



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Minutes of Board Meeting 24 April 2019

Present Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor K Mitchell), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Professor D Ahern, Professor A Burke, Ms A Connolly, Mr J Cunningham, Mr S De Rís, Ms J Donoghue, Professor S M Draper, Ms S Farrell, Dr D Fayne, Mr D Grouse, Mr J Keogh, Professor K McTiernan, Professor R Moss, Professor B O'Connell, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor D R Phelan, Professor A Seery, Professor F Sheerin, Mr O Vince Coulter.

Apologies Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor L Brennan.

In attendance Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).

(ex officio) Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Interim Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).

(by invitation) Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

A photograph to mark the last meeting of the Board in the Boardroom of House 1 was taken before the start of the meeting.

SECTION A

BD/18-19/208 Statement of Interest

The Secretary to the College advised that no statements of potential conflicts of interest had been received.

BD/18-19/209 Minutes

The draft minutes of 27 March 2019, which had been circulated, were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

BD/18-19/181 Matters Arising

Amend the first sentence to read: **'(i) BD/18-19/153 Trinity Business School Update**

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the Sectoral Employment Order, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation clarified that the first phase of a dispute process: the meeting of the project Board had now concluded and an agreement had been reached by both parties.'

BD/18-19/182 Provost's Report

Amend the second last sentence to read: 'The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised that Architects for this project have been appointed with a proposal and design costs to be developed in 2019.'

BD/18-19/183 Consolidated Financial Statements for year ended 30 September 2018 and associated Letters of Representation to KPMG and the Comptroller & Auditor General (C & AG)

Amend minor typing errors in the third last paragraph and correct the final Action/Decision number to read 183.04.

BD/18-19/210 Matters Arising from the Minutes

The following items were raised under matters arising:

(i) BD/18-19/186 Brexit Risk Working Group Update

The Secretary to the College advised Board members that an update on this item would be provided at the next meeting of the Board.

(ii) BD/18-19/196 Audit Committee

The Secretary to the College advised Board members that an update on this item in respect of the Review of Completed and Risk Accepted Recommendations would be provided at the next meeting of the Board.

He also informed Board members that the Assistant Secretary had liaised with the secretaries of the relevant committees and confirmed that each of the committees were either already in compliance with the Meeting Hours Policy or would be in compliance by the start of the next academic year.

BD/18-19/211 Provost's Report

The Provost provided a report to the Board under the following headings:

- **Trinity Education Project (TEP)**

The Provost advised the Board that the Trinity Electives were formally launched on 27 March 2019 and would commence in the next academic year. He also noted that an audit had been conducted and it is envisaged that capstone projects would be a feature of all undergraduate courses in the coming academic year.

The Provost advised Board members that a meeting of TEP Plenary had recently been held and that regular updates on the project continue to be brought to meetings of the University Council.

- **Research**

The Provost advised the Board that six researchers from Trinity were among the twelve successful applicants for the Irish Research Council (IRC) Advanced Laureate Awards programme announced by Minister for Education and Skills, Joe McHugh and Minister of State for Training, Skills, Innovation and Research and Development, John Halligan. The recipients were noted as:

- Professor Adrian Bracken, School of Genetics and Microbiology;
- Professor Christine Casey, School of Histories and Humanities;
- Professor Seamus Martin, School of Genetics and Microbiology;
- Professor Lorraine O'Driscoll, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences;
- Professor Stefano Sanvito, School of Physics;
- Professor Igor Shvets, School of Physics.

The limited funding available to Principal Investigators at a national level was noted as an item of concern. In response to comments from a Board member the Provost advised that he plans to address this matter when he is Chair of the Irish Universities Association (IUA) Council. The Vice-

Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed Board members that this matter had been raised at the most recent meeting of IUA Presidents on 1 April 2019 in Belfast and in particular the small number of funding awards available relative to the number of applications.

- **Engineering, Environment and Emerging Technologies (E3)**

It was noted that a recalibrated business plan for this project is to be brought to a future meeting of the Board. The Provost advised the Board that a review of the governance of the project is being conducted and a new structure will be put in place to oversee the development of the project as it moves in to the capital planning project stage.

- **TTEC and the Grand Canal Innovation District**

The Provost advised that a revised governance structure for this project and detailed work-streams are being developed and would be brought before a future meeting of the Board. It was noted that the Innovation Advisory Group, chaired by Mr Martin Fraser, was meeting and that a report is due to be presented to Government soon.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Interim Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that the early phase of this project will see the preparation of the site and outlined the proposed timeline in respect of the planning, procurement and the building process.

- **Philanthropy**

The Provost had recently travelled to London to engage in philanthropic activity in respect of the proposed refurbishment of the Old Library. It was noted that the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation is the Chair of the group currently costing and developing the plans for this project.

- **Events**

(i) Philanthropic Campaign Launch

It was noted that the launch of the philanthropic campaign: Inspiring Generations is scheduled for 2 May 2019. The importance of having a robust communication plan for the campaign was acknowledged.

(ii) Opening of the Trinity Business School

The Provost advised Board members that An Taoiseach, Leo Varadkar, T.D., will open the new Trinity Business School building on 23 May 2019. The significant philanthropic support which facilitated the delivery of this project was acknowledged.

(iii) Chancellor Dr Mary Robinson

It was noted that the Chancellor, Dr Mary Robinson, is to finish her term as Chancellor of the University at the end of the current academic year. A portrait of Dr Robinson, which was philanthropically funded, is to be unveiled in the Dining Hall on 28 May 2019 and will be the first female portrait to be displayed in the Hall.

- **Pollard International Poetry Prize**

The Provost advised the Board that poet Hannah Sullivan was the recent winner of the inaugural John Pollard Foundation International Poetry Prize which is administered by the Trinity Oscar Wilde Centre in the School of English.

Professor O'Halpin joined the meeting at this point.

BD/18-19/212 Printing House Square – Quarterly Update

The Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O’Kelly, Dean of Students, Head of Capital Projects and Planning, Mr Greg Power, and Mr Joe Linders, Steering Committee Chair joined the meeting for this item.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised the Board that unfortunately the Independent Monitor was unavoidably unavailable for this meeting of the Board and that her report would be brought to the Board at the time of the next update on this project.

The Project Sponsor invited the Board’s attention to his presentation, dated 24 April 2019, which had been circulated. He provided Board members with an update on the progress of the project noting that the project was in week 89 of a total of 123 weeks. He advised the Board that while some slippage to the timeline had been observed every effort is being made to minimise future delays including items being tracked by the Project Manager on a weekly basis. Trinity is also actively engaged with the contractor in negotiating any revisions to the original schedule. Professor O’Kelly informed the Board that the financial model for the project is to be reviewed by the Financial Services Division to examine the impact of delays on the business case, noting that the project is currently within budget. He concluded his presentation by noting the risk register for the project.

Mr Linders, noting the importance of delivering the project on time and within budget, informed Board members that large construction projects can be subject to slippage but that significant efforts were being made to minimise the potential for delays to this project.

Responding to comments from Board members, Professor O’Kelly advised the Board that an external analyst has been engaged to review the proposed revision to the work programme and document any future potential risks of delay. Mr Power also clarified that written assurances had been received to confirm that appropriate sub-contracting arrangements were in place. He also informed the Board that the quality of the works to be conducted had been agreed at the design phase and this issue was being very closely monitored in addition to a tier 1 contractor having been appointed.

Professor O’Kelly, responding to queries from Board members, clarified the potential financial implications for Trinity arising from any revisions to the schedule of works and the Provost advised that should there be any unspent contingency it is to be returned to the College. Professor O’Kelly also noted the scenario planning and review of the financial plan being conducted by the Financial Services Division.

In response to further queries from a Board member, Professor O’Kelly advised that rigorous quality checks and inspections were being conducted on the building and the Chief Operating Officer advised that the Commercial Revenue Unit (CRU) is currently exploring ways by which occupancy can be maximised in the absence of student occupation.

The Provost closed the item by thanking Mr Linders and all those who are currently working on this project.

Action/Decision

212.01 The Board received an update from the Project Sponsor Professor Kevin O’Kelly, Dean of Students, Head of Capital Projects and Planning, Mr Greg Power and Mr Joe Linders, Steering

Committee Chair.

The Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O’Kelly, Dean of Students, and Head of Capital Projects and Planning, Mr Greg Power, Mr Joe Linders, Steering Committee Chair left the meeting at his point.

BD/18-19/213 Arts Building Refresh Project

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation invited the Board’s attention to her presentation dated 24 April 2019 and her document dated 11 April 2019, which had been circulated and acknowledged the contribution of Ms Sandra Kenny, Estates and Facilities, to this item. She advised the Board that as the project costs would exceed the threshold of €3million the project required the approval of the Board to proceed. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation summarised some of the recent works carried out under Phase 1 of the project including the installation of new carpet on levels 3, 4 and 5 of the building, additional power points and new student furniture on all levels. It was noted that Phase 2 is envisaged to be conducted in summer 2019 and will include improved acoustics, wayfinding and lighting and 5th and 6th floor garden landscaping.

She advised the Board that the tender process for the works in Phase 2 was nearing completion, estimates received were within budget and that the works were due to commence in June 2019. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation summarised the financial plan for the project, noting that the budget had been approved by the Finance Committee on 7 March 2019 and that funds arising from activities conducted by the Commercial Revenue Unit (CRU) were being used to deliver this project.

In response to comments from Board members, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation clarified that stakeholder engagement had been key to the development of the schedule of works and that the project is to be managed very carefully to minimise any potential for deviation from the proposed timeline. It was also noted that the proposal had been considered and endorsed by the Estates Policy Committee on 22 March 2019.

Responding to comments from a Board member, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised that the new way-finding strategy and improved signage will encourage the use of all stairwells in the building and minimise the potential for congestion.

Action/Decision

213.01 The Board received the presentation from the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and approved the award of the Works Contract for Phase 2 subject to the successful tender being within the pre-tender estimates and available budget.

BD/18-19/214 Nomination of Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer

The Provost advised Board that, following from the procedure established in 2008, he had invited his nominee for the position of Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Professor Jürgen Barkhoff, to attend the Board meeting to give a brief presentation of his vision for the role and to give Board members the opportunity to discuss some of these issues with him.

Professor Barkhoff joined the meeting at this point.

Professor Barkhoff informed the Board that he was grateful for the honour to be nominated for the role of Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, and acknowledged the high standard with which the current Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Professor Morash, had fulfilled the duties of the role.

Professor Barkhoff thanked the Board for the opportunity to highlight some of the principles that would guide him in fulfilling this role if so appointed. He noted that the role will involve striking a balance between financial, academic and operational needs and acknowledging the need to ensure the completion of key strategic projects such as TEP, E3 and the implementation of the new Strategic Plan 2019-2024. Professor Barkhoff also acknowledged the importance of focusing on morale, innovation, diversity and inclusivity and strong institutional self-governance with a focus on collegial decision making.

Professor Ahern and Ms Farrell left the meeting at this point.

The Provost thanked Professor Barkhoff and invited questions and comments from Board members.

Professor Barkhoff, in response to a query from a Board member, noted the importance of ensuring a sense of community amongst all staff in the University and of ensuring a sense of transparency and fairness in all activities.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer welcomed Professor Barkhoff's presentation and advised Board members that his office is working closely with Professor Barkhoff to ensure an appropriate handover is provided.

In response to comments from Board members, Professor Barkhoff noted the benefits and valuable experience he had gained from his time of being a College Tutor and welcomed the invitation to work closely with the student representatives during his time as Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

The Provost informed the Board that Professor Barkhoff will be formally nominated for the role of Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, along with the other Annual Officers, at the Board meeting of 22 May 2019.

Professor Barkhoff withdrew from the meeting at this point.

The Board approved the nomination of Professor Jürgen Barkhoff as Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer. The Provost advised that he would like to formally acknowledge the contribution of the current Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer to the university at a later date.

Action/Decision

214.01 The Board approved the memorandum from the Provost, dated 24 April 2019 and the nomination of Professor Jürgen Barkhoff as Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

Following the break, the Provost invited Ms Caroline Foley in to the meeting and, as this was the last time for the Board to meet in the current Boardroom, thanked Ms Foley for her work in catering for the Board meetings there.

BD/18-19/215 Report on MA jure officii (MAjo) Degrees

The Registrar introduced this item with reference to her memorandum and report, dated 22 April 2019, which had been circulated. She then invited the Board's attention to her presentation dated 23 April 2019 which had also been circulated. The Registrar provided the Board with an overview of the context in which such a degree is awarded and its relevance in respect of Senate membership. She also provided an overview of the various amendments which had been made to the relevant regulations since the first entry in the 1922/23 Calendar and gave a comparison of the Senate and similar structures in other universities. The Registrar concluded by summarising

three main considerations for the Board which included whether the current procedure is to continue, the equity of the procedure and the merits of the procedure in modern society.

The Provost thanked the Registrar and invited the views of the Board on how this matter should proceed. In response to comments from several Board members, the potential inequality of the current procedure was acknowledged.

Responding to comments from a Board member, it was agreed that the Registrar is to prepare a report on the membership of Senate and the criteria for this for discussion at a future meeting of the Board.

Action/Decision

215.01 The Board received the report from the Registrar.

215.02 The Registrar is to prepare a report on the membership of Senate and the criteria for this for discussion at a future meeting of the Board.

BD/18-19/216 Timeline for Fellows' Assents to Amend Chapter on the Fellows

The Registrar invited the Board's attention to her memorandum, dated 16 April 2019, which had been circulated. She advised the Board that at the meeting of 27 March 2019, Board had approved proposed amendments to the Chapter on the Fellows in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes to provide that members of academic staff, such as Ussher Assistant Professors, who become eligible to apply for Fellowship once they are permanent members of the academic staff, would have their prior time on contract count for the three-year eligibility period (BD/18-19/189 refers).

The Registrar clarified that the Board is now asked to set a return date for Fellows' Assents, pursuant to Schedule 2 to the Chapter on the Fellows, Section 2 (1), of 4pm on Tuesday 14 May 2019, and the date on which Assents shall be counted of Wednesday 15 May 2019.

