

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 21 November 2012 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Dean of Graduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Research, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor E O'Dell, Professor M Junker-Kenny, Professor D Faas, Professor J Walsh, Professor G Watson, Professor G Davey, Professor D Brennan, Professor S Smith, Professor J Nunn, Dr S Bloomfield, Dr A O'Gara, Professor A Piesse, Mr D Ferrick, Ms S Leydon, Mr S Maguire, Mr A McEwan, Ms J Spillane.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor J P Labrador, Professor A McNabola, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor T Connor, Ms D Jones, Professor J Ohlmeyer, Mr E Tebay, Secretary to the Scholars (Mr T O'Connor), Academic Secretary, Chief Operating Officer.
<i>In attendance</i>	Librarian, Secretary to the College, Ms O Sheehan.
<i>Observer</i>	Ms M Dee (GSU).
<i>By invitation</i>	Professor H Rice (Chair, Human Resources Committee) for CL/12-13/054.

SECTION A

**CL/12-13/047 Minutes**

Minutes of the meeting of 24 October were approved and signed following the requested amendments:

- (i) to record the Dean of Research's presence;
- (ii) CL/12-13/034: line 4, amend to read 'The Calendar entry covering representation *was* redrafted to make clear ... Following this session the form for submitting appeal *will be* reviewed ...'

**CL/12-13/048 Matters Arising**

**CL/12-13/024**

- (i) Following the Senior Tutor's concerns that there were students unable to register because of delays in decision-making, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies reported that of the 75 cases granted medical repeat status, 36 had registered by 24 October 2012 and 39 are eligible to register. The Senior Tutor and Dean of Students replied that there are still students unable to register for a variety of reasons, including the delay in the payment of local authority grants.

- (ii) The College Secretary reported that although text has been received as recently as yesterday the expected timescale for production of hard copy of the Calendar remains unchanged.

**CL/12-13/025** Council will be aware that the Minister for Education and Skills has accepted the recommendation of the Report on the Structure of Initial teacher Education that Trinity join with UCD, Marino Institute of Education and the National College of Art and Design to form one of the six national centres for teacher education. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that the four institutions have agreed to form a task force to consider how best to progress a virtual, research-based institute for teacher education. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Professor of Education will represent Trinity. As part of the consideration of the Reviewer's Report the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer met the School of Education, together with the Faculty Dean, for a useful discussion. The School expressed its support for a single institute - with appropriate governance, located in a university setting, and with a research-led curriculum. A Council member queried the position of other colleges of education that traditionally have close links with Trinity. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer replied that the International Reviewers' Report is clear about what the constellations should be and that Trinity is only considering the recommendations as they apply to us. The Registrar further elaborated that her understanding is that the Church of Ireland College of Education is working towards a closer relationship with other institutions. Trinity College is sorry to lose its long-standing relationship with the CICE but respects the decision of the CICE's Board of Governors. Professor Walsh of the School of Education thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer for her summary of the School's concerns and expressed the School's regret about the CICE's decision to end the relationship.

**CL/12-13/026** Council was informed that Board accepted the recommendations of the Review of the Scholarship Examination with the added stipulation that Schools/courses should not inform candidates of the outcome before the formal announcement on Trinity Monday. The report has been circulated to Heads of School and Directors of Teaching and Learning (UG).

**CL/12-13/027** The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies informed Council that plans are underway for the public launch of the feasibility study in undergraduate admissions and that the Dean of Admissions in Harvard has accepted an invitation to attend. The Provost suggested that when the results of the feasibility study are being reported the concerns raised by Council members should be addressed.

#### **CL/12-13/049 Provost's Report**

The Provost informed Council that, at a meeting with the Minister for Education and Skills, he highlighted what he sees as the dangers of the proposed amendment to the Universities Act 1997 (CL12-13/025 (ii)). The Minister has undertaken to reflect on the points made by the Provost but has made clear that there are aspects of the governance of higher education institutions that concern him. If they are not addressed through the proposed amendment the Minister will be seeking to do so through other means. The Provost expects that this was the first of a series of conversations on the issue. Representatives from the Students' Union and the Graduate Students' Union reported that their councils had passed motions opposing the proposed amendment.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The HEA has published individual institutions' 'Landscape' documents, the International Expert Panel's report 'A Proposed Reconfiguration of the Irish System of Higher Education', and its own report 'Institutional Responses to the Landscape Document and Achieving the Objectives of the National Strategy for Higher Education: A Gap Analysis' very recently. Institutional meetings with the HEA have not yet been confirmed but Council will be kept informed, and will have the opportunity to comment when the HEA's response to our own document is available.

