

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Minutes of Board Meeting of 22 February 2017

Present Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior

Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G S Martin), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Professor D Ahern, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Dr O Braiden, Mr S Collins, Professor S M Draper, Ms S Dunphy, Ms S Farrell, Dr D Fayne, Professor R Gilligan, Mr J Keogh, Professor C Laudet, Professor B M Lucey, Professor C McCabe, Mr K McNulty, Professor R Moss, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor A Seery, Professor R

Timoney, Mr D Whelehan.

Apologies Mr T Keohane, Ms A Ní Lochlainn, Professor D R Phelan.

In attendance Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).

(ex officio) Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr I Mathews).

(by invitation) Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

SECTION A

BD/16-17/138 Statement of Interest

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that he had received a statement of potential conflict of interest from Professor Phelan in relation to Agenda item A.12 Visitors.

BD/16-17/139 Minutes - Meeting of 25 January 2017

The minutes of the Board meeting of 25 January 2017 were approved and signed

BD/16-17/140 Matters Arising from the Minutes

The following items were discussed:

BD/16-17/116 Formal engagement with staff representative groups on job evaluation The Chief Operating Officer provided the Board with an update on recent engagement with the staff representative groups and on the job evaluation process. She advised that consultation was on-going and it is envisaged that the final job evaluation proposal would be brought to the Executive Officers Group and the Human Resources Committee in April 2017.

BD/16-17/114 Assurances required by Trustees of the Trinity Foundation

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised the Board that he had resigned as a Trustee of the Trinity Foundation, in order to avoid any potential conflict of interest.

BD/16-17/141 Provost's Report

The Provost provided the Board with an update on his work in the past month under the following headings:

• Trinity Education Project

The Provost advised the Board that a significant level of engagement with the Fellows had been conducted in respect of providing information to the Fellows regarding their assent to amending the Statutes to allow for the flexibility to hold end of Semester examinations. He also advised the Board that the Senior Lecturer is co-ordinating an independent review of entry routes to the Two-Subject Moderatorship programme and other two-subject combinations. The Terms of Reference for this review are to be considered at the next meeting of Council on 8 March 2017.

• F3

The Provost informed the Board that two meetings of the steering committee for the E3 project had taken place. The development of a hiring plan is currently underway and that this planning will be done in a considered way according to the research strategy, interfacing with industry and with a view to meeting global needs. It was also noted that the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation is, with the steering committee, progressing with planning for the proposed E3 Phase 1 building.

Philanthropy

The Provost informed the Board that he had attended several engagements with Alumni in Great Britain over the last month noting that there is a considerably large network of Alumni based there, especially in the London area.

In addition, the Provost, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer (Dr Diarmuid O'Brien) had visited the White City Campus at Imperial College London to consider potentially similar opportunities for the development of the TTEC site or Pearse Street. It was noted that the Chief Innovation and Enterprise Officer is to develop the proposal for the development of the TTEC site.

Campaign and Cancer Institute

It was noted that the membership of the Development Group for the Cancer Institute had been established. The full proposal is to be developed further in the coming months and will be brought to a future meeting of the Board for consideration.

Rankings

It was noted that the Times Higher Education (THE) World University Rankings had been re-issued with the data for Trinity being revised for the past two years resulting in more favourable outcomes for the university. The contributions of the Dean of Research and Head of Strategic Research Initiatives in reviewing and ensuring that the most accurate data was being utilised for this submission by Trinity was acknowledged.

Strategic Fund from Commercially Generated Revenue

The Provost advised the Board that a new strategic fund is to be established from the additional revenue generated by the Commercial Revenue Unit. While some of this fund may be used to mitigate the cost of the depreciation of infrastructure, it is envisaged that it will also be used to fund new academic activities including new hiring and start-up funds.

• Society of International Affairs Event

The Provost conveyed to the Board his disappointment with the cancellation of the Society for International Affairs event on Monday, 20 February 2017. The Israeli Ambassador, HE Ze'ev Boker, had been due to address the student society but the event was cancelled before he arrived at the proposed venue amid security concerns after protestors from inside and outside the university threatened to disrupt the event. Noting the importance of the principle of freedom of speech and the free exchange of ideas, the Provost advised the Board that he had contacted the Ambassador to express the College's profound regret that the Ambassador had been prevented from speaking. The Provost advised the Board that Ambassador Boker had been a regular visitor to Trinity since his appointment and he looked forward to welcoming the Ambassador back to Trinity to speak again in the near future. The Provost confirmed that appropriate follow-up actions were being pursued and the importance of appropriate security for such events was also acknowledged.

Action/Decision

141.1 It was agreed that the Dean of Research would be asked to provide an update on Rankings at the next meeting of the Board.

The Provost invited any comments on his report and a number of members raised queries on which information or clarification was provided.

BD/16-17/142 Proposed New Method for Strategic Hires

The Dean of Research and the Director of Human Resources attended for this item.

The Director of Human Resources, with reference to the revised document which had been circulated, provided Board members with a summary of the amendments made to the proposal following consideration by the Board on 25 January 2017 (BD/16-17/117 refers). She informed Board that these changes had subsequently been approved by Council on 8 February 2017.

The Dean of Research advised the Board that in all cases of the strategic hires which had been conducted since 2000 all of the individuals had taken on leadership roles and were engaged in teaching at undergraduate and postgraduate level.

During discussion on this item, further amendments were suggested by Board members and it was agreed that these amendments would be incorporated in to the proposal. Following a query from a Board member, it was clarified that feedback would be provided to unsuccessful candidates in the normal manner by the Dean of Research, the Faculty Dean or the Director of Human Resources, as appropriate. The importance of ensuring sustainability and support for such strategic appointments was acknowledged and those issues would be included in each business case.

The Provost thanked the Dean of Research and Director of Human Resources, and agreed to advise the Board, under Matters Arising at the next meeting, in relation to the adoption of the further amendments, as noted below.

Action/Decision

- **142.1** The Board considered and approved the revised memorandum from the Dean of Research and Director of Human Resources dated 15 February 2017, subject to some further amendments.
- **142.2** It was agreed that the terms of reference of the Board Sub-Committee on Remuneration would be amended to include monitoring and reporting to the Board on gender balance issues in its work.
- **142.3** It was also agreed that the selection committee would include a second external member, if required, to provide gender balance.
- **142.4** Professor Ahern agreed to liaise with the Director of Human Resources to suggest amendments to some of the text in the document and in particular the wording in relation to the interview stage in the process and the performance review stages.
- **142.5** The Provost agreed to advise the Board, under Matters Arising at the next meeting, in relation to the adoption of these amendments.

The Dean of Research and the Director of Human Resources left the meeting at this point.

BD/16-17/143 Response to the HEA Gender Equality Review

The Equality Officer, Ms Aoife Crawford, attended for this item.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item with reference to his memorandum, dated 15 February 2017, which had been circulated. He advised the Board that a working group of the Equality Committee (HEA Review Implementation Plan Working Group) had drafted the implementation plan in response to the HEA National Review of Gender Equality in Irish Higher Education Institutions. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted the importance of integrating gender equality in to all aspects of the university's

activity. He advised the Board that the Higher Education Authority will be monitoring progress towards the achievement of gender equality by Higher Education Institutions. He also noted that it is envisaged that the working group will report biannually to Board.

Professor Alyn-Stacey joined the meeting at this point.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer acknowledged the work of the Equality Officer in clarifying the implications of the HEA Review for Trinity and outlined the planned approach for the implementation of the recommendations in the report.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and opened the item for comments and questions.

During the course of discussion these were among the points noted:

- Cost and resource implications should be considered when progressing the proposed actions:
- The ambitious nature of the proposed work plan;
- Consideration should be given to identifying ways of capturing non-binary gender data.

The Provost thanked the members of the working-group for their work on this response to date noting that a significant work programme had been identified and that it is important for Trinity to continue to show leadership and commitment on this issue.

Action/Decision

143.1 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 15 February 2017.

BD/16-17/144 Commercial Revenue Unit Results 2015/16

The Commercial Director, Mr Adrian Neilan, attended for this item.

The Commercial Director, with reference to his document dated 14 February 2017, which had been circulated, provided the Board with a summary of the financial performance of the Commercial Revenue Unit (CRU) for 2015/16 in comparison to the prior year. He also summarised the performance of the unit since its establishment in 2012/13 and considered its performance with respect to the budget allocated. He advised the Board that the contribution of the CRU to the university had increased by 22% on the previous year and by 59% since the 2012/13 baseline level. He also gave an overview of some of the activities which had contributed to achieving this growth.

The Provost opened the item for discussion noting that revenue generated in the year 2015/16 by CRU had been used to fund approximately 40 Ussher lectureships as well as other initiatives.

In response to comments from Board members, the Commercial Director outlined the governance structures in place in CRU and acknowledged the importance of protecting the reputation and assets of the university. He also advised Board members that thanks had been conveyed to the members of the University's services teams for their continued support over the year. The intangible benefits for the university from the activities of the CRU were also acknowledged.

The Provost thanked Mr Neilan and all of the CRU team for their contribution to the university noting the projected growth in income generation anticipated in the period up to 2021.

Action/Decision

144.1 The Board considered the document from the Commercial Director dated 14 February 2017.

144.2 It was agreed that the Commercial Director would prepare an update on how the income generated by the Commercial Revenue Unit is used to support teaching and research activities for a future meeting of the Board.

BD/16-17/145 Trinity Development and Alumni Business Case

Director of Trinity Development and Alumni, Mr Nick Sparrow, and Director of Campaigns, Trinity Development and Alumni, Ms Kate Bond, attended for this item.

The Provost introduced the item and welcomed Mr Sparrow and Ms Bond to the meeting. Mr Sparrow invited the Board's attention to his presentation which had been circulated. He provided the Board with an overview of the proposed Fundraising Campaign. In particular he noted the overall target and the importance of having a co-ordinated approach which builds on existing relationships.

Following queries from Board members, Mr Sparrow clarified that the projects to be included in the campaign had been selected by the Campaign Cabinet, which is chaired by the Provost.

The Provost, acknowledging the need to be ambitious in the campaign, advised that appropriate levels of risk analysis and management had been considered for each of the projects. It was noted that a feasibility study had also been conducted to inform the decision on the level of the target and Ms Bond assured Board members that the business case had been validated externally.

During the further discussion that followed, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised the Board that Trinity Development and Alumni is to report to Board on a bi-annual basis and that this will allow visibility on the projects as a whole, not just financially, as they are progressed. It was noted that the Trinity Development and Alumni would be working to the university's priorities.

Action/Decision

145.1 The Board considered and approved the Business Case from the Director of Trinity Development and Alumni dated 14 February 2017.

The Provost thanked Mr Sparrow and M Bond and they left the meeting at this point.

BD/16-17/146 Update on Douglas Hyde Gallery

The Provost welcomed the Chair of the Board of the Douglas Hyde Gallery, Professor Linda Doyle who joined the meeting for this item. Professor Doyle, with reference to her presentation, which had been circulated, provided Board members with a verbal update of the current status and future plans for the Douglas Hyde Gallery. In particular, she advised of recent revisions to the governance of the Gallery including the imminent appointment of a new Director and the preparation of a 5 year financial plan.

During discussion on this item the importance of maximising the use of the space and the potential to increase events in the Gallery was acknowledged.

The Provost advised Board members to liaise with the Secretary to the College should they wish to view the Memorandum and Articles of Association for the Gallery which had been approved by the Trinity Board. He then thanked Professor Doyle who left the meeting at this point.

Action/Decision

146.1 The Board received and noted the update from the Chair of the Board of the Douglas Hyde Gallery, Professor Linda Doyle.

BD/16-17/147 Honorary Degrees

The Registrar referred to her memorandum, which had been tabled. She reminded the Board of

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

the confidential nature of the memorandum and asked for all copies to be returned.

Action/Decision

147.1 The Board received the report from the Registrar on Honorary Degrees and approved the nominations contained within.

BD/16-17/148 The 2010 Consolidated Statutes – Assent of the Fellows

The Board received the report from the Registrar and noted that the Fellows had assented in two separate sets of amendments to the Statutes; 1) to the Chapter on the Fellows and 2) to the Introduction Chapter and Chapter on the Senate.

Professor Moss left the meeting at this point.

BD/16-17/149 Fellowship 2017

The Board approved the nominations for Fellowship and Honorary Fellowship as presented by the Provost.

BD/16-17/150 Visitors

The Board noted the verbal update from the Secretary to the College on this item in relation to a recent case heard by the Visitors and the related implementation.

BD/16-17/151 University Council

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 8 February 2017.

BD/16-17/152 Any Other Urgent Business

There was no other urgent business.

Professor Timoney left the meeting at this point.

SECTION A.2

BD/16-17/153 Campus Tours Policy

The Board welcomed Mr Adrian Neilan who provided a summary of the proposed policy to Board members. In response to a query from a Board member, Mr Neilan confirmed that the contract with the current tour provider, Authenticity Tours, had been revised and that any new arrangements would continue to be in compliance with public procurement requirements based on advice from the Secretary to the College and the College Solicitor.

Action/Decision

- **153.1** The Board noted and approved the Memorandum and draft Policy from the Commercial Director dated 14 February 2017.
- 153.2 It was agreed that the Commercial Director would liaise with the current tour provider in relation to recruitment practices and the use of appropriate gowns/ attire.

SECTION B

BD/16-17/154 Board Business

(i) Callover

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 25 January 2017.

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 25 January 2017.

BD/16-17/155 Finance Committee

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer drew the Board's attention to those minutes of particular relevance to the Board. The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 6 February 2017.

BD/16-17/156 Human Resources Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the Human Resources Committee meeting of 26 January 2017 and approved the process for employees on professional grades applying for internal recruitment competitions and the amendment to the membership of the Selection Committee for Technical Officer.

BD/16-17/157 Library and Information Policy Committee

The Chair of the Committee provided Board members with a summary of the main items of relevance to Board members. The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 5 December 2016.

BD/16-17/158 Equality Committee

The Chair of the Committee provided Board members with a summary of the main items of relevance to Board members. The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 6 February 2017.

SECTION C

BD/16-17/159 Meetings of Board and Council 2017-2018

The Board noted the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 15 February 2017.

BD/16-17/160 Senate Business - Recommendations for the award of the degree MA (jure officii)

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 14 February 2017.

BD/16-17/161 Approval to alter name of Degree under which graduate was admitted

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 14 February 2017.

BD/16-17/162 Higher Degrees

The Board noted the Higher Degrees, circulated, approved by the Sub-Committee of Board and Council on 8 February 2017.

BD/16-17/163 Prizes and Awards:

- The Carole King Annual Award and (ii) The Lorraine Andrews Medal & Bursary
 The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the School Administrative
 Manager, School of Nursing and Midwifery, circulated, dated 1 February 2017.
- (iii) Establishment of the Stanley Elliott Prize

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the School Manager, School of Engineering, circulated, dated 14 February 2017.

BD/16-17/164 Membership of Technical Staff Committee

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary, Technical Staff Committee, circulated, dated 8 February 2017.

BD/16-17/165 Trinity Asia Services Limited (TASL), Singapore

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College and Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, circulated, dated 15 February 2017.

BD/16-17/166 Associated Companies – Report of Director of Ghala DAC

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 15 February 2017.

BD/16-17/167 Related Entity Financial Reporting

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, circulated, dated 15 February 2017.

BD/16-17/168 Representation: Director of HEAnet

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Mr Patrick Magee, Interim Director of IT Services, as a Director of HEAnet.

BD/16-17/169 Heads of School

The Board noted and approved the appointment of Professor Andrew Loxley as Acting Head of School of Education with immediate effect, until the end of Trinity Term 2017, replacing Professor Carmel O'Sullivan who has stepped down before the end of her term of office.

BD/16-17/170 The H.O. White Memorial Lecture 2017 (Ref: Calendar Part 1)

The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the School of English that Professor Steven Gould Axelrod, University of California, Riverside, should present the 2017 H.O. White Memorial Lecture.

BD/16-17/171 Sealings

The Board noted the sealings as circulated, and attached as Appendix 1 to this Minute. This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.

Section D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:	
Date:	