



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

**Minutes of Board Meeting of 9 November 2016**

- Present* Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G S Martin), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Professor D Ahern, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Dr O Braiden, Mr S Collins, Professor S M Draper, Ms S Dunphy, Ms S Farrell, Dr D Fayne, Professor R Gilligan, Mr J Keogh, Professor C Laudet, Professor B M Lucey, Professor C McCabe, Mr K McNulty, Professor R Moss, Ms A Ní Lochlainn, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor D R Phelan, Professor A Seery, Professor R Timoney, Mr D Whelehan.
- Apologies* Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Mr T Keohane, Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).
- In attendance* Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
- (ex officio)* Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr I Mathews).
- (by invitation)* Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane).

**SECTION A**

**BD/16-17/056 Statement of Interest**

The Secretary to the College advised that a number of statements of interest had been declared and addressed each one as follows:

- Professor Claire Laudet had declared a potential conflict of interest in relation to Agenda item A.06 SITS User Group – Progress Update as she is a member of the SITS User Group. The Secretary to the College recommended, having considered the matter with the Chair of the User Group that Professor Laudet should take a full part in the discussion on this item, and the Board agreed.
- Ms Sheila Dunphy declared a potential conflict of interest in relation to Agenda item A.06 SITS User Group – Progress Update as she is working in IT Services. The Secretary to the College recommended, having considered the matter with the Director of IT Services that Ms Dunphy should take a full part in the discussion on this item, and the Board agreed.
- Ms Stephanie Farrell had declared a potential conflict of interest in relation to Agenda item A.06 SITS User Group – Progress Update as she is working in the Academic Registry. The Secretary to the College recommended, having considered the matter with the Director of Academic Registry that Ms Farrell should take a full part in the discussion on this item, and the Board agreed.
- Professor Brian Lucey had declared a potential conflict of interest in relation to Agenda item A.07 University Council as he was included in the nominations for promotion to Personal Chair which had been approved by Council. The Secretary to the College recommended, and the Board agreed, that Professor Lucey should excuse himself from the meeting for the discussion on this item.

**BD/16-17/057 Minutes - Meeting of 12 October 2016**

The Minutes of the Board meeting of 12 October 2016 were approved and signed.

**BD/16-17/058 Matters Arising from the Minutes**

There were no matters arising.

**BD/16-17/059 Provost's Report**

The Provost provided the Board with an update on his work in the past month under the following headings:

**(i) Global Relations and Philanthropy**

The Provost advised the Board that he had travelled to London, China and Singapore in the last month with significant funding opportunities for internship programmes being identified while in London. On his visit to China (17-24 October 2016), a Memorandum of Understanding and the Student Exchange Agreement between Tsinghua University and Trinity had been renewed and several Alumni events were held. The Provost had attended an Education in Ireland Reception with the Minister for Education and Skills, Mr Richard Bruton T.D. in the Embassy of Ireland in Beijing where the Minister addressed Irish Higher Education Institutions and their education partners. He also attended the China Education Expo. While in Shanghai, the Provost attended a meeting in Tongji University. In Singapore he met with Senior Officers from Singapore Institute of Technology and attended the Emerald Ball, an event for the Irish community in Singapore.

**(ii) Capital Projects**

The Provost provided the Board with an update on the following capital projects:

- **Trinity Business School**

It was noted that Dean Andrew Burke, Minister Richard Bruton and the Provost officially turned the sod on the new building for the Trinity Business School on Friday on 14th October 2016.

- **E3**

The Faculty Dean and three Heads of School from the relevant schools are preparing 10 year student number projections and estimates of the associated costs and income. Opportunities to deliver part of the E3 strategy on the TTEC site are also being considered.

**(iii) Mid-term Address**

It was noted that the Provost delivered his mid-term address on 14 October 2016.

**(iv) League of European Research Universities**

The Provost advised the Board that Trinity is expecting an announcement regarding membership of the League of European Research Universities (LERU) on Friday 18<sup>th</sup> November 2016. If successful this would see Trinity being the first and only Irish university to become a member of Europe's leading network of research-intensive universities that includes Oxford and Cambridge universities.

**(v) Campaign Cabinet**

Noting that the work of the Campaign cabinet was progressing, the Provost advised Board members that the shortlist of key projects was currently being reviewed. The cabinet are keen to increase the number of potential projects in the coming weeks and it is anticipated that the campaign will be officially launched in 2018.

**(vi) Trinity Education Project**

It was noted that the Trinity Education Project is progressing well and that a list of the desirable graduate attributes had now been identified and communicated to employers in a consultation process. The next phase of the project is to review

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

curriculum design and programme architecture. Linking of Trinity electives to the existing research themes is being considered.

**(vii) Trinity Visitor Experience**

At the invitation of the Provost, the Chief Operating Officer provided the Board with an update on the Trinity Visitor Experience and, in particular, the refurbishment works at the Nassau Street entrance. Noting that the project had encountered some issues and delays, she advised the Board that works were in progress and she thanked the College community for their patience at this time. The Chief Operating Officer also advised that the Discipline of Music were currently looking at pursuing a temporary move to resolve the issue of noise coming from the works at Front Gate. The importance of communication with staff and of learning from problems encountered for such large scale projects was acknowledged. The Board noted the verbal update from the Chief Operating Officer on the Trinity Visitor Experience.

