of Education and Skills 'Framework for Consent in Higher Education Institutions', which requires HEIs to develop and publish specific institutional action plans on tackling sexual violence and harassment. At European level, eligibility for Horizon Europe funding is conditional on the applying institution having a gender equality plan.

The AVPEDI extended her thanks to the Academic Secretary and Stephanie Reilly for organising and facilitating an External Review of the governance of EDI in Trinity. She outlined the nine high-level recommendations of the Review and provided an update on their implementation. Speaking to progress to-date on all the recommendations, she informed Council that: (i) an EDI Committee, replacing the existing Equality Committee, will be established; (ii) an EDI Strategy is under development, which will consider the specific recommendations relating to KPIs, ownership of and responsibility for identified targets, collaboration with other units across College, as well as the development of an implementation plan; (iii) the existing Annual Equality Monitoring Report will be re-imagined as an Annual EDI Report, commencing 2023; and (iv) the ownership of responding to the Public Sector Duty annual reporting requirements is under consideration.

The AVPEDI further advised that the reviewers recommended that responsibility for the development of the university's Athena SWAN remain with the EDI Office. The EDI Office is currently compiling the Silver Institutional Application and supporting several School applications. The demands of the application process outstrip resourcing, and the Data Analytics and Strategic Initiatives (DAaSI) unit is supporting the process through the provision of the data required for the fulfilment of statutory obligations, policy duties and internal KPIs.

With respect to resourcing needs, the AVPEDI informed Council that she is working with HR on the EDI structure and that a business plan will be prepared for the consideration of the Planning Group in March 2023.

The Provost thanked the AVPEDI and the Acting Equality Officer and invited questions and comments.

Responding to a query from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer on the intention to implement the actions in a step wise manner or simultaneously, the AVPEDI advised that certain actions such as the Athena SWAN applications and the Gender Equality Plan required for Horizon 2 funding will be prioritised. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer recommended that the implementation plan reflect the delivery of actions on a prioritised basis. Commenting on recommendation 9 on resourcing, she explained that the review group cannot mandate resources. A member, who is an Athena SWAN champion, stressed the importance of adequately resourcing the EDI Office. The Dean of Research highlighted research grant opportunities and recommended that Trinity's application to the Research Culture Grant should make provision for funding for the EDI Office due to the alignment of the Grant with EDI.

A member welcomed the establishment of an EDI Committee but cautioned against establishing a sub-group/working-group structure that may have an impact on reaching timely decisions.

The Provost clarified that the reform of the principal and compliance committees of Board will also include a deeper discussion on sub-committees working to ensure they are fit for purpose.

Responding to a query on the DAaSI unit and the importance of reliable data, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer explained that DAaSI had been recently established to support the inter-operability of data sources across College. The unit is relatively new and a working group has been convened with representatives of owners of data across College to, in the first instance, scope and review the repository of data that exists across Trinity.

**Decision:**

**CL/22-23/110.1:** Council noted the Equality, Diversity and Inclusive Governance Review.

**Action:**

**CL/22-23/110.2:** The Secretary to the College will bring an update to Council on the proposed governance changes and committee structures.

The Associate Vice-Provost for Equality, Diversity and Inclusion and Acting Equality Officer left the meeting.

**CL/22-23/111 Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer's Report**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that assessment was discussed at a recent meeting with Heads of School, with a focus on why, how, and when assessment takes place, and also on the location of examinations. She highlighted the need for an institution-wide discussion on how students are assessed and the timing of assessments and encouraged Council members to bring the discussion to their constituencies. A mechanism is required to facilitate written examinations that are required for genuine purposes rather than for historical reasons.

Speaking to the Senior Academic Promotions process, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that the Heads of School were consulted for nominees who will engage in a consultative process led by a facilitator, which is being organised by the Provost.

Noting the delay of the issuing of the Leaving Certificate results again this year and for the next three years, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that she is working with the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies and the Dean of Graduate Studies to reach a consensus on the best course of action with the view to deciding on the start date for the coming academic year as soon as possible so as to provide certainty to incoming students in the academic year 2023/24.

**CL/22-23/112 Provost's Report**

The Provost invited the Vice-President for Global Engagement to update Council on Trinity's response to the devastating earthquake in Turkey and Syria.

The Vice-President for Global Engagement informed Council that Global Engagement has reached out to Trinity students who are from, or who have family members in Turkey, Syria, and surrounding and impacted regions. The Global Incident Response Unit that sits within Trinity Global will co-ordinate College-wide efforts to put supports in place for affected students and colleagues, in particular the co-ordination of fundraising efforts. She advised of supports available to affected students including Trinity Global, the Senior Tutor's Office, and the Student Counselling Service.

Referring to her attendance at a recent conference in Brussels on 'Sustainable Horizons: Does our future depend on Science?', the Provost commented that there is a shift in language and focus on research and innovation to a greater emphasis on defence at European level, which

can be attributed to recent geopolitical changes such as the War in Ukraine and measures to address inflation. The US Inflation Reduction Act is seen as an existential threat to EU and UK economies. These changes may see an era of entrenchment emerging, which will have an impact on research and innovation and sustainable initiatives due to the collaborative nature of these initiatives and will ultimately have an impact on research-intensive universities. Of particular concern to delegates, was a remark from the European Commissioner for Competition, Margrethe Vestager, of the importance of the continued existence of the Horizon Programme. The Provost emphasised the importance of taking opportunities to raise awareness of the issues and she did so with the President of the European Parliament during the latter's visit to Trinity last week.

The Provost thanked the Librarian and College Archivist and her team for the event hosted by the Library on 1 February 2023 to present the new sculptures of four outstanding women which are now part of the iconic collection in Trinity's Old Library.

Speaking to core funding and the need to address the €307 million shortfall in Government funding, the Provost informed Council that the IUA is currently working on its submission for next year's budget. The need for investment in providing adequate levels of up-to-date and well-resourced infrastructure will form part of this year's IUA submission.

The Provost extended her congratulations to the two Trinity European Research Council (ERC) Consolidator Grant recipients Professor Sarah Doyle and Professor Marius de Leeuw.

#### **CL/22-23/113 Any Other Urgent Business**

There was no Any Other Urgent Business.

### **SECTION A.2: Policy Matters which have already been considered by Committees**

#### **CL/22-23/114 Postgraduate Renewal Programme**

XX

- (i) Review of English Language Requirements for Postgraduate Programmes
- (ii) Proposed Supervisor and Research Student Agreement

#### **Decisions:**

**CL/22-23/114.1:** Council approved the 11 recommendations of Work Package 1 (Taught) of the Postgraduate Renewal Programme on the Review of English Language Requirements for Postgraduate Programmes for implementation in Horizons 2 and 3 of the Renewal Programme.

**CL/22-23/114.2:** Council approved (i) the Supervisory and Research Student Agreement, (ii) to introduce the Agreement on a pilot basis in first instance in the academic year 2023/24, and (iii) to authorise work package 2 of the Postgraduate Renewal Programme to incorporate any changes following further discussions and in the context of any additions relevant to the ongoing work of the Renewal Programme.

#### **CL/22-23/115 Postgraduate Programme Proposals**

- (i) Proposal for MSc course in Regulatory Affairs for Medical Devices
- (ii) Proposal for revision of the MSc course in Health Services Management

#### **Decisions:**

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings**

**CL/22-23/115.1:** Council approved the proposal for the two-year part-time blended course in Regulatory Affairs for Medical Devices leading to the MSc in Regulatory Affairs for Medical Devices (90 ECTS) and exit award of Postgraduate Diploma in Regulatory Affairs for Medical Devices (60 ECTS) at NFQ level 9 offered by the School of Medicine, with a first intake in September 2023.

**CL/22-23/115.2:** Council approved the revision of the current MSc in Health Services Management incorporating (a) a course title change to MSc in Health Policy Management and the exit award to Postgraduate Diploma in Health Policy Management, and (b) an introduction of an additional one-year full-time MSc delivery format in Health Policy and Management, from September 2023.

**CL/22-23/116 Agreement on Reforming Research Assessment**

XX

**Decision:**

**CL/22-23/116.1:** Council recommends to Board that Trinity signs the Agreement on Reforming Research Assessment including the Declaration on Research Assessment (DORA) Agreement.

**CL/22-23/117 Higher Doctorate Corpus Library Submission**

**Decision:**

**CL/22-23/117.1:** Council approved the change in submission format of the Higher Doctorate Corpus to Trinity's Access to Research Archive (TARA) to comprise the title page, contents page, a context-setting commentary not exceeding one thousand words, and a list of all titles that made up the examined corpus, including the Digital Object Identifier for each piece of work.

**CL/22-23/118 Annual Quality Report to Quality and Qualifications Ireland (QQI) 2021-22**

XX

**Decision:**

**CL/22-23/118.1:** Council approved the Annual Quality Report to Quality and Qualifications Ireland (QQ) 2021-22.

## SECTION B

**CL/22-23/119 Graduate Studies Committee**

The draft minutes of 26 January 2023 were noted and approved.

**CL/22-23/120 Human Resources Committee**

The Secretary to the College requested that Council excuse the delay in circulating the minutes of the Human Resources Committee, which was due to the absence of a system to do so. He advised that this has now been addressed and that there were no specific items requiring Council approval.

Responding to a query from a member regarding minute HRC/22-23/17 on the new framework for conducting interviews, which proposes online interviews for blended roles and in-person interviews for in-person roles up to AO1/Assistant Professor level, the Provost clarified that interview formats are decided by the recruiting School/division. For equity purposes the same interview format should be offered to all candidates presenting for interview.

The Provost confirmed that DORA will be factored into Senior Academic Promotions once it has been signed.

Speaking to the consultations on reward, recognition and successful careers for professional services staff, the Provost confirmed that the discussion will include promotions. A facilitator has been engaged by HR to manage the series of consultations with the College community. The format of the consultations is open-ended with all options being discussed and considered.

**Decisions:**

**CL/22-23/120.1:** Council noted and approved the minutes of 24 September 2021, 29 October 2021, 18 November 2021, 21 January 2022, 3 March 2022, 8 June 2022, and 13 October 2022.

**CL/22-23/120.2:** Council noted and approved the minutes of 17 November 2022 with a change in wording for minute HRC/22-23/17 to reflect the discretion of the School/division in deciding on the interview format.

**CL/22-23/121 Quality Committee**

**Decisions:**

**CL/22-23/121.1:** Council noted and approved the minutes of 1 December 2022.

**CL/22-23/121.2:** Council noted and approved the draft minutes of 26 January 2023 and appendices (a) Revised Linked Provider Quality Review Procedures, and (b) Updated Implementation Plan for the Joint B.Sc. in Physiotherapy Programme (TCD and SIT).

**CL/22-23/122 Research Committee**

The draft minutes of 6 December 2022 were noted and approved.

**CL/22-23/123 Undergraduate Studies Committee**

The draft minutes of 17 January 2023 were noted and approved.

**SECTION C**

**CL/22-23/124 Higher Degrees – Reports of Examiners**

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees (Higher Degrees List) dated 8 February 2023.

**(i) Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**M.D.** Anna O'Rourke

**(ii) Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**Ph.D.** Claire Condon; Karen Conlan; Michael Craig; Stephen Cunningham; Paul Donnelly; Bernard Fares; Angelica Silvia Federici; Lukas Jakob Hallen; Nathaniel Laurence Lam; David Lee; Tom McKenna; Chris John Morris; Nuno Guilherme Branco Neto; Ryan Alberto Ó Giobúin; Cathal Ormond; Jane O'Toole; Nadezda Prochukhan; Eric Scanlon; Ciara Mary Smyth.



**D. Mus. Perf.** Madeline Judge

**M.Sc.** Rolando Israel Arce Olivares Hanlon

**CL/22-23/125 Head of Discipline**

The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor Omar Garcia as the acting Head of the Discipline of Hispanic Studies, in the School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies, from 23 January 2023 to 31 May 2023.

**SECTION D**

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts, this information is restricted.

Signed .....

Date .....