

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 28 October 2009 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

- Present* Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Senior Lecturer, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Dr C Laudet, Dr M Ó Siochrú, Professor J Wickham, Dr V Kelly, Dean of Health Sciences, Dr D Brennan, Professor M McCarron, Professor M Radomski, Dr H Mannan, Ms D Flynn, Professor G Whyte, Mr A Cooke, Ms M Furlong, Mr F Hughes, Mr N Timmon, Ms A Murphy.
- Apologies* Dr E O'Dell, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor J Fitzpatrick, Dr M Lyons, Dr D O'Sullivan, Dr A O'Gara, Mr A O'Callaghan, Secretary to the Scholars (Mr B Devlin), Librarian, Interim Chief Operating Officer.
- In attendance* Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary.

SECTION A

- CL/09-10/030 **Statutory Declaration** A member of Council, attending for the first time, made the statutory declaration.
- CL/09-10/031 **Minutes of the meeting of the 30th September 2009** were approved subject to two minor corrections to Actum CL/09-10/005.
- CL/09-10/032 **Matters Arising** Responding to a query relating to Actum CL/09-10/006, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that the College's Strategic Plan will be launched towards the end of November 2009. Council members will receive an invitation to the launch. He also noted that Schools will now begin to develop a School Strategic Plan derived from the College's Strategic Plan 2009-14.
- Referring to Actum CL/09-10/008, one Council member noted that the School of Histories and Humanities in response to the quality review report of the School commented on inaccuracies in the review report. He noted that the Reviewers' observation that 'most members of staff are research active' was incorrect. The School's response states "that the reviewers underestimated the proportion of staff that is research active. The overwhelming majority (94%) of the academic staff are research active by current Trinity criteria."
- CL/09-10/033 **Provost's Report** The Provost informed Council that Trinity was ranked 43rd on the Times Higher Education-QS World Ranking. He also reported that evaluation of the Trinity submission to the Programme for Research in Third Level Institutions (PRTL)

Cycle 5 was on-going. Ten two-hour site visits have already taken place, and the evaluation process is expected to be completed in November 2009.

CL/09-10/034 The Ireland Academy of Dramatic Art A memorandum dated 21st October 2009 from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer was circulated. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item informing Council that following the closure of the Bachelor in Acting Studies in 2007, the Provost established a Forum on Actor Training involving the principal figures in the Irish theatre industry. The Forum published a Report in May 2008, and the primary recommendation of the Report was the creation of a National Academy of Dramatic Art, linked to a University, similar to the Royal Academy of Dramatic Art (RADA) in London. The creation of a national academy for Ireland is also the desire of the Cathal Ryan Trust that has links and associations with RADA. Through Professor Singleton's connections with RADA, initial and informal discussions took place in late 2008 culminating in a series of formal discussions between the Trust and Trinity College. These discussions have led to a proposal between College and the Trust to establish The Ireland Academy of Dramatic Art. The proposal together with a detailed budget will be presented to Board at its meetings on the 11th November 2009. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer drew Council's attention to the courses that the Academy proposes to deliver.

The Provost expressed his satisfaction that a recommendation of the Forum on Actor Training, chaired by Professor Nicolas Grene, has come to fruition. The closure of the Bachelor in Acting Studies was highly controversial and generated considerable negative press. This proposal to establish The Ireland Academy of Dramatic Art in partnership with Trinity College, the theatre industry, and a private sponsor will give a much needed boost to dramatic art in Ireland and will achieve the high standards and quality necessary for this field to thrive and succeed. The Provost invited Council to consider the academic merits of the proposal, noting that financial and governance matters will be considered by the Board at its meeting on the 11th November 2009.

Council welcomed the proposal and sought clarification on several matters. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer responding to a number of questions, noted that funding was secure and that the Higher Education Authority (HEA) has been involved in agreeing a subject weighting for the course that was favourable. He also confirmed that new staff will be employed and it is expected that many of these staff will be from the theatre industry and will work part-time. There will be a requirement for full-time staff also. Council felt that the involvement of well known theatre figures in the course will not only add to the quality of course provision, but should also be a magnet to attract international students. Responding to queries on the delivery of the course over nine terms across three years, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that the distinctiveness and special purpose nature of the proposed Bachelor in Acting programme sets it apart from other academic programmes. The intensive nature of the undergraduate programme reflects established professional norms as evidenced in all leading Drama schools, such as RADA, and it is essential that the intensity of training is preserved. In response to a query on credits, it was confirmed that 240 credits is the normal credit volume of a University of Dublin honor bachelor degree. It was noted that course proposals will be presented to the relevant Academic Committees of Council in 2009 and to Council in 2010 for consideration and approval.

Council noted the proposal on the establishment of The Ireland Academy of Dramatic Art at Trinity College in association with the Royal Academy of Dramatic Art, and further noted the proposed courses - Bachelor in Acting (Level 8), Higher Diploma in Stage Management and Technical Theatre (Level 8), and Master in Fine Art (Level 9).

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The Secretary to the College requested, for commercially sensitive reasons, that the memorandum and the discussion at Council on The Ireland Academy of Dramatic Art remain confidential until after the Board meeting of the 11th November 2009.

CL/09-10/035 Research Quality Metrics A memorandum from the Dean of Research dated 21st October 2009 was circulated. The Dean of Research introduced this item and drew Council's attention to the circulated proposal on Research Quality Metrics to Board and the minute of the Board discussion on this topic in July 2009, also circulated. The Dean of Research explained the background to the proposal, noting the research proxies employed under the current Academic Resource Allocation Model (ARAM) are linked to PhD completions and competitive research income. These measures do not directly consider quality of research output. The Board established a working group to examine mechanisms by which the 30% allocation attributed to research might be made under the proposed new Resource Planning Model (RPM). The Board was concerned that the research metrics should capture quality of research output, and the Dean of Research commented on the importance of achieving an equitable approach. The working group proposed three principles for research quality metrics. Principle 1 proposes to reward and incentivise research participation by academic staff across College: Principle 2 proposes to encourage research quality and growth across College: Principle 3 proposes to benchmark performance against peer international units. The Dean of Research explained how the proposed Principles might operate and noted the discussion of these at Board. He commented that many of the external quality reviews of Schools highlight that much of the research output is of international standards. The proposed model attempts to align principles with the research strategic objectives of College.

In discussing the proposed principles for research quality metrics, Council heard that current research quality metrics do not provide an accurate or near accurate picture of the quality of research across Schools. It was felt that it would be difficult to achieve objective criteria, but the role of the Faculty Deans as 'gatekeepers' was considered important. Finding international comparators with which a School could benchmark itself was also considered difficult. Council felt that it would be complicated to benchmark the research of a School against peer institutions as the discipline composition of some Schools in Trinity is not mirrored in other institutions. It was agreed that benchmarking at discipline level would be more realistic. The Head of the School of Nursing and Midwifery reported that the School of Nursing in the University of Manchester is ranked number one in the UK, and she informed Council of the process that the University of Manchester implements in preparation for the Research Assessment Exercise (RAE). If a school/discipline is entered into the RAE, then there is usually a significant level of resources and staff dedicated to that area. In discussing the RAE, it was suggested that the creation of a two-tier system of teaching and research in the UK university structure is a consequence of the RAE.

Discussing the definition of 'research active', it was argued that all academic staff should be research active as this is a condition of their employment and fundamental to their profession. It was proposed that research quality metrics should include the output of Research Fellows, and the output of students. It was noted that equity of participation of Research Fellows in College, subject to the regulations of the funding agencies, should be promoted. There was a discussion on the perceived value placed on teaching relative to research. The Provost noted that 70% of the funds are allocated to Schools based on teaching activity. It was proposed that research quality metrics should take account of the teaching workload of staff as there are significant differences across disciplines and within Schools. Council was cautioned against the

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

development of a two-tier system within the College where research 'stars' are promoted and freed from teaching, and 'good teachers' are channelled into a teaching-only career structure.

Referring to the language in the memorandum on research quality metrics, it was argued that the College's aspirations should be 'to continue to be world-class' and not 'to become world-class'. With respect to principle 2, it was felt that the timeline of one year was too short to demonstrate attainment of a research objective as in many disciplines it could take anything up to three years for an article to be published, and up to ten years to publish a book of significance in some fields. Referring to concerns about the added administration and costs of maintaining a research metrics system, the Dean of Research commented that the College acknowledges that all research outputs should be of international standing, and as such there will be costs in keeping any model introduced relevant and up to-date.

It was agreed that the current model for allocating 30% of funds to research activity was not equitable, and Council noted the need to change this model to one that is more equitable and that addressed quality of research output.

CL/09-10/036 Quality - School of Dental Science An implementation plan arising from recommendations from the quality review of the School of Dental Science was circulated. The Dean of the Faculty of Health Sciences confirmed that the Implementation Plan was realistic and that many of the recommendations have already been acted upon. He acknowledged the contribution of the former Dean of the School of Dental Science, Professor Noel Claffey, in preparing the School for the quality review, and acknowledged the contribution of the Acting-Dean of the School of Dental Science, Professor June Nunn, for her role in preparing the Implementation Plan.

CL/09-10/037 Academic Appeals Committee Minutes of the meetings of the Academic Appeals Committee of the 30th September 2009, and the 1st, 2nd and 5th October 2009 were circulated. The Senior Lecturer drew Council's attention to Case 17/09 where a student was given permission to repeat Senior Freshman for a second time. The Dean of Health Sciences expressed his concern at the high number of appeals that were upheld, noting that many of the students in question do not avail themselves of the supports provided to assist them through their studies. He argued that the Faculty of Health Sciences takes every measure to support students, and in some instances it is not in the best interest of the student to repeat or continue her/his studies. The Dean noted that he has taken a personal interest in ensuring that students are supported, and feels that the appeals process should be reviewed. The Registrar, Chair of the Academic Appeals Committee, responded that some of the appeals this year involved transition issues to the new academic year structure. He noted that the Committee can only act on the information available on the day and on foot of calendar regulations. The Senior Tutor noted that a review of the process is in train.

Council noted and approved the recommendations as set out in the minutes of the Academic Appeals Committee of the 30th September 2009, and the 1st, 2nd and 5th October 2009.

CL/09-10/038 Chairs Under Any other Business the Secretary advised as follows:

- (i) **Chair Title** The Council approved the title of Prof M Ramaswami's Chair 'Professor of Neurogenetics'.

- (ii) **Chair in Medieval and Renaissance Literature** Council noted that the nominated candidate had advised the College that for personal reasons he would not be taking up the position.

SECTION B

CL/09-10/039 Undergraduate Studies Committee Responding to a query on Actum UGS/09-10/006, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that outsourcing the delivery of International Foundation Programmes is commonly held to be good practice and the most efficient way to deliver such programmes. Companies involved in delivering such programmes have access to the right student markets, have advanced recruitment tools, and have curricula already in place. It would not be feasible for Trinity academic staff to be involved in delivering second-level curricula. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Council that three companies have been invited to tender following an 'invitation to dialogue' procurement process. He confirmed, in response to a query, that the International Foundation Programme would be suitable for students from countries where the second level education qualifications were not on par with Irish or European second level qualifications.

The Council noted and approved the recommendations as set out in the minutes of the Undergraduate Studies Committee from its meeting of 13th October 2009, which had been circulated.

CL/09-10/040 Quality Committee The Council noted and approved the recommendations as set out in the minutes of the Quality Committee from its meeting of 14 October 2009, which had been circulated.

CL/09-10/041 Research Committee The Council noted and approved the recommendations as set out in the minutes of the Research Committee from its meeting of 6th October 2009, which had been circulated.

SECTION C

CL/09-10/042 Council Membership The Council noted that Dr H Mannan (Research Fellow, School of Psychology) had been elected as a member of Council for the Research Staff constituency, replacing Dr F Walsh, to serve until the end of the 2009-2010 academic year.

CL/09-10/043 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 30 September 2009 and noted by Board on 14 October 2009, as circulated.

- (i) **Higher Degrees by Publication**

ScD Patrick John Prendergast.

- (ii) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

MD Peter Robert Byrne; Josephine Brigid Loftus; Cíara McDonnell; Aisling Mary Mulligan.

(iii) Higher Degrees by Research Alone

PhD Mohd Bakri Bakar; Catriona Theresa Bradley; Ross Brennan; James Joseph Connolly; Deirdre Judyth Mary Craig; Barry Dixon; James Eoin Dixon; Pierpaolo Dondio; Margaret Fitzgibbon; Mathew Garrison; Ruari Hanafin; Sarah Elizabeth Heal; Cynthia Heffron; Niall Oliver Holmes; Sabine Horn; Noor Ahmed Jatoi; Michael Kelly; Niall Thomas Kinahan; Déirdre Mary Brigid Kirwan; Veronica Lambert; Rory Vincent Loughnane; Shane Mac Giollaibhui; Michéal Mac Piarais; Uttam Manna; Fergus McAteer; Keith Mc Quillan; Mícheál Moloney; Nóra Ní Nualláin; Jennifer O’Brien; Rory O Toole; Egle Passante; Niamh Plunkett; Gwendolin Porst; Mohammad Harun-ur Rashid; Eloise Rogers; Peter Ryan; Jan Sacha; Zari Saeedi Talab; Atchara Teerawatananon; Deirdre Ann Toher; Margaret Rogers; Matthew Treacy; Tomoko Ueno.

MSc Michael Barragry; Sharon Mary Cullen; Irene Frisby; Marcus Furlong; Julie Harel; Lenka Horalkova; Howard Gordon Leech; Gerard Lynch; Laura Maher; Rosemary Ann Peel; Trevor Woods.

MLitt Emmet Brendan Mary Hayes; Alexandra Kamala Elizabeth Kohn; Daniel O’Callaghan.

MAI (Recurrent Education)
Raymond Gerald Flanagan.

CL/09-10/044 Schools - Directors, Heads of Discipline, Course Co-ordinators The Council noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) Directors of Research - 2009-2011
 - (a) School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies: Dr C Ruthner;
 - (b) School of Social Sciences and Philosophy: Dr R Chari.
- (ii) Heads of Discipline - School of Computer Science and Statistics, 2009-2012
 - (a) Computer Systems: Professor V Cahill;
 - (b) Information Systems: Dr F Bannister;
 - (c) Intelligent Systems: Professor V Wade;
 - (d) Software Systems: Professor M Hennessy;
 - (e) Statistics: Professor S Wilson
- (iii) Course Co-Ordinator - BESS - 2009-2011 Dr F T O’Toole.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed

Date