**BD/16-17/060 Senior Academic Promotions Trinity College, Review of Policy and Operations**

The Provost welcomed Professor Linda Hogan, who joined the meeting for this item. Professor Hogan introduced her memorandum dated 1 November 2016, which had been circulated, and provided the Board with a summary of the report entitled 'Senior Academic Promotions at Trinity College Dublin, Review of Policy and operations', conducted by Professor Jeremy Sanders CBE, FRS, of the University of Cambridge. Professor Hogan advised the Board that this review had been conducted following a request from the Board in December 2015 (BD/15-16/095 refers). She then addressed each of the 13 recommendations within the report, recommending approval or providing comment for each.

The Provost thanked Professor Hogan and opened the item for discussion. During the course of the discussion a variety of views including the following points were noted:

- There is a need to revisit the current academic titles in use in the university;
- Consideration should be given to the provision of additional supports to academics taking on additional roles within the Schools, to enable them to maintain a threshold of performance in all areas;
- The university is financially constrained, with the Board tasked to ensure fiscal responsibility, and as such quotas are required to ensure the feasibility of any round of promotions;
- The application of quotas can result in qualified candidates not being promoted;
- The removal of the requirement to provide details of certain research metrics was welcomed.
- The recommendation for a greater commitment in the area of Equality & Diversity will be considered when preparing the university's response to the HEA National Review of Gender Equality in Irish Higher Education Institutions;
- Some recommendations could be of value to non-academic grades also.

**Action/Decision**

**060.1** The Board noted the Memorandum from Professor Hogan dated 1 November 2016 and the accompanying report.

**060.2** The recommendations in the report were approved as follows: 1-9 and 11-13. As regards Recommendation 3, option 3a was preferred. With respect to Recommendation 10, it was

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

agreed that the Vice-Provost /Chief Academic Officer would consider this recommendation further and propose modifications as appropriate.

**060.3** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer would now prepare detailed proposals and procedures to implement these decisions, which would come back to the Board for approval.

**060.4** It was also agreed that a communication would be issued to members of academic staff informing them that a copy of the report is available from the Secretary's Office should they wish to receive a copy.

The dissent of Professor Phelan in relation to Recommendation 1 was noted.

The Provost recorded his appreciation for the work of Professor Saunders and thanked Professor Hogan who left the meeting at this point.

#### **BD/16-17/061 Trinity Business School Quarterly Report to Board**

The Provost welcomed the Dean of the Trinity Business School, Professor Andrew Burke; Project Sponsor, Dr Gerard Lacey; and Independent Monitor, Mr Leo Harmon who joined the meeting for this item. Professor Burke, referring to his memorandum of 1<sup>st</sup> November 2016 which had been circulated, provided the Board with an update on the Trinity Business School Development Plan. He informed the Board that there had been a significant growth in revenue above that in the financial model due to the launch of five new programmes in the school and an increase in the number of non-EU taught postgraduate students registered on courses in the School. The Dean congratulated all of those who contributed to this growth noting that the resulting extra surplus is to be held in reserve in case it is needed to off-set below-budget performance in future years.

Dr Lacey, with reference to his presentation which had been circulated, informed the Board that the demolition of the Luce Hall was now complete and that the project was entering its highest risk phase, i.e. digging the foundations and basement floors which might uncover issues not picked up on the radar survey. While some delays due to unforeseen services found in the site had been experienced, it is hoped that this time will be regained at a future stage. He advised that it is envisaged that the project will remain within approved budget and summarised the philanthropic achievements to date.

The Independent Monitor advised the Board that full planning permission has been received for the project and that the project was proceeding accordingly. He noted that, in his view, the project team are working well together but that consideration could be given to resourcing some activities to ensure cohesion and to cement the team in achieving a successful outcome. Mr Harmon noted that the relationship with the contractor to date has been courteous and professional. He concluded by advising Board members that he will provide a further update to the Board in early 2017.

The Provost thanked Professor Burke, Dr Lacey and Mr Harmon and opened the item for discussion.

Responding to queries from Board members, it was noted that the School development plan had been rigorously reviewed by the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer and the Finance Committee. The planned growth was in keeping with similar practice in other universities and would see a balanced recruitment of both EU and Non-EU undergraduate and postgraduate students to meet the pedagogic objective of providing a high quality international learning environment in the classroom.

#### **Action/Decision**

**061.1** The Board noted the update on the Trinity Business School Project presented as follows:

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

- (i) Trinity Business School Development Plan – Memorandum from the Dean of the Trinity Business School dated 1 November 2016.
- (ii) Trinity Business School Project update – presentation from the Project Sponsor, Dr Gerard Lacey.
- (iii) Independent Monitor Report – Memorandum from the Independent Monitor Mr Leo Harmon dated 1 November 2016.

*Professor Andrew Burke, Dr Gerard Lacey and Mr Leo Harmon left the meeting at this point.*

**BD/16-17/062 SITS User Group – Progress update**

The Provost welcomed the Director of the Academic Registry, Ms Leona Coady, who joined the meeting for this item.

The Chief Operating Officer introduced this item and the document from Dr Alison Oldham, Director of Student Services, circulated in advance, and invited the Director of the Academic Registry to present an update on progress made in light of the recommendations from the SITS User Group.

Ms Coady, with reference to her presentation, informed the Board that many of the recommendations had already been implemented and provided an update in relation to the progress being made on the remaining items. She advised the Board that the SITS User Group is to reconvene to consider the future needs and requirements of the system, and in particular, to consider the impact of the Trinity Education Project.

*The Registrar left the meeting at this point to attend the Commencements ceremonies.*

During discussion, comments from Board members included:

- Some of the functionality can be quite cumbersome and can add to the administrative load for academic staff members;
- Consideration should be given to broadening the gender categories currently contained in the system;
- The 21<sup>st</sup> Century Administration project will contribute to resolving some of the remaining issues;
- The inability of students to access results should they have an outstanding balance owed to the university can cause difficulties for Tutors and also in terms of progression;
- The fact that registration for postgraduate students is often not completed until after the academic year has commenced can result in additional workload for staff as course materials have to be circulated separately due to an inability to access the relevant systems;
- The ability to view marks for a full cohort would be useful; the high turnover of staff in the Academic Registry can result in a loss of knowledge and expertise.

Following discussion the Provost advised that many of the issues raised will be fed back to the SITS User Group for consideration and the restrictions of a system that was not bespoke for the university was acknowledged.

**Action/Decision**

**062.1** The Board noted the progress update from the Director of the Academic Registry and the Chief Operating Officer.

The Provost thanked Ms Coady who left the meeting at this point.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

**BD/16-17/063 University Council**  
*Professor Lucey left the meeting for this item.*

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the University Council meeting of 26 October 2016 including the two supporting documents which had been tabled.

**Action/Decision**

**063.1** It was agreed that the details of staff members approved for promotion at meetings of Council would be listed in future sets of the minutes of the Council meetings.

**063.2** The Board noted the six recently appointed Trinity Education Fellows.

**BD/16-17/064 Any Other Urgent Business**  
 Following comments from Board members the importance of social spaces was noted.

**SECTION B**

**BD/16-17/065 Board Business**  
 (i) Callover  
 The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 12 October 2016.

(ii) Outcomes  
 The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 12 October 2016.

**BD/16-17/066 Audit Committee**  
 The Secretary to the College drew the Board's attention to those minutes of particular relevance to the Board.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 19 October 2016 and the Audit Committee Recommendations Log.

**BD/16-17/067 Estates Policy Committee**  
 The Chair of the Estates Policy Committee drew the Board's attention to those minutes of particular relevance to the Board.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of Estates Policy Committee meetings of 3 June 2016 and 5 October 2016.

**BD/16-17/068 Finance Committee**  
 The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer drew the Board's attention to those minutes of particular relevance to the Board.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of Finance Committee meeting of 26 October 2016.

**BD/16-17/069 Human Resources Committee**  
 The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 13 October 2016. The Board also noted and approved the following:

- Policy and Guidelines for supporting staff who are Breastfeeding
- Code of Practice applying to the employment of people with Disabilities.

**Action/Decision**

**069.1** It was agreed that the Diversity and Inclusion Strategy is to be further revised by the Chief Operating Officer and the Director of Diversity and Inclusion, in consultation with Professor R. Gilligan, and the revised strategy brought to a future meeting of the Board.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

**069.2** It was also agreed that the Chief Operating Officer, working with the Director of Human Resources, would organise for a communication to be issued to all professional, administrative, technical and support staff in relation to the process for seeking a review of their roles.

**BD/16-17/070 Quality Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the Quality Committee meeting of 6 October 2016.

**BD/16-17/071 Coiste na Gaeilge**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 14 July 2016.

### SECTION C

**BD/16-17/072 Compliance with the Companies Act 2014**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 2 November 2016.

**BD/16-17/073 Disciplinary Panel (Academic Staff)**

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Ms Cliona Kimber, SC as Chair of the Disciplinary Panel (Academic Staff) for a second period of three years with effect from February 2017, and further noted that this nomination had been approved by the Academic Staff Association on 11 October 2016.

**BD/16-17/074 Committee Membership - Student Conduct and Capacity**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar dated 1 November 2016.

**BD/16-17/075 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 26 October 2016.

**BD/16-17/076 Proctors' Lists for Autumn Commencements**

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 1 November 2016.

**BD/16-17/077 Prizes and Other Awards**

**(i) EC Smith Scholarship in Pathology**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from Dara O'Mahony, Postgraduate Administrator of the School of Medicine, dated 18 October 2016.

**(ii) Amendment to Collen Prizes**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the School Manager, School of Engineering, dated 28 October 2016.

**BD/16-17/078 Representation - Board of Directors Central Applications Office (CAO) – Membership**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 19 October 2016.

**BD/16-17/079 Sealings**

The Board noted the sealings.

### SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed: .....

Date: .....

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings