

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 4 May 2011

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr M A Marsh), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Bursar (Dr F M Boland), Dr S P A Allwright, Dr S D C Barrett, Dr M Bourcoche, Dr O Braiden, Ms M A Coffey, Mr F Cowzer, Mr W J Dowling, Ms S Fleming, Ms J Fox, Mr J Gallagher, Dr H Gibbons, Dr R Gilligan, Ms D Lawless, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Dr N Marples, Ms N Murray, Dr E J O'Halpin, Professor D O'Neill, Dr H J Rice, Dr D M Singleton, Mr N Trigoub-Rotnem.
<i>Apologies</i>	Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff).
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer.  Staff Secretary (for BD/10-11/203 (iii)). Dr E O'Dell (for BD/10-11/205).

The Board congratulated Dr Barrett on his recent election to Seanad Éireann and the Secretary undertook to arrange the results of the count to be made available on the Seanad Election website.

## SECTION A

**BD/10-11/200 Minutes** The minutes of the meeting held on 30 March 2011 and 11 April 2011 were approved and signed subject to amendments to minute BD/10-11/179.

**BD/10-11/201 Matters Arising**  
A matter arising from the minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, (see minute BD/10-11/202 below).

**BD/10-11/202 BD/10-11/177 Annual Budgetary Process (see minute BD/10-11/177 of 30 March 2011)**  
In response to a query the Treasurer clarified that the cost per student had been incorporated into the annual budgetary process.

**BD/10-11/203 Provost's Report**

The Provost invited the Board's attention to the following:

- (i) **International Collaboration** The Provost advised Board that during his recent trip to India and Singapore he had signed a number of collaborative academic agreements with several of the universities visited.
- (ii) **Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II's Visit** The Provost advised Board of the security measures to be put in place in advance of Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II's visit to the College on 17 May 2011.
- (iii) **College Autonomy/ Employment Control Framework (ECF)**  
The Provost advised Board that negotiations were ongoing with the Minister for Education and Skills and that the Heads of Universities had recently met with the Minister to further these negotiations. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, who attended this meeting on the Provost's behalf, advised Board that issues such as recruitment, promotions, research staff and pension arrangements had been discussed. The Board noted that the Minister had been receptive to the points made by University Heads and that further consultation will take place on the Employment Control Framework with the Department of Finance. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that the issue of autonomy had also been raised at the meeting and that it had been acknowledged that there are aspects of the current Employment Control Framework which are not appropriate for the higher education sector.

In response to a number of queries raised, the Staff Secretary, present by invitation, clarified that discussions were on-going with the Department of Education and Skills in relation to the arrangements for Heads of Schools and research staff recruitment.

The Board, while noting the progress which had been made in the negotiations, agreed that a contingency plan together with a full risk assessment should be investigated and presented to Board at the next meeting in the event that the terms of the current Employment Control Framework stay in force.

**BD/10-11/204 Gender Analysis of Merit Bar Reports**

Dr Marples, Chair of the Equality Committee, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 16 March 2011, which had been circulated. She advised Board that a gender analysis of the Merit Bar had been carried out at the request of the then Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, in the context of previous reports investigating the barriers to women's career progression and women's under-representation in senior academic grades. Dr Marples invited Board's attention to the report's findings which suggested that while some difficulties exist, particularly in professional areas dominated by women academics, many of whom are reluctant to present themselves to the Junior Academics Progression Committee for assessment to progress beyond the Merit Bar, the issue is not one of gender but of the academic requirements of the disciplines and how these match with the criteria for progression.

Dr Rice, Chair of the Human Resource Committee, advised Board that the findings of the report were discussed at the Junior Academic Progression Committee, the Human

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

Resources Committee and the Equality Committee, who jointly recommend that the following issues be referred to the Human Resources Committee for further consideration:

- (i) the necessity of research as well as teaching being part of the portfolio of all Lecturers;
- (ii) the appropriateness of the weightings currently employed in assessing Lecturers at the Merit Bar;
- (iii) the development of a communication and education process regarding the Merit Bar and the application of its criteria, in conjunction with relevant Heads of School;
- (iv) the appropriateness or otherwise of mandatory review of eligible staff at the Merit Bar.

In the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (a) the number of candidates who were eligible to present to the Junior Academic Progression Committee and choose not to present exceeded those who did;
- (b) there is an assumption that the number of research publications is the determining criteria for progression;
- (c) academic staff who focus heavily on teaching are being disadvantaged by the criteria;
- (d) teaching, as a criterion, should be giving the same weighting as research;
- (e) there is a necessity that academic staff in the professional Schools focus largely on teaching and clinical aspects and therefore it is more difficult for them to focus on research;
- (f) Schools should accommodate clinical staff in linking with the university for research purposes;
- (g) the School of Nursing and Midwifery is a relatively young School and it will take time for its staff to develop research portfolios;
- (h) teaching is a fundamental element of the post of Lecturer but it should be communicated that research is also an essential element;
- (i) teaching should receive a higher weighting than research as many Lecturers spend a large amount of time teaching very large groups of students;
- (j) teaching is currently acknowledged in the criteria as the transfer of knowledge derived from research and this may need to be reconsidered;
- (k) Schools need to distribute tasks appropriately to their staff to allow them to engage in both teaching and research.

The Board agreed that the proposals should be presented to the Human Resources Committee for further investigation taking into account the issues raised by Board members.

#### **BD/10-11/205 Statutory Matters**

The Provost, by way of introduction, advised Board that, in the context of an appeal taken during the recent Provost Election, the Visitors had recommended that the definition of the electorate for the election of a Provost in Section 11 of the Provost Chapter of the 2010 Consolidated Statutes should be amended.

Dr O'Dell, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Registrar dated 28 April 2011, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the proposed amendment to Section 11 included in the definition of the electorate those

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

members of staff, who previously were full-time, permanent members of the academic staff and therefore had been eligible to vote in previous Provosts' elections, but who, for family or related reasons, opted to work on a permanent part-time basis, carrying out all of their previous functions as full-time members of staff, but with shorter working hours.

Dr O'Dell advised Board that the proposal was based on policy rather than a legislative requirement as eligibility to vote in the Provost's election was a privilege rather than a right of employment.

The Board agreed that for clarity, a definition of permanent part-time staff should be inserted into the schedule and that the draft ordinance so amended should be presented to the Fellows for assent.

**BD/10-11/206 University Council**

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 16 March 2011 and 20 April 2011 subject to further comments covering CL/10-11/121, 154 and 155.

**CL/10-11/121 (i) M.Sc. in Business and Management**

The Board noted the introduction of a new Masters in Science from the School of Business.

**BD/10-11/207 Head of School Election: School of Business**

Under Other Business, the Board considered a proposal to widen the eligibility of criteria for the Headship of the School of Business to include Lecturers above the Merit Bar noting that the proposal was based on stated exceptional circumstances within the School. Having discussed the difficulties in securing successful nominations from among the pool of eligible staff, the Board decided that, in view of the number of members of the School on the Senior Lecturer grade and above, the proposal did not fall within its understanding of 'exceptional' circumstances, stating that this provision was to accommodate small Schools which would not have a sufficient field from which to draw candidates for Headship.

**BD/10-11/208 Dean of Health Sciences**

Under Other Business, the Board agreed to extend the term of office of Professor C O Morain's Deanship to 30 September 2011 in recognition of the very significant role he as Dean has in hosting Tercentenary conferences in Dublin in September 2011. The Board noted that the election for his successor will take place during September with a view to taking up office on 1 October 2011.

**BD/10-11/209 Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer**

Under Other Business, the Board approved the appointment of Professor M Marsh as Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer until 31 August 2011.

**BD/10-11/210 Staff Matters**

Under Other Business, the Board noted that issues in relation to a recent recommendation of the Labour Court should be referred to the Staff Office. The Board

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

also noted that negotiations are on-going with the Department of Education and Skills on proposals for a voluntary early retirement scheme.

## SECTION B

### **BD/10-11/211 Equality Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Equality Committee from its meeting of 14 March 2010 and the Annual Report of the Equality Committee 2009-2010, noting in particular:

#### **Equal/10-11/21 Legal advice on the provision of reasonable accommodation for students with disabilities**

The Board noted that the Senior Lecturer would clarify the drafting of the minute with the Chair of the Committee.

### **BD/10-11/212 Finance Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 13 April 2011, noting in particular:

#### **FN/10-11/59 Travel Policy**

The Board approved the Travel Policy as presented by the Treasurer.

#### **FN/10-11/59 Treasury Management Policy**

The Board approved the proposed amendment to the Treasury Policy as presented by the Treasurer.

### **BD/10-11/213 Library and Information Policy Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Library and Information Policy Committee from its meeting of 31 March 2011.

## SECTION C

### **BD/10-11/214 Board and Council Meetings 2011-2012**

The Board noted and approved dates of Board and Council for 2011-2012, as set out in a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 27 April 2011.

### **BD/10-11/215 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on:

- (i) 30 March 2011;
- (ii) 1 April 2011;
- (iii) 20 April 2011.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

**BD/10-11/216 Proctors' Lists for Spring Commencements**

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 12 April 2011.

**BD/10-11/217 Prizes and Other Awards - Canadian Studies Travel Scholarship 2010-2011**

The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Dean of Graduate Studies that the 2010-2011 scholarship should be awarded to Mr Brian Barry (09129260), value: €2,875.

**BD/10-11/218 Board Membership - Students' Union**

The Board noted that the following had been elected as office-holders of the Students' Union and that they would serve as members of the Board of the College for the academic year 2011-2012:

President:	Mr Ryan Bartlett
Welfare Officer:	Ms Louisa Miller
Education Officer:	Ms Rachel Barry

**BD/10-11/219 Headship of Schools 2011-2014**

The Board noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) **Law** Professor H Biehler;
- (ii) **Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences** Professor J Saeed;
- (iii) **Mathematics**  
Dr D O'Donovan, for a further three years;
- (iv) **Natural Sciences**  
Professor C V Holland, for three years;
- (v) **Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences**  
Professor M W Radomski for a further three years.
- (vi) **Social Sciences and Philosophy** Professor J Wickham;
- (vii) **Social Work and Social Policy** Dr T E O'Sullivan.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

The following agenda item was deferred:

- A.5 (ii) Query on 2010 Statutes (see minute BD/10-11/182 of 30 March 2011).

Signed: .....

Date: .....

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*