

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 6 November 2013

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor G J Lacey), Professor M Bourgoche, Dr O Braiden, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Professor E Drew, Ms S Dunphy, Mr D Frost, Mr J Gallagher, Mr G J Garrahan, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Mr R Kenny, Mr J Leahy, Mr T Lenihan, Professor J F McGilp, Professor N Marples, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor M Ó Siochrú.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor S D C Barrett, Mr S Garry, Professor D O'Neill, Professor H J Rice.
<i>In attendance</i>	Administrative Officer, Secretary's Office (Ms M M M Alcock).
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College (Mr John Coman), Treasurer (Mr I Mathews).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer (Ms D Kneafsey), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J H Ohlmeyer).

SECTION A

BD/13-14/066 New Board Member - Statutory Declaration

Ms Sheila Dunphy, elected as a Board member for the Technical, Administrative and Support Staff Constituency, made the statutory declaration. The Provost welcomed Ms Dunphy to the Board.

BD/13-14/067 Declaration of Interest

- (i) The Secretary advised that he had a potential conflict of interest in relation to Agenda Item A5 and withdrew from the meeting for the discussion.
- (ii) The Chief Operating Officer advised that she had a potential conflict of interest in relation to the tabled Interim COO Selection Committee and withdrew from the meeting for the discussion.

BD/13-14/068 Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of 9 October 2013 were approved and signed.

BD/13-14/069 Matters Arising

A matter arising from the minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, see minute BD/13-14/070).

BD/13-14/070 Tobacco-Free Trinity (see BD/13-14/051 of 9 October 2013)

The Registrar advised that three town hall meetings had taken place and two further town hall meetings were scheduled to take place shortly. The issues arising from the meetings and email responses would be worked on by small working groups and a further report would be made to Board in Hilary Term.

BD/13-14/071 Provost's Report

- (i) **Strategic Plan 2014-2019:** The Provost invited the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer to brief the Board on the Strategic Plan, 2014-2019 and she advised the Board as follows:
- (a) a proposal was shortly to be presented to the Executive Officers;
 - (b) between December and February there would be an assessment of capabilities across a wide range of areas to review where the College's strengths and opportunities lay;
 - (c) there would be an assessment of the external context, international education and research imperatives, Government priorities, trends and student demand;
 - (d) there would be an audit of existing strategies and a thorough analysis and assessment of where the College is positioned;
 - (e) there would be engagement with the broader community in the strategic objectives for 2014-2019;
 - (f) consideration would be given to size, disciplinary mix and high level actions required;
 - (g) there would be a broad, multi-disciplinary way of engaging with the community in that period;
 - (h) the text would be drafted in March/April followed by consultation with Council and decision by Board in May/June 2014, and launched in September 2014.

Some Board members noted that a time-frame of eight weeks seemed to be ambitious. It was noted that the consultation process involved external stakeholders, alumni, business leaders and as well as the cultural context - the Government being just one stake holder.

It was agreed that the Strategic Plan would be a standing item on future Board agendas and that the possibility of setting aside one complete Board meeting for the Strategic Plan would be considered.

- (ii) **Branding Strategy:** the outcome of the branding strategy would be launched with the new Strategic Plan in September 2014.
- (iii) **Key infrastructure projects:** The new School of Business and the Central Services Building would come to the Board, via the Estates and Finance Committees, for approval. The construction would require significant

philanthropic funding, in addition to College funds, with the total project costs estimated at approximately €70m. The Board noted that there was significant demand for business education. A public announcement of the project would be made at the forthcoming Trinity Global Graduate Forum.

Liaison had taken place with the Luce family regarding the demolition of the Luce Hall.

- (iv) **Engineering, Energy and Environment (E3):** The Provost advised that he would be meeting the Schools to discuss this initiative; the academic plan was in place and fund raising was in its early stages at present. The building design would come later, with footprint and costings. A small planning committee under the chairmanship of the Provost had been established.
- (v) **Student Residences on the Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus:** The Provost advised that he was working with the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and a report would come from the Estates Committee to Board for final decision in due course.
- (vi) **Budget Update:**
At the request of the Provost, the Treasurer provided an update following the Minister for Finance's Budget speech of 15 October 2013:
 - (a) detailed information was not yet available though it was expected that the Government grant would be reduced - the College's four year funding outlook in 2011 predicted a reduction of 1% for 2014;
 - (b) College finalized its 2013-2014 budget in June 2013 anticipating a reduction of 3% in funding, not taking the effects of the Haddington Road Agreement into account.
 - (d) it was still not clear whether the impact of the €25m funding reduction announced in the Minister's speech was simply a timing issue or was to be permanent.

In response to a query, the apparent level of College cash surplus is large but was not all generated from Exchequer sources, and included some ongoing items paid in advance. The Treasurer advised that funds in the Trust Funds accounts should be seen in a positive light and referred to an article in a recent issue of *Trinity Today*.

- (vii) **Appointment of Librarian:** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that by the closing date of 25 October 2013 interest had been expressed by up to 230 candidates; interviews were scheduled for 12-13 December 2013.
- (viii) **Dublin Midlands Hospital Group:** The Provost advised that St James's Hospital, Tallaght Hospital; Coombe Women and Infants' Hospital, Midland Regional Hospital Tullamore, Midland Regional Hospital Portlaoise and Naas General Hospital comprised this group. In consultation with the Provost, the Minister for Health had appointed Dr Frank Dolphin to chair the administrative board. He noted that until legislation is passed fiduciary responsibility would rest with the individual hospitals but would ultimately transfer to the board of the Dublin Midlands Hospital Group. It also appeared that Trinity will be able to nominate three members of the nine-person Board, to cover teaching, research and innovation. The group would also have a CEO and Chief

Academic Officer. It was the College's intention that the Head of the School of Medicine will be Chief Academic Officer for the hospital group.

BD/13-14/072 Fellowship - Report from Equality Committee

The Board noted a report on Fellowship from the Equality Committee which had been circulated. Professor Bouroche, Chair of the Equality Committee, presented the report.

Professor Bouroche outlined the background to the report and presented the main conclusions:

- (i) 42% of the academic staff were female, but comprised only 26% of the Fellows;
- (ii) Female applicants for Fellowship accounted for only 33% on average;
- (iii) There was no significant difference in the success rates of applicants of both genders (49.9% vs 49.7%);
- (iv) 9% of Honorary Fellows are female;
- (v) The percentage of female Fellows varied across the faculties, as follows:
 - (a) Engineering, Mathematics and Science: 47%
 - (b) Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences: 34%
 - (c) Health Sciences: 19%
- (vi) Even within a given grade women are underrepresented amongst Fellows;
- (vii) Within a given grade, representation as Fellows across Faculties varies.

The report drew attention to some aspects of the application process:

- (i) unfamiliarity with the procedures was reported by some respondents in a survey;
- (ii) mentoring from senior staff was valuable for career progression;
- (iii) eligibility criteria: non-tenure or part-time staff were currently unable to apply;
- (iv) assessment criteria: disciplinary differences existed.

The Provost thanked the Equality Committee for this report.

The Board considered the recommendations (No 1 to 14) and it was agreed that they would be presented to the Fellows and the Central Fellowship Committee to address the issues raised.

BD/13-14/073 Quality - Progress Report on the Secretary's Office

The Secretary to the College withdrew for this item of business

The Board noted the Progress Report on the Secretary's Office, dated 3 October 2013, which had been circulated.

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies advised Board that the recommendations in the report had been met. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, in response to a query, advised that the reference to Deputy Secretary in point 3 of the table referred to the appointment of the Assistant Secretary, set out in point 2 of the table.

BD/13-14/074 Annual Governance Statement

The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary to the College and the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, dated 30 October 2013, which had been circulated. The Board approved the Annual Governance Statement to the Higher Education Authority, noting changes made since the last statement of May 2012, which were set out in the memorandum from the Secretary and Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer:

- (i) approval of the sectoral Code of Governance in September 2012;
- (ii) establishment of a sub-group of the Board to update the College's Code of Governance in the light of the revised sectoral code;
- (iii) approval of a protocol on the issue of conflict of interest in November 2012;
- (iv) approval of the revised 'Trinity College Dublin Code of Governance' in June 2013.

In response to a query regarding item 4 in the letter, the Secretary advised that it was a reporting requirement and applied to all organisations.

BD/13-14/075 Summary of Governance of Science Gallery at Trinity College Dublin and Science Gallery International

The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, dated 30 October 2013, which had been circulated.

The Secretary advised Board that various individual elements of the structures of the Science Gallery had been approved from time to time and the current document drew these elements together for the first time.

The Board noted:

- (i) the Science Gallery is not a separate legal entity;
- (ii) the new Director of Marketing and Communications had been added to the membership of the Science Gallery Governance Board;
- (iii) the vision of Science Gallery International (SGI) is to develop a global Science Gallery Network;
- (iv) SGI was established in 2012 as a company limited by guarantee and approved for Charitable Taxation Status by the Revenue Commissioners;
- (v) the Brand Policy had been revised and there were provisions for co-branding.

Board members noted the following:

- (i) how SGI was marketing Trinity internationally needed to be considered in terms of the College's overall strategy, having regard to any risks involved;
- (ii) the enhancement Trinity's profile internationally as a result was noted;
- (iii) the policy could be reviewed by the College;
- (iv) there was twice-yearly reporting to the Finance Committee;
- (v) the Director is accountable to the SG Board and through the Chief Operating Officer to the Board of the College;
- (vi) SGI would report regularly to Board;
- (vii) the title of the Governance Board could suggest more autonomy than was the case.

Following discussion it was agreed that:

- (i) the Board would reconsider the branding policy which needed to be updated to reflect current practices in co-branding;

- (ii) there should be more clarity on the reporting lines of the Director to the executive management of the College;
- (iii) the Secretary to the College would take up the issue of the title of the Governance Board with the Chair of the Science Gallery Board.
- (iv) SGI would be included in the six- monthly reporting to the Board by related entities.

BD/13-14/076 Visitors

The Secretary advised the Board on two cases which had come before the Visitors:

- (i) The Visitors found that the published procedures in the matter of an application for promotion had not been followed and had ruled that the application should be re-assessed;
- (ii) A staff member whose contract was due to terminate on 30 September 2013 appealed on 26 September 2013 under Section 8 of the Statutes on the Visitor. The Visitors determined the matter over the course of the week-end of 28-29 September and refused jurisdiction in the matter, while leaving open the possibility of conducting a hearing under Section 6. The applicant accepted the offer made by the College in respect of post-retirement employment. The attention of the Visitors to this matter at very short notice was commended.

In response to a question, the Provost advised that, even though some appeals were still ongoing, it was hoped to begin the promotions round in this academic year.

BD/13-14/077 University Council

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting of 23 October 2013, with particular reference to Acta CL/13-14/028, CL/13-14/036, CL/13-14/042, CL/13-14/043.

BD/13-14/078 Online Education (see Actum CL/13-14/028 of 23 October 2013)

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, in response to a question, advised that the online courses had gone public that day; from January 2014 international students in the consortium could take the options and that from 2015 students in Trinity could take the options as part of the Broad Curriculum.

BD/13-14/079 Academic Appeals Committee (see Actum CL/13-14/036 of 23 October 2013)

The Board confirmed the terms of this Actum.

BD/13-14/080 Any Other Urgent Business -**Trinity Global Graduate Forum- 8 and 9 November 2013**

The Provost advised that approximately 100 successful graduates had been invited to College from around the world with the objective of engaging them to work more closely with the College, especially in relation to the upcoming Strategic Plan.

SECTION B

BD/13-14/081 Board Business

- (i) **Callover**
The Board noted the callover of Board decisions, as circulated.
- (ii) **Outcomes**
The Board noted the outcomes from the last meeting, as circulated.

BD/13-14/082 Coiste na Gaeilge

- (i) **Minutes of 27 June 2013**
The Board noted and approved the minutes of Coiste na Gaeilge from its meeting of 27 June 2013, as circulated.
- (ii) **Minutes of 29 October 2013**
The Board noted and approved the minutes of Coiste na Gaeilge from its meeting of 29 October 2013, as circulated.
- (iii) **Irish Language Scheme 2013-2016**
The Board noted the second Irish Language Scheme 2013-2016 which had been circulated with the minutes of Coiste na Gaeilge of 29 October 2013.
The Board approved the Scheme subject to the following:
 - (a) the Irish Language Officer to make any late formatting and minor textual amendments required, and,
 - (b) with Professor Eoin Mac Cárthaigh, to finalise the Irish language version, noting that the English language version was to be considered the authoritative version.Further to (a) and (b), the Irish Language Officer to submit the Scheme to the Department of the Gaeltacht for the Minister's signature and implementation.

The Chair of Coiste na Gaeilge also advised Board on the success of Seomra na Gaeilge; that the College's Cumann Gaelach had won first prize in the all-island competition for the best Irish language society organized by Glór na nGael; and that the Cumann Gaelach also won the USI award for the best student language campaign.

BD/13-14/083 Equality Committee

The Minutes of the meeting of the Equality Committee of 21 October 2013 as circulated were noted and approved. The Chair of the Equality committee drew the Board's attention to the following:

Equal/13-14/05 INTEGER Project and Baseline Report Briefing: The INTEGER report would be submitted to Board at a later stage.

Equal/13-14/06 Fellowship: Gender, Faculty and School Analysis Report (which had been discussed at length in Minute BD/13-14/072 above).

Equal/13-14/07 Equality Committee Annual Report 2013-2014 (noted below, see Minute BD/13-14/089).

Equal/13-14/08 Equality Officer Annual Report 2013-2014: The following points were highlighted:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The College had achieved the 3% target for employment of people with disabilities, reaching 3.7% for the first time; student parent supports continued to be improved.

SECTION C

BD/13-14/084 Board By-election - Technical, Administrative and Support Staff

The Board noted the result of the by-election, as tabled, dated 4 November 2013.

BD/13-14/085 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 23 October 2013, as circulated.

BD/13-14/086 Proctors' Lists for Autumn Commencements

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 29 October 2013.

BD/13-14/087 Irish School of Ecumenics - Governance Review

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 30 October 2013.

BD/13-14/088 Sealings

The Board noted Sealings, as circulated and set out as Appendix 1 to this minute.

BD/13-14/089 Annual Report - Equality Committee 2012-2013

The Board noted the annual report of the Equality Committee for 2012-2013, as circulated.

BD/13-14/090 Prizes and Other Awards -Entrance Exhibitions 2013

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 6 November 2013.

BD/13-14/091 Tutorship

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 25 October 2013.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted

Signed:

Date:

Sealings

12 July 2013

(1) The Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and (2) Uiversity Limited

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Trade Mark Licence Deed between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Uiversity Limited.

9 September 2013

**Revenue Commissioners
Bond for Receipt, Safe Custody and Proper Use of Certain Alcoholic Liquor**

The Seal of the College was put to a Bond for the Revenue Commissioners for the receipt, safe custody and proper use of certain alcoholic liquor by the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of the Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Aviva Insurance (Europe) plc unto the Minister for Finance in the sum of €21,500.

9 October 2013

**Mythen Construction
1. Project Supervisor and 2, Fit-out of Unit 28,
Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus**

1. The Seal of the College was put to an Agreement between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of the Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin for the appointment of Mythen Construction Ltd as the Project Supervisor for the Fit-out of Unit 28, Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus.
2. The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to the articles of agreement between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of the Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Mythen Construction Ltd for the Fit-out of Unit 28, Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus.
3. The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to the Tender and Contract Documentation for Electrical Services' Installation in Unit 28, Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and MacArdle McSweeney Associates.
4. The Provost, on behalf of the College, signed two copies of the Preliminaries Particulars Document prepared by the Quantity Surveyor, Davis Langdon Limited, 24 Lower Hatch Street, Dublin 2 in respect of the Fit-out of Unit 28, Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus.