



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Minutes of Board Meeting of 25 April 2018

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G S Martin), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Professor D Ahern, Dr O Braiden, Mr S Collins, Professor S M Draper, Ms S Farrell, Dr D Fayne, Professor R Gilligan, Mr K Keane, Mr J Keogh, Professor C Laudet, Professor B M Lucey, Ms A MacPherson, Professor C McCabe, Mr D McClean, Professor R Moss, Professor D R Phelan, Professor A Seery, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor R Timoney.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor E O'Halpin.
<i>In attendance</i>	Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr I Mathews).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

SECTION A

BD/17-18/199

Statement of Interest

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that there was a potential conflict of interest for two Board members, the Registrar and Mrs Mary Foody, in respect of agenda item A.5 E3 Business Case, as they are both staff members in the School of Natural Sciences. Having discussed the matter with both individuals and with the Head of School, the Secretary to the College proposed, and it was agreed, that both Board members should remain and take a full part in the meeting for that item as the proposals in the agenda item would have no direct personal or financial impact on those individuals.

The Provost advised the Board that, in respect of agenda item C.23 Service Level Agreement with Trinity Brand Commercial Services Ltd, a potential conflict of interest existed for the Secretary to the College, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer and the Chief Operating Officer as they are Directors of the company. Having considered the matter, the Provost proposed, and it was agreed, that all of those concerned should remain and take a full part in the meeting for that item as the proposals in the agenda item would have no direct personal or financial impact on those individuals.

BD/17-18/200

Minutes - Meeting of 28 March 2018 and 9 April 2018

The minutes of the Board meeting of 28 March 2018 were approved and signed subject to the noting of Professor Phelan's dissent to minute BD/17-18/178, Action/Decision: 178.2.

The minutes of the Board meeting of 9 April 2018 were approved and signed.

BD/17-18/201

Matters Arising from the Minutes

The following item was raised as a matter arising as follows:

(i) BD/17-18/172 Tobacco Policy Committee: Tobacco Free Zones Report

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that having liaised with the President of the Students' Union, he could confirm that the student poll has now been completed and the

results are to be brought to the Tobacco Policy Working Group. The findings will be brought to the next meeting of the Board.

BD/17-18/202 Provost's Report

There was no report provided by the Provost on this occasion as an extensive report had been provided at the previous meeting.

The next two items were taken at this point in the meeting.

BD/17-18/203 Description of Undergraduate Students – Dubium for the Visitors

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item with reference to his memorandum dated 18 April 2018 which had been circulated. He advised the Board that the Equality Committee had requested that the Board issue a dubium to the Visitors, i.e. a request for clarification in relation to the Statutes, on the position of alternative terms “Fresh” and “Fresher” for first and second year students.

Action/Decision

203.1 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 18 April 2018 and approved the request for a dubium to be issued to the Visitors.

The Registrar joined the meeting at this point.

BD/17-18/204 Senior Academic Promotions and Junior Academic Progressions effective 2018/19

The Provost, with reference to his memorandum, dated 23 April 2018, which had been circulated, advised the Board that it is proposed to proceed with the Senior Academic Promotion Procedure according to the financial envelope as had been confirmed by the Financial Services Division.

The Provost also advised Board members that the Junior Academic progression process is to proceed as normal.

In response to comments from Board members the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified the timings of the Junior Academic progression process. He also clarified that further detail on the relevant criteria, including creative works, would be circulated to the Faculty Deans in due course.

Action/Decision

204.1 The Board approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 23 April 2018.

BD/17-18/205 Update on Plans for Trinity @Grand Canal Quay

The Provost welcomed the Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer, Dr Diarmuid O'Brien, to the meeting.

The Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer invited the Board's attention to his presentation, which had been circulated, and advised Board members that a model of the proposed development would be available to view in the Provost's Library during the break in the meeting. He provided the Board with a summary of the vision for the site, an update on the plans since the previous Board update and gave an overview of the plans for the next six months. He also informed the Board that a firm had been appointed to develop the masterplan which is envisaged will come to the Board at the end of the year and that development of a business case would commence shortly. He concluded by noting that this is a generational and national opportunity which is ambitious but achievable.

The Provost thanked the Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer and opened the item for questions and comments. The following points were noted in relation to the potential development:

- The importance of an appropriate arts/sciences balance and of engaging with the School of Creative Arts and The Lir;
- The possibility of including additional library facilities;
- The importance of appropriately engaging with existing tenants and occupiers;
- The potential for expansion of the Science Gallery.

In response to comments from a Board member in relation to the financial aspects of this proposal, the Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer advised that in the medium term the University would have a significantly enhanced asset that will benefit Trinity.

Responding to comments from a Board member regarding the use of the space, the Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer advised that dialogues with all relevant Schools will be held and it is envisaged that space will be allocated taking many factors in to account.

The Provost, responding to comments from a Board member, noted that the masterplan will be brought to a future Board meeting for approval. He noted that the development is to be undertaken through a phased building process with each construction project requiring the approval of the Board. The Provost also noted that many discussions are on-going and that this was an update to keep Board members informed at an early stage.

Professor Gilligan joined the meeting at this point.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation, following a query from a Board member, noted that the relocation of some activities to Grand Canal Quay would in turn create other space opportunities on the campus and that there is ongoing activity to identify alternative buildings and sites to acquire as they become available.

The importance of engaging with the neighbourhood and the city was acknowledged. The Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer noted that he had met the Chair of the St. Andrew's Resource Group and that the Community Liaison Officer, Professor Ciaran O'Neill, is actively engaged in the plans. The opportunities for local employment and additional educational opportunities for those in the surrounding area were acknowledged.

Action/Decision

205.1 The Board received a report from the Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer, dated 16 March 2018.

The Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer left the meeting at this point.

BD/17-18/206 E3 Business Case

The Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor Vinny Cahill and Mr Paul Coote, Project Appraisal Manager, joined the meeting for this item and it was noted that Ms Edwina Hegarty would not be attending.

The Provost welcomed the Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor Vinny Cahill and Mr Paul Coote, Project Appraisal Manager to the meeting and the Secretary to the College reminded Board members of the confidential nature of this item.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation introduced this item with reference to her presentation which had been circulated and provided the Board with a brief overview of the business case for the E3 project.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Dean of the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Sciences advised the Board that this project is to facilitate the expansion of the School of Computer Science and Statistics, the School of Natural Sciences and the School of Engineering with a strategic growth of 40% envisaged in each of the three schools. He further advised that a very substantial amount of planning had been conducted to date, including the development of realistic student recruitment plans which had been externally benchmarked.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation informed the Board that a detailed space planning exercise had been conducted across the three schools which examined both the existing space and likely future requirements. She noted that this project would not only see the development of a new building but would also involve the refurbishment of existing buildings including the O'Reilly Institute and the Museum Building. She also informed Board members that the result of the procurement process for the design team would be announced shortly. She noted that it is envisaged that the building will contain an increased number of collaborative and informal learning spaces to enhance the student experience and allow for flexible use of space. It was noted that the project would be subject to the required governance of the Programme Management Office and that the Board would be kept up to date at regular intervals.

Mr Coote advised that the E3 business case had been reviewed independently and approved by the Finance Committee on 23 April 2018 it was also the first large financial project to have an independent financial assessment by Ernst & Young in accordance with the Indecon recommendations to the Board last June. Mr Coote provided the Board with a summary of the key financial figures over 30 years, highlighting a net surplus of €56m, internal rate of return of 14.33% and a positive net present value of €112m. In addition, he summarised the impact on the financial reporting of the University (GAAP) position and some of the potential financial scenarios that may impact on the project noting that all would leave the project in a positive financial position. He noted for the Board that this project would be outside of the Baseline Budgeting Model (BBM) and as such a derogation from this budgeting process is required. In response to a question from a Board member on the period of the BBM derogation, it was noted that this derogation would be reviewed after 5 years.

Mr Coote confirmed the funding sources as those from Government and philanthropy with financing from the European Investment Bank and another bank. He also noted that the project had been classified as a self-financing project by the Higher Education Authority (HEA), as a result it would be excluded from the HEA borrowing framework. The HEA had requested that any additional income generated would first be allocated to repay loan interest and loan repayments.

In response to a question from a Board member, it was confirmed that staff numbers will only increase in line with student target being achieved.

