

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

XX = Board relevance

**Trinity College Dublin
The University of Dublin**

A meeting of the University Council was held on 9 March 2022 at 11.15am remotely and hosted from the Provost's Library.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Vice-President for Global Engagement, Dean of Students, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Dean of Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor L. Carson, Professor P. O'Grady, Professor A. Bray, Professor D. Romelli, Professor M. Lyons, Professor B. O'Connell, Professor L. O'Driscoll, Professor M. Gill, Dr. O. Gobbo, Professor A. Long, Prof. S. Smith, Ms. Z. Cummins.
<i>Apologies</i>	Prof. A. O'Connor, Prof. Monaghan, Prof. M. Ruffini, Prof. C. Donnellan, Prof. AM Malone, Ms. B. Genockey, Ms. J. Bochenek, Ms. S. Sutton, Ms. A. Bhattacharjee, Mr. D. Lee, Ms. Nilki Aluthge Dona.
<i>In attendance</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer, Secretary to the College, Librarian and College Archivist, Academic Secretary, Assistant Academic Secretary, Ms. A. Crawford.
Observers	

SECTION A

The Provost welcomed everyone to Council and requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest relating to the agenda. The Secretary advised that there were no conflicts of interest reported.

CL/21-22/120 Declarations by New Members and Observers

The Secretary to College advised that agenda item C17 Membership of the University Council be brought forward for Council approval of (i) Pro-Senior Tutor and (ii) Secretary to the Scholars. Council approved the Pro-Senior Tutor as a member of University Council, and Secretary to the Scholars representative as an observer of University Council until the next election of Secretary to the Scholars which will be held on Trinity Monday (25 April) 2022.

CL/21-22/121 Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of Council on 22 February 2022 were approved and signed.

CL/21-22/122 Matters Arising from the Minutes

The Secretary to College referred Council to minute CL/21-22/103 on the resumption of in-person Council meetings. He explained that it was decided to hold the March meeting of Council remotely due to the Trinity Institutional Review taking place this week and as it is also

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Reading week. It is proposed that the April Council meeting will be held in-person and a communication will be sent to members ahead of the meeting to establish if members are comfortable with an in-person meeting.

Ms Z. Cummins joined the meeting.

The Director of the Careers Advisory Service, Ms Orla Bannon, and Careers Consultant, Mr. John Wynne, joined the meeting.

CL/21-22/123 Graduate Outcomes Survey Results: Class of 2020

The Director of the Careers Advisory Service introduced her colleague Mr John Wynne, Careers Consultant for Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) who is also the project lead for the graduate outcomes survey. She advised that she would take the report as read and provided a brief overview of the context for the survey, noting that the survey did not take place for the Class of 2019 due to the Covid-19 pandemic. She advised that the survey includes responses from Trinity students graduating at National Framework of Qualifications (NFQ) levels 8-10 across all modes of study (full-time, part-time and online).

The Careers Consultant, Mr John Wynne, took Council through the main findings of the survey reporting a response rate of 52% representing 2771 respondents, and the limitations of the survey. He presented the employment rates of Trinity graduates compared to 'All Universities' based on institutional data provided by the Higher Education Authority (HEA) for the Class of 2020, highlighting that a lower percentage of Trinity graduate respondents (68%) reported to be in employment compared to graduates from 'All Universities' (71%). Covid-19 was cited as the main barrier to employment amongst honours degree respondents. Reasons provided for progressing to further study included, changing/improving career options, and broadening skills and knowledge. The Careers Consultant noted that there had been some changes to graduates reporting being in full-time employment across all Faculties compared to 2018, with decreases reported for Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences (21%) and STEM (10%). Referring to postgraduate degree graduates, the Careers Consultant reported that 74% of postgraduate taught, 88% of Masters research, and 87% of Doctorate graduate respondents reported being in employment, with 22% of these in Post Doc positions compared to 30% in 2018. He noted that the national percentage for 'All Universities' is 12.6%. Of the PhD graduate respondents who had reported being in employment, 40% were working in the education sector and 31% working in the professional, scientific, and technical sector.

The Director of the Careers Advisory Service presented the data on the most popular destinations for graduate employment overseas, which included the UK and US for honours degree graduate; China, Germany and the US for postgraduate degree graduates; and Germany and the UK for PhD graduates. She explained that the decrease in the number of postgraduate degree graduate respondents seeking employment in the UK, down to 6% from 15% in 2018, can be attributed to Brexit, and noted that all of those working in China were Chinese nationals returning home.

Presenting the QS rankings for graduate employability in 2022, the Director of the Careers Advisory Service highlighted that Trinity ranked 91st (in the top 18%) worldwide. The data is based on the evaluation of 786 institutions worldwide with approximately 75,000 employers surveyed. Trinity holds first position in Ireland for employer reputation and alumni outcomes. Concluding the presentation, the Director of the Careers Advisory Service highlighted some points for discussion, noting that the data shows a disruption to patterns in trends due to the pandemic. Trinity's slight shift in position may be attributed to its student demographic and exposure to global employment markets, and the limited availability of internships at undergraduate level. She noted the shift in graduate motivation for pursuing further study presents an opportunity for Trinity to increase its education provision in continuing professional development and micro-credentials.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The Provost thanked the Director of the Careers Advisory Service and the Careers Consultant and invited questions and comments.

Members urged caution in the interpretation of the data relating to the comparison of Trinity's graduate employment rate with that of 'All Universities' due to a lack of information on the response rates of other Higher Education Institutions (HEIs). Responding to a query from the Dean of AHSS and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer on the availability and disaggregation of institutional data, the Director of the Careers Advisory Service advised that it would only be possible to disaggregate the Trinity data, as data is not available for other institutions. The Provost agreed that caution is required when interpreting the data and suggested that the HEA be contacted and asked to provide institutional data for 'All Universities' for comparability purposes. A member raised the need for Trinity graduate employment data to be compared with graduates from comparator institutions, highlighting that there may be reasons for the Trinity graduate employment rate. The Director of the Careers Advisory Service highlighted that there are plans to develop a European wide survey in the future with the HEA progressing work on this currently.

Responding to a comment from a member on the impact of the large number of Business graduate respondents on the findings, the Director of the Careers Advisory Service acknowledged that Business graduates accounted for a high number of respondents which may have skewed the data. She stated that the data can be interrogated in different ways.

The Dean of Graduate Studies drew attention to student internships at the postgraduate level, noting that it would be important for postgraduate renewal to address the area of student internships. In responding to the Dean of Graduate Studies, the Director of the Careers Advisory Service acknowledged that internships are underdeveloped in Trinity and she advised that a module on careers and employability for PhD students had been launched by Careers this year. She clarified that the data presented in the report will be available to Schools for analysis purposes and will not be made available outside of Trinity.

Responding to a query from the Dean of Research on the QS rankings for graduate employability, the Director of the Careers Advisory Service explained that the 'Partnerships with Employers per Faculty' metric in the QS Graduate Employability Rankings is based on research with global companies for which QS uses the Scopus database to establish which universities have produced three or more collaborative papers in a five-year period. The QS Rankings do not account for the many collaborations Trinity has with employers and doesn't represent the reality of the work being done across Trinity Schools. The Provost agreed that the QS ranking indicators are limited, and she highlighted the need for further reflection on the Trinity data.

Decision:

CL/21-22/123.1: Council noted the Report on the Graduate Outcomes Survey Results – Class of 2020.

The Director of the Careers Advisory Service and the Careers Consultant left the meeting.

The Dean of STEM and Professor A. Bray left the meeting.

CL/21-22/124 Policy Management Framework

XX

The Secretary to College extended his thanks to the Academic Secretary for her contribution to the development of the Policy Management Framework and especially to Dr. Elizabeth Donnellan from the Quality Office who had done significant work on developing the Framework. In providing a background to the Framework, he explained that in line with good governance practice, and in response to an internal audit recommendation, the Secretary's Office had agreed to consult with key stakeholders and to develop a Policy Management Framework for implementation across the University. It is envisaged that the framework will

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

assist the University in implementing effective policy management by establishing a structure to support colleagues and by setting out standards and principles for policy development, approval, implementation, and review. He noted that the Framework will ensure consistency and compliance, as it outlines a transparent process that incorporates processes for stakeholder input and appropriate approval pathways. The Framework includes feedback and input from the Equality, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) unit and the Quality Office and was sent to all Chairs of principal committees of Board, academic committees of Council, and compliance committees of Board and Council for comment.

The Provost thanked the Secretary to College commending him on the graphics in the document.

In response to a question raised on the accessibility of all policies from a central online College location, the Secretary to College acknowledged the need for a single location where all policies are housed, and he agreed to follow-up on this.

There was considerable discussion on the monitoring of the implementation of policies with two members highlighting that questions on this had been raised by the Institutional Review Panel at separate meetings during the week. The Secretary to College agreed that greater attention is required on this, and he noted that a review date will be indicated on each policy to facilitate the updating of the policy. Council was directed to 8.4.1 of the Framework which highlights the responsibility of the policy owner for the implementation and monitoring of the policy. He explained that the Secretary's Office will track and report on the review, updating and implementation of policies. The Provost agreed that monitoring the implementation of policies is important and she suggested that the office of the COO and the Secretary's Office explore the development of a policy dashboard similar to one that was developed for research policies when she was Dean of Research. Such a dashboard would facilitate the tracking of policies, and the development of a mapping tool could help establish where crossover exists across policies to facilitate the updating of relevant sections of several policies as needed. The Academic Secretary commenting on the review of academic policies noted that this takes place through the academic committee structure and if a policy isn't working it is raised at that forum and updated accordingly. While welcoming the monitoring of the implementation of policies, she remarked that this would be resource intensive and that careful consideration is required on how this may be best achieved. Highlighting the work of Academic Affairs in reviewing and updating academic policies, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies explained that a clear timeline for the review and updating of policies is followed. He suggested that the implementation of policies could be considered at the time of policy review. Responding to a comment from the Provost on examining the implementation of policies at the review stage using a set of questions provided in the Framework, the Secretary to College undertook to review the policy checklist in appendix 2 to establish if additional questions could be included to address this.

The Provost thanked the Secretary to College and the Academic Secretary highlighting the importance of the Policy Management Framework in ensuring that Trinity policies are robust, properly implemented, and reviewed on an ongoing basis. The Academic Secretary noted the significant contribution of Dr. Elizabeth Donnellan, Quality Office, to the development of the Framework.

Decision:

CL/21-22/124.1: Council approved the Policy Management Framework.

Actions:

CL/21-22/124.2: The Secretary to College to ensure that all College policies are held in one central location for ease of access.

CL/21-22/124.3: The Secretary to the College to review the policy checklist in appendix 2 to establish if additional questions can be included to facilitate a review of the implementation of policies.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

CL/21-22/125 The Library of Trinity College Dublin Annual Report 2020/21

The Librarian and College Archivist provided an overview to the report explaining that while the entire academic year was dominated by Covid-19 remarkable progress had been made on two major capital projects – the Old Library Redevelopment Project and the Virtual Trinity Library. She conveyed her appreciation and thanks to every single member of the Library staff for playing their part in supporting the academic community through a tough year.

Referring to the Library Strategy 2015-20, the Librarian and College Archivist explained that this is essentially a 15-year strategy and that much has been achieved since 2015. She reminded Council that the Strategy consists of 5 pillars underpinned by three areas – communications, operations, and training and development. The pandemic resulted in the introduction of new services such as ‘scan and demand’ and ‘click and connect’ and provided much needed non-clinical support to the academic and student community. She highlighted that during the pandemic the excessive cost of e-textbooks and the onsite-only access to UK e-legal deposit material were brought to the fore.

The Librarian and College Archivist presented key activities and achievements for each pillar as follows:

- Pillar 1 Integrated Space – the overall business case for the Old Library Redevelopment project was approved by Board in summer 2020 allowing the design team to progress to detailed design completion. Extensive planning was completed for an interim Research Collections’ reading room in the basement of the Ussher Library to enable continuity of access to the collections during the estimated three-year construction phase of the Old Library Redevelopment Project. Significant planning for the decant of over 700,000 valuable and vulnerable collection items ahead of the construction phase took place.
- Pillar 2 Integrated Digital – significant progress was made on the Virtual Trinity Library with the launch of the overall programme featuring Vartan Gregorian, the late President of the Carnegie Corporation of New York. The Fagel international collaboration project started and was awarded two more tranches of funding. As part of the shift towards digital, the Library collaborated with researchers in the School of Creative Arts and V-Sense resulting in a virtual reality rendition of Dean Swift in the Long Room of the Old Library.
- Pillar 3 Teaching, Learning and Research – the TCD Sense Project funded by the HEA fund for students with disabilities resulted in eleven spaces across the Berkeley, Lecky, Hamilton and John Stearne Medical Libraries identified for refurbishment, including quiet individual study rooms, shared quiet study spaces, open spaces and dedicated sensory rooms with soft furnishings. The Library Life Pulse Survey findings highlighted the role played by the Library as a non-clinical support with 61% of respondents agreeing with the statement ‘The Library has a positive impact on my wellbeing/my wellbeing at work’.
- Pillar 4 Prioritised Funding – there were major donations, for example, when His Serene Highness Prince Albert of II of Monaco visited Trinity and made a significant donation to the Old Library.
- Pillar 5 Suite of Policies and Programmes – during the pandemic Library staff transferred the contents of the 1872 Printed Catalogue into Stella Search resulting in 280,000 research collection items newly available in the catalogue, which are already being used by researchers.

Referring to external events and communications, the Librarian and College Archivist noted that significant efforts were put into communications in 2020/21 with the launch of the Virtual Trinity Library taking place and the competition to commission four sculptures of women scholars in the Long Room completed in the summer with awards made to four different artists.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The sculptures are due to be introduced into the Old Library by the end of the next calendar year.

Referring to the data in the appendices, the Library and College Archivist presented the percentage breakdown of overall expenditure on resources by Faculty 2020/21, with AHSS accounting for 40% of expenditure, Health Sciences, 30%, and STEM, 29%.

Concluding, the Librarian and College Archivist highlighted the challenges and opportunities that lie ahead, which include:

- The Offsite Collections Resource Centre.
- Start planning for a new Library Management System.
- Digital sustainability.
- Advancing the unique resource available to the Trinity community of UK legal deposit. Six significant libraries in four countries have created, and are running, a 7th transnational e-library. Strategic development and the transnational digital infrastructure are being reviewed for the next five years against disruption in publishing.
- The inclusion of a knowledge and library component of a second campus is critical to ensure researchers have access to UK legal deposit e-resources.
- Sustainability of e-textbooks.

The Provost thanked the Librarian and College Archivist for the enormous level of work achieved by the Library over the pandemic, noting how activities were pushing boundaries, and improving access for everyone. The Provost extended her appreciation and thanks to all Library staff.

Members commended the Librarian and College Archivist for her work and endorsed the view that the Library is a safe space during challenging times and a non-clinical support to the academic community. In response to an observation that the planning cycle is normally a five year one rather than a 15 year strategy, the Librarian and College Archivist explained that the Strategy coincided with her appointment, and a longer term view of the direction that the Library needed to go in was required. There was a consensus that it would take 15 years to deliver on the Library Strategy 2015-20.

Decision:

CL/21-22/125.1: Council noted the Library Annual Report 2020/21.

CL/21-22/126 **Covid Adjustment to Faculties' Research Productivity Metrics**
XX

The Vice Provost/Chief Academic Officer highlighted that the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic on staff's ability to conduct research has been adversely affected by additional demands arising out of the pandemic and in light of these exceptional circumstances a proposal to add an additional year to the Faculties Research Productivity Metrics was considered and approved by the Executive Officers Group on 2 February 2021 (EO/20-21/239) and Council on 10 February 2021 (CL/20-21/112). She advised that EOG at its meeting on 1 March 2022 considered and approved continuing with the Covid adjustments to Faculties Research Productivity Metrics for an additional year.

Decision:

CL/21-22/126.1: Council approved the proposal to extend the COVID adjustments to the Faculties Research Productivity Metrics for an additional year.

CL/21-22/127 **Provost's Report**

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The Provost updated Council on events taking place in Trinity, which include hustings for the Senate Bye-Election and the Senior Tutor position. The Trinity Institutional Review is taking place from 7-11 March 2022 with a full programme of meetings taking place with staff from around College and the Provost thanked all involved for devoting their time to the process.

The Provost noted that Trinity has experienced challenging times recently with the loss of a medical student and she commended the Faculty of Health Sciences, the School of Medicine, Student Counselling and the Library for the support they had provided to-date. Referring to the war on Ukraine, the Provost commented that this is a very difficult time for staff and students who may be from Ukraine or Russia or who are currently in Ukraine or Russia. She thanked the Vice-President for Global Engagement and her team for all the work they are doing to support staff and students and for making arrangements to bring students currently in Ukraine and Russia back to Ireland. She acknowledged that ongoing support will need to be provided to students in the weeks ahead and there will be a College communication on this in due course.

The Head of School of Medicine thanked the Provost for her kind words and stated that it is a very difficult time for staff and students in the School of Medicine. He commended the Student Counselling Service for its work noting that there are limits to what can be done at School level to support staff and students. A member applauded Dr. Aidan Seery for his extraordinary work as Senior Tutor, and he emphasised the need for infrastructure to be put in place for caring for the carers, as critical incidents can be very challenging for staff. The Provost agreed and stated that there is a need for Trinity's emergency response to be updated to take account of the wider political context.

Speaking to the item the Provost highlighted a number of high profile visits to Trinity over the past two weeks, including a visit from the Tánaiste to launch an Irish-led €10 million project to delivery precision medicine for Motor Neuron Disease, the UK Commissioner, the Lord Mayor of London and the Sheriff-elect of the City of London.

Referring to the blended working policy, the Provost commented that College is monitoring the implementation of the policy and she acknowledged that there is considerable fear in the system with College working through the issues as they arise. She observed that the pandemic has been challenging for most and stated that supports may need to be put in place to support staff with the transition out of the pandemic and a return to campus.

CL/21-22/128 Any Other Urgent Business

There was no any other urgent business.

SECTION B

CL/21-22/129 Graduate Studies Committee

The minutes of 24 February 2022 were noted and approved.

CL/21-22/130 Library and Information Policy Committee

The minutes of 22 November 2021 were noted and approved.

CL/21-22/131 Quality Committee

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The minutes of 1 February 2022 were noted and approved.

CL/21-22/132 Research Committee

The minutes of 18 January 2022 were noted and approved.

CL/21-22/133 Student Life Committee

The Dean of Students drew attention to an error in the decision recorded on page 3 of the minutes relating to the draft Student Partnership Agreement and advised that February should be the month indicated rather than March.

The minutes of 18 January 2022 with the amendment were noted and approved.

CL/21-22/134 Undergraduate Studies Committee

The minutes of 22 February 2022 were noted and approved.

SECTION C

CL/21-22/135 Revised Proposal for Award for Excellence in Research Student Supervision

The Council noted the circulated memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies dated 1 March 2022

CL/21-22/136 Membership of Student Life Committee

The Council noted the circulated memorandum from the Registrar dated 28 February 2022

CL/21-22/137 Membership of the University Council

(i) Pro-Senior Tutor

The Council noted that Professor Gerard Whyte has been appointed as Pro-Senior Tutor and will serve as a member of the University Council until a new Senior Tutor is elected by the Tutors and approved by Board

(ii) Secretary to the Scholars

The Council noted that James McLaughlin has been elected as Secretary to the Scholars and will serve as an observer of the University Council until the next election of Secretary to the Scholars on Trinity Monday (25 April) 2022

CL/21-22/138 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners (Higher Degrees list, circulated) on candidates for higher degrees:

(i) Higher Degrees by Research Alone

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Sc.D. John James O’Leary

(ii) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

Ph.D. Selin Akkol Solakoglu; John Allen; Giulio Brunetti; Christopher Byrne; Elaine Maria Clotworthy; Ciana Diskin; Foteini Drakou; Richard Michael Duffy; Daire Healy; Brendan Colin Hoare; Marta Lovisari; Benjamin Lynch; Marta Emilia Markey; Ruth Usher

D.Music.Perf Sylvia O’Brien

M.Sc. Oluwasegun John Ohunye

CL/21-22/138 School Directors

The Council noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) Professor Martin Worthington as Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate), School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies, from 16 February 2022 to 31 May 2024;
- (ii) Professor Nathan Hill as Director of Research, School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences, from 1 June 2022 to 31 May 2024;
- (iii) Professor Julie Regan as Director of Global Relations, School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences, from 1 June 2022 to 31 May 2024;
- (iv) Professor Kathleen McTiernan as Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate), School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences, from 1 June 2022 to 31 May 2024.

CL/21-22/139 Head of Discipline

The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor Justin MacGregor as Head of Discipline of Film, School of Creative Arts, from 3 June 2022 to 2 June 2025

CL/21-22/140 Revised Membership for Academic Integrity Working Group

The Council noted and approved the circulated memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies dated 2 March 2022

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts, this information is restricted.

Signed

Date

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings