

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 14 March 2012 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Registrar, Senior Lecturer, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Associate Dean of Research, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor E O'Dell, Professor M Ó Siochrú, Professor Z Rodgers, Professor J Wickham, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor D O'Donovan, Professor J P Labrador, Professor A McNabola, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor D Brennan, Professor S Smith, Professor J Nunn, Ms D Jones, Professor A Piesse, Ms R Barry, Mr D Ferrick, Mr M McAndrew, Dr D Fitzgerald.
<i>Apologies</i>	Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Professor G Watson, Professor T Connor, Dr H Mannan, Dr A O'Gara, Professor J Ohlmeyer, Ms S Leydon, Ms L Aljohmani, Mr R J Smith, Mr B Roantree
<i>In attendance</i>	Librarian, Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Chief Operating Officer, Ms O Sheehan.
<i>By invitation</i>	Chair, Human Resources Committee (for CL/11-12/117).

SECTION A

**CL/11-12/113 Minutes**

Minutes of the meetings of 15 February 2012 were approved and signed.

**CL/11-12/114 Matters Arising:** There were no matters arising.

**CL/11-12/115 Provost's Report**

- (i) As noted at previous meetings, the HEA has requested higher education institutions to respond to the document 'Towards a future higher education landscape' by the end of July 2012. The strategy recommends regional clusters of higher education, which should deliver a coherent and well-coordinated system of higher education institutions and contribute to the realisation of national economic and social objectives. The Provost reported that he is convening a small group to formulate the College's response. Some smaller institutions in the Dublin region have already approached College with a request to explore possible collaborations. Any possible collaborations will

have to be beneficial to Trinity College as a whole and will require Council and Board approval. The Provost welcomed the proposed introduction of technological universities, but noted the importance of not diluting the funding of the third level education budget any further.

- (ii) The Minister for Education and Skills has informed the IUA of his intention to consider institutional governance as recommended in the National Strategy for Higher Education to 2030. He has asked that a detailed proposal on the composition of Academic Councils be brought forward. The Provost noted that the Royal Irish Academy had hosted a forum on the Hunt Report (May 2011) and the IUA had organised a conference on University Governance (March 2010). He expected discussion at both to feed into the response from the IUA to the Minister and he undertook to keep Council informed.
- (iii) The Provost reported that the HEA has recently issued a new Employment Control Framework (ECF), which will possibly require a further reduction in staff numbers. He noted that this would be a particular challenge given that we already have low staff numbers by international norms. College will be formulating a response to the HEA which will note the dangers of the continuing imposition of the ECF. Some members of Council expressed the view that College had accepted the restrictions of earlier versions of the ECF too readily and that the same approach should not be taken to the Landscape Document: both initiatives represent a threat to institutional autonomy. It was noted that, unlike other institutions, College has to-date operated within a balanced budget, and this is not recognised by the HEA. It was suggested that College should propose a focus on reducing costs rather than on a micromanagement of staff reduction targets. Performance in the past has already shown our success in managing resources. The Provost noted that the effects of the ECF have not been uniform across the sector, and that some institutions are better able to absorb reductions in staff numbers. While he respected the concerns expressed, the Provost noted the importance of managing the funding crisis while at the same time working to remove the restrictions placed on higher education institutions.

#### CL/11-12/116 Research Matters

The Provost welcomed the Associate Dean of Research, who presented this item, to this meeting of Council.

- (i) **Research Quality Metrics** A memorandum from the Dean of Research, dated 7 March 2012, was circulated with the papers. At its meeting in January 2012 the Research Committee considered the Research Quality Metrics proposed by the Working Group on Academic Freedom and adopted by Council (CL/10-11/032) and Board (BD/10-11/061). The Research Committee unanimously agreed that the reduced weighting for multi-author publications was inequitable and penalised disciplines which published exclusively by multi-author. For some Schools the reduction in the weighting made no difference but for a small number it had a considerable effect. The Research Committee considered the lower weighting of multi-author publications was contrary to the College's strategic aim to foster multidisciplinary research. The Research Committee requests Council to remove the clause in the Research Metrics policy document which assigns different weightings to multi-authored publications and to give all publications the same weighting.

In the discussion that followed a number of points were made:

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

- In earlier discussions Council had decided that it was important to maintain an institutional standard for research productivity rather than permit multiple models;
- The original intention had been to differentiate between 'team papers' and those with a small number of authors;
- The Executive of the Faculty of Health Sciences agreed with the proposal and noted that the conditions of some research grants require interdisciplinarity and thus multiple authors;
- The existing criteria recognised that different outputs required different types of work;
- The weighting discourages single-author research;
- Whatever the criteria, they should not encourage a lower level of research productivity than is actually the case.

