

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 17 June 2009.

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Ms G Clarke, Ms M A Coffey, Mr P G Connell, Mr W J Dowling, Ms O S Foley, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Dr D O'Neill, Dr A J Piesse, Mr C Reilly, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr H Sullivan, Mr B Sweeney.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dr S P A Allwright , Dr A McElligott, Ms P Murphy, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr H J Rice, Dr J K Vij, Treasurer (Acting).
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Acting Secretary.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer Director of Strategic Initiatives (for BD/08-09/286).

SECTION A

- BD/08-09/276 Minutes** The minutes of the meeting held on 20 May 2009 were approved and signed.
- BD/08-09/277 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/08-09/278, 279 below).
- BD/08-09/278 Pension Matters (see minute BD/08-09/257 of 20 May 2009)** Dr McGinley advised Board that the draft legislation transferring the College's assets and liabilities is currently before both Houses of the Oireachtas. He advised Board that issues regarding the retirement age at 60 should be urgently addressed noting that, once the legislation is passed, any amendment will require the consent of the Minister for Education and Science and the Minister for Finance. The Board agreed that this matter should be referred to the Director of Strategic Initiatives.
- BD/08-09/279 Staff Matters (see minutes BD/08-09/252 and BD/08-09/253 of 20 May 2009)**
- (i) **Employment Control Framework** The Provost advised Board that the Irish Universities Association (IUA) had submitted a proposal for the Employment Control Framework to the HEA, which would be examined by the Department of Finance. The IUA is currently awaiting a response.
 - (ii) **Promotions** The Provost advised Board that the Senior Promotions procedure was now complete and, in the absence of the Employment Control Framework, the decision to present candidates to Board for approval, will be deferred until Michaelmas Term 2009.

- (iii) **Staff Matters** The Interim Chief Operating Officer clarified a number of staff issues which had been raised by Board members at the previous meeting, noting that:
 - (a) at present the Public Service early retirement scheme does not apply to College;
 - (b) there is continued engagement with Trade Unions in relation to the introduction of the new academic year structure and it is hoped that all outstanding issues will be resolved in the near future.

BD/08-09/280 Provost's Report

- (i) **PRTL 5** The Provost advised Board that the College has been successful in its proposals to the international assessment panel in the first stage of PRTL 5's competitive process. The Board noted that the specific details of the proposals would now be developed for the next phase of assessment.
- (ii) **Sectoral Matters** The Provost invited Board's attention to issues which have recently been raised within the sector, including the structure and regulation of higher education, the quality of undergraduate degree courses and the student experience in third level institutions. The Board noted the importance of taking action, both internally and externally, to address these issues in the context of the College's Strategic Plan.
- (iii) **Board Meeting on 8 July 2009** The Board agreed that due to the pressure of business, the next meeting of Board would start at the earlier time of 9.30am.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Senior Lecturer, Bursar and Registrar withdrew from the meeting

BD/08-09/281 Annual Office The Board noted, for approval at its meeting on 8 July 2009, the nominations for Annual Officership for the academic year 2009-2010 as presented by the Provost.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Senior Lecturer, Bursar and Registrar rejoined the meeting

BD/08-09/282 Annual Report of the College - 2007-2008 The Provost invited Board's attention to the College's Annual Report for 2007/2008 which had been circulated. He noted that it was a high-level commentary of the College's achievements in that year drawing on the annual reports of individual areas which had been considered by Board at previous meetings. The Board approved the Report.

BD/08-09/283 Appointment of Provost - Procedures - Report of Board Sub-Group on the Choice of Future Provosts The Provost invited Board's attention to the memorandum dated 10 June 2009, which had been circulated, with an up-dated report from the Board Sub-Group.

The Provost, noting the comments of Board members and discussions with the Fellows, outlined the recommendations of the Board Sub-Group under the following headings:

- (i) **Terms of Reference of the Board Sub-Group**
- (ii) **Context** - The Provost invited Board's attention to the provision, based on the Board Regulations pertaining to casual vacancies, to replace a Board member or College Officer who has withdrawn from Board following the declaration of

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

his/her candidature. Board agreed that this matter would be addressed in detail in the Regulations for the appointment of the Provost.

- (iii) **Time-table**
- (iv) **Provost Appointment Steering Committee**
- (v) **Interview** - The Provost advised that it was proposed that the Board, on the recommendation of a sub-committee comprising Board members and the Chair of the Fellows, shall appoint an Interview Committee which shall be a sub-group of Board. He further advised that the interview process shall identify candidates for whom there is a *prima facie* case for proceeding to election, based on:
 - (a) verification of curriculum vitae factual data;
 - (b) significant academic standing taking into account the references received;
 - (c) evidence of capacity for management/administration in an educational institution;
 - (d) evidence of representative skills.
- (vi) **Election Process and (vii) Electorate** - The Provost advised that proposals would be presented to Board following further consultation with the Standing Committee of Fellows.
- (viii) **Appeals Process** - The Provost advised Board that the appeals Sub-Group of Board will adjudicate on all issues which may arise in relation to the implementation of the appointment procedures.
- (ix) **Appointment.**

In the course of a discussion, Board members noted the agreement which had been reached between the Board Sub-Group and the Standing Committee of the Fellows in relation to the interview process.

The Provost advised Board that, as the inclusion of an interview into the procedures would require a statutory change, approval was sought to seek the assent of the Fellows. He noted that, since a change to the electorate may not necessarily require a statutory change, this would be considered separately by Board in due course.

The Board agreed to the proposals outlined in the paper presented by the Board Sub-Group subject to the inclusion of a provision in the forthcoming Regulations that fair and equitable procedures would apply to the process.

The Board agreed that the section on the interview process would be sent to the Statutes Review Working Party to prepare an appropriate Ordinance for which the assent of the Fellows would be sought.

BD/08-09/284 Strategic Plan up-date The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 11 June 2009, which had been circulated. He advised Board that in the course of developing the College's Strategic Plan (2009-2014), it was decided to include a mission statement and stated values for the College. The Board noted the item was for discussion only and that formal proposals would be considered at its next meeting.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer outlined two draft mission statements and draft list of values for the College.

In the course of a discussion, Board members raised the following issues:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (i) the Students' Unions were disappointed not to have a representative member on the Mission, Values and Vision Group;
- (ii) the clarity of the mission statement was welcomed;
- (iii) the values should reflect external as well as internal views and, in particular, include social policy and the College's place in Dublin society;
- (iv) the values should be stated clearly and directly and include the contribution made by graduates, postgraduates and staff to society;
- (v) consideration should be given to the order of the values listed and the inclusion of the promotion and use of the Irish language.

In responses to the issues raised, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that he would incorporate Board members' suggestions into the final draft of proposals, noting the Board's preference for the mission statement. He invited the President of the Students' Union and the President of the Graduate Students' Union to attend the next meeting of the Strategic Planning Group on Mission and Values.

BD/08-09/285 Up-dated High Level Risk Register - Critical Risks to the College The Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 2 June 2009, which had been circulated. The Board, recognising the pace of change in the external economic environment, noted the modifications to the Risk Register and the Critical List since January 2009. The Provost advised Board that financial risks, including the retention of staff, are being examined by the Planning Group with a view to developing contingency plans for cost savings.

BD/08-09/286 External Relations The Director of Strategic Initiatives, present by invitation, together with the Registrar invited Board's attention to a number of proposed alliances which are currently being reviewed, including:

- (i) **Marino Institute of Education** The Registrar updated the Board on the status of the on-going discussions regarding trusteeship of the Institute.
- (ii) **Milltown Institute** The Registrar invited Board's attention to the decision made by Board to agree in principle to the strategic alliance with the Milltown Institute subject to further consideration of the detailed financial and governance arrangements (minute BD/07-08/082 refers). He advised Board that these negotiations are at an advanced stage
- (iii) **Economic and Social Research Institute (ESRI)** The Director of Strategic Initiatives advised Board that since being approached with a view to forming a strategic alliance, negotiations have taken place with the ESRI including issues such as governance, academic activities and financial arrangements. He further advised Board that the Treasurer's office is reviewing financial issues while the Staff Office is examining possible staffing issues. The Board noted that formal proposals would be brought to Board for consideration in Michaelmas term 2009.
- (iv) **Exploration Campus** The Director of Strategic Initiatives advised Board that in the current economic climate the proposal is unlikely to be advanced.
- (v) **Irish Management Institute (IMI)** The Director of Strategic Initiatives invited Board's attention to previous discussions which had taken place at Board on the negotiations between the College and the IMI. Discussions are on-going but it is unlikely that an alliance will take place.
- (vi) **Forum on Actor Training** The Director of Strategic Initiatives invited Board's attention to the Forum which had been established to review the need for undergraduate actor training in this country (minute BD/06-07/136(ii) of 31 January 2007 refers). He advised Board that the Forum has generated

significant interest from the acting profession, a philanthropic trust and international drama schools. The Board noted that, should further progress be made, the Head of the School of Drama may be invited to Board to discuss the matter in detail.

The Board agreed that any decision to proceed with any of these proposed ventures would be presented to Board for approval and that all proposals would include a formal risk analysis. The Provost thanked the Registrar and the Director of Strategic Initiatives.