Action/Decision

216.01 The Board approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, dated 16 April 2019 and invited the Fellows to grant their Assent to the Ordinance, setting a return date of 4pm on Tuesday 14 May 2019.

BD/18-19/217 Foundation Scholarship 2019

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies invited the board's attention to his memorandum, dated 15 April 2019, which had been circulated. He provided the Board with a summary of the criteria for candidates to be eligible for Scholarship and advised that, following a meeting of The Foundation Scholarship – Central Scholarship Committee fifty-eight candidates are being proposed for Scholarship. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies also provided a comparison of the number of applicants, attendees and Scholarships awarded over the past ten years. He also noted that the introduction of end of semester examinations had not impacted on the participation levels in the Scholarship examinations.

In response to a queries and comments from Board members, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies agreed to clarify the success rate of male and female candidates and there was agreement to explore possible ways of minimising the rate of absenteeism for future years to ensure a more efficient use of resources.

Following comments from several Board members in respect of the potential inequalities and issues with the current Scholarship examination process, it was agreed that the Executive Officers' Group is to consider the possibility of conducting a review of the process and report back to a future meeting of the Board.

Action/Decision

217.01 The Board noted and approved the report from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 15 April 2019, and the award of Scholarship in 2019. Those proposed for Scholarship would be formally elected at a meeting of the Board on Trinity Monday, 29 April 2019.

217.02 It was agreed that the Executive Officers' Group is to consider the possibility of conducting a review of the process and report back to a future meeting of the Board.

BD/18-19/218 Strategic Plan Update

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited the Board's attention to his presentation, dated 24 April 2019, which had been circulated. He provided Board members with an update on the preparation of the new Strategic Plan 2019-2024. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer provided the Board with a summary of the proposed timeline noting that the final draft of the plan is to be presented at a joint meeting of the Board and Council on 19 June 2019. He summarised the proposed pillars of the new Plan and updated the Board on the next steps in the process, advising Board members that it is proposed to connect the operational targets from existing strategies and projects and to develop common themes and commitments for the Plan.

In response to comments from Board members the importance of engagement with all staff members and stakeholders and the potential to reflect the sustainability agenda in the Plan were acknowledged. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board members that his team are actively engaged in testing the achievability of the proposed targets for the plan. It was noted that, while it is important to ensure there is not a level of over-commitment in the Plan, it is appropriate to ensure there is a significant level of ambition and foresight in the targets that are set.

Responding to a query from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified the Interim Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer is a member of the working group that is reviewing the five-year financial plan to underpin the Strategic Plan and that five-year planning templates were being developed for use in future projects.

Action/Decision

218.01 The Board received the update from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer.

BD/18-19/219 University Council

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 10 April 2019.

BD/18-19/220 Any Other Urgent Business

There were no items of other urgent business.

SECTION B

BD/18-19/221 Board Business

(i) Callover

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 27 March 2019.

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 27 March 2019.

BD/18-19/222 Audit Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 12 March 2019.

BD/18-19/223 Engagement Advisory Group

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 13 December 2018.

SECTION C**BD/18-19/224 Fellowship 2019**

The Board noted that the circulated Memorandum from the Provost dated 4 April 2019 had been approved electronically by the Board on 4 April 2019.

BD/18-19/225 Almanack 2019/20

The Board noted the Memorandum from the Editor of the University Calendar, circulated, dated 17 April 2019.

BD/18-19/226 Chair of Coiste na Gaeilge

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 16 April 2019.

BD/18-19/227 Establishment of Endowment Fund for *Behind the Headlines*

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Director of the Trinity Long Room Hub Arts and Humanities Research Institute, circulated, dated 27 February 2019.

BD/18-19/228 McGillp Project Prize in Physics

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Head of the School of Physics, circulated, dated 16 April 2019.

BD/18-19/229 Code of Governance (see BD/18-19/188)

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 15 April 2019.

BD/18-19/230 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 10 April 2019.

BD/18-19/231 Proctors' Lists for Spring Commencements

The Board noted that the Proctor's Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 9 April 2019.

BD/18-19/232 Dean of the Faculty of Health Sciences (2019-2024)

The Board noted that Professor Orla Sheils had been elected to the Dean of the Faculty of Health Sciences for a five-year term to commence on 25 April 2019.

BD/18-19/233 Dean of the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences (2019-2024)

The Board noted that Professor Gail McElroy had been elected to the Dean of the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences for a five-year term to commence on 3 June 2019.

BD/18-19/234 Head of School of Creative Arts (2019-2022)

The Board noted that Professor Ruth Barton had been elected to the Head of School of Creative Arts for a three-year term to commence on 25 April 2019.

BD/18-19/235 Sealings

The Board noted the sealings, as circulated, and attached as Appendix 1 to this Minute.

This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: