

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 31 March 2010

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Dr S D C Barrett, Ms G Clarke, Ms M A Coffey, Mr P G Connell, Mr A Cooke, Mr W J Dowling, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.
<i>Apologies</i>	Mr C Cashman, Dr A McElligott, Mr C Ó Broin.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer.  Dean of Students (for BD/09-10/195) Dean of Research (for BD/09-10/196) Dr E O'Dell (for BD/09-10/197)

SECTION A

**BD/09-10/187 Minutes**

- (i) **Meeting of 3 March 2010** The minutes of the meeting held on 3 March 2010 were approved and signed.
- (ii) **Aide-memoire of Joint Consultative meeting of Board and Council, 10 March 2010.** The Board noted the aide-memoire of the joint consultative meeting held on 10 March 2010.

**BD/09-10/188 Matters Arising** A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/09-10/189, 190, 191 below).

**BD/09-10/189 Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC) (see minute BD/09-10/154 of 3 March 2010)** The Provost, noting that, in accordance with the agreed procedure each institution had submitted its nominees, advised Board of the following membership of the first Committee of the TAMC:

- (i) Professor Sir Gordon Duff (Chair)
- (ii) Professor Edward Klasen
- (iii) Professor Kevin Conlon
- (iv) Professor Ian Graham
- (v) Mr Ian Carter
- (vi) Professor Charles Normand
- (vii) Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer
- (viii) Professor Celia Holland

- (ix) Dr Ena Prosser
- (x) Mr David Shanahan
- (xi) Professor Kelleher (CEO)

The Board noted that consideration could be given to additional external members at a later date.

**BD/09-10/190 Appointment of the Chief Operating Officer (see minute BD/09-10/156 of 3 March 2010)** Noting previous practice, the Board agreed that the Personnel and Appointments Committee would develop a policy on the nomination of representatives to Selection Committees for senior administrative appointments by the College's Group of Unions.

**BD/09-10/191 Report from the Planning Group (see minute BD/09-10/161 of 3 March 2010)** In response to a query, the Treasurer advised Board that his Office has planned a comprehensive communication strategy to engage with the College Community over the coming months in advance of the new procurement policy coming into force in Michaelmas Term 2010. The Board noted that provision will be made for the procurement of specialist equipment in consultation with the Procurement Office and that the policy is expected to deliver significant savings to the College.

**BD/09-10/192 Provost's Report** The Provost invited Board's attention to the following matters:

- (i) **Innovation Task Force** The Board noted that the Report of the Innovation Task Force had been launched on 11 March 2010.
- (ii) **NUIG/UL Alliance** The Board noted the announcement of the alliance between the National University Ireland Galway and the University of Limerick.
- (iii) **Resignation of Board member** The Board noted with regret the resignation from Board of Dr Amanda Piesse and paid tribute to her unstinting contribution during her time on Board. The Board noted that Dr Sean Barrett is the next eligible candidate in the constituency of Fellows and Fellow Professors and that he will be invited to attend the next Board meeting.
- (iv) **Resignation of Pro-Chancellor** The Board noted with regret the resignation of Pro-Chancellor Mrs Justice Susan Denham, further noting that the process to replace her will commence in accordance with the Statutes. The Provost paid tribute to Mrs Justice Denham and thanked her for her contribution to the College during her time as Pro-Chancellor.
- (v) **Strategic Plan 2010-2014** The Board noted that the Strategic Plan 2010-2014 had been presented to members of the Government and Opposition parties in recent weeks.
- (vi) **National College of Art and Design** The Board noted that preliminary discussions are taking place with the National College of Art and Design regarding possible future collaboration with the College.

**BD/09-10/193 Estimates 2010** The Treasurer, introducing the topic, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 24 March 2010, which had been circulated containing:

- (i) HEA recurrent grant allocation letter dated 24 February 2010 along with accompanying tables;
- (ii) The basis of preparation of 2010 Estimates of Income and Expenditure;
- (iii) Executive Officers' minute of meeting dated 2 March 2010;

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

- (iv) 2010 Estimates of Income and Expenditure (Calendar Year) and 2009/2010 Estimates of Income and Expenditure (Financial Year) with explanatory notes;
- (v) 2011 High Level Estimates of Income and Expenditure;
- (vi) draft letter from the Provost, on behalf of the College, to the HEA under the Framework for Borrowing and Loan Guarantees;
- (vii) draft letter from the Provost, on behalf of the College, to the HEA in accordance with S.37(5) of the Universities Act 1997.

The Treasurer invited Board's attention to the financial strategy which will be required to achieve the goals outlined in the College's Strategic Plan.

Noting that the 2010 Estimates of Income and Expenditure had been considered by the Planning Group, the Executive Officers Group on 2 March 2010 and by the Finance Committee on 19 March (see minute FN/09-10/62 of 19 March 2010), the Treasurer invited Board's attention to the following issues:

- (a) in line with the decrease in the sector, the core recurrent grant allocated to College for 2010 amounted to €65.1m which represents a decrease of 25.9% over 2009, as determined by the HEA RGAM following the application of the moderating mechanism. The HEA has informed the College that the moderator will rise to 2% in 2011;
- (b) a number of items have contributed to offsetting the absolute decrease of 25.9% in the 2010 Grant, namely pay reductions, increase in student numbers generating additional grant in lieu of fees income and additional income arising from increased student services charge resulting in an estimated real reduction of circa 7% on the 2009 core recurrent grant;
- (c) the need for the College to abide by the Employment Control Framework, including reaching the required reduction in numbers and balanced budgets.

The Treasurer advised Board that the calendar year Estimates which show a cumulative deficit of €8.33m include a provision for a contingency/strategic fund. The Board noted that the Estimates did not include a provision for submissions for additional funds received by the Treasurer's Office and that all requests for funding would be considered at a future date and would be allocated in line with the Strategic Plan through the Faculty Deans, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and Interim Chief Operating Officer.

In the course of a discussion, the Provost and the Treasurer clarified a number of issues raised by Board members including:

- (a) the IUA is addressing the issue of decreasing funding at a sectoral level;
- (b) the contingency/strategic fund which will be used for Board approved strategic initiatives is calculated as a percentage of overall income;
- (c) the issue of shared services in the sector is being explored by the IUA;
- (d) provision must be made for pension supplementation, including post retirement increases, for which the State will not be liable;
- (e) an increase in student numbers will not necessarily result in an increase in the recurrent grant.

The Board approved:

- (i) the 2010 Estimates of Income and Expenditure including an estimated deficit of €8.33m;
- (ii) the high level outturn for 2011;
- (iii) the draft letter to the HEA from the Provost under the Framework for Borrowing and Loan Guarantees for 2008/2009;
- (iv) the draft letter to the HEA in accordance with Section 37 (5) of the Universities Act, advising of the planned deficit for 2010.

The Provost thanked the Treasurer and his staff.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

**BD/09-10/194 eStrategy - Update** The Interim Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 26 March 2010, together with simulated data in Appendices, which had been circulated. Noting the recommendations of both the College Auditors in their Annual Report and the external Quality Assurance consultants, he invited Board's attention to the proposals for a revised governance for eStrategy.

The Board noted that the Quality Assurers had reported to the eStrategy Steering Group on 18 March 2010 (see minute 3 of 18 March 2010) and that the Interim Chief Operating Officer had updated the Information Policy Committee on 23 March 2010. The Interim Chief Operating Officer advised Board that an overall Projects Management Group will be established with responsibility for considering and approving all information and communication technology projects. The Board noted that Project Steering Boards will be established with a Project Sponsor who will report to the Projects Management Group.

In the course of a discussion the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (a) there should be consultation with the Staff Office regarding any proposed changes in systems and work practices which the projects will deliver;
- (b) steps should be taken to ensure a compatibility in the overall architecture supporting the projects;
- (c) each project should have an identifiable owner with ultimate responsibility for delivering the project;
- (d) consideration should be given to one overall committee rather than separate project groups;
- (e) Project Steering Boards should consult with the students, particularly in relation to the student project;
- (f) there is concern that as Project Sponsors are senior College officers, they will not be in a position to dedicate sufficient time to the projects due to other College responsibilities.

The Interim Chief Operating Officer advised Board that the revised governance structure will ensure that Project Sponsors are both responsible and accountable for delivering the project, including the overall I.T. architecture. The Board noted that plans were in place to consult with the College Community regarding changes to systems and work practices and that provision had been made within areas to allow Project Sponsors prioritise these projects.

The Board approved the proposals.

**BD/09-10/195 Report of Working Party on the Student Registration Charge** The Dean of Students, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 24 February 2010, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the Working Party had been established to develop proposals in the context of the existing HEA framework of good practice for the provision of student services (see minute BD/09-10/123 of 3 February 2010). Noting the legitimate expectation of students that the student charge would be applied directly to student services, he invited Board's attention to the recommendations of the Working Party.

- (a) **Scope of application of Student Services Charge:**
  - (i) the Student Services Charge (excluding the portion applied to registration and examinations) should, in the first instance, be disbursed on the Accommodation Office, the Careers Advisory Service, the Chaplaincy Service, the College Deans, the Health Service, the College Tutorial Service, the Day Nursery, the Department of Sport and Recreation, the Disability Office, student bodies through the Capitation Grant, the Student Counselling Service and space costs associated with these student facilities;

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

- (ii) the College shall obtain the views of the Student Services Charge Consultative Group on any proposal to disburse the student services element of the Student Services Charge on any other services on which students rely.
- (b) **Consultation:**
- (i) student representation on the existing Consultative Group should be expanded to include the SU Education Officer and the SU Welfare Officer, the secretary of the Student Services Committee (ex officio) and that the meetings should be convened and chaired by the Dean of Students;
  - (ii) the Consultative Group should consider and make recommendations to the Student Services Committee on the implementation and distribution of the student services portion of the student registration charge as part of the College's allocation process in relation to the registration charge;
  - (iii) the Consultative Group should meet in November, January/February and May, with both the relevant outgoing and incoming SU Officers attending the meeting in May;
  - (iv) the Treasurer's Office will furnish members of the Consultative Group with data in relation to the Student Registration Charge Income and Expenditure in a prescribed format.

The Board, noting that the report had been welcomed by the Students' Unions, approved the recommendations of the Working Party. The Provost thanked the Dean of Students and the Working Party for its timely consideration of the issue.

- BD/09-10/196 Research Quality Metrics - Second Report** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 26 March 2010, which had been circulated. Noting the comments made by Board members in relation to Component 3 of the proposed research quality metrics (see minute BD/09-10/128 of 3 February 2010), he advised Board that the Working Group had held a consultative forum with the Heads of Schools on 18 March 2010. He further advised that, following this consultation process, the Working Group had revised Component 3 as follows:
- (a) the five agreed School objectives, which will have a weighting of 50%, will have one global metric rather than two;
  - (b) the criterion for increased funding will be amended from a 5% increase to maintaining or increasing performance;
  - (c) the risk of statistical error in establishing metrics based on small numbers will be addressed by the Faculty Dean meeting with the Head of School to discuss and agree the five School objectives. A consolidated list of metrics for the Faculty will be presented to the Dean of Research, who will comment on them to the Faculty Dean, taking advice of international peers as appropriate.

The Provost advised Board that the proposed draft research quality metrics are intended to address the perceived inadequacies in ARAM and provide a practical solution to the allocation of research funding. In the course of a discussion in which divergent views were expressed concerning the proposals, the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (i) there is a risk associated with allocating money using untested metrics based on objectives set by the School;
- (ii) the proposed metrics could result in up to a 50% decrease in allocation for some Schools
- (iii) there is a risk that excellence will be compromised in the application of the proposals;

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

- (iv) reducing the weighting of Component 3 during an introductory period would reduce these risks;
- (v) the metrics will favour Schools with more research students;
- (vi) the new metrics will address earlier difficulties caused by a disproportionate weight being given to research income;
- (vii) consultation on the School objectives should be with the School Executive rather than the School;
- (viii) the current proposal will bring stability to the present situation.

The Dean of Research, present by invitation, advised Board that Component 3 is performance-related and that Faculty and School Executives will have oversight of the application of the metrics to ensure the integrity of the process. In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that staff commitments made on the basis of previous ARAM data would be addressed on a case-by-case basis.

The Board approved the proposed amendment to Component 3. Dr McGilp, in the context of the Audit Committee's recommendations concerning the need for a thorough risk analysis of all major initiatives, dissented from the Board's decision.

**BD/09-10/197 Statutes - Final Draft Approval** The Registrar, noting that the process of revising the Statutes had begun over three and a half years ago, advised Board that this was the penultimate stage in the consultation process.

Dr O'Dell, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to the proposed amendments to the Restatement of the Statutes as follows:

- (i) to the amendments to the Chapter on Officers, noting that in advance of the meeting, comments on the Chapter had been invited from Officers who are not members of Board;
- (ii) to the amendments to the Chapters on Governance;
- (iii) to a number of technical amendments including the elevation of the Chapter on Staff to a Division.

In response to queries raised by Board members, Dr O'Dell advised that either Board, or in some instances Board together with other relevant authorities (e.g. the Senate, Academic Council or Principal Committees) had the power to amend Schedules to the Statutes. The Board also noted that voting on changes to the Schedules would be carried out in accordance with the principle of consensus in the Universities Act, 1997.

The Board approved the principles enshrined in the Restatement of the Statutes and agreed that it should be sent to the Fellows for assent subject to approval by the Senate at its meeting on 6 April 2010. The Provost thanked the Registrar, Dr O'Dell and the members of the Statutes Review Working Party for their outstanding work on the Restatement of the Statutes, noting that the Statutes had not been revised in their entirety since 1966.

**BD/09-10/198 Scholarship 2010** The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 30 April 2008, which had been tabled. She stated that eighty Scholars were proposed for election on Trinity Monday, of whom seventeen were Foundation Scholars. She invited Board's attention to the distribution of the Scholars across Faculties and by gender.

**BD/09-10/199 University Council** The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meetings held on 16 March 2010 subject to further comments covering CL/09-10/130, 138, 139 (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

- BD/09-10/200 Appeal to the Visitors** The Secretary invited Board's attention to the outcome of a named student's appeal to the Visitor against a Board decision taken on 14 October 2009 (see minute BD/09-10/033 of 14 October 2009) in which the Visitors upheld the decision of the Board. The Board noted that the Senior Lecturer will, in consultation with the Undergraduate Studies Committee, address the Visitors' recommendations in relation to how external examiners would indicate their views on scripts reviewed by them.
- BD/09-10/201 Selection Committee for the Dean of Dental Science** Under Other Business, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board of the following nominees to the Selection Committee for the Dean of Dental Science:  
Professor S Allwright  
Professor D Sullivan  
Professor S Flint

#### SECTION B

- BD/09-10/202 College Safety Committee** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the College Safety Committee from its meeting of 2 April 2009 and 25 February 2010 together the College's Revised Policy on Smoking. The Board noted that the Secretary will clarify that the membership conforms to the legal requirements and that all members are receiving their notification of, and papers for, meetings.
- BD/09-10/203 Equality Committee** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Equality Committee from its meeting of 25 February 2010.
- BD/09-10/204 Finance Committee** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 19 March 2010.
- BD/09-10/205 Information Policy Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/130 of 16 March 2010)** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Information Policy Committee from its meetings of 8 October 2009 and 26 November 2009.

#### SECTION C

- BD/09-10/206 Callover of Board Decisions** The Board noted the callover of decisions, as circulated.
- BD/09-10/207 Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 16 March 2010, as circulated.
- BD/09-10/208 eStrategy Steering Committee** The Board noted and approved the following minutes of the eStrategy Committee, as circulated:

- (i) 4 November 2009;

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

- (ii) 25 February 2010;
- (iii) 18 March 2010;
- (iv) 23 March 2010.

**BD/09-10/209 Sealings** The Board noted Sealings attached as Appendix 1 to this minute, as circulated.

**BD/09-10/210 Senate - Council Representation (1966 Consolidated Statutes Chapter X, section 4)**  
The Board approved the nomination of:

- (i) 2010-2011 Mr S Gannon;
- (ii) 2010-2012 Dr A O'Gara.

**BD/09-10/211 Prizes and Other Awards - Calendar Entries** The Board noted and approved the following:

- (i) **C.H. Holland Prize** This prize is awarded to the student obtaining the highest overall mark in the Geology Moderatorship. Value €100.
- (ii) **W.E.A. Phillips Prize** This prize is awarded to the student who obtains the highest dissertation mark in the Geology Moderatorship. Value €100.
- (iii) **Brian McMurry Prize (amended)** A memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 22 March 2010.

**BD/09-10/212 National Institute for Intellectual Disability - Memorandum of Understanding - Mary Immaculate College** The Board noted that a memorandum of Understanding between the College and Mary Immaculate College, Limerick, has been signed by the Provost and the President of Mary Immaculate College (Board Minute BD/08-09/299 of 17 June 2009 refers).

**BD/09-10/213 Coiste na Gaeilge - Membership** The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 23 March 2010, and approved the following membership:

An elected Board member (Chair)	Dr Eoin Mac Cárthaigh
Irish Language Officer (Secretary)	Mr Aonghus Dwane
Secretary to the College (or nominee)	Ms Anne FitzGerald
Representative from Roinn na Gaeilge	Dr Pádraig de Paor
Representative from the Library	Ms Clíona Ní Shúilleabháin
Registrar of Chambers (or nominee)	To be confirmed
Reachtaire of An Cumann Gaelach	Ms Marie Ní Bhraonáin (2009-2010)
Irish Language Officer - Students' Union	Ms Elaine Níc Réamoinn (2009-2010)
Representative of Graduate Students' Union	Ms Michelle Furlong
1 Council nominee	Dr Eoin O'Dell
1 Dean (or nominee)	Professor Colm O'Moráin
Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics & Science	Dr Colm Ó Dúnlaing
Faculty of Arts and Humanities	To be confirmed
Faculty of Health Sciences	To be confirmed
Administrative and Support Areas	To be confirmed

**BD/09-10/214 Tutorship** The Board noted and approved the nomination of Dr G Murdock as an Acting Tutor with a full chamber, in place of Dr P Geoghegan.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*



**BD/09-10/215 Pro-Junior Dean** The Board noted and approved the nomination of Dr T Trimble as Pro-Junior Dean in the matter of a student case.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed: .....

Date: .....

### Sealings

10 February 2010

#### **New Square Residences - Minor Building Work Contract**

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a contract for minor building and engineering works associated the refurbishment of the New Square Residences between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth Near Dublin and Duggan Brothers (Contractors) Limited.

PROVOST

#### **Long Room Hub - Contract**

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a contract for building works associated with the construction of the Long Room Hub between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth Near Dublin and Michael McNamara & Company Limited.

PROVOST