#### CL/12-13/050 Quality

##### (i) Quality Review of the E3 Strategy

The Provost introduced The Review of Strategy for E3 - the Engineering, Energy and Environment Institute, 13 November 2012, circulated. The report presents the outcome of an external review of the strategy for E3 - the Trinity Institute for Engineering, Energy and the Environment. E3 will integrate research and teaching activities of the Schools of Natural Science and Engineering. The Schools have developed a common strategy for research, teaching and innovation in the area. Within College this is a new approach to collaboration which presents a real opportunity for a world-class development based on complementary expertise. The reviewers describe the inclusion of staff from both Schools as 'a distinctive and highly innovative development' and saw 'potential for E3 to impact positively and significantly on a range of major issues important for Ireland and for the planet'. It is expected that the Institute will be a powerful lever to secure external funding supporting the academic mission. The Dean of Research elaborated further on the reviewers' recommendations, particularly their strong support for the development of the south-east corner site to accommodate the physical consolidation of the Schools' teaching and research activities. He noted that Council's acceptance of the report will begin the process leading to an exciting new development - both academic and physical. The Dean of Research commended both Schools on their deep engagement with the project to deliver an ambitious and realistically achievable vision. In response to a query about student involvement in the discussions the Dean of Research said that he was aware that working groups had been set up but did not have details of the membership of the groups. The Provost encouraged the student representatives at Council to participate in the discussion. The Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences described this as a very exciting proposal to integrate teaching, research and innovation. He wondered if the Dean of Research had considered what the appropriate governance structures for E3 would be considering those for existing TRIs. The Dean of Research agreed that the inclusion of teaching made E3 very distinct from TRIs but he expects that the governance structure will be derived from that for TRIs and this will be addressed during implementation.

Council accepted the Provost's recommendations for the next steps in planning this development to house the E3 Institute:

- (a) The Heads of School for Natural Sciences and Engineering, working closely with the Dean of Research, and other relevant Academic Officers, should consider the detailed recommendations of the Review

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

- Report and draw up an implementation plan in line with College's capital projects framework - to be approved.
- (b) The Steering Group for the development of the E3 proposal - in consultation with the relevant College Officers - should continue to develop and streamline the documentation and overall vision of the project to engage with, and appeal to, an external audience. In this regard, consultation should also be sought from key external policy makers and industrialists.
  - (c) In consultation with the Trinity Foundation a detailed future funding strategy is developed with specific reference to potential international linkages in order to support and sustain the broader vision. This is to consider funding opportunities, which would support the future appointment of senior staff to help realise E3's potential as a 'world reference point for research, teaching and innovation.'
  - (d) The Senior Lecturer and Dean of Graduate Studies engage with the Schools of Natural Sciences and Engineering in relation to further developing innovative teaching and learning programmes, within E3, informed by the development of the Trinity education strategy.
- (ii) **School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences**  
 The Faculty Dean introduced the progress report, dated 9 November 2012. He described the Reviewer's original report and the School's response as exemplary. Most of the recommendations have been implemented. Within the Faculty the School is taking a lead role in developing a workload allocation model. Those recommendations that have not been implemented fall outside the remit of the School - such as the funding strategy for the Centre for Deaf Studies. The Centre currently benefits from ring-fenced funding from the HEA. The Faculty Dean understands that College has taken steps to ensure the fuller integration of deaf staff into all aspects of College life. Council approved the progress report from the School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences.

#### CL/12-13/051 Mid-Term Review of the Strategic Plan

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer spoke to her memorandum, 12 November 2012, which introduced the Mid-Term Review of Strategic Plan 2009-2014. She thanked all those who have contributed and noted that its structure mirrors that of the Strategic Plan 2009-2014. Where specific targets were set in the Strategic Plan the Mid-Term Review reports on progress and the narrative highlights significant features since 2009 and under the new Provostship. It incorporates Board-approved recent initiatives such as the Global Relations Strategy and START. The core message of the Mid-Term Review is that

- we now inhabit a very different financial and political environment from that pertaining at the time of the Strategic Plan's development;
- we are developing pragmatic and strategic responses to this changed environment focussing on income generation through the Global Relations Strategy, philanthropy and commercialisation;
- we continue to achieve at a high level, notwithstanding the challenges in sustaining our core mission of teaching and research; and
- our core sustainability is now in sharp relief and is the focus of all our current planning.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer drew Council's attention to Figures 1 and 2 which illustrate staff:student ratios. Figure 2 compares our ratios to UK comparators. While King's College London has been able to maintain its ratio at about 1:11 from 2007/08 to 2010/2011 and the University of Edinburgh has reduced its to 1:14 in 2010/2011, Trinity's staff:student ratio was 1:17 in 2010/2011. Figure 1 demonstrates that the impact of declining state funding on staff:student ratios has been mitigated significantly by the application of non-exchequer income to employ additional academic staff, such as the Ussher lecturers. The increase in direct funding supplementing the state grant is clearly demonstrated in Figure 3.

A Council member asked if there had been objectives of the Strategic Plan 2009-2014 which had been abandoned or paused. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer said where projects had been redefined (such as building a student centre, see Action 4.1) this had been noted in the Mid-Term Review. She believes that the tone of the Mid-Term Review makes clear that the original level of ambition in the Strategic Plan has had to be moderated in the context of the changed external environment. Nonetheless College continues to achieve many of its objectives. Minor suggested amendments to the Review included consistency in the use of the title Trinity Academic Medical Centre and highlighting, in a broad way, new initiatives in quality assurance and continuous professional development. The alignment of thematic research areas and academic units, including TRIs', is illustrated in an important diagram on page 36. The Dean of Research commented that the diagram shows that College has used its resources well - the focus is now on sustainability. The Dean of Students suggested that, it would be timely to develop a clear strategy on space usage - both from the perspective of planning new capital projects and ensuring full utilisation of existing space - before work starts on the formulation of the next Strategic Plan.

The Mid-Term Review 2012 will now proceed to Board for final discussion. The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and staff in the Office of the Vice-Provost for their work in its preparation.

#### **CL/12-13/052 Annual Report of the Dean of Research, 2010-2011**

The Dean of Research introduced the 2010-2011 Annual Report, circulated. This is only the second ever Annual Report from the Dean of Research and he would welcome feedback from Council members on what information they would like to see in future Annual Reports. For this Report he had asked Schools/TRIs to highlight their research achievements in 2010-11, giving a stronger qualitative report. Chapter 4 of the Report reports on bibliometric data. Although Trinity's research impact continues to be very high, we have lost the lead nationally in terms of numbers of citations. While the number of publications has increased significantly since 2002, the current trend, as reflected in the RSS, is a levelling-off or decrease in publication outputs across all publication types. Data in the RSS shows a drop in peer-reviewed journal papers and a similar trend for books and especially peer-reviewed conference papers. This is a cause of some concern although the latter may be explained by a focus on other forms of publication. The Dean of Research emphasised, once again, that overall impact is very high but that it will be necessary to continually monitor our comparative position. There has been a steady increase in the number of research outputs deposited in TARA, as required by the Open Access Publications Policy, and it is expected that this continued growth will improve the ratio of cited to uncited publications (63:37 %).

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

Chapter 3 of the Annual Report considers intellectual property and demonstrates the continued strong performance in terms of Technology Transfer outputs - 60 invention disclosures received in 2010-11 (45 in 2009-10). An issue for consideration is the cost of patent applications - €0.5m in 2010/2011 - especially as State support for patent costs is declining. Nationally, Trinity has contributed 21.8% of the spin-out companies formed under the Technology Transfer Strengthening Initiative programme, 2007-2011.

Chapter 2 addresses research income and research accounts. In 2011 Trinity earned €91.7m in research income, an increase of nearly 7% on 2010. While we are maintaining a healthy portfolio of research accounts it is to be expected that research income will decrease. There is a risk in the fact that of approximately 800 academic staff, only 383 held research accounts and our research income is highly dependent on a small number of researchers. While the number of research contracts awarded in 2010/2011 was 557 (444 in 2009/2010) the complexity of research contracts, many requiring co-funding or multi-party participation, is increasing. There has been a decline in the number of research applications but an increase in the number of applications for European funding, reflecting an increasing trend towards overcoming the reliance on Irish funding and diversification of funding streams.

Important policy developments have been (i) the successful pilot of the Research Proposals and Awards Management System (RPAMS); (ii) that Research Fellows/Senior Research Fellows and Contract Lecturing Staff may now apply as PIs for research funding under certain conditions; (iii) encouraging and facilitating increased participation in competitive research funding; and (iv) the introduction of new procedures for approval of and reporting by research centres.

A speaker congratulated the Dean of Research on the detailed report. He would, however, like to have seen the policy on overheads addressed, particularly now that it appears that redundancy payments will be charged to School overheads. Although this issue is not part of the Annual Report, the Dean of Research clarified that there is a College-approved policy on the retention of overheads centrally to meet the cost of core services. Individual Schools and TRIs may then have separate policies on how their overheads are treated and how individual researchers may access them. There is no doubt that provision for redundancy costs needs to be made. College policy is that where possible redundancy costs should be charged directly to research grants; however many funding agencies do not accept such costs as direct costs of research in which case they may be charged to the School the activity relates to. The representative of the research staff welcomed the extension of those eligible to apply for research grants but suggested that this policy needs further dissemination to Heads of School. The Dean of Research undertook to monitor the take-up of this policy.

The Provost thanked the Dean of Research and his colleagues for this comprehensive report. He noted the importance of the contribution from all staff to maintaining Trinity's position as a top-ranking research university.

**CL/12-13/053 Graduate Studies - Course Proposal - Master in Fine Arts (Two New Strands - Stage Design and Theatre Directing)**

The Dean of Graduate Studies, spoke to the proposal for two new strands to the Master in Fine Arts, 13 November 2012, circulated, to be offered by The Lir - National Academy of Dramatic Art. The Master in Fine Arts has one existing strand in Playwriting and the two proposed strands will run parallel to this. The three will share a core module as well as some elective modules. The Master in Fine Arts (MFA) is the first of its kind in Ireland to provide professional training in all of the arts of the theatre at postgraduate level. In conjunction with the academic content, there is a strong practice-based element to the programme and the curriculum has been informed by practitioners. The proposals were approved by the Graduate Studies Committee and have been developed with the support of the School of Drama, Film and Music. The external reviewer described it as unique and as having the appropriate academic base while simultaneously making a genuine inroad into practitioner training. The two new strands will be a valuable complement to College's Initiative in Creative Arts, Technologies and Cultures and hence to the city of Dublin. The Dean of Graduate Studies presented the proposals to Council recommending their acceptance. The Faculty Dean endorsed the Dean of Graduate Studies' recommendation noting, too, that the course has potential for international student recruitment. College's normal quality assurance procedures will apply and the Lir works in association with the Royal Academy of Dramatic Art (RADA). Appendix 5 of the proposal gives some financial details and the Dean of Graduate Studies clarified that the expenditure listed applies to The Lir's costs. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that the Treasurer's Office is formulating a new template to assess income from new courses, given that the RPM is no longer in operation. The Lir is not restricted by the Employment Control Framework and is committed to making the necessary appointments to support the course. In response to a query, the Dean of Graduate Studies confirmed the normal admission requirements: an upper second class honors primary degree, a portfolio and a successful interview. Council approved the proposals for two new strands to the Master in Fine Arts - Stage Design and Theatre Directing - for admission in 2013/14.

**CL/12-13/054 Proposal to Establish the Title Professor Emeritus/Emerita**

Professor Rice, Chair of the HR Committee, attended for this item and spoke to the memorandum, 5 November 2012, circulated. The background to the proposal is to provide an appropriate title, outside the adjunct titles, for retired academic staff who wish to continue their roles in teaching or research. While many are Fellow Emeriti this title is not widely understood outside of College. It is proposed that candidates who wish to be awarded the title should present a written case for the award of the title Professor Emeritus/Emerita to the Provost. The title will accrue no additional privileges and hence the proposal has no resource implications. The initiative for applying for the title must come from the individual and he/she must previously have been on the Professor or Associate Professor grade. After some discussion Council agreed that these appointments should be renewable. In response to a query from the Senior Tutor the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer said that this proposal is just one of a number of initiatives being developed on how College engages with retired staff who remain active. It may be that a further proposal on a title for other academic staff who continue to teach and research is forthcoming. Council accepted the proposal to establish the title Professor Emeritus/Emerita as an appropriate mechanism to recognise the contribution of retired staff who contribute to teaching or research.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

**CL/12-13/055 Any Other Urgent Business**

There was no other urgent business.

**SECTION B****CL/12-13/056 Graduate Studies Committee**

Council approved the draft Minutes of the meeting of the Graduate Studies Committee of 1 November. The Dean of Graduate Studies informed Council that the Innovation Alliance Steering Group has approved Queen's University Belfast as a partner in the Innovation Academy. This new relationship will foster cross-border doctoral researcher mobility, inter-institutional sharing of modules in innovation and entrepreneurship and shared access to contacts, entrepreneurs and spin-out companies. A memorandum from the Dean, 13 November 2012, was circulated with the papers. Council welcomed the addition of QUB to the Innovation Academy and approved the arrangements proposed.

**CL/12-13/057 Human Resources Committee**

The draft Minutes of the meeting of 16 October 2012 were noted and approved.

**CL/12-13/058 Undergraduate Studies Committee**

- (i) The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies drew Council's attention to student volunteers who had agreed to become Trinity Ambassadors and assist student recruitment from their home counties. Over 170 responses had been received to an invitation to take on this role. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies is representing College on a 'Task Force on University Entry and Selection' chaired by Dr Philip Nolan, the President of NUI Maynooth. The Task Force's report will be brought to Council next term. Council noted and approved the draft Minutes of the meeting of 30 October 2012
- (ii) Council noted and approved the revised terms of reference and membership of the Undergraduate Studies Committee.

**CL/12-13/059 Research Committee**

The Dean of Research informed Council that an implementation plan for the Ranking Strategy is being implemented. The Research Committee considered a research funding development strategy and it is expected that the appointment of six locally-based Research Programme Officers will greatly benefit those applying for research funding. The posts have been part-funded by the relevant Schools. The Research Committee approved proposals for four research centres - two of which formalise existing activity and two of which are linked to thematic research areas and have significant cross-faculty involvement. Council noted and approved the draft Minutes of the Research Committee of 16 October 2012.

**CL/12-13/060 Academic Appeals Committee for Graduate Students (Research)**

Council noted and approved the draft Minutes of the meeting of 31 October 2012.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*



## SECTION C

**CL/12-13/061 Council Minutes - Correction to Minutes of 13 June 2012**

The Council noted and approved a correction to minute CL/12-13/208 (iv): Heads of Discipline - Electronic and Electrical Engineering: the term of office of Professor J B Foley to be amended to 2012-2015.

**CL/12-13/062 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners**

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 24 October 2012 and noted by Board on 7 November 2012, as circulated:

**(i) Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**DEd** Michael Joseph Dayton.

**DDentCh** Nadiya Ali Al-Kindi; Michael Freedman; Evelina Kratunova; Una Aine Lally; Jennifer McCafferty; Justin Moloney.

**MD** Cathal James Collins; John Paul Anthony O'Connor; Abdul Zaheer.

**(ii) Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**PhD** Muntaz Abu Bakar; Anna Baldycheva; Adriana Bunea; Gerald Paul Byrne; Ricardo Simon Carbajo; Darragh Crowley; Anne Davis; Sarah Donnelly; Caoimhe Maire Rois Fahy; Stephen Fitzgerald; Louise Gallagher; James Michael Gallen; Jane Humphries; Mary Geraldine Keyes; Tommy Kyaw Tun; Robert Lennox; Caitriona McKeever; Ellen O'Carroll; Ian Brian O'Keeffe; Francesco Pilla; Colman Patrick Ross; Jarlath Varley; Julie Walsh; Patrick Michel Wulliamoz; Monika Zawadzka.

**MSc** Kalle Koirpela.

**MLitt** Rebecca Halpin.

**CL/12-13/063 Title of Personal Chair**

The Council noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 5 November 2012 and approved the title of Professor D C Williams's appointment to be 'Professor of Chemical Biology'.

**CL/12-13/064 Deanship - Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science**

The Council noted and approved the appointment of Professor D C Williams as Dean of the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science from 1 January 2013 to 30 June 2015.

**CL/12-13/065 Head of School - Mathematics 2012-2015**

The Council noted that the Board approved the nomination of Professor S M Ryan as Head of School of Mathematics, 2012-2015 at its meeting of 7 November 2012.

**CL/12-13/066 School Directors**

The Council noted the following nominations:

- (i) **Mathematics**
  - (a) Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Professor R Timoney, 2012-2013;
  - (b) Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Professor J Stalker, 2012-2015;
  - (c) Director of Research: Professor S Sint, 2012-2015.
- (ii) **Medicine**
  - Director of Research: Professor Y Volkov, 2012-2014

**CL/12-13/067 Research Centres**

The Council noted and approved the establishment of the following research centres, approved by the Research Committee on 16 October 2012:

- (i) Smart and Sustainable Cities Research Centre (Professor S Clarke);
- (ii) TrinityHaus Research Centre (Professor M Dyer);
- (iii) Trinity Academic Gastroenterology Group Research Centre (Professor B McMahan);
- (iv) Trinity Ageing Research Centre (Professor R A Kenny).

**CL/12-13/068 Proposal to amend entrance requirements for Professional Diploma in Stage Management and Technical Theatre**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from Head of the School of Drama, Film and Music, circulated, dated 12 November 2012.

**CL/12-13/069 Change in Course Title: Natural Sciences to Science**

Council approved the memorandum, circulated dated 14 November 2012 from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies following correction of a typographical error: the change in course title will come into effect from 2013/14.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed .....

Date .....