

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 31 March 2004 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

Present Provost, Senior Lecturer, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Arts (Humanities), Dean of Arts (Letters), Dr E V Patten, Dean of Business, Economic and Social Studies, Dr N Persram, Dean of Engineering and Systems Sciences, Dr D W O'Dwyer, Dean of Health Sciences, Dr A W Kelly, Dr C M Begley, Dean of Science, Professor P Coxon, Dr C Benson, Ms G E Fallon, Ms H Fychan, Mr J O Q Inderhaug, Ms S Scott.

Apologies Vice-Provost, Registrar, Dr P C Conroy, Dr M H Adams, Professor D M Singleton, Dr M L Brennan, Professor P J Prendergast, Dr B Espey, Ms M McMahon, Dean of Dental Affairs, Secretary, Mr F de Bulbh, Ms L O'Brien, Mr C O'Coilean, Mr N Hughes, Ms R Ni Eidhin.

In attendance Librarian, Academic Secretary.

Declaration A member of Council attending for the first time made the statutory declaration.

32/A Minutes The minutes of the meetings of 25th and 26th February 2004 were approved.

32/B Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the Minutes of 25th February 2004 were discussed and have been minuted under appropriate headings hereafter.

32/C European University Association – Quality Review of Universities (see Actum 25/A of 25th February 2004) The Senior Lecturer advised that the first meeting of the Steering Committee had been held and it was intended to complete the first draft of the self-evaluation report by the end of April. Consultation would take place in the first three weeks of May with a view to agreeing a final document for submission to the European University Association at the end of the month.

32/D Graduate Studies (see Actum 25/B of 25th February 2004) The Senior Lecturer advised that Board had approved the necessary resources to strengthen the staffing in the Graduate Studies Office.

32/E Provost's Report

- (i) **Higher Education Authority – Review of Recurrent Funding Model** The Provost stated that the Higher Education Authority (HEA) had conducted a review of the recurrent funding mechanism for the university sector and had prepared a

consultation document. Currently the HEA invites the universities to bid for funding from the Targeted Initiatives Scheme which provides funding for areas identified by the HEA as being important for the achievement of national policy objectives. It was now proposed that a Strategic Fund should replace the Targeted Initiatives Scheme. The HEA had also reviewed the unit cost mechanism and had concluded that the majority of the core grant should be unit cost driven. It was also being proposed that core funding should include some performance related elements (e.g. intake and number of graduates) and that it be allocated on a multi-annual basis. Research funding was not a feature of this model. It was noted that there are a number of issues of concern in relation to this document which are being addressed at a sectoral level.

The Provost advised that while the funding available under the Targeted Initiatives Scheme was quite low, it was proposed that the Strategic Fund would be quite significant – 10% of the overall block grant which would potentially rise to 15%. It was envisaged that this would stimulate the sector to respond to national needs through the seed funding of initiatives that would eventually have to be delivered through the core grant. It was considered that budgets should fund an evolving portfolio of activities which would involve substitution of activities.

- (ii) **Financial Situation** Responding to a question on the expected grant situation in 2005 and the implication for staffing in 2004-05, the Provost indicated that he hoped to be in a position to clarify the situation in the very near future.

33/A Departmental Review – Department of Public Health and Primary Care (formerly named the Department of Community Health and General Practice) A report from the Provost dated 10th March 2004 on the review of the Department of Public Health and Primary Care had been circulated. The reviewers noted that while the department is very small in comparison to those in the United Kingdom and had ‘meagre’ resources, the activities of senior staff had resulted in a high public profile for the Department. The reviewers recommended that undergraduate teaching should be more practice-based however this would require additional funding. They noted that while the MSc in Community Health has a good reputation nationally and internationally, it was very labour intensive and in the circumstances, its viability should be considered. In relation to research, the reviewers suggested that the Department consider a strategy for developing an international reputation based on research carried out locally but with international relevance. They noted that the main factor limiting research development was the number of senior academic staff capable of obtaining funding and providing research supervision. Completion rates for postgraduate research students were very satisfactory and students were positive about the quality and amount of research supervision. Some concerns had been expressed that staff and students in the Adelaide and Meath Hospital, incorporating the National Children’s Hospital at Tallaght, felt somewhat isolated and it was recommended that consideration be given to how this might be rectified.