BD/08-09/287 Annual Governance Statement to the Higher Education Authority The Board approved the draft Annual Governance Statement to the HEA, dated 17 June 2009, which had been circulated and authorised the Provost to sign it on its behalf.

BD/08-09/288 Visitors: -Postgraduate Appeals The Acting Secretary advised Board of the outcomes of the following three recent postgraduate appeals to the Visitors:

- (i) an appeal of the decision taken on 25 February 2009 by the Disciplinary Panel was heard on 9 June 2009;
- (ii) an appeal of the decision taken on 9 December 2008 by the Disciplinary Panel and heard on 9 June 2009;
- (iii) an appeal of the decision taken on 23 February 2009 by the Disciplinary Panel has heard on 12 June 2009.

The Acting Secretary advised Board that the College is now taking steps to implement the Visitors' findings.

BD/08-09/289 University Council The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 3 June 2009 and 5 June 2009 subject to further comments covering CL/08-09/182, 193 and 194. (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes)

BD/08-09/290 Appeal to the Visitors (minutes BD/08-09/196 of 1 April 2009 and BD/08-09/196 of 22 April 2009 refer) Under Other Business, the Board noted that a named case had been taken to the Visitors in the interests of the College and at no personal gain to the staff member involved.

The Board, without precedent, approved the College's contribution to the total legal costs incurred by the named staff member.

SECTION B

BD/08-09/291 Audit Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 27 May 2009.

BD/08-09/292 Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 26 May 2009.

BD/08-09/293 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/08/09/182 of 3 June 2009) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meetings of 3 June 2009.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

SECTION C

- BD/08-09/294 Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 3 June 2009, as circulated.
- BD/08-09/295 Library and College Archives Annual Report 2007-2008** The Board noted the Library and College Archives Annual Report 2007-2008, as circulated.
- BD/08-09/296 Almanack 2009-2010** The Board noted the Almanack 2009-2010, as circulated.
- BD/08-09/297 Prizes and Other Awards**
- (i) **School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies - Christopher Donovan Translation Prize** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Head of School, circulated, dated 6 May 2009;
 - (ii) **School of Nursing and Midwifery - Establishing Student Prizes A** memorandum from the School Administrator, circulated, dated 5 June 2009;
 - (iii) **New Prize - Patrick O'Sullivan Prize** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer (Acting), circulated, dated 11 May 2009;
 - (iv) **Sweet and Maxwell Prize - Change of Name** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer (Acting), circulated, dated 11 May 2009;
 - (v) **IBM David Dier Memorial Prize - increase in value** The Board noted and approved the increase in value to €1,500 of the above prize and Calendar entry in the School of Computer Science and Statistics;
 - (vi) **Mahaffy Memorial Prize - amendment** The Board noted and approved the following change and Calendar entry in the School of Drama, Film and Music: 'on the nomination of the Head of Music'.
 - (vii) **Changes in Prizes in Engineering, Mathematics and Science** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from Treasurer (Acting), circulated, dated 26 May 2009.
- BD/08-09/298 Financial Assistance Committee - Recommendations** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 15 May 2009.
- BD/08-09/299 National Institute for Intellectual Disability - A memorandum of Understanding - Mary Immaculate College** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Director of the NIID together with a Memorandum of Understanding between TCD and Mary Immaculate College, South Circular Road, Limerick, as circulated.
- BD/08-09/300 Scholarship - Request for Intermission** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 8 June 2009.
- BD/08-09/301 Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences - Headship of Schools** The Board approved the following:
- (i) **School of Drama, Film and Music** Professor S Wilmer, 2009-2012
 - (ii) **School of English** Dr D Jones, 2009-2012
 - (iii) **School of Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies** Dr S Smyth, 2009-2012
 - (iv) **School of Psychology** Dr H Smith, 2009-2013.

BD/08-09/302 Bequests and Benefactions - Estate of Séamus O'Mathúna The Board noted the receipt of €3,716.38 from the Estate of the late Mr Séamus O'Mathúna which had been added to the Provost's Academic Development Fund.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date:

Appendix 2 to Minute BD/08-09/304 (ii)

Nominations for Appointment

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
Computer Science and Statistics	Systems Administrator	WALSH, Michael, B.A., BSc., Dip., H.Dip., (N.U.I.)	01-07-2009	Permanent
Computer Science and Statistics	Administrative Officer	O'CONNOR, Ceara, Dip. (Inst of Technology, Kevin Street), Dip., B.A. (Inst Technology, Mountjoy Square)	04-08-2009	03-08-2012