The Provost concluded the discussion by noting that accepting this proposal would lower the level of activity required to be deemed research productive. As there was no agreement at Council, the proposal from the Dean of Research was not accepted.

- (ii) **Provost's Research Award** A memorandum from the Dean of Research dated 7 March 2012, was circulated with the papers. Introducing this item, the Associate Dean of Research invited Council to consider the proposal that a Provost's Research Award be instigated that would recognise colleagues who achieve a very high standard of excellence and productivity in research. The Research Award could be seen as mirroring the established Provost's Teaching Awards. At least one award would be made to an early career stage nominee. The announcement of the awards could be used as an occasion to showcase Trinity's research strengths.

In discussing the proposal, Council made the following points:

- Excellence in research is already recognised by the award of Fellowship and that any new award should not diminish the value of that honour;
- Research excellence should not be equated with research funding. The level of research funding available differs widely from discipline to discipline;
- The application for a Provost's Teaching Award requires significant input and could not be described as 'lightweight';
- An award of this type could help bolster morale and, if linked to achievements in recent years, could be clearly distinguished from election to Fellowship.

On balance Council welcomed the initiative, and invited the Dean of Research to develop the proposal further to include information on the criteria and nomination process for consideration. A full proposal should be brought back to a future meeting of Council for further consideration and approval.

#### CL/11-12/117 Academic Titles

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and Chair of Human Resources (HR) Committee, dated 2 March 2012 was circulated with the papers. The

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

Chair of HR Committee attended for this item. Council approved the recommendations of the Working Party on the Internationalisation of Academic Titles in June 2011 (CL/10-11/183). The Working Party met on a number of occasions during this academic year to consider issues arising from the implementation of this policy, and made the following recommendations:

- (i) All clinical titles (Clinical Professor, Clinical Senior Lecturer, Clinical Lecturer, Academic Consultant, Specialist Registrars and Lecturer Registrars) retain the previous nomenclature. These are unremunerated titles of esteem and are considered titles of national understanding. It is not viable to change them at this time.
- (ii) The title of Research Associate be discontinued with those in the category to be redefined as Visiting Academic, Visiting Research Fellow or Assistant or Adjunct Assistant Professor. Some changes in existing practice will be necessary to implement this proposal.
- (iii) A new usage of the title of Lecturer is proposed to cover short-term early career appointments with teaching responsibilities.

The Chair of HR Committee brought Council through the document noting that adjunct titles should be awarded to those whose primary employer is not Trinity. It was clarified that the appointment of a Research Professor is not necessarily a permanent one and is clearly linked to considerable funding being able to support both it and a research team. The title of Senior Research Fellow is considered on a competitive basis and such staff members are permitted to act as primary supervisors of postgraduate students.

Discussion concentrated on the usage of the title Lecturer. It was recognised that externally the title carries the expectation of a research portfolio while under the new nomenclature it would be reserved for teaching appointments only. Council agreed that the title of Teaching Fellow would be more appropriate for this role.

The document Academic Titles in Trinity College Dublin (27 February 2012) was approved subject to this change. It was noted that amendments to the Statutes would now be necessary.

#### CL/11-12/118 Statutes

The Registrar introduced the document by noting that Board had established a Schedules Working Party to complete the process of revising the Schedules associated with the Consolidated Statutes adopted in 2010. It is expected that further revised Schedules will be presented to Council during the course of this academic year.

- (i) **Standing Orders of the University Council** The Registrar advised that this item had been postponed to the next meeting of Council to allow members sufficient time to consider it.
- (ii) **Student Conduct** A memorandum from the Registrar, dated 8 March 2012, had been circulated. The Schedules Working Party has undertaken a fundamental and comprehensive revision of the Schedules relating to Student Conduct to address many issues that have arisen in practice with the existing Schedules. This revision will require some amendments to the Statutes, in particular to the Chapter on Student Conduct. The objectives of the revised Schedules are to clarify the various powers to suspend students and to provide

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

for appropriate rights of appeal against decisions to suspend students. During formulation of the revisions other issues arose, such as the need to ensure appropriate treatment for students, particularly with respect to mental health and disability, and the development of a section on students' best interests. At present suspension of students may result from a decision of the Junior Dean, from the Senior Lecturer, or arising from the Fitness to practice Policy. The existing rights of appeal are in many cases unclear. The Schedules Working Party suggests rationalising these powers and to provide a clear method of appeal. A Student Conduct Committee is proposed, which would subsume the existing Student Discipline Committee and would also hear automatic appeals against decisions to suspend students. The Registrar noted that the Schedules Working Party has consulted widely, over a two-year period, on the document circulated.

Dr O'Dell brought Council through the details of the document and pointed to the new title of the Statute - the Chapter on Student Conduct and Capacity - which the Schedules Working Party feels more appropriately reflects the wide range of matters considered. Section 1 of the Chapter introduces student conduct and capacity and establishes the Student Conduct Committee. The procedures for the Student Conduct Committee incorporate experience from the existing Disciplinary Committee. Sections 2 and 3 deal with discipline and mental health respectively. Section 4 is a new section on fitness to study and Section 5 deals with fitness to practice, replacing an existing section and casting the recent policy in statutory language. Section 6 deals with student conduct and capacity among Scholars. Section 7 simplifies the inter-operation of the various subsequent Schedules. Throughout the Chapter there is an emphasis on acting in the best interests of the student. Schedule 1, for example, allows the decision-maker to adjourn any proceedings if concern and support are more in the student's best interest than in continuing with the proceedings.

The Provost thanked Dr O'Dell for a very thorough presentation and invited comments. A Council member expressed concern that Schedule 3 on Mental Health links 'dangerousness' to mental health. The language is not supportive of students and he requested that this be reconsidered. It was agreed that the Registrar, the College Secretary, Dr Brennan, and Dr O'Dell should meet to agree amendments to Schedule 3, perhaps emphasising the caring context in which the Chapter operates and clarifying that point 4 of the Schedule refers to students who have already been involved in a disciplinary process. Council approved the Schedules on Student Conduct and Capacity and agreed they should be forwarded to Board once the agreed changes have been made.

- (iii) **Academic Freedom** The Schedule on Academic Freedom which incorporates the principles of the College Policy on Academic Freedom (CL/10-11/032 and BD/10-11/094) was approved.

#### CL/11-12/119 Graduate Course Proposals

- (i) **MSc in Immunology**

A course proposal leading to the award of an MSc in Immunology was circulated. The Dean of Graduate Studies introduced the course proposal, noting that immunology is an area of particular research strength in the

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

School of Biochemistry and Immunology. This is the first postgraduate taught course in the School and is unique in Ireland. The course is aimed at applicants hoping to pursue careers in academic research, medicine or the pharmaceutical industry. Its structure consists of taught modules, a laboratory-based research project and a dissertation and is in line with the draft proposals for the Harmonisation of Academic Regulations. As well as staff from Trinity, teaching contributions will be made from staff in Teagasc and St Vincent's University Hospital. The Dean of Graduate Studies assured Council that the course content is sufficiently distinct from the recently-approved MSc in Translational Oncology and noted that both courses will share a module. The course proposal received a favourable report from an external assessor who commended the expertise of the Trinity staff. It is supported by the Dean of Health Science, and funding has been made available for the appointment of a lecturer.

Council approved the course proposal leading to the award of MSc in Immunology with a postgraduate diploma exit option, for admission in the academic year 2012/13.

(ii) **Master in Education Studies (Intercultural Education)**

A course proposal leading to the award of a Master in Education Studies (Intercultural Education) was circulated. The Dean of Graduate Studies noted that the proposal is submitted by Marino Institute of Education, one of the Associated Colleges for which College validates degrees. The Associated Colleges Degree Committee has oversight of academic quality issues and has approved this course proposal. The Dean of Graduate Studies expressed thanks to the School of Education which acted in an advisory role during development of the proposal. The course will meet the needs of educational professionals working in diverse settings by providing theoretically grounded modules exploring cultural, linguistic and religious diversity. The proposal received a favourable external review describing it as well-structured and distinct from others on offer in Ireland. Marino Institute of Education has committed to take measures to build capacity for research supervision for the course. Marino is also in consultation with the Irish School of Ecumenics, which offers a postgraduate taught course in Intercultural Theology and Interreligious Studies. It was suggested that consultation with the Director of the MPhil in Race, Ethnicity and Conflict might be useful. The Librarian clarified that, as these students are not registered Trinity students, they would not have access to the online resources.

Council approved the course approval leading to the award of a Master in Education Studies (Intercultural Education) with a postgraduate diploma exit option, part-time over two years, for admission in the academic year 2012/13.

**CL/11-12/120 Quality Assurance - Implementation Plan for the Office of the Vice-Provost Review**  
This item was deferred to the next meeting because of time pressure.

**CL/11-12/121 Any Other Urgent Business**  
There was no urgent business.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

## SECTION B

**CL/11-12/122 Undergraduate Studies Committee**

The Senior Lecturer drew Council's attention to Acta UGS/11-12/045 External Examiners and UGS/11-12/047 Academic Year Structure. The Committee shared Council's concern about the low response rate for external examiners' reports in some faculties. The Senior Lecturer reported that an analysis of the returns since publication of the Senior Lecturer's Report has shown an improvement in the response rates and these will be kept under review. Council noted the recommendation that the additional revision week should be retained in the current academic year structure. The Draft Minutes of 21 February 2012 were noted and approved by Council.

**CL/11-12/123 Research Committee**

The Draft Minutes of 17 January 2012 were noted and approved by Council. The Associate Dean of Research reported that the Town Hall meetings held to date in connection with the Research Strategy Implementation Plan have been very well attended.

**CL/11-12/124 Human Resources Committee**

The Draft Minutes of the meeting of 21 February 2012 were noted and approved by Council.

## SECTION C

**CL/11-12/125 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners**

Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 15 February 2012 and noted by Board on 29 February 2012, as circulated:

**(i) Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**MD** Mary Ethna Black; Niamh Phelan; Claire Marie Sheehy; Charles D'Adhemar.

**(ii) Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**PhD** Amy Birch; Tara A McIndoe Calder; Sinéad Flannery; Piotr Hajduk; Andrew James Hines; Xiaowei Jiang; Amila Kahvedžić; Hanifeh Khayyeri; Peter Larsen; David Long, Robert McAdoo; Eoghan Maher; Clíodhna Siobhán Murphy; Batsaikhan Nyamdash; Thérèse O'Donoghue; Emma Quinn; Alexander Runchman; Emma Smith; Jenny Sofia Svard; Streeja Varghese; Guy Woodward; Karen Young.

**MSc** Ian Fitzgerald; Eleanor Wallace.

**CL/11-12/126 Graduate Studies Committee Business**

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, circulated, dated 8 March 2012:

- (i) An introduction of a one year full-time option of the M.Sc. in Healthcare Infection Management (part-time course code: 804).
- (ii) An introduction of a one year full-time option of the Masters in Medicine (part-time course code: 143).
- (iii) An amendment to the M.Ed. strand in Teaching and Learning (Higher Education) (course code: 866) to change name to Master in Education (Higher Education).
- (iv) An amendment to the existing M.Sc. Nursing, Clinical Health Sciences Education (CHSE) strand (course code 536/537); M.Sc. Midwifery, Clinical Health Sciences Education (CHSE) strand (course code 538/539) and Postgraduate Diploma Clinical Health Sciences Education (CHSE) (course code 656) to replace with an M.Sc. Clinical Health Sciences Education (CHSE) with a Postgraduate Diploma Clinical Health Sciences Education (CHSE) as an exit option.
- (v) A restructuring of the LLM to introduce two new strands. Along with the existing LLM (course code 607); LLM in International and Comparative Law (course code 870) and LLM International and European Business Law (course code 871) there will now also be strands in International and European Intellectual Property Law and Criminal Justice.

**CL/11-12/127 Whately Chair of Political Economy (1832)**

The Council noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 5 March 2012, and approved the appointment of Professor P Lane to the Whately Chair of Political Economy (1832).

**CL/11-12/128 External Examiners**

The Council noted and approved the following:

- (i) **Consolidated List of External Examiners 2012-2013**  
A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 7 March 2012;
- (ii) **Associated Colleges of Education - External Examiners on Validated Courses**  
A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies and Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 28 February 2012;
- (iii) **BEd Degree Courses - External Examiner - Coláiste Mhuire/Marino Institute of Education**  
A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 28 February 2012.

**CL/11-12/129 Provost's Teaching Awards 2011-2012: Panel Members**

The Council noted a memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies and Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 7 March 2012 and approved the following membership:

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*



Dean of Graduate Studies (Chair)  
Senior Lecturer  
Dean of Students  
Dr Aine Kelly  
Dr Desmond Ryan  
Dr Paula Murphy  
Education Officer, Students' Union  
Vice-President, Graduate Students' Union  
Professor Áine Hyland (external member)

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed .....

Date .....