The Dean of Health Sciences stated that it was important to emphasise the important role that the Department had played in the development of national policy on health issues. He acknowledged the issues raised regarding the size of the Department and noted that similar issues had been raised in review reports of other departments in Health Sciences. The Department recognised that the time devoted to practice based teaching and public health was inadequate and was working with the Faculty to redress the imbalance in the medical curriculum and expand teaching in public health and primary care. The MSc in Community Health had been suspended and a new MSc in Global Health had been developed. The Dean acknowledged the important contribution made by students to the review process and regretted the fact that it had not been possible on this occasion for the reviewers to meet with them. The Dean also commented on the underfunding of Health Sciences in Ireland and noted that discussions were ongoing at a sectoral level in an effort to improve the situation.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

In the discussion which followed, Dr Kelly, a member of the Department of Public Health and Primary Care, made a number of comments which he hoped would assist Council in its consideration of the reviewers' report. The Dean of Graduate Studies advised Council of the CHIU project on good practice in relation to PhD degrees. He also noted that the current 'self-financing' model for taught courses was unsatisfactory and should be reviewed. In response to a question, the Dean of Health Sciences stated that the need to increase teaching in primary care and public health in the context of the introduction of a five-year curriculum in Medicine would be addressed in terms of moving towards a competence based approach. It was suggested that the staff:student ratio of 1:7 in the Department was very favourable compared to those in other Departments in College.

It was proposed that the issue of the size of the Department should be addressed in the recommendations and following discussion, the inclusion of the recommendation noted below under (ii) 4 was agreed.

Council noted and approved the following recommendations:

- (i) that the Department should:
 1. Build on its strong research contribution to a range of public health issues by developing an integrated research plan for the whole department.
 2. Continue to develop programmes for the further expansion and integration of public health and general practice elements into the medical curriculum.
 3. With the suspension of the MSc in Community Health, re-focus its energies on research and seek to expand the number of postgraduate research students and postgraduate research fellows.

- (ii) that the Faculty should:
 1. Increase the proportion of the curriculum devoted to public health and general practice in line with the recommendations of the reviewers, the Medical Council review, and practice in comparable medical schools elsewhere.
 2. In light of comments made by reviewers regarding succession, the Dean should work with the Department to develop a staffing plan.
 3. Continue to make the case for a new funding model along the lines of the SIFT scheme in the United Kingdom.
 4. Address the issue of small size of departments in the Faculty in the context of current considerations of the need for academic re-structuring in College.

- (iii) that the College should:
 1. Support the Department and other departments and units in their establishment of a new College base at the Adelaide & Meath Hospital, incorporating the National Children's Hospital.
 2. Actively lobby the government for adequate funding for the education of medical students.
 3. Support the Faculty's reform of the undergraduate curriculum as it moves from a six to a five year programme.

34/A Personnel and Appointments Committee Council noted and approved the recommendations arising from the meeting held on 12th March 2004 as set out in the circulated memorandum dated 19th March 2004 from the Acting Secretary of the Committee. Council noted that the recommendation in relation to the Department of Geology that a lectureship be replaced on a permanent basis was in accord with contractual undertakings given to the Professor of Geology at the time of his appointment.

35/A Junior Promotions Committee 2004 Review A memorandum dated 24th March 2004 from the Secretary to the Junior Promotions Committee was tabled. Council approved the recommendations of the Committee in respect of the Lecturers below as follows

- (i) **Confirmation in Appointment** with effect from 1 October 2004:
 - (a) **Appointed on probation for a period of one year**
 - Dr Jonathan Coleman (Physics)
 - Dr Gerard Menezes (Radiation Therapy)
 - Ms Stephanie Holt (Social Studies)
 - (b) **Appointed on probation for a period of three years**
 - Dr Mairead Brady (Business Studies)
 - Dr Brendan Murphy (Statistics)