In response to queries from Board members the Bursar/ Director of Strategic Innovation confirmed that due consideration had been given to the potential impact of Brexit on this project and that the proposed budget, which contained a contingency element, had been externally validated.

The Provost advised that any decision on the project is subject to State funding being secured and that if successful, it is reasonable to assume that substantial matching philanthropic income will also be secured. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that the European Investment Bank is likely to recommend this project to its Board in July 2018.

Professor Lucey left the meeting at this point.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Provost advised that the projected growth in student numbers across the three schools is to be conducted in a planned and strategic manner. Professor Cahill confirmed that considerable independent market analysis had been

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

conducted and had demonstrated that there was a demand in the market and as such there was a level of confidence that this planned growth could be achieved.

Responding to comments from Board members, Professor Cahill provided the Board with a summary of the planned recruitment process, noting that the refurbishment of existing space would facilitate the accommodation of new staff and research teams while the building work was being conducted. The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation also summarised the costs which would be met by the initial funding request.

The complexities of undertaking three large capital projects concurrently, one of which is on a fully internal site, were acknowledged. However, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation noted that the works on the Trinity Business School are envisaged to be completed by the end of 2018 which will create some additional capacity and she reminded the Board that all projects have a project manager who will liaise closely with Estates and Facilities to schedule works appropriately and minimise potential disruption for the main stakeholders.

The Provost closed the item noting that it is envisaged that demolition will commence at the end of 2019, subject to planning approvals as appropriate.

Action/Decision

206.1 The Board considered and approved the Business Case from the Bursar/ Director of Strategic Innovation in her memorandum dated 18 April 2018 subject to the receipt of Government funding to support this project.

The Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor Vinny Cahill and Mr Paul Coote, Project Appraisal Manager, left the meeting at this point.

BD/17-18/207 General Data Protection Regulation

The Provost welcomed the Data Protection Officer, Ms Jennifer Ryan, to the meeting.

Ms Ryan invited the Board's attention to her memorandum, dated 18 April 2018 and presentation, which had been circulated and reassured Board members that significant efforts are being made to assist the University in meeting its requirements under the new General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR). She provided the Board with an overview of the obligations under the new law and outlined the possible actions of enforcement which may be applied to the University if found to be in breach of the legislation. In addition, Ms Ryan gave an overview of some of the immediate actions required under the GDPR project implementation plan. She advised that a significant number of further tasks would need to be completed and noted that it is envisaged that additional resources would be required to assist in the project as a whole. Ms Ryan concluded her presentation by advising Board members that it is envisaged that a risk-based approach will be adopted so that the compliance needs of high risk areas such as the Academic Registry and Human Resources will be addressed in the first instance. The Provost thanked Ms Ryan and the Board noted that any need for additional resources to assist with the GDPR Implementation Project will be considered by the Executive Officers' Group.

In response to comments from Board members, the importance of allocating additional resources was acknowledged and welcomed. The need for clear guidelines for staff and students across the University was also acknowledged. Ms Ryan advised that an online training module had been developed and that a series of Frequently Asked Questions and further guidance is available on Trinity's Information Compliance webpage. Lack of compliance with the legislation was noted as a potential significant issue for the University. Ms Ryan, responding to comments from Board members, advised that there is some lack of clarity at present in relation to the responsibility of the university for data protection operations of students particularly research students. It is envisaged that once Trinity can demonstrate reasonable

efforts are being made to ensure compliance; any potential enforcement outcomes would also be reasonable and proportionate.

In response to queries from Board members, the Secretary to the College clarified that under the legislation he is classified as the Data Controller for the University and would be deemed accountable, as appropriate, under the legislation. He clarified that individual staff members might also be accountable under the legislation, depending on the circumstances. He also advised that he is Chair of the GDPR Working Party. He clarified that the GDPR project implementation plan will be rolled out in keeping with the current Divisional and Faculty structures and it is envisaged that some areas/schools will have similar needs and a common approach will be adopted.

Professor Gilligan, noting that he had raised this item on behalf of the Audit Committee, emphasised the importance of ensuring adequate resources, commensurate to the level of associated risk, are available to the project.

The Chair of the Library and Information Policy Committee advised the Board that she and the Information Security Manager are both members of the GDPR Working Party and that a set of IT proposals had been approved by the Committee and will be rolled out in due course.

Responding to comments from a Board member, the Secretary to the College noted that it may be beneficial to seek legal advice in respect of the legislation as to the classification of Trinity as a public body and the obligations of the university in respect of research students.

Action/Decision:

207.1 The Board considered and noted the memorandum from the Data Protection Officer, Ms Jennifer Ryan, and the Secretary to the College dated 18 April 2018.

207.2 The Board noted that any need for additional resources to assist with the GDPR Implementation Project will be considered by the Executive Officers' Group and Planning Group as appropriate.

Ms Ryan left the meeting at this point.

BD/17-18/208 University Council

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 4 April 2018

BD/17-18/209 Any Other Urgent Business

The Provost, on behalf of the Board, extend his congratulations to Mr McClean on his recent election as Vice-President for Welfare of the Union of Students of Ireland (USI).

SECTION A.2

BD/17-18/210 Review Procedures for Clinical Staff Promotion

Director of HR, Ms Antoinette Quinn, and the Head of the School of Medicine, Professor Michael Gill, joined the meeting for this item.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, with reference to the Memorandum dated 18 April 2018, which had been circulated, provided the Board with a summary of the new review procedures for Clinical Staff promotion noting that the procedure was now aligned with the Senior Academic Promotions process. He advised that this cohort of staff were unremunerated and provided undergraduate and postgraduate teaching within the Faculty of Health Sciences.

Professor Gill, noting that there are no financial implications to these procedures, acknowledged the significant contribution to the Faculty by the individuals concerned. He advised the Board, that as Head of School of Medicine, he welcomed the procedures noting that

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

the weightings were very appropriate and that the procedures were very rigorous by comparison externally.

Responding to comments from Board members, Professor Gill clarified the rationale for the use of the Clinical Senior Lecturer title and advised that a moderate number of applications is envisaged as many of the staff members involved would not fulfil the criteria due to work commitments.

The Director of Human Resources noted an amendment to section 11.6 to remove the word 'normally'.

The Provost closed the item, noting that the procedures were approved and that a call will be issued in due course.

Action/Decision

210.1 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 18 April 2018.

Ms Quinn and Professor Gill left the meeting at this point.

SECTION B

BD/17-18/211 Board Business

- (i) Callover
The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 28 March 2018.
- (ii) Outcomes
The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 28 March 2018.

BD/17-18/212 Equality Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 5 April 2018.

BD/17-18/213 Quality Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 22 March 2018.

BD/17-18/214 Human Resources Committee

This item was deferred.

SECTION C

BD/17-18/215 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, circulated, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 4 April 2018.

BD/17-18/216 Proctors' Lists for Spring Commencements

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 10 April 2018.

BD/17-18/217 Headship of Schools

The Board noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) Professor Damian Murchan (Assistant Professor) to the Headship of the School of Education from 26 April 2018 for a three-year term to the end of Trinity Term 2021;
- (ii) Professor Gail McElroy (Professor in Political Science) to a second term in the Headship of the School of Social Sciences and Philosophy, for a three-year term 2018 to the end of Trinity Term 2021.

- BD/17-18/218 HEA Borrowing Framework & Loan Guarantee**
The Board noted the memorandum from Mr Paul Coote, Project Appraisal Manager, circulated, dated 16 April 2018.
- BD/17-18/219 Prizes and Other Awards**
- (i) Postgraduate Travelling Scholarship, Sir Edward Halloran Bennett Medal in Surgery and the Sheppard Memorial Prize**
The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Administrator, Research & Postgraduate Education, School of Medicine, circulated, dated 29 March 2018.
 - (ii) Visual and Performing Arts Fund 2017/18**
The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 29 March 2018.
- BD/17-18/220 Progression and Awards – Criteria for the Award of a Gold Medal**
The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 18 April 2018.
- BD/17-18/221 Annual Governance Statement**
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 18 April 2018.
- BD/17-18/222 Service Level Agreement with Trinity Brand Commercial Services Ltd.**
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 17 April 2018.
- BD/17-18/223 Printing House Square – Appointment of Independent Monitor**
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Dean of Students, Project Sponsor, circulated, dated 19 April 2018.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: