

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 30 June 2010 and 2 July 2010

All items of business took place on Wednesday 30 June 2010 with the exception of Minutes BD/09-10/307(part of) and BD/09-10/306.

*Present* Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Dr S D C Barrett, Ms M A Coffey, Mr A Cooke, Mr W J Dowling, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Mr T Merriman, Mr C Ó Broin, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Dr J K Vij.

*Apologies* *30 June:* Ms P Murphy, Dr E J O'Halpin (present on 2 July), Professor D O'Neill, Mr B Sweeney.  
*2 July:* Mr C Cashman (present on 30 June), Ms G Clarke (present on 30 June), Ms P Murphy, Dr D O'Neill, Mr B Sweeney.

*In attendance* Ms S Mac Bride.

*(ex officio)* Secretary to the College, Treasurer.

*(by invitation)* Interim Chief Operating Officer.

Professor L Weber and Dr S Reichert (for BD/09-10/307)  
Academic Secretary (for BD/09-10/307)

SECTION A

**BD/09-10/287 Minutes**

The minutes of the meeting held on 2 June 2010 were approved and signed.

**BD/09-10/288 Matters Arising**

A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/09-10/289, 290, 291 below).

**BD/09-10/289 Financial Statements (incorporating Consolidated Financial Statements and extracts from Funding Statements), 2006-2007, 2008 (see minute BD/09-10/263 of 2 June 2010)**

In response to a query, the Provost advised that the Planning Group is continually examining the College's operating costs as part of their overall work plan.

**BD/09-10/290 Proposed Development of Academy of Dramatic Art (see minute BD/09-10/264 of 2 June 2010)**

The Secretary advised Board that the name “Trinity College Dublin Academy of Dramatic Art Limited” had now been registered with the Companies Registration Office.

**BD/09-10/291 Draft Development Control Plan (see minute BD/09-10/265 of 2 June 2010)**

The Board noted that the revised Development Control Plan will be presented to Board in Michaelmas Term and will reflect the comments made by Board members and other groups taking part in the consultative process.

**BD/09-10/292 Provost’s Report**

The Provost advised Board that Professor Sir Gordon Duff had been appointed as the Chair of the Trinity Health Committee. He also stated that Ms Darina Kneafsey had been appointed as the College’s Chief Operating Officer and would take up the position on 30 August 2010.

**BD/09-10/293 Annual Office**

The Board approved the following nominations for Annual Officers for 2010-2011 as proposed at its meeting on 2 June 2010 (minute BD/09-10/267 refers):

Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer	Professor P Prendergast
Dean of Research	Dr D Lloyd
Dean of Graduate Studies	Professor V Campbell
Senior Lecturer	Dr A Douglas
Bursar	Professor F Boland
Registrar	Professor J Barkhoff
Dean of Students	Professor G Whyte
Senior Tutor	Dr C Laudet
Senior Dean	Professor M Jones
Junior Dean	Dr T Trimble
Senior Proctor	Dr J R Graham
Junior Proctor	Professor P Humphries
Public Orator	Professor A Chahoud
Community Liaison Officer	Professor C Brady

**BD/09-10/294 Planning Group Report, No. 3**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, invited Board’s attention to a memorandum, dated 22 June 2010, which had been circulated together with the Group’s third report and appendices including a letter from the HEA, dated 28 May 2010, addressing budgetary matters for 2010 and the 2011-2012 period.

He advised Board that the Planning Group had continued to meet fortnightly to ensure that a strategic approach would be taken in the use of current limited financial resources. He invited Board’s attention to the recommendations from the Planning Group under the following headings:

1. Update on the Recommendations of Report No 2 of the Planning Group;
2. Strategic Planning - Update;
3. Estimates of Income & Expenditure;
4. Resource Planning Model;
5. Income Diversification;
6. Trinity Research Institutes;
7. Strategic Staffing;
8. Summary of Recommendations.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

In the course of a detailed discussion, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Treasurer clarified a number of technical issues raised by Board members including that:

- (i) the implementation of the strategic plan is intended to operate within the constraints of a balanced budget;
- (ii) noting the need for 5% savings, the Planning Group does not intend to be prescriptive as to how this should be achieved in specific areas; it recommends that savings should be identified by the Faculty Deans following consultation with the Heads of Schools and by the Chief Operating Officer in relation to administrative/service areas;
- (iii) given the current economic climate the risk is presently too high to implement the Resource Planning Model in full;
- (iv) the College must consider both cost reduction and revenue generation strategies;
- (v) the proposed continued reduction in pay and non-pay expenditure is not sustainable in the long term.

The Board noted Dr McGinley's concerns that the implementation of recommendation (iii) viz. to reduce pay and non-pay costs by 5% in 2011, in addition to savings already achieved, would ultimately lead to a reduction in staff numbers. He noted that this reduction in staffing would conflict with the need to provide services to an increased student population.

Noting that a full report on RPM will be presented to Board for consideration at the end of the pilot phase, the Board approved the Planning Group's work programme and its recommendations as set out in section 10 of the report. The Board noted the dissent of Dr McGinley to recommendation (iii).

#### **BD/09-10/295 Recommendations on Principal Committees of Board**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, invited Board's attention a memorandum, dated 22 June 2010, and the Report from the Committee Review Group which had been circulated. Noting the importance of an effective committee structure for both the formulation of policy and for effectiveness in decision making in the College, he invited Board's attention to recommendations of the Committee Review Group including the Terms of Reference for Principal Committees.

In the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by individual Board members including that:

- (a) Dr O'Dell should be consulted to ensure that the report is consistent with the Statutes and the Trinity College, Dublin (Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000;
- (b) the Board should not delegate its powers to Principal Committees;
- (c) it is impossible for Board to make every decision in relation to the operation of the College and delegation is an appropriate way to proceed;
- (d) the membership of committees should be small and other individuals should only be invited to attend as required;
- (e) Board representatives who sit on Principal Committees should give a verbal report at each Board meeting;
- (f) the Consolidated 2010 University Statutes should be referred to in the report;
- (g) action should be taken to avoid the perception that committees are pre-selected by Board;
- (h) two elected Board members on each committee should lend greater openness and transparency;
- (i) the names of the Committees should not be changed.

In the course of a discussion, the Provost and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified a number of technical issues including that:

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

- (i) Principal Committees, with the exception of the Finance Committee, which has statutory basis, are instruments of the Board;
- (ii) Principal Committees enable the Board to have oversight of the operations of the entire College;
- (iii) Principal Committees cannot overturn a decision of the Board;
- (iv) the Board has the power to investigate all decisions made by Principal Committees;
- (v) the names of the Committees represent their current functions;
- (vi) Principal Committees of Board are not representative committees.

The Board, accepting the overall thrust of the report, approved the terms of reference of the Principal Committees of Board with the addition of an additional Head of School to their membership and agreed that the proposals on delegation would be brought back to Board for final approval following consultation with Dr O'Dell.

**BD/09-10/296 Disciplinary Committee: Outcome of Hearing held on 18 May 2010 - Statutes, Chapter XII, Section 17**

The Registrar invited Board's attention to the outcome of a hearing by the Disciplinary Committee on 18 May 2010. Noting the serious nature of the case, the Board, in accordance with the Statutes, approved the recommendation of the Disciplinary Committee to remove Scholarship from a named student as proposed by the Registrar.

**BD/09-10/297 University Council**

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meetings held on 16 June 2010 subject to further comments covering CL/09-10/201, 210, 213, 232, 233, 234. (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).

**BD/09-10/298 Weighting Higher Level Mathematics (see Actum CL/09-10/201 of 16 June 2010)**

The Board noted that the University Council had approved the recommendation of the Undergraduate Studies Committee that Higher Level Leaving Certificate Mathematics should carry a weighting of 140% to recognise the extra work required by students taking this subject. In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that regardless of how other Irish universities address the matter, it is necessary that the College considers and articulates its own position on attributing weightings to Higher Level Mathematics.

**BD/09-10/299 External Board Members**

The Provost advised Board of the appointment by the Sub-Committee of Board of Dr Olive Braiden (the Arts Council nominee) as the Board nominated external member in accordance with the Trinity College Dublin (Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000. The Board noted that the Minister for Education and Skills is expected to announce her nominee to the Board in the near future.

**BD/09-10/300 Appointment of the Provost: Recommendation Committee**

The Board approved the following nominations as members of the Recommendation Committee to advise on the composition of the Interview Committee for the appointment of the Provost:

Chair of the Fellows (ex officio);  
 Professor H Rice (Fellow);  
 Mr W Dowling (Non-Fellow).

In accordance with the Statutes the Board requested the Registrar and the College Secretary to formally commence the process for the appointment of the Provost.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

**BD/09-10/301 Foundation Scholarship, Calendar Part 1 R2 Tenure 16**

Under Other Business, the Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, dated 24 June 2010, which had been tabled.

**BD/09-10/302 Electronic circulation of Board documents**

Under Other Business, the Board agreed that all Section C items on the agenda would, in future, be circulated to Board members in electronic format only.

**BD/09-10/303 Pension Matters**

Under Other Business, the Board noted that the College is in consultation with the HEA and the Department of Finance regarding the draft Framework Agreement on the implementation of the College's pension arrangements.

**BD/09-10/304 2010 Consolidated Statutes**

Under Other Business, the Registrar invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 30 June 2010, which had been tabled. In anticipation of the approval by the Visitors of the 2010 Consolidated Statutes and noting a small number of typographical and textual errors in the Statutes, the Board agreed to invite the Visitors to exercise their powers under section 6(1) of the Introduction Statute to correct these "obvious errors" by Decree.

**BD/09-10/305 Headship of School of Histories and Humanities, 2010-2013**

Under Other Business, the Board approved the nomination of Professor Brian McGing as Head of School of Histories and Humanities for the term 2010-2013.

**BD/09-10/306 Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees**

Under Other Business, the Board approved the nominations of the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees, as presented by the Registrar, noting that those approved will be conferred with Honorary Degrees at Commencements ceremonies during 2010-2011 or as soon as possible thereafter.

**BD/09-10/307 Mid-Term Review of Academic Restructuring<sup>1</sup>****SECTION B****BD/09-10/308 Audit Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 26 May 2010, noting in particular:

**AD/09-10/64 Matters Arising**

The Board noted the recommendation of the Audit Committee of need for risk assessment to continue to be embedded in the decision-making process of Board.

**AD/09-10/67 Update on Internal Audit Work Plan**

The Board noted that, due to its workload, the Audit Committee is not in a position to provide positive assurances to Board in relation to its systems of internal control as required by the Code of Governance. Dr McGilp advised that the Audit Committee will continue to provide negative assurances to Board.

---

<sup>1</sup> Minute 307 is not publically available at present.

**BD/09-10/309 Coiste na Gaeilge**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of Coiste na Gaeilge from its meetings of 28 April 2010 and 9 June 2010. The Board noted the need for College's continued commitment to the support of Irish language initiatives.

**BD/09-10/310 Equality Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Equality Committee from its meeting of 28 May 2010, noting in particular:

**Equal/09-10/27 Accessible Information Policy**

The Board noted that workshops have taken place to facilitate the introduction of the College's accessible information policy.

**Equal/09-10/31 Equality Monitoring Report 2009-2010**

The Board noted that the Annual Equality Monitoring Report which was recommended by the HEA in its review in 2003 is the only one of its type in the sector.

**BD/09-10/311 Finance Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 10 May 2010 and also approved the proposed Treasury Management Policy.

**BD/09-10/312 Information Policy Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/210 of 16 June 2010)**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Information Policy Committee from its meetings of 22 April 2010 and 10 June 2010. The Board also noted the Revised Records Management Policy and the Annual Report of IS Services 2008-2009.

**BD/09-10/313 Site and Facilities Committee**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 15 June 2010, noting in particular:

**SF/09-10/52 Capital Projects Report Issue 12**

Dr McGinley, Chair of the Committee, invited Board's attention to the following aspects of the Capital Projects Report, which had been circulated:

- (i) **Biosciences Project**  
The Board noted that the additional funds required for the completion of the fit-out of the Biosciences Project will be provided collectively by the Schools involved;
- (ii) **Student Residence Project**  
The Board noted that as significant costs will be incurred by companies making submissions for the final stages of the tender process for the Student Residences Project, a decision should now be made on the extent to which the project should be advanced;
- (iii) **Strategic Capital Projects Fund**  
The Board noted the decision of the Committee that small amounts of funding available for potential capital projects that have not proceeded should be amalgamated to provide a strategic capital projects fund.

**SF/09-10/54 Clinical Research Facility, St James's Hospital**

The Board noted that the VAT liability in relation to the Clinical Research Facility, St James's Hospital is being addressed by the Faculty of Health Sciences.

**SF/09-10/55 Phoenix House**

Dr McGinley advised Board that, due to additional unforeseen costs arising from new planning regulations, the budget for the refurbishment of Phoenix House has now been revised. Acknowledging that compliance with planning regulations is a legitimate cost, the Board noted the importance of accurate budget planning for all capital projects in the future.

**BD/09-10/314 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/213 of 16 June 2010)**

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 27 April 2010, noting in particular:

**SS/09-10/48 Postgraduate Advisory Service**

The Board noted the Committee's unanimous recommendation for the continuation of the Postgraduate Advisory Service by the College.

**SECTION C**

**BD/09-10/315 Science Gallery Governance**

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Interim Chief Operating Officer, circulated, dated 21 June 2010.

**BD/09-10/316 Callover of Board Decisions**

The Board noted the callover of decisions, as circulated.

**BD/09-10/317 Board Elections 2010**

The Board noted the results of elections, 15 June 2010, as circulated:

- (i) **Fellows and Fellow Professors Constituency**  
Dr S D C Barrett  
Professor R Gilligan  
Dr N Marples  
Dr H Rice
- (ii) **Academic Staff (Non-Fellow) Constituency**  
Dr M Bouroche  
Dr H Gibbons
- (iii) **Technical, Administrative and Support Staff Constituency**  
Ms N Murray

**BD/09-10/318 Almanack 2010-2011**

The Board noted the Almanack 2010-2011 as circulated.

**BD/09-10/319 External Relations - Memorandum of Understanding with ESRI**

The Board noted a memorandum from Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, circulated, dated 22 June 2010.

**BD/09-10/320 Board Membership**



The Board noted that, following the retirement of Mr P G Connell, that Mr T Merriman had been deemed elected to the Board for the remainder of Mr Connell's term of office, to the end of the academic year.

**BD/09-10/321 Annual Report 2008-2009 - Secretary's Office**

The Board noted the Secretary's Office Annual Report 2008-2009, available at the link below:

<http://www.tcd.ie/Secretary/assets/pdf/Secretarys%20Office%20Annual%20Report.pdf>

**BD/09-10/322 Disciplinary Committee Report**

The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 21 June 2010,

**BD/09-10/323 Response to Audit Committee Annual Report**

The Board noted a memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 21 June 2010.

**BD/09-10/324 Risk Register**

The Board noted a memorandum from the Interim Chief Operating Officer, circulated, dated 22 June 2010.

**BD/09-10/325 Disciplinary Panel - Standing List**

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated dated 29 June 2010.

**BD/09-10/326 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 16 June 2010, as circulated.

**BD/09-10/327 Proctors' Lists for Summer Commencements**

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 22 June 2010.

**BD/09-10/328 Sealings**

The Board noted Sealings, as circulated, and attached as Appendix 1 to this minute.

**BD/09-10/329 Prizes and Other Awards - A J Leventhal Scholarship Award 2010**

The Board noted and approved the following awards:

A J Leventhal Scholarship: Ms S Fitzgerald. Value €2,285  
Grant to be awarded to the following two candidates:  
Mr R Kilroy. Value €1,000  
Ms S Gubbins. Value €1,000

**BD/09-10/330 College Art Collections - Donations and Bequests to June 2010**

The Board noted a memorandum from the Curator, circulated, dated 22 June 2010.

**BD/09-10/331 Committee Matters**

The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 22 June 2010, and approved the following:

- (i) **Audit Committee**

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*



Professor J Horne to replace Professor B McGing who has completed his term of office as a member of the Audit Committee.

- (ii) **Coiste na Gaeilge**  
Mr L Dowling to succeed Dr E Mac Cárthaigh as Chair.
  
- (ii) **Co-ordinating Committee for Continuous Professional Development Courses in Education**  
The Board dissolved the committee, in accordance with a decision taken by the Committee on 3 June 2010. The courses offered within the CPD division heretofore, as well as their management had been integrated with the other postgraduate courses offered by the School of Education leading to the Master in Education. This decision would be ratified by Council in Michaelmas Term 2010.

**BD/09-10/332 Administrative Arrangements - 3 July to 29 August 2010**

The Board noted that matters of routine business will be dealt with by the Provost from 3 July to 29 August 2010.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

The Provost thanked all outgoing Board members for their contribution to the Board during their terms of office. In particular, he wished the student members of Board well in their future careers. Outgoing Board members individually thanked the Provost and the Board for the opportunities offered to them as Board members.

Signed: .....

Date: .....

Appendix 1 to Minute BD/09-10/328

**Sealings**

1 April 2010

**Trinity Science Gallery - Jamaica Coffee Company Ltd.**

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a licence agreement between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Jamaica Coffee Company Ltd for a three-month extension to the existing lease, commencing 1 February 2010.

20 May 2010

**DMMC Unwind**

The Seal of the College was put to Deed of Assignment and a Deed of Release of Charge between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Nerville.