

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 15 May 2013 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Registrar, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor M Junker-Kenny, Professor D Faas, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Davey, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor D Brennan, Professor J Nunn, Dr S Bloomfield, Dr A O'Gara, Professor J Ohlmeyer, Mr D Ferrick, Mr A McEwan, .
<i>Apologies</i>	Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Senior Tutor, Professor E O'Dell, Professor J Walsh, Professor G Watson, Professor J P Labrador, Professor A McNabola, Professor S Smith, Ms D Jones, Professor A Piesse, Ms S Leydon, Mr E Tebay, Mr S Maguire, Ms J Spillane, Academic Secretary, Chief Operating Officer.
<i>In attendance</i>	Acting Librarian, Secretary to the College, Ms O Sheehan.
<i>Observers</i>	Ms M Dee (GSU), Secretary to the Scholars (Ms A P Worrall).

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to agenda items. No such conflicts were declared.

CL/12-13/167 Minutes

Minutes of the meeting of 17 April 2013 were approved and signed.

CL/12-13/168 Matters Arising:

CL/12-13/143 (ii) The Provost reported that relevant academic staff of the four institutes committed to forming one of the national centres for Teacher Education had met on 3 May 2013. Dr O'Gara, who attended that meeting, further informed Council that the historic occasion had provided the first opportunity for academic staff from NCAD, MIE, and the Schools of Education in UCD and TCD to meet together to discuss the development of this dispersed institute. The meeting concentrated on two issues - the development of a vision for the institute and the potential for joint programmes, possibly in the postgraduate area. While acknowledging the significant challenges, particularly in HR and funding, that this new initiative presents the meeting was positive about the strengths each partner could bring to the new entity.

The Provost thanked Dr O’Gara for updating Council and noted the importance for the new institute in developing an innovative curriculum that brings benefit to the sector.

CL/12/-13/150 The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies drew Council’s attention to a memorandum, dated 14 May 2013, tabled. The memorandum synthesises discussions at Council on the work of the IUA Task Group on Admissions and sets out the statement of principles that are contained in the Task Group’s report.

‘The universities will work together to reduce the number of entry routes to the minimum number necessary for efficient and academically appropriate allocation of places to applicants. An entry route is necessary and should be maintained (or a new entry route established) if:

- *it is required to admit students to a broad area of study (e.g. arts, science, business, engineering)*
- *it is generally accepted that a separate entry route is required (e.g. music)*
- *it is required to admit students to a specific professional programme (e.g. nursing, journalism)*
- *it is required to ration places where there is a significant excess of demand over supply (e.g. physiotherapy, psychology).*
- *it is required to admit students to a small number of disciplines or fields of study which are identified and differentiated strategic priorities for the institution in question.*

Where denominated entry routes are required to ration places on highly specialised streams or pathways within programmes that have restricted capacity, universities will give consideration to whether selection to such streams should occur post-entry on the basis of results in first and/or second year examinations.

Universities will, in a collaborative and transparent process, revise their portfolio of entry routes guided by these principles with a view to completing the transition to the new approach at the earliest opportunity consistent with the need to ensure effective delivery of their portfolio of programmes.’

Council approved the statement of principles.

CL/12-13/148 The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies reported that at its meeting on 30 April 2013 the Undergraduate Studies Committee [USC/12-13/065] had expressed reservations about the practicalities of implementing Council’s decision for mandatory annual student evaluation of undergraduate modules and the additional workload this would impose on Schools, both in terms of administration of surveys and a requirement on the Head of School to discuss the results of each survey with individual lecturers. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies welcomed the decision to introduce student evaluation of programmes which will seek to capture feedback on the wider experience of student learning. An implementation plan, attempting to address the concerns of the Committee, will be brought back to the Undergraduate Studies Committee. Council reaffirmed its decision that there should be in place a system of mandatory and comparable evaluation of undergraduate modules.

CL/12-13/147 Following the last Council meeting the Faculty Executive and Heads of Student Services had been invited to consider the proposals for a new structure of

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Quality Committees, approved in principle by Council. The Assistant Academic Secretary, on behalf of the Dean of Students, reported that the Student Services Committee and the Heads of Student Services have no objection to the proposals as they affect their areas of responsibility. The Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences reported that the Faculty Executive had not been enthusiastic about the proposal and saw it merely as a 'box-ticking' exercise requiring more work on the part of Schools. His own personal view, articulated in the earlier discussion, was that implementation would involve a significant change in how Faculty and School Executives operate. The Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science reported similar concerns from his Faculty Executive. The Heads of School felt the proposal addressed process rather than quality improvement and suggested that it would bring no more benefit than the existing external examiners' reports. The Health Sciences Faculty Executive has not yet had an opportunity to discuss the proposal but the Dean reported that, in informal conversations, similar points had been made and that more consideration should be given to the methodology and resourcing.

The Provost suggested that, given that successful implementation of the proposed structure of Quality Committees is dependent on the Faculty Executives, a further iteration on the structure of Quality Committees should be brought back to Council in due course.

CL/12-13/169 Provost's Report

The Provost informed Council that as the next meeting is the last of this academic year he would use the opportunity to provide a substantive review of the year.

CL/12-13/170 Undergraduate Course Proposals

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies introduced two proposals for accreditation of undergraduate courses provided by the Royal Irish Academy of Music - the Bachelor in Music Performance and the Bachelor in Music Composition. Both proposals have the support of the School of Drama, Film and Music and the Faculty Dean.

The Director of the Royal Irish Academy of Music, Dr Deborah Kelleher, had presented both courses to the Undergraduate Studies Committee at its meeting on 28 March 2013. The meeting had approved both courses and had noted that they were a continuation of the existing strong links with the RIAM. The courses were then sent for external review by Professor Mist Thorkelsdottir of the Iceland Academy of the Arts and received favourable review. Professor Thorkelsdottir described the Bachelor in Music Performance as having a particular strength in allowing composition students opportunities to have their works performed by students and professional musicians. She regarded the learning outcomes for the Bachelor in Music Composition as comparable to other similar courses across Europe. Initially, she had some concern that the programme had an overly traditional approach but these were addressed by the RIAM. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies noted that students on these courses are required to complete a dissertation or similar piece of independent research - reiterating the research-inspired approach to teaching. Council will be aware that a second stream of the Associated Colleges Degrees Committee has been set up to manage the operational issues of this new relationship with the RIAM, including the appointment of external examiners. In earlier discussions [CL/12-13/124] Council had noted the benefit students from the RIAM could bring to the

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

College community, including student societies. The Registrar reported that the department of Music and the RIAM have recently held very fruitful conversations about developing synergies between their activities and the Vice-President for Global Relations reported that in a recent visit to China by both institutions Trinity had benefited from the close relationship between the two and she looked forward to a deepening relationship.

Council approved the Bachelor in Music Performance and the Bachelor in Music Composition undergraduate courses for accreditation with effect from 2013/14.

CL/12-13/171 Trinity Education

The Provost invited the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies to introduce the document 'The Trinity Education', 7 May 2013, circulated. The discussion document is a first iteration of a definition and articulation of the core principles surrounding the undergraduate curriculum and will, in time, inform the next Strategic Plan. As part of the preparation of the document, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies has been visiting Schools to learn more about the delivery of undergraduate programmes and to hear examples of best practice. It is clear that there is much innovation going on at the point of delivery. He noted, for example, Senior Freshman students in Chemistry who work in groups on an independent piece of research which is then presented to secondary schools students; how some Schools develop communication skills by requiring Senior Sophisters to make presentations based on their dissertations as part of the assessment. For Schools with a professional accreditation requirement curriculum review and consideration of how assessment delivers learning outcomes is a regular process.

The document builds explicitly on the 2003 Final Report of the Working Group on Teaching and Learning developed by Professor Sheila Greene. Unfortunately, some of the excellent recommendations of that report remain to be fully implemented and many will be revisited now - not just to reaffirm the aspirations but to be used as the basis for a full engagement with the College community on what we mean by the 'Trinity Education' and the development, and implementation, of policies that support our educational objectives. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies proposes to hold a number of town hall meetings in Michaelmas Term 2013, similar to those on assessment held in 2012, as part of this engagement. Part 1 of the document attempts to summarise the Trinity Education, setting out the distinctiveness of the undergraduate curriculum, emphasising the development of specialist expertise in tandem with a range of generic transferable skills. The document then goes on in Part 2 to outline the long tradition of excellence in teaching and notes that a commitment to research-inspired teaching is not a recent one. Part 3 suggests a number of specific recommendations to be discussed as part of developing the final policy. These will be developed in conjunction with other initiatives under development, for example in innovation and entrepreneurship and in online learning and recognising that student learning happens in a wider context than just the classroom.

In the discussion that followed Council members congratulated the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies on the work to date and endorsed his approach to developing the definition and policies to support the undergraduate curriculum. The following points were made:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

- a definition of what is meant by research-inspired or research-led teaching should be provided
- that research-led teaching is not just a part of Senior Sophister teaching
- that there are not sufficient mechanisms in place to learn from each other about different teaching practices and innovations
- that Schools are delivering the distinctiveness of a Trinity Education in an environment of constantly diminishing resources
- that the levels of available resource are affecting individual students differently. For example, in some programmes 'small group' teaching means five to six students, in other programmes it means 30-40 students
- that in a globally competitive market it is essential that the curriculum has a global fluency and best international practice should be examined
- that involving students in the debate would be beneficial
- that compared to European universities students have low contact hours so there would be scope to introduce, for example, more European languages into curricula
- that there may be potential to involve more inter-student/inter-class teaching and learning
- that consultation with end-users is an invaluable component of curriculum review
- that there is a substantial administrative burden in formalising curriculum design and review

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies agreed that to date we have not been good at sharing examples of good practice and part of the discussion will involve considering how this might be done better - for example by using the expertise of recipients of the Provost's Teaching Awards and by highlighting good practice in recruitment material. He acknowledged the important role of peer learning and that it would be useful to seek feedback from alumni and recent graduates on their preparedness for employment. Both the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies and the Dean of Research agreed that research-led teaching does not just mean that students have access to staff who are research-active, but that there is a deep involvement in the research process - in articulating research questions, in testing hypotheses, in reporting and in bringing knowledge to practice. The objective of research-inspired teaching is to promote creativity and innovation to develop future social leaders. The Vice-President for Global Relations pointed to the experience of the University of Waterloo, Canada, where innovation is embedded into the undergraduate curriculum.

Council provisionally approved the document and looked forward to a progress report next academic year after it has been discussed in various College committees and fora.

CL/12-13/172 Postgraduate Course Proposal - Course for Validation - Doctorate of Music in Performance

The Dean of Graduate Studies spoke to a memorandum, dated 7 May 2013, circulated, seeking approval for accreditation of a Doctorate of Music in Performance (level 10) offered by the Royal Irish Academy of Music. The proposal has the support of the School of Drama, Film and Music and has been approved by the Graduate Studies Committee. The programme has been offered since 2006 and has a distinguished cohort

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

of graduates. The key distinguishing feature of the Doctorate is that it develops the capacity of candidates to make a contribution to the advancement of knowledge of professional practice in their own field. It is a full-time, four-year programme consisting of taught modules and a research-based dissertation and five hours of recitals, with external assessment. The course was sent for external review by Professor Anthony De Ritis of Northeastern University who described it as a well-thought out programme, delivered to a very high level with highly-accomplished faculty. This is the first doctorate substantially based on performance to be awarded by the University of Dublin and the Dean of Graduate Studies drew Council's attention to the purpose and objectives of the Doctorate as articulated on page 6 of the circulated document. At present there is no exit award from the Doctorate, in line with existing structures for professional doctorates. Accordingly, the Dean of Graduate Studies asked Council members to disregard the reference to the Master of Performance in Music on page 10. As noted in the discussion on the undergraduate course [CL12/13—above], the Associated Colleges Degrees Committee will be responsible for managing the relationship and quality assurance, including the appointment of external examiners. The Provost suggested that as this is the first degree of its kind learning outcomes for a performance doctorate should be developed.

Council approved the Doctorate of Music in Performance for accreditation with effect from 2013/14.

CL/12-13/173 Any Other Urgent Business

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies informed Council that the Dean of Students and Senior Tutor are representing College at a workshop on student retention organised by the IUA and hosted by College being held at the same time as this Council meeting.

SECTION B

CL/12-13/174 Graduate Studies Committee

The Dean of Graduate Studies drew Council's attention to minute GS/12-13/41. She thanked those who had nominated candidates and those involved in assessing candidates for the Trinity Teaching Award for Postgraduate Studies. Five candidates will be presented with their awards shortly and the Dean described the calibre of applications as excellent, demonstrating the positive influence postgraduate students have on the undergraduate curriculum. The Provost thanked the Dean of Graduate Studies for initiating this Award. Council approved the draft Minutes of the Graduate Studies Committee of 25 April 2013.

CL/12-13/175 Human Resources Committee

Council approved the draft Minutes of the Human Resources Committee of 11 February 2013 (reconvened on 6 March 2013).

CL/12-13/176 Quality Committee

Council approved the draft Minutes of the Quality Committee of 21 March 2013.

CL/12-13/177 Research Committee

The Dean of Research drew Council's attention to minute RS/12-13/65 on the development of an innovation and entrepreneurship strategy which is currently being developed with input from an international advisory panel. The strategy will be brought to Council in due course. An early draft for a Trinity Translational Medicine Institute was discussed [RS/12-13/63] and a further developed proposal, which will bring coherence to existing activities will revert to the Research Committee. The Provost congratulated the Dean of Research on the successful launch of a student incubator, LaunchBox, which will support six student teams for a period of three months to develop their ideas into potential business ventures. LaunchBox is philanthropically supported by Trinity Angels - a network of entrepreneurs and angel investors who are willing to support fledgling student ventures [RS/12-13/61]. Council approved the draft Minutes of the Research Committee of 30 April 2013.

CL/12-13/178 Undergraduate Studies Committee

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies drew Council's attention to the request from the School of Nursing to change the title of the BSc (Cur.) strand in Psychiatric Nursing to Mental Health Nursing from 2014/15 [USC-12-13/072] (see CL/12-13/ 186). The Undergraduate Studies Committee had noted that although there are more female than male undergraduate students, more male than female students present for Scholarship examinations. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies undertook to further explore this issue in the next academic year [USC/12-13/064]. Council approved the draft Minutes of the Undergraduate Studies Committee of 30 April 2013.

SECTION C**CL/12-13/179 Membership of the University Council - Senate Representation**

The Council noted that the Senate representatives on Council would be as follows:

- (i) 2013-2014 Dr A O'Gara;
- (ii) 2013-2015 Ms D Alexander.

CL/12-13/180 Schedule of Council and Board Meetings 2013-2014

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 23 April 2013 (approved by Board on 1 May 2013).

CL/12-13/181 Meetings of Council to interview for professorial appointments

The Council noted that the Council will meet as follows:

- (i) Seamus Heaney Professor of Irish Writing - Thursday 23 May 2013 from 1400;
- (ii) Professor of Zoology - Tuesday, 18 June 2013, 1100-1230;
- (iii) Loyola Professor of Catholic Theology - Tuesday 25 June 2013.

CL/12-13/182 Higher Degrees by Research Alone –Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 17 April 2013 and noted by Board on 1 May 2013.

PhD Ikarastika Rahayu Abdul Wahab; Joanne Adam; Olabisi Adigun; Laura Marie Byrne; Donal Carney; Michael Patrick Collins; Ross Comerford; Marion Dalvai; Evelyn Marie Doherty; Joseph Doyle; Ruth Maureen Doyle; Derek Edward Dunne; Katelyn Ferguson; Robin Frauenlob; Philip Geheber; Niall Antoin Gillespie; Emma Kathryn Howard; Kathy Kipp; Julia Matz; Mukaya Jean Mbombo; Terence John McDonald; Kristian Kari McGlenn; Gerard Joseph McGranaghan; Mairead McGrath; Niall McInerney; Luke McNally; Kathleen Miller; Muhammad Inam Mirza; Lorraine Marion Murray; Aine Ni Mhaolain; Conor Mark O’Toole; Heather Julie Quinn; Andrea Raganelli; David Patrick Reid; Roseanne Sheila Reilly; Stephan Schlögl; Alan James Smyth; Melanie Bettina Spath; Tara Louise Sweeney; Anita Monika Umerska.

MLitt Lisa Naomi Spencer.

MSc Aoife Foley; Ciara McNamee; Aoife Catherine Nic Chraith; Aurelie Cindy Julie Stallivieri; Ash Nicolas Watson.

DEd Mary Patricia Slevin.

CL/12-13/183 External Examiners

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 8 May, 2013.

CL/12-13/184 Registrar of the Law School

The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor R Walsh as Registrar of the Law School for 2013-2014.

CL/12-13/185 School Directors

The Council noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) **Business (2013-2014)**
Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor M Fellenz (extension for one further year).
- (ii) **Computer Science and Statistics (2013-2015)**
Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor S Wilson (second term).
- (iii) **Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies (2013-2015)**
Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor A Fitzpatrick
Director of Research: Professor C Ruthner (third term, approved by the Dean of Research)
- (iv) **Law (2013-2014)**
Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor O Doyle;
Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor A W E Schuster;
Director of Research: Professor B Clarke.

- (v) **Natural Sciences (2013-2014)**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor M E Hennessy;
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor A Davies;
 Director of Research: Professor A Jackson.
- (vi) **Nursing and Midwifery (2013-2014)**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor A-M Brady;
 Director of International Initiatives: Professor N Elliott.
- (vii) **Social Work and Social Policy (2013-2015)**
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate) Professor G Kirwan;
 Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor S Holt.

CL/12-13/186 School of Nursing and Midwifery - Change in title of 'Psychiatric Nursing Discipline and Psychiatric Nursing BSc (Cur) strand to 'Mental Health Nursing'
 The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the School Administrator, School of Nursing and Midwifery, circulated, dated 24 April 2013.

CL/12-13/187 Committees

- (i) **Personal Chairs Subcommittee**
 The Council noted that Professor D Taylor, Professor S O'Mara and Professor B Clarke would replace Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor M Radomski and Professor J Nunn for 2012-2013 and two further years thereafter;
- (ii) **Senior Academic Promotions Committee**
 The Council noted that Professor A Chahoud (Histories and Humanities) and Professor D Murray (Engineering) would continue as members of the committee for 2012-2013 and two further years thereafter.

CL/12-13/188 Personal Chair - Title

The Council noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 29 April 2013 and approved that Professor G Watson's title should be: Professor of Theoretical Chemistry.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed

Date

