

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 14 October 2009

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty) Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr C Cashman, Ms G Clarke, Ms M A Coffey, Mr A Cooke, Mr P G Connell, Mr W J Dowling, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Mr C Ó Broin, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.
<i>Apologies</i>	Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Dr A J Piesse.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms M Alcock.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer. Director of Buildings (for BD/09-10/027). Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs (for BD/09-10/028).

SECTION A

BD/09-10/022 Minutes The Minutes of the following meetings were agreed and signed:

- (i) 16 September 2009;
- (ii) 7 October 2009.

BD/09-10/023 Matters Arising A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below (see minutes BD/09-10/024, 025, 026 below).

BD/09-10/024 Pension Matters (see minute BD/09-10/003 of 16 September 2009) The Interim Chief Operating Officer advised Board on current developments in relation to the transfer of the College's Pension Fund assets and liabilities.

He stated that the College had been advised by the Department of Finance that, on the basis of advice from the Attorney General, the Minister for Finance had decided that all discretionary matters would be retained by him and not delegated to institutions whose pension funds were being transferred to the State.

In particular, the Interim Chief Operating Officer advised that this decision means that the College would no longer have the discretion to reinstate the arrangements for retirement at 60 years of age which had prevailed prior to 2003. He noted that, prior to the meeting with the Department of Finance and the HEA on 12 October, there had been an expectation that the discretion set out in the terms of the Pension Scheme, which had been deferred by the Trustees so as to prudently manage the pension fund

in 2003, would be reinstated and operated on the basis of an agreed protocol between the College and the HEA and the Department of Finance.

The Interim Chief Operating Officer also advised that the Minister's decision related to all discretionary items in the Pension Fund, including those relating to staff retiring aged 65 years. In the course of a discussion Board members expressed extreme disquiet at the removal of all discretion from the College.

Noting that the Minister's decision appeared to be inconsistent with the advice previously given to Board in relation to the pension arrangements for staff aged 65 years, the following points were made:

- (i) staff members have an employment contract with the College, including contractual commitments in relation to pension rights, and, notwithstanding the Minister's decision, would seek redress either through industrial action or legal means;
- (ii) the morale of the staff will be severely damaged by the removal of legitimate expectations in relation to retirement benefits which will inevitably impact negatively on the College's ability to deliver its strategic objectives, including alliances with other institutions;
- (iii) the fact that other universities will have the capacity to honour pension expectations will raise equity issues across the sector;
- (iv) staff's career choices have been influenced by their contractual pension expectations;
- (v) it appeared that the Board had been given insufficient information and expert advice in relation to the pension legislation and was therefore not fully informed when being asked to approve the transfer of the College's pension funds.

The Treasurer advised Board that, while investments had improved in recent months, there is still a very significant gap between the asset and liability values of the College's Pension Fund.

In conclusion, it was agreed that the College's negotiating team should continue to explore all avenues to redress this situation and report to the next Board meeting.

BD/09-10/025 Outlook 2009-2010 (see minute BD/09-10/007 of 16 September 2009)

- (i) The Provost advised the Board that the recently agreed 'New Programme for Government' had excluded the re-introduction of third-level fees, noting that the impact on the sector's finances was as yet unclear. A Board member stated that the external perception is that the student registration fee is an element of the core grant whereas it is intended for the provision of student services.
- (ii) It was noted that a decision is required urgently in relation to the promotions process for 2009/2010.
- (iii) The Provost noted that the College had improved its position by six points in the recently published THES University rankings (world-wide) to 43rd position.

BD/09-10/026 Draft Strategic Plan (2009-2014) (see minute BD/09-10/021 of 7 October 2009) In response to a query, the Provost advised that the amendments agreed by the Board at its last meeting had been incorporated into the final version of the Strategic Plan.

BD/09-10/027 Biosciences and Luce Hall Development - Status Reports The Director of Buildings, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to memoranda, dated 5 October 2009, which had been circulated.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (i) **Biosciences** The Director of Buildings outlined the background to the development, noting that applications for funding under PRTL 5 have been submitted for the Biosciences Research Institute, a number of additional research activities and the Medical Teaching facilities. He advised Board that, as a consequence, the academic and support space requirements in the development have increased to take account of these initiatives with a consequent reduction in the amount of commercial space available to the project. The Board noted that the budget for the development remains at €75 million and that additional costs associated with relocation of the Bioresources facility to the Biosciences building will be attributed to the Luce Hall development.

The Director also advised Board that a proposal to provide space for the School of Nursing and Midwifery in the development has been approved in principle but is conditional on the availability of funding from the capital allocation for the Nursing Degree Programme which is being pursued with the Department of Health and Children.

The Board noted that the project is well advanced and on schedule for completion, within budget, by December 2010. The Director of Buildings invited Board's attention to the detailed risk assessment of the individual elements of the development and the Treasurer outlined the loan repayment options as set out in an appendix to the memorandum.

The Director of Buildings clarified a number of points raised by Board members in respect of power supplies, particularly for the provision of IT services, as well as on a number of technical issues in relation to the contract with the developer.

In response to a query, the Director of Buildings advised that renting the commercial element of the development was a risk for the developer but noted that its location was a mitigating factor in this regard.

- (ii) **Luce Hall** The Director of Buildings invited Board's attention to the status report on the Luce Hall development, noting that a planning application was due to be submitted in the coming weeks. Noting that the anticipated cost of the development was expected to be approximately €22 million, of which €8 million is attributable to the relocation of the Bioresources facility, the Board noted that this relocation would free 700 m² for the Students' Centre and that space in the building would be shared 70:30 between student recreational and support activities. The Board also noted that the squash courts would remain in Luce Hall and that academic activities would also remain pending completion of the Biosciences project and the subsequent redevelopment of vacated space at the east end of College.

The Board noted that it was anticipated that the cost of the development would be split between the College, funds raised by Trinity Foundation and a student levy. The Director of Buildings invited Board's attention to the project's risk assessment and to the funding scenarios detailed in an appendix to the memorandum.

The Board noted the President of the Students' Union's proposal that the student levy should not exceed €80 and his comments in relation to the split between recreational and service functions in the Centre.

BD/09-10/028 Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC) The Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs, present by invitation, advised Board that the Academic Medical Centre (AMC) model is the accepted international best practice for health care delivery, initially developed in the US but now being increasingly recognised in Europe. He stated that the lack of

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

a Trinity AMC is perceived as hindering progress in the delivery of services in the College's Teaching Hospitals, with the consequent threat to clinical and research relationships with consultants. The competition from other recently-established AMCs was noted as were the current relationships with statutory bodies, the National Cancer Control Plan, individual hospitals, charities, patient groups and international groups.

The advantages of an academic medical centre, previously presented to Board, were outlined as were the two possible implementation models viz.:

- (i) Single governance; or
- (ii) Delegated responsibility, similar to the Johns Hopkins arrangements.

The Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 7 October 2009, which had been circulated outlining the current status of the discussions on the establishment of the TAMC, the requirements of single governance and delegated authority models for academic medical centres and the legal principles for an AMC based on delegated authority. Noting the need to reach a conclusion in the discussions as a matter of urgency, the Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs advised Board that an AMC based on a model of delegated authority was now being proposed.

In the course of a wide ranging discussion in which there was general support for the establishment of a TAMC, the following points were made by Board members:

- (i) there are possible risks to the College's relationship with its Teaching Hospitals if an AMC is not established in a timely manner;
- (ii) there is a need to learn from the negotiations to date in developing the final AMC model for the College and the Teaching Hospitals;
- (iii) there is a need for a strong governance model to ensure that any current weaknesses in College/Hospital governance arrangements are avoided in any future AMC;
- (iv) there will be a need to ensure adequate reporting to the College Board as part of the AMC's governance arrangements.

In conclusion, the Board adopted the proposal for a TAMC based on a delegated authority model and agreed that discussions would continue with a view to implementing this model in the two major Teaching Hospitals. Noting the importance of academic governance to the success of the initiative, it was agreed that a final document, incorporating the points made by Board members, the legally agreed Heads of Agreement and a risk analysis, would be presented for decision to the Board meeting scheduled to take place on 8 December 2009.

The Provost and the Treasurer withdrew from the meeting and the Registrar assumed the chair.

BD/09-10/029 Choice of Future Provosts The Registrar invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Provost, dated 7 October 2009, which had been circulated outlining recommendations from the Board Sub-Group on the Choice of Future Provosts in relation to the electorate for the election element of the appointment process. He also invited Board's attention to the recommendation that, should the Board agree that the proposals for the electorate be referred to the Fellows for assent and should assent to the required statutory change not be given, the current statutory provisions in relation to the electorate should remain in force.

In considering the proposals on the electorate, to which Dr Singleton noted his dissent, the following points were made by Board members:

- (a) the proposed procedure is complicated and unduly diminishes the central role of academics in the process and could act as a disincentive to potential external candidates and may not attract candidates with sufficient understanding of the academic needs of the College;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (b) the extension of the electorate to categories of staff who previously had no vote in the election of the Provost is a welcome recognition of the responsibility of the Provost for the whole College community and has created an expectation as to their inclusion in the process;
- (c) the electorate should comprise those staff with strong, long-term links to the College;
- (d) the size and diversity of the proposed electorate would impose a significant burden on candidates when organising campaign meetings/events;
- (e) the proposed weighted voting for certain categories of staff diminishes their impact on the final outcome;
- (f) the size of the weighted electorate is fair, preserves the primacy of the academic electorate and reflects the need to appoint an academic to the post of Provost;
- (g) the current proposals are weighted in favour of an internal candidate;
- (h) the combined student vote in the election of the Provost should increase to 4% of the total electorate.

In response to queries, the Secretary to the College advised Board that part-time staff, defined in accordance with the Protection of Employees (Part-Time Work) Act, 2001, are entitled to the same rights and privileges as full-time staff doing equivalent work. She also advised Board that the integrity of a postal vote for an enlarged Provost electorate would be similar to that which prevails in Board elections, noting that both elections would be of a similar scale.

The Board agreed to the process proposed by the Provost and referred the proposed changes to the Statutes Review Working Party to draw up statutory provisions. These will be put to the Fellows for assent, noting that should this not be successful the current statutory provisions would remain in force.

Dr Vij and Mr Dowling dissented.

BD/09-10/030 eStrategy - Update The Interim Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 6 October 2009, which had been circulated, together with the minutes of the eStrategy Steering Committee of 1 September 2009 and a risk analysis. He outlined the current status of the following matters:

- (i) Investigation of existing SAS packages;
- (ii) Project timeframe;
- (iii) Consultation and Communication programme;
- (iv) Staffing, noting the appointment of the Programme Manager;
- (v) Up-date on Student, Staff Office and Treasurer's Office workstreams;
- (vi) Programme budget.

He also advised the Board that the minutes of the eStrategy Steering Committee would be forwarded to Board on a regular basis.

Commenting on the Student Administration System, the Interim Chief Operating Officer advised Board that seven vendors had responded to the invitation to express interest in supplying the new system. He noted that it was intended to select up to five companies to engage in a process of competitive dialogue with a view to selecting the preferred supplier. He emphasised the importance of ensuring that the vendor had an in-depth knowledge of the College's requirements and terminology, and that the College should be fully aware of the capabilities of the proposed system.

In response to queries from Board members, the Interim Chief Operating Officer advised Board that IS Services is an integral part of the project plan and that the implementation of eStrategy is a key element of its work programme. He also advised Board that it is planned to fill the post of Director of IS Services.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In the course of a discussion, Board members noted the importance of including data migration issues in the risk assessment and stated that the assessment would benefit from a sharper definition of the factors mitigating the risks in certain key areas. The importance of communicating with the academic community on the impact of the proposed eStrategy was noted as was the need for a dedicated resource to address the change management issues necessary to ensure the success of the programme.

- BD/09-10/031 College Ethics Policy** (BD/07-08/262 of 23 April 2008 refers) The Secretary to the College invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 7 October 2009, had been circulated outlining a proposed Ethics Policy for the College. In the course of a discussion, Board members noted the difficulty of implementing the *Funding* element of the Policy as presented and requested that the Policy be re-drafted to reflect the stated concerns and a number of agreed editorial amendments.
- BD/09-10/032 University Council** The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 30 September 2009 subject to further comments covering CL/09-10/011, 013, 014, 025, 026, 027 (ii). (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).
- BD/09-10/033 Academic Appeals Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/011 of 30 September 2009)** The Board confirmed the decision of the University Council to approve the recommendations of the Academic Appeals Committee from its meeting of 10 July 2009.
- BD/09-10/034 Gold Medals 2008-2009** A memorandum from the Senior Lecturer dated 14 October 2009 was tabled. The Board noted a significant increase in the number of awards, 86, up from 65 awards last year. The Senior Lecturer advised that issues of marking and awarding of degrees are being considered by the University Council. The Board approved the Senior Lecturer's recommendations, as set out in Appendix 1 to this Minute.

SECTION B

- BD/09-10/035 Site and Facilities Committee** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 29 September 2009. The Chair of Committee, Dr K J McGinley, advised Board that tendering for additional student residential accommodation was underway. The President of the Students' Union stated that there had not been general agreement on the ratio of student activity to support services (70:30) in the proposed new Student Centre, noting that they had sought between 70:30 and 82:18. In response to a query, Dr McGinley advised that any unresolved complaint about the Buildings Office's services should be sent to the Interim Chief Operating Officer.
- BD/09-10/036 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/09-10/013 of 30 September 2009)** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 26 May 2009.

SECTION C

- BD/09-10/037 Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 30 September 2009, as circulated.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- BD/09-10/038 **Equality Committee - Council Nominee** The Board noted that the Council had nominated Dr M Ó Siochrú to be its representative on the Equality Committee.

- BD/09-10/039 **Tutorship** The Board noted and approved the nomination of Dr R Dayhot as an Acting Tutor with a full chamber from 1 November 2009 in place of Professor Simon Wilson.

- BD/09-10/040 **Self-Evaluation of the effectiveness of the Board** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 7 October 2009.

- BD/09-10/041 **Prizes and other Awards - School of Medicine Prizes and Medals 2009** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Administrative Officer, circulated, dated 5 October 2009.

- BD/09-10/042 **Douglas Hyde Gallery Board**
 - (i) **TCD Nominee** The Board noted and approved the nomination of Ms Valerie Mulvin as the College's nominee for four years;
 - (ii) **Arts Council Nominees** The Board noted the following nominations:
 - Mr Dermot Boyd (to December 2009)
 - Mr Declan Long (to December 2009)
 - Mr Caoimhín MacGiolla Leith (to May 2010)
 - Mr Kieran Owens (to July 2012)

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date:

Appendix 1 to Minute BD/09-10/034

Gold Medals 2008-2009

(i) Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences

Business Studies

Yearsley, Conor Dermot

Clinical Speech & Language Studies

O'Toole, Caoimhe Helen

Drama and Theatre Studies

Murphy, Oonagh Breda (Sch)

Economic and Social Studies

Curtis, Kieran Thomas (Sch)

Byrne, Anne (Sch)

McCarthy, Donal Paul

Kinsella, Claire

Henderson, Maxwell Kenneth

Velic, Adnan (Sch)

Cowman, Jennifer Ruth Ann

Doyle, Aidan

Moynihan, Laura

Education

O'Brien, Aoife Mary

Bennett, Mary

Kingston, Wendy Jane

English Studies

Robinson, Tara Joanne (Sch)

O'Leary, Naomi Frances (Sch)

European Studies

Moran, Eoghan Thomas

Brown, Judith Ashley (Sch)

Mulligan, Donal Martin

History

Furlong, Stephen Henry Matthew (Sch)

History and Political Science

Hession, Peter

Mental and Moral Science

Adams, Matthew Robert (Sch)

Music

Jackson, George Henry (Sch)

Psychology

O'Connor, Clíodhna (Sch)

Murphy, Peter

McCarthy, Caoimhe Christina

Nic A Bhaird, Caoimhe (Sch)

Sociology and Social Policy

Walsh, Niamh

(ii) Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science

Computer Science (BA)

Purcell, Stephen John

Engineering: Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering

Harte, Michael

Conlan, Sinead

Fitzgerald, Breiffni

O'Brien, Ronan James (Sch)

Engineering : Electronic and Computer Engineering

O'Callaghan, Mark (Sch)

Doyle, Joseph (Sch)

Kelly, Finnian Paul

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Rowley-Brooke, Roisin Frederica (Sch)

Engineering : Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering

Lynch, Eoin Patrick

Augy, Sylvain

Power, Liam

Elliott, Jessica Rosanne (Sch)

Glynn, Jane

Mesallati, Tariq

Horn, Stephen Christopher

Gourley, Ian John

Management Science and Information Systems Studies

Cronin, Aisling Marie (Sch)

Mathematics

Redmond, Jennifer Catherine

Palmer, Sam (Sch)

Sanger, Philippa

Medicinal Chemistry

Kelly, Brendan (Sch)

Daly, Robin

Curran, Simon Peter

Natural Sciences : Chemistry

O'Ruairc, Orla

Natural Sciences : Geography

Devaney, Laura (Sch)

Natural Sciences : Microbiology

Lynch, Jennifer

Natural Sciences : Physics

Buckley, Sonia Mary (Sch)

Cleary, Ciaran Sean (Sch)

Natural Sciences : Physics & Computer Simulation

Sexton, Michael Brendan (Sch)

Natural Sciences : Zoology

McNally, Luke

Physics & Chemistry of Advanced Materials

Ackland, Karl (Sch)

Theoretical Physics

Farrelly, Terence Chris (Sch)

Britton, Stephen Kevin (Sch)

Furlong, Michelle

(iii) **Faculty of Health Sciences**

Human Nutrition and Dietetics

[Results Published in December 2009]

Medicine

Farrell, Terence Patrick Joseph (Sch)

Adams, Niamh Catherine (Sch)

Geoghegan, Pierce (Sch)

Prunty, Sarah Louise

Midwifery Studies

Kinsella, Ita

Nursing Studies : General Nursing

Sullivan, Una

Nursing Studies : Psychiatric Nursing

Cullen, Caroline Esther Catherine

Pharmacy

Sharma, Manuj (Sch)

Conlon, Louisa Sarah

Flahavan, Eva (Sch)

Physiotherapy

Whelan, Darragh (Sch)

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Radiation Therapy
Redmond, Ciara

- (iv) **Multi-Faculty - Two Subject Moderatorship: Pattern B**
Carroll, Michael James (*Sch*) (Philosophy and Greek)
Gallagher, John James (*Sch*) (History and French)
Walsh, Eimhin James John (*Sch*) (Biblical & Theological Studies and History)
Hennessy, Claire (*Sch*) (History and English Literature)
O'Connor, Claire Patricia (Sociology and English Literature)
Fredheim, Rolf (*Sch*) (Russian and History)
Mee, Simon Francis (Economics and History)
Dowdall, Alex James (English Literature and History)
Rankin, Craig (Geography and Sociology)