- (ii) **Merit Bar** (to proceed beyond the Merit Bar at the date appropriate in each case):
 - Ms Audrey Adams (Nursing Studies)
 - Dr Giuliana Adamo (Italian)
 - Dr Lilian Alweiss (Philosophy)
 - Dr Mairead Brady (Business Studies)
 - Mr Damien Brennan (Nursing Studies)
 - Dr Jonathan Coleman (Physics)
 - Dr Thomas Connor (Neuroscience)
 - Dr Gavin Doherty (Computer Science)
 - Ms Naomi Elliott (Nursing Studies)
 - Dr Linda Hogan (Peace Studies, Irish School of Ecumenics)
 - Ms Stephanie Holt (Social Studies)
 - Dr Amir Khan (Biochemistry)
 - Dr Majella Lane (Pharmaceutics)
 - Dr Saturnino Luz (Computer Science)
 - Ms Catherine McCabe (Nursing Studies)
 - Dr Mary McCarron (Nursing Studies)
 - Dr Brendan Murphy (Statistics)
 - Dr Paula Murphy (Zoology)
 - Dr Isabel Rozas (Chemistry)
 - Ms Sheila Ryder (Pharmaceutics)
 - Dr Stephen Smith (Microbiology)
 - Mr Gerard Tobin (Nursing Studies)
 - Dr Cathal Walsh (Statistics)
 - Ms Fiona Wilson (Physiotherapy)
 - Dr Gillian Wylie (Peace Studies, Irish School of Ecumenics)

Council noted that the Committee will meet again in Trinity Term 2004 to complete the review of Lecturers approaching the Merit Bar, to review Lecturers completing the full period of their probation and to conduct the initial probationary review of Lecturers completing their first year in College.

35/B Academic Affairs Committee Minutes of the meeting of the Academic Affairs Committee held on 24th February 2004 had been circulated and the Senior Lecturer invited Council's attention to a number of issues, as follows:

- (i) **Admissions** Information on undergraduate applications for 2004-2005 had been circulated to Deans and Heads of Department and a copy was tabled for the information of Council members. There had been an overall drop in the number of applications to Trinity. The number of applications to Computer Science courses had decreased across the sector. The Senior Lecturer noted that the Two-subject

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

Moderatorship programme presented structural difficulties in terms of filling quotas of subjects that combined with very popular subjects and that this will need to be addressed in the near future.

Council also noted that a study had been conducted to benchmark the Leaving Certificate against A Levels and the outcome of the study was currently being discussed by the Irish Universities. An outcome of this discussion may be a recommendation that Irish Universities should require students presenting A Levels to present four (rather than three) subjects and also that the points awarded for A Levels should be modified.

- (ii) **Medicine – five year curriculum** The Academic Affairs Committee had already approved the proposal to revise the medical degree curriculum from a six to a five-year programme. The academic year 2004-05 would be a transition year and there would be a reduction of quotas from 60 to 50 (for both EU and non-EU students) to facilitate the transition. In addition, approximately 50% of new EU entrants would be admitted to the second year and a mechanism to facilitate the selection of such students would be considered at the next meeting of the Academic Affairs Committee.
- (iii) **Final Report of the Academic Promotions Review Working Party** Council noted the comments of the Academic Affairs Committee on this report which would be circulated for discussion at a future Council meeting.
- (iv) **Admissions – Establishment of a 15% quota of CAO intake for non-traditional students** The Academic Affairs Committee had approved a proposal to establish a 15% quota for non-traditional students which included (a) students admitted under the Mature Student Dispensation; (b) students with a disability; (c) socio-economically disadvantaged students. Admissions under these categories represented 4%, 1% and 2% respectively of CAO intake in 2003 and it was noted that national targets were 10-15%, 3% and 5% respectively. All non-traditional students would compete for a place within the 15% quota and if this quota is not filled, the places will go to standard competitive applicants. Individual quotas for the three categories of students will not be established within the 15% but instead places available will be determined by the number of applications in each category. The Senior Lecturer noted that the Academic Affairs Committee had acknowledged that some non-traditional student groups require more academic and pastoral support and that a clear commitment from the College on this matter may help in securing additional funding.

Council approved this recommendation from the Academic Affairs Committee to take effect in the academic year 2004-2005, and acknowledged the importance of providing adequate funding for student support services.

- (v) **Bologna Process** The Senior Lecturer advised that the HEA had provided funding to support the progression of implementation of the objectives of the Bologna Declaration. The Deans' Committee had agreed a funding allocation for specific initiatives and a Call for Proposals had been issued. In addition, funding had been allocated to support the establishment of a Bologna Desk in College.

A status report on implementation of the Bologna objectives had been considered by the Academic Affairs Committee and would be circulated for consideration by Council at its next meeting. The Senior Lecturer undertook to raise with the CHIU Registrars' Group the issue of inclusion of non-academic activity on the Diploma Supplement.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

- (vi) **Introduction of Polish to the European Studies undergraduate programme**
Council noted and approved the introduction of Polish to the European Studies programme with effect from 2004-2005.

36/A Nominations for Appointment Dr Begley withdrew from the meeting for consideration of this item.

Council noted and approved the circulated information which is attached as Appendix 1 to the minutes, subject to a number of amendments relating to the use of titles which have not been approved by Council and procedural issues regarding the nomination of a Research Senior Lecturer, which should be processed initially through the Deans' Committee.

Council also approved the tabled nomination form for the appointment of Dr Cecily Begley to the Chair of Nursing and Midwifery (2004).

36/B Graduate Studies

- (i) **Proposal for an MSc in Economic Science** A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies dated 18th March 2004 had been circulated together with supporting documentation. It was proposed to introduce an MSc in Economic Science which would provide students with the training required to enter PhD programmes or to work as economists in the public and private sector. It was noted that the introduction of such a programme had been recommended by external reviewers of the Department. The Dean of Graduate Studies stated that students would be required to complete a preliminary course which would be held each year in September and provided they completed it satisfactorily, they would be invited to proceed to registration on the MSc.

The Dean of Business, Economic and Social Studies stated that the introduction of this programme would be in line with best practice internationally and he noted that it was being introduced by the Department within its existing resources in the initial years.

The one-year programme would be launched in 2004-2005 with an annual intake of 30-35 students (although there would be a reduced intake of 12-15 students in the first year).

Arising from the discussion, the Senior Tutor commented that there was no equivalent to a tutorial system for postgraduate taught course students and, as the relevant course director normally assumes related responsibility for students, this could potentially give rise to conflict. The Dean of Graduate Studies acknowledged the importance of providing adequate pastoral support for all students.

Council noted and approved the proposal as presented.

- (ii) **Higher Doctorates – Revision of Procedures** A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies dated 18th March 2004 had been circulated. In introducing this item, the Dean of Graduate Studies stated that in March 2002, the Graduate Studies Committee had suspended the awarding of higher doctorates by published research (DD, LLD, LittD, ScD, MusD) pending a revision of procedures. The Graduate Studies Committee and the Academic Affairs Committee had discussed revised procedures which were now presented for approval by Council. It was noted that the revisions addressed administrative procedures, the criteria for awarding the degrees, and the eligibility of applicants. Sample guidelines for applicants had also been circulated.

It was proposed that applications for admission to the register for higher doctorates will be considered once a year (in October) by a sub-committee of the Graduate Studies Committee. The sub-committee will decide whether to admit the applicant to the register for the purpose of external assessment, and where this is the case, two external assessors will be nominated by the Dean of Graduate Studies on the advice of the relevant Faculty Dean. Higher doctorates will be awarded to candidates who are judged by the University Council to have made an outstanding contribution to the advancement of knowledge, as evidenced by the publication of their work. The level of attainment required for a higher doctorate is substantially higher than that required for the degree of PhD. In terms of eligibility, candidates should be graduates of the University of Dublin of at least eight years' standing.

The Dean of Graduate Studies answered a number of questions and clarified points raised and Council approved the proposal as presented. It was noted that it would be necessary to make a number of changes to the Statutes and to the Calendar Part II.

37/A Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 24 February 2004 and noted by Board on 10 March 2004.

(i) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

MD Bartley David Sheehan.

(ii) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

PhD Ian Carroll; Ronan Kevin Carroll; Marie Fogarty; Conor Hayes; Eamonn Martin Kenny; Chantelle McCann; Sinead Mulready; Canice O'Brien; Cora O'Reilly; Roisin Reilly.

MSc Mark Rodgers-Lee.

37/B Graduate Studies Committee—Minutes The Council noted and approved the minutes of the meetings of the Graduate Studies Committee of:

- (i) 22 January 2004;
- (ii) 5 February 2004.

37/C Leave of Absence The Council noted and approved the following applications recommended by Deans and Heads of Department concerned on the usual basis, satisfactory proposals having been made for provision for teaching and other needs:

- (i) **Hebrew, Biblical and Theological Studies** Professor A D H Mayes – academic year 2004-2005;
- (ii) **Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering** Dr C Meskell – Hilary and Trinity terms 2005;
- (iii) **Nursing and Midwifery** Mr G A Tobin – Trinity term 2004;
- (iv) **Political Science** Dr N Persram – academic years 2004-2005 and 2005-2006.

37/D Career Break – Physiotherapy The Council noted and approved the request of Mr C Condon (Clinical Teacher) for a career break from 1 September 2004 to 31 August 2005 (at no cost to the Department).

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

38/A Faculty of Business, Economic and Social Studies – Business Studies and a Language Management Committee The Council noted and approved the membership of the following one-tier committee to replace the existing two-tier Management Committee/Co-ordinating Committee structure:

- Business Studies and a Language Director *chair*
- Language Co-ordinator for each language area: French, German, Russian, Chinese*, Japanese*
- International Exchange Co-ordinator in Business Studies
- Director of Undergraduate Studies in Business Studies
- Student Representatives (3) (1 Sophister, 2 Freshman)
- Secretaryship to rotate annually among the Language Co-ordinators

*to cease when Business Studies and Chinese/Japanese programmes are no longer offered.

38/B Nominating Committee to approve the membership of the following committee:

- Lectureship in Law and French (5-year contract)**
- Dean of the Faculty of Arts (Humanities)
- Dr H Delany
- Professor J Gratton
- Mr E O'Dell

Signed

Date

Appendix 1 to Actum 36/A

Nominations for Appointment – 31 March 2004

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
Biochemistry	Research Assistant	Smith, Liam, BSc (Uni. Westminster)	01.03.2004	28.02.2005
Biochemistry	Research Assistant	McManus, Gavin, BA Mod (Dubl.)	01.04.2004	30.10.2006
Botany	Research Fellow	Oksanen, Pirita Orvokki, MSc (Helsinki)	15.04.2004	31.03.2006
Civil, Structural & Environmental Engineering	Research Assistant	Brown, Leslie, BSc (Lond.), MSc (Dunelm)	13.04.2004	12.04.2006
Classics	Research Associate	Durigon, Albert Peter, BS (C.M.U.) JD (Pitt.), M.Litt., PhD(Dubl.)	01.02.2004	01.04.2004
Clinical Medicine	Visiting Academic	Xin, Xiaoqing, BSc (University of Medical Science) MSc. (Gui Yang Medical College)	01.04.2004	31.03.2005
Clinical Medicine	Research Fellow	Phillips, Catherine, PhD (Dubl.) BSc(NUI) Post Grad Dip Statistics (Dubl.)	20.03.2004	31.03.2005
Clinical Medicine	Research Fellow	Byrne, Maria, MB, BCh, BAO (NUI)	01.01.2004	31.12.2004
English	Visiting Professor	Toda, Tsutomu, BA, MA (Meiji-gakuin University, Tokyo)	01.04.2004	01.09.2004
Germanic Studies	Research Fellow	Bargna, Katya, MA (Liv.) Ph.D (Sheff.)	01.02.2004	31.01.2005
Immunology	Research Fellow	Dunne, Jean, PhD (Dubl.)	01.02.2003	31.07.2006
Mathematics	Part-time Lecturer	Duffy, Robert, Kenneth BA, PhD (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	30.09.2004
Mechanical & Manufacturing Engineering	Visiting Professor	Lee, Thomas Clive, MB, MSc, PhD, FRSCI, FRCS ED, MD (Dubl.)	01.10.2003	29.09.2006
Microbiology	Research Fellow	Mitchell, Jennifer BA (Dubl.)	01.03.2004	31.05.2004
Nursing and Midwifery Studies	Chair	Begley, Cecily M., R.G.N., R.M., R.N.T., M.Sc. (Dubl.), Ph.D. (Dubl.), Dip.N.Ed. (N.U.I.), Dip.Stats., F.F.N.R.C.S.I.	01.04.2004	permanent
Pharmacy	Research Fellow	George, John Phillips, BSc (Napier), PhD (H-W)	01.03.2004	31.03.2005
Psychology	Research Associate	Johnston, Neil, BA, Open (UK)	01.02.2004	31.01.2009
Psychology	Lecturer (Part-time)	Thakore, Jogin H, PhD, MRC Psych (Lond.), MRCPI, MB, BCh, BAO, BA, (Dubl.)	01.03.2004	01.03.2007