

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 18 January 2012 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor E O'Dell, Professor Z Rodgers, Professor J Wickham, Professor D O'Donovan, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor D Brennan, Professor S Smith, Professor J Nunn, Dr H Mannan, Ms D Jones, Dr A O'Gara, Professor A Piesse, Ms R Barry, Ms S Leydon, Mr D Ferrick, Mr M McAndrew, Dr D Fitzgerald.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor M Ó Siochrú, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Professor J P Labrador, Professor A McNabola, Professor T Connor, Professor J Ohlmeyer, Ms L Aljohmani, Mr R J Smith.
<i>In attendance</i>	Librarian, Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Chief Operating Officer, Head of Central Academic Administration Services.
<i>Observer</i>	Secretary to the Scholars (Mr B Roantree).

SECTION A

CL/11-12/067 Minutes of the meetings of 23 November 2011 were approved and signed subject to an amendment to Actum CL/11-12/051 to include the views expressed for the allocation of additional resources to support services to address the demands of an increased international study body.

CL/11-12/068 Matters Arising:

- (i) *Actum CL/11-12/049 - Budget 2012:* The Dean of Graduate Studies reported that the impact of Budget 2012 on postgraduate students had been restricted to the postgraduate maintenance grant. While the postgraduate tuition fee would continue to be covered, the maintenance grant would no longer be available to new postgraduate entrants from 2012. It was noted that a grant of €2,000 would be made available to approximately 4,000 students across the state. The Dean of Graduate Studies acknowledged the assistance of the President of the Graduate Students' Union in the representations made to the Minister for Education in advance of the budget announcement.
- (ii) *Actum CL/11-12/054 - Milltown Institute:* The Provost reported that the integration of the Loyola Institute into the College had been approved by the

Board, and its Director, Professor Con Casey, was in place. A proposal to develop the Institute in College was proceeding and it was expected that in due course Council would be asked to consider proposals in respect of new courses and associated staffing appointments. In response to a comment that such proposals may impact on existing courses, the Provost reassured Council that any changes would be routed through the appropriate College committees.

CL/11-12/069 Provost's Report

National Strategy for Higher Education: The Provost reported that a National Strategy for Higher Education as recommended by a Ministerial-appointed high level strategy group, under the Chairmanship of Dr Colin Hunt, was in the process of being implemented. The Higher Education Authority (HEA) has a lead role to play in respect of the development of higher education policy and strategic objectives. The strategy for the future landscape of higher education recommends (a) regional clusters, and (b) the establishment of a National Academy for the Enhancement of Teaching and Learning, which includes the introduction of a national student survey. The Provost advised that regional clustering focused more on the Institutes of Technology (IoTs) and other Colleges rather than universities *per se*. It was possible, however, that there would be collaboration between these institutions and local universities. Commenting on the introduction of a national survey of students, the Senior Lecturer advised that the College had established an advisory group to consider this development and was cognisant of the widespread uncertainty expressed in respect of the reliability and validity of such surveys that operated elsewhere. He advised that College would require further details including what data would be collected in the survey and its intended use.

CL/11-12/070 HEA/NCCA Proposals to the Minister for Education and Skills

A memorandum dated January 10, 2012 from the Vice-Provost /Chief Academic Officer together with a copy of a Report and Recommendations to the Minister for Education and Skills from the National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA) and the Higher Education Authority (HEA) on the Outcomes of the Conference on the Transition from Second to Third-Level Education in Ireland had been circulated. In introducing this item, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Council that the Conference held in the Autumn had analysed the outcome of a number of reports prepared and circulated during the Summer. Arising from that conference, the HEA and NCCA had presented proposals to the Minister for Education and Skills on a range of issues relating to second and third level education. The second level proposals would have a profound effect on third level admission policies, the design and delivery of the undergraduate curriculum, on the quality of the education provision, and on resources. The proposed actions included, amongst others:

- reinforcing the issue of foundational skills and the first-year experience as priorities for concerted action across higher education institutions;
- the extension of the academic year in the first year of all undergraduate courses to accommodate the incorporation of transversal skills;
- a review of the undergraduate portfolio with a view to establishing broader entry to undergraduate programmes at level 8.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

A series of assumptions had been made on the curriculum, admission, and the first year experience. It was noted that the issues covered by the proposals, were actively being considered by the College, which included a working group on undergraduate admissions, chaired by the Senior Lecturer. The Working Group expected to make recommendations to the Undergraduate Studies Committee in March and to Council in April 2012.

In the discussion which followed, it was noted that undergraduate professional courses in the health sciences required a high number of professional hours, and concern was expressed that the diversity of experience that professional students enjoyed could be impacted by the proposals. It was noted that the College had decided not to partake in the separate development of graduate entry to medicine which was introduced approximately five years ago by other universities in the State. The proposal would adversely impact on the recruitment of international students to medicine: for example, Malaysian students are admitted from second level schooling whilst North American students are graduates. There was further concern that restricting entry to professional courses at graduate level would curtail the access of students from disadvantaged background particularly in the light of recent cuts in postgraduate funding. It was feared that the introduction of generic courses in higher education would effectively push the points system from second to third level.

The Provost expressed a view that the introduction of graduate entry may provide equitable access to professional courses from generic third level courses. Currently entry to professional courses was skewed in favour of privately funded second level schools. It was noted that such a radical change to third level admission would necessitate an overhaul of the student financial support system in order to fund students for an extended academic career. It was noted that the transition from second to third level education was an issue for some students and necessitated the development of a required skills set.

Council supported the Vice-Provost / Chief Academic Officer's proposal that College make a response to the Minister for Education & Skills on the Report and its recommendations. It was noted that the Irish Universities Association (IUA) would be considering the Report also.

CL/11-12/071 Promotions – Revision of Procedures for Promotions Process

A memorandum dated 10 January, 2012 from the Vice-Provost /Chief Academic Officer together with review procedures for academic staff had been circulated. In introducing this item, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Council that at the request of the Senior Promotions Committee (SPC) a working party, chaired by the Vice-Provost/CAO, was established in 2008/09 to consider possible improvements to the senior promotions process. These issues ranged from clinical titles to membership of the Promotion Committees (a separate sub-committee had been established to look specifically at clinical titles and matters relating to the Faculty of Health Sciences).

In Michaelmas Term 2011, the SPC approved the recommendations of the Working Party, which included:

- revised membership of the SPC,
- the passing of senior administrative promotions to another committee,

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

- a new Clinical Promotion process with the School of Medicine making recommendations to the SPC,
- a process to allow the Faculty to review applications in the first instance,
- the introduction of interviews for Professor and Associate Professor candidates,
- review of the promotion application form.

It had been agreed at the HR Committee of 15 November 2011 that the recommendations of the Working Group should go directly to Council and Board for consideration. It was noted that the recommendations had been approved by Executive Officers on 22 December 2011.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer drew Council's attention to a tabled memorandum which addressed an unintended consequence of the revisions to the Promotions Procedures for Academic Staff for promotion to the Associate Professor Grade (Procedure No. 46b, Revision 5) and Professor Grade (Procedure No. 46c, Revision 5) which had arisen, whereby it could have been interpreted that Faculty Deans who had applied for promotion to Personal Chairs would be excluded from the Faculty Review Process. In order to address the issue, it was proposed to amend the Review Procedures in respect of promotion to the associate professor and professor grades as follows:

In place of bullet point 5 (Section 4.4), there should be two bullet points:

- With the exception of Faculty Deans, no other serving member of the Senior Promotions Committee may participate in the Faculty Review Process.
- Candidates for Personal Chairs may be members of the Faculty Review Process.

Council approved the recommendations as presented in respect of review procedures for promotions process, including the proposed revision as tabled.

CL/11-12/072 Trinity Long Room Hub

A confidential memorandum dated 18 January, 2012 from the Vice-Provost /Chief Academic Officer was tabled. In introducing this item, the Vice-Provost /Chief Academic Officer advised Council that upon taking office, the Provost had initiated a review of the Trinity Long Room Hub (TLRH) to be conducted by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer. During Michaelmas Term 2011, an extensive consultation process had been undertaken which focused on TLRH governance, leadership and finances. Based on her main findings that the TLRH was being limited by its current management structure and the lack of a financial model, she presented seven recommendations.

Council approved the recommendations as presented subject to the inclusion of the Librarian, or his nominee, on the nominations committee to appoint the new Director of the TLRH.

CL/11-12/073 Graduate Course Proposal – MSc in Biological Psychiatry

A course proposal dated 6 January 2012 leading to the award of a Master in Science (M.Sc.) from the School of Medicine had been circulated. The Dean of Graduate

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Studies spoke to this proposal noting that it was a timely proposition that was designed to address the major neuroscience developments and challenges in psychiatry and their clinical application. The course would be delivered on a part-time basis over two years. The aim of the MSc course is to deliver high calibre training in biological psychiatry and translational neuroscience research. The course would draw on the resources already available as a result of the prioritization of the Neuroscience research programme within College, and the strong links between the Department of Psychiatry and the Trinity College Institute of Neuroscience (TCIN), and the Institute of Molecular Medicine. The proposal has been approved by the Graduate Studies Committee, Library Committee and the College Archives' Users Committee, and has also received a positive external review assessment.

In response to a query arising from some inconsistencies in the data presented in the proposal, the Dean of Graduate Studies advised that she had sought clarification from the School of Medicine in respect of resources, and it had confirmed that adequate resources were available from within the School to support the academic and administrative needs. It was noted that documentation presented to Council should reflect the current status of discussions as a matter of principle.

In order not to delay recruitment, Council approved the course proposal leading to an award of Master in Science, with a postgraduate diploma exit option subject to the Dean of Graduate Studies resolving a number of issues highlighted in respect of the ECTS value of modules, and the teaching terms in which the course would be delivered. The Dean undertook to seek an amended proposal, which would be presented at a future meeting of Council.

CL/11-12/074 Undergraduate Course Proposal – Bachelor in Science in Occupational Therapy

A course proposal for a Bachelor in Science in Occupational Therapy, in conjunction with the Singapore Institute of Technology (SIT), dated 10 January, 2012 from the Discipline of Occupational Therapy, School of Medicine, had been circulated. In introducing this item, the Senior Lecturer advised Council that the course proposal followed the structure of the new Physiotherapy course approved by Council at its previous meeting on 23 November, 2011. It had been developed following a number of site visits by the School of Medicine to the Singapore Institute of Technology (SIT). The proposal was supported by the School of Medicine and the Faculty Dean, and had received a favourable review from the external reviewer. Outstanding matters that needed to be addressed in respect of professional accreditation have now been addressed, and the Discipline of Occupational Therapy in consultation with the Association of Occupational Therapists of Ireland (AOTI) and the Singapore Association of Occupational Therapy (SAOT) and Nanyang Polytechnic are developing suitable review mechanisms for the course.

The allocation of resources to the support services to provide for these international students was flagged.

In noting the very strong academic and strategic rationale for this course, Council approved the proposal for a Bachelor in Science in Occupational Therapy in conjunction with the Singapore Institute of Technology, including the derogation from the admission regulation which normally requires students to complete at least two academic years in College in order to complete a degree.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

CL/11-12/075 Harmonisation of Academic Assessment Regulations

A memorandum dated 10 January 2012 from the Vice-Provost / Chief Academic Officer together with a draft proposal for the 'Harmonisation of Assessment Regulations in Trinity' had been circulated. In introducing the item, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Council that at a meeting in December 2010, it had agreed to streamlining and harmonising regulations, and noted that harmonisation would not only enable smooth implementation of a new student system, but would also provide for transparency and comparability in the administration of our academic programmes, greater efficiency, and reduction of errors and duplication of tasks (Actum CL/10-11/070). The draft proposal as presented had been revised following discussion at the Undergraduate Studies Committee and the Graduate Studies Committee on 13 and 15 December 2011 respectively. Both Committees recognised the need to harmonise, where possible, existing assessment regulations.

The Vice-Provost / Chief Academic Officer drew Council's attention to the appendices, which provides information on existing practices, which were difficult to defend and costly to maintain. The proposal set out key principles and presented a series of alternative 'schemes' that were intended to suit the needs of the range of course types in College. These alternative schemes covered regulations relating to:

- Marks and their associated grades
- Re-assessment of failed modules/assessment elements
- Regulation of progression to next stage of study
- Regulation of failure to progress (repetition/exclusion)
- Award classifications.

Within each of these schemes a number of options were presented and it was expected that the majority (if not all) of our existing courses (UG and PG) could be accommodated within the schemes, however, the proposals provided for exceptions. Work was underway to combine the proposed schemes into a manageable number of course 'models' for the various types of courses including UG single honor, joint honor, TSM and other prevalent course types at both UG and PG level. Schools have been invited to consider the proposal and where it was felt that it was not possible to fit a course(s) within one or more of the proposed schemes, a sound academic reason for placing a course regulation outside the options proposed can be made to the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

While recognising the academic freedom of disciplines to make decisions about the nature of the curriculum and how it is taught, Council strongly supported the rationale for the harmonisation of academic assessment and progression regulations, and recommended that the number of options within each scheme be limited and the number of models adopted be no more than three or four.

CL/11-12/076 Quality Assurance: Progress Report

Council noted the progress report from the School of Drama, Film & Music as presented by the Dean of Arts, Humanities, and Social Sciences.

CL/11-12/077 Academic Appeals Committees for Postgraduate Students

Minutes of the meetings of

- (i) Research: 1st December, 2011 and 10 January, 2012 were approved.
- (ii) Taught: 19th December, 2011 were approved.

CL/11-12/078 Any other urgent business

- (i) *Statutory Amendments relating to College Treasures*: A memorandum, dated 16 January 2012, from the Registrar was tabled. In introducing this item, the Registrar advised Council that the Library's participation in the Museum Standards Programme for Ireland (MSPI) highlighted a need to introduce an amendment to the 2010 Consolidated Statutes of Trinity College Dublin and of the University of Dublin in order to safeguard the College's various treasures and collections. Council consented to the statutory amendments as presented.
- (ii) *Research Quality Metrics*: The Dean of Research provided an update on the Research Committee's deliberations on the application of research quality metrics. Following discussion, Council advised the Dean to bring a formal proposal on proposed changes for consideration at a future meeting of Council.

Section B

CL/11-12/079 Undergraduate Studies Committee draft minutes of the meeting of 13 December, 2011 as circulated were noted and approved by Council. The Senior Lecturer drew Council's attention to Actum UGS/11-12/027, concerning Open Day. Council noted that a discussion paper would be presented to Council for consideration at a future meeting.

CL/11-12/080 Graduate Studies Committee draft minutes of the meeting of 15 December, 2011 as circulated were noted and approved by Council. The Dean of Graduate Studies drew Council's attention to Acta GS/11-12/021, GS/11-12/022 in respect of a relationship with Brown University, and collaborative Academia-Enterprise Ph.D. Studentship respectively.

CL/11-12/081 Research Committee draft minutes of the meeting of 8 December, 2011 as circulated were noted by Council. The Dean drew Council's attention to Acta RS/11-12/19, RS/11-12/20, RS/11-12/21 in respect of Research Funding Diversification, Trinity Research Institutes, and Associate Staff's participation in Research respectively.

CL/11-12/082 Quality Committee draft minutes of the meeting of 6 December, 2011 as circulated were noted and approved by Council. The Senior Lecturer drew Council's attention to Actum QC/11-12/010 in respect of UG student retention data 2006/07 cohort, which would be an agenda item at a future meeting of the Undergraduate Studies Committee.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

CL/11-12/083 Human Resources Committee draft minutes of the meeting of 15 November 2011 as circulated were noted and approved by Council (approved by Board on 7 December 2011).

SECTION C

CL/11-12/084 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners
The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 23 November 2011 and noted by Board on 7 December 2011.

Higher Degrees by Research Alone

DChDent	Sheila Hagan; Donal McAuley.
MD	Ciara Barrett; Sara Elizabeth Moya Cunningham; Richard John Drew.
PhD	Jennifer Brown; Thomas Curtin; Donghoon Kim; Svetlana Eriksson; Kieran Flynn; Rodrigo González; Stephen Hardiman; Paul Harris; Clare Hayes-Brady; Durga Sankar Kesanakurthi; Anne McGuinness; Thomas McNally; Peter Edward McQuade; Emily McRae; Patricia Brigid Minnock; Mamatha Nasgaraj; Fionnuala Ní Áinle; Daniel O'Donovan; Declan Joseph O'Keefe; Gerardo Presbitero; Antje Sibylle Roeder.
MLitt	Claire Mary Faughey; Thomas Finbarr O'Rafferty.
MSc	Paul Christopher McElligott; Laura Mullaney.
MAI	Conor Francis Taaffe.

CL/11-12/085 Graduate Studies Business
The Council noted a memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, circulated, dated 6 January 2012 and approved the following:

- (i) an amendment to the Postgraduate Diploma in Applied Behaviour Analysis (course code: 784) - changing status from part-time to full-time;
- (ii) an introduction of a one year full-time option of the MSc in Clinical Speech and Language Studies (part-time course code: 758);
- (iii) an amendment to the MSc / PGradDip Nursing to introduce a new strand from September 2012 in Nursing - Advanced Nurse Practitioners.

CL/11-12/086 School Directors - Mathematics - Director of Research
The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor S Ryan in place of Professor C Houghton to the end of the academic year 2011-2012.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

CL/11-12/087 Headships

The Council noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) **Dental Science - Head of Division (Restorative Dentistry and Periodontology)** Professor D McCarthy, for three years with effect from 1 December 2011, in succession to Professor Francis Houston who retired on 30 November 2011.
- (ii) **Immunology** Professor D Doherty, pending an appointment to the Chair of Immunology

CL/11-12/088 Teaching Assistants and Assistant Examiners including Demonstrators for 2011-2012

The Council noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 10 January 2012.

CL/11-12/089 Chair in Inorganic Chemistry (1922)

The Council noted a memorandum from the Dean of the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, circulated, dated 10 January 2012, and approved the Search committee:

- Provost
- Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer
- Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science
- Dean of Research
- Professor C O'Farrelly
- Professor D Grayson
- Professor Y G'unko

CL/11-12/090 Accreditation Visits

The Council noted the following visits:

- (i) Clinical Doctorate in Dental Surgery (DChDent) - Paediatric Dentistry stream: 6 October 2011;
- (ii) Clinical Doctorate in Dental Surgery (DChDent) - Periodontology stream: 18 October 2011;
- (iii) Doctoral Programme in Clinical Psychology (DClinPsych): 18 January 2012;
- (iv) Undergraduate degree in Dental Science (BDentSc): 5-6 March 2012;
- (v) Bachelor in Social Studies (BSS): 27-29 March 2012.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed

Date

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings