

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 28 January 2009

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast, Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Ms G Clarke, Mr P Connell, Mr W J Dowling, Ms O S Foley, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr A J Piesse, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr H Sullivan, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij, Dr K Walshe.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dr A McElligott, Ms P Murphy, Mr C Reilly, Dr H J Rice.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Acting, Secretary, Treasurer (Acting).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer. Dr E O'Dell (for BD/08-09/123).

The Provost welcomed Mr Peter Connell to his first Board meeting (see minute BD/08-09/126 below).

SECTION A

BD/08-09/118 Minutes

- (i) **9 December 2008** The minutes of the meeting held on 9 December 2008 were approved and signed.
- (ii) **21 January 2009** The minutes of the meeting held on 21 January 2009 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

BD/08-09/114 College High Level Risk Register The word 'Offices' was replaced with the word 'Officer' in the first sentence on page four;

BD/08-09/115 Disciplinary Panel The word 'December' was replaced with the word 'January' in the first sentence of the minute.

BD/08-09/119 Matter Arising from the Minutes A matter arising from the minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, (see minute BD/08-09/120).

BD/08-09/120 BD/08-09/093 Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC) (see minute BD/08-09/093 of 9 December 2008) The Provost advised Board that meetings of the TAMC Interim Executive and Steering Committee had been temporarily paused in December 2008 to facilitate bilateral discussions between the parties.

A Board member stated that further engagement with the hospitals' Medical Boards was essential to ensure the success of the venture. The Provost advised Board that there was a strong commitment by College to progress this initiative with the two

hospitals and the Board agreed that it would receive a further report from the Vice-Provost for Medical Affairs at its next meeting.

BD/08-09/121 Provost's Report The Provost invited Board's attention to the following issues:

- (i) **Proposals for future Collaboration** The Provost, referring to his report at the previous meeting, (see minute BD/08-09/087 of 9 December 2008), invited Board's attention to the government's framework for economic recovery. He advised Board that central to this framework was the creation of a 'smart economy' based on innovation and research. Noting the views expressed at a recent meeting of the Irish Universities Association (IUA), he advised Board that the government's plans provided the sector with an opportunity to play a leading role in innovation and research and that the College's Strategic Plan for the next five years should reflect this.

The Provost advised Board that the Special Group on Public Service Numbers and Expenditure Programmes will review the HEA and the sector in March 2009 and that a request for detailed statistics as an input to this review had been received from the Special Group. Recognising the likely recommendations from the review, he stressed the need to take initiatives to maximise the opportunities available in the context of a 'smart economy', including collaborations with other institutions, while at the same time preserving the College's autonomy and independence.

The Provost, noting the College's history of collaboration with other institutions and referring to the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with UCD in 2007, (see minute BD/06-07/188 of 28 February 2007), stated that there was now an opportunity for further collaboration and for the development of a Dublin-based platform of innovation and research as a first step towards a national system. He invited Board's attention to the proposal that the College and UCD commit to developing an agreement based on their individual strategic plans, and on existing strengths, to:

- (a) define areas in which each institution's research priorities can be enhanced by joint action;
- (b) investigate the establishment of joint graduate programmes related to these strengths where there is clear added-value in working together;
- (c) define how the two institutions might work together to deliver innovation in teaching and learning in light of the developments at 4th level, noting the advantage of the geographical proximity of the two institutions;
- (d) in the context of the Strategy for Science, Technology and Innovation (SSTI), jointly define the infrastructure and staff requirements necessary to deliver joint actions, as well as separate institutional actions, and lobby all decision-makers to communicate the urgency and magnitude of the requirement.

In the course of a discussion, and in response to queries from Board members, the Provost, noting that a proposal for further collaboration and not a merger of the two universities is currently being considered, stated that it is necessary for the College to make proactive decisions to drive the initiative, given the pace of change in the economic climate. The Board noted that, in the context of the MOU, a high level of engagement with UCD has already taken place, and that in the first instance, Science, Engineering and Technology will be the most likely areas for collaboration given their clear connection with entrepreneurship and intellectual property rights but that, over time, opportunities will be sought across all disciplines. The Board also noted, that collaboration with other institutions would not be precluded in the development and, as has happened in previous disciplinary collaborations,

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

individual Schools would be involved in developing proposed collaborative programmes.

The Board, noting that the experiences gained from other such College initiatives should be taken into account, supported the development of collaborative activity with UCD and agreed that the Board should be fully briefed on progress.

- (ii) **Strategic Plan 2009-2014** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, at the invitation of the Provost, outlined the process for development of the Strategic Plan for the College for the next five year period 2009-2014. He invited Board's attention to the Review of the Strategic Plan 2003-2008 which had been circulated under item C.5 of the agenda.

He advised Board that there is a need to obtain a balance between the devolution of strategy for particular Schools and Faculties and the College's overall Strategic direction. The Board noted that the Planning Group, a sub-group of the Executive Officers, (comprising the original members of the Funding Group and other Executive Officers and College staff as required) will oversee the development of the Strategic Plan. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the Planning Group will engage with the College Community to identify the key strategic themes to capture College's core objectives and that the development of the plan will be carried out in a consultative and collaborative way. He advised Board that, following the completion of the College's Strategic Plan, Schools and administrative/service areas will write their individual plans based on the overall College plan.

In response to queries raised by Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer stated that:

- (a) engagement will take place with staff in administrative/service areas through their management structures and the Partnership process;
- (b) the views of external stakeholders will be taken into consideration in the development of the Plan;
- (c) it is hoped to present the draft Strategic Plan to Board for consideration at the meeting to be held on 17 June 2009 and for approval at the meeting on 8 July 2009.

- (iii) **New Academic Year Structure** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that, further to the Fellows' assent to the statutory change to implement the new academic year structure in Michaelmas Term 2008, discussions had taken place with staff representative groups (see minute BD/08-09/033 of 22 October 2008). He stated that significant progress had been made and that, although there were still some outstanding issues to be resolved, the discussions had been positive and had not identified any issues that would prevent the implementation of the new academic year structure.

The Board, noting that negotiations with trade unions and staff representative groups will continue throughout the implementation phase, approved the implementation of the new academic year structure effective from 2009/2010.

- (iv) **Funding Group** The Provost advised Board that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, who is Chair of the Funding Group, will present the Group's report to the next meeting of Board, noting that the Estimates for 2009 will also be considered at that meeting.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the Funding Group has developed a tool for scenario planning for the College's finances

based on real data which will support, not just the management of the College's finances, but also the strategic planning exercise.

- (v) **Pay Awards and Allowances** The Provost invited Board's attention to discussions which are currently underway with the Department of Education and Science in relation to previously approved allowances for senior College Officers and the approved pay awards for staff on the Professorial scale. The Board, noting that these issues are being addressed, urged that an equitable solution be found as soon as possible.

BD/08-09/122 ARAM - Response of the Task Force (see minute BD/08-09/089 of 9 December 2008) The Bursar invited Board's attention to the memorandum, dated 20 January 2009, which had been circulated detailing responses from the ARAM Task Force to the points made by Board members at its previous meeting when considering the paper 'Recommended Adjustments and Weightings for use in the New Resource Planning Model'. She also noted the Audit Committee's recommendation that stability be introduced into the implementation of ARAM.

Noting that the proposals had the full support of the Faculty Deans, the Bursar invited Board's attention to proposals in relation to:

- (i) measurement of research quality and the interim use of research proxies;
- (ii) taught Masters courses, noting the memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies in this regard;
- (iii) increasing the numbers of postgraduate students;
- (iv) charges for IS Services;
- (v) the reduction of risk to the College, identified by the Audit Committee, arising from the implementation of the proposals.

In the course of a discussion, the following points were raised by Board members:

- (i) the risk of not progressing with the current proposals was greater than the risk pertaining to the proposals themselves;
- (ii) consideration should be given to using a strategic fund to address Schools deficits;
- (iii) there is a need to define what is meant by realistic deficits for Schools within the context of the model;
- (iv) an increase in research may lead to less emphasis being placed on maintaining the quality of teaching;
- (v) the recruitment process may need to be reviewed to ensure continued emphasis is placed on recruiting academic staff who can deliver high quality teaching as well as engaging in research;
- (vi) teaching and research are not integrated at freshman level;
- (vii) clarity must be brought to the funding relationship between Schools and Trinity Research Institutes;
- (viii) there should be a moratorium on revising the weights used in the model for the duration of the next Strategic Plan i.e. five years.

In the course of a discussion, the Bursar clarified a number of technical issues which were raised by Board members and advised Board that if the proposed weightings are approved, the ARAM Task Force will examine methods for measuring research quality and present proposals to Board in Trinity term.

The Board noted the Treasurer (Acting)'s comments that the model should be aligned to the College's strategic goals and that it should not act as a disincentive to the achievement of the College's objectives.

The Board approved:

- (i) the proposals in relation to the revised weightings to be used in the model;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (ii) in principle, the proposals in relation to the use of research quality measures, noting that proposals on the measures to be used would be presented to Board in Trinity Term 2009 and that proxies would be used until the operation of approved measures could be implemented;
- (iii) a moratorium on any amendments to the model for five years.

The Provost thanked the Bursar and the ARAM Task Force.

BD/08-09/123 Statutes Review - Process by which the Provost is chosen by the College Dr O'Dell, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to the memorandum from the Statutes Review Working Party (SRWP), dated January 2009, which had been circulated, outlining the legislative provisions concerning the procedures by which the Provost is chosen.

Dr O'Dell advised Board that the Universities Act, 1997, imposes an obligation on Board to develop interview procedures to be included in the process by which the Provost is chosen by the College and that these procedures must be contained in the Statutes. The Board noted that relevant legislative provisions require the Provost to be appointed by Board, having been chosen by the College pursuant to procedures set out in the Statutes, which must include an interview. Dr O'Dell advised Board that since the Statutes do not provide for such an interview they must be amended to include one.

Following a brief discussion of the SRWP's findings, in the course of which a number of practical issues associated with the proposed interview process were raised, the Board accepted that the choosing of Provosts would require an interview process and agreed that this process should also include an election.

The Board approved the Provost's recommendation to establish a Sub-Group of Board to prepare proposals for approval by Board on the technical operation of the combined approach to choosing the next Provost.

The Board, noting that the revised Statute in relation to the choosing of the Provost would require the assent of Fellows in due course, approved the following membership of the Sub-Group:

- (i) Provost (Chair);
- (ii) Acting Secretary (secretary);
- (iii) Dr J McGilp;
- (iv) Dr K McGinley;
- (v) Dr A Piesse

The Board noted Dr Vij's reservations about the membership of the Sub-Group.

Dr O'Dell advised Board that the SRWP would prepare a submission for the consideration of the Sub-Group posing questions which, in the SRWP's opinion, would need to be addressed to enable the operation of the procedures to choose the Provost. The Board noted that, if the Board so wished, the SRWP would, in due course, draft a revised Statute for submission to the Fellows for assent.

The Board thanked Dr O'Dell and the Working Party for their assistance in bringing this matter to a conclusion.

BD/08-09/124 Acta of the University Council The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 14 January 2009 subject to further comments covering CL/08-09/069, 070, 071, 075, 077, 083 and 084 (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- BD/08-09/125** **Provost's Report on the Review of the School of Education (see Actum CL/08-09/071 of 14 January 2009)** The Board noted the Provost's Report on the Review of the School of Education and the recommendations made which were approved by University Council on 14 January 2009.
- BD/08-09/126** **Board Election Result** Under Other Business, the Board noted that Mr P Connell had been elected to represent the Technical, Administrative and Support Staff constituency in the by-election which had been concluded on 27 January 2009.
- BD/08-09/127** **Chair of Panel of Enquiry** Under Other Business, the Board, noting that in accordance with Chapter XII, Schedule II, Section 18 of the Statutes, the Students' Unions had been consulted and supported the recommendation, approved the re-appointment of Mr A Owens S.C. as Chair of the Panel of Enquiry. The Board also approved the re-appointment of Mr T Turpin as secretary to the panel. The Board noted that the position of Deputy Chair is currently vacant and that the Acting Secretary will bring forward a recommendation for that position in due course.
- BD/08-09/128** **Board of Douglas Hyde Gallery** Under Other Business, the Board approved the nomination of Mr S G Williams to the vacant position on the Board of the Douglas Hyde Gallery.
- BD/08-09/129** **Steward** Under Other Business, the Board approved the nomination of Dr E Arnold as Steward.
- BD/08-09/130** **Selection Committees** Under Other Business, the Board noted and approved the Selection Committees for the posts of:
- (i) **Programme Manager - eStrategy**
Chief Operating Officer
Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer
Staff Secretary
Mr A Lush (external)
Ms M Crowe (UCD)
 - (ii) **Workstream Co-ordinators (4)**
Chief Operating Officer
Acting Director, ISS
Professor J Grimson
Mr A Lush (external)
Programme Manager-designate
Recruitment Manager

SECTION B

- BD/08-09/131** **Information Policy Committee (see Actum CL/08-09/077 of 14 January 2009)** The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Information Policy Committee from its meeting of 21 October 2008.
- BD/08-09/132** **Research Committee (see Acta CL/08-09/069 and 075 of 14 January 2009)**
- (i) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Research Committee from its meeting of 17 December 2008.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (ii) The Board noted the Social Science Research Review dated 21 July 2008 as prepared by the External Reviewers which had been considered by the Research Committee (minute RS/08-09/04 of 17 December 2008 refers).

BD/08-09/133 Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 20 January 2009 with particular reference to:

SF/08-09/37 European Performance of Buildings Directive Dr McGinley advised Board that under the Energy Performance of Building Directive all new buildings must be provided with a Building Energy Rating and an initial assessment of almost 160 buildings that College owns indicates that up to 40 buildings will require a Display Energy Certificate to be prepared each year.

SECTION C

BD/08-09/134 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 14 January 2009, as circulated.

BD/08-09/135 Sealings The Board noted Sealings, circulated, as set out in Appendix 1 to these minutes.

BD/08-09/136 Prizes and Other Awards

- (i) **Gold Medal Recommendation 2008** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Senior Lecturer that Ms S L Doyle (04504429) (Human Nutrition and Dietetics) be awarded a Gold Medal.
- (ii) **John Bennett Fund** The Board noted and approved the recommendation that Ms A Wilson (06418783) should received the bursary for the academic year 2008-2009, value €750.
- (iii) **School of Medicine Prizes and Medals 2008** The Board noted a memorandum from the Administrative Officer, School of Medicine, circulated dated 5 December 2008 and approved the award of prizes and medals in the School of Medicine.
- (iv) **School of Medicine - Studentships 2008-2009** The Board noted a memorandum from the Medical Student and Intern Co-ordinator, circulated dated 13 January 2009 and approved studentships for 2008-2009.

BD/08-09/137 Senior Lecturer's Annual Report (see Actum CL/08-09/070 of 14 January 2009) The Board noted the Senior Lecturer's Annual Report 2007-08 with Admissions Data for 2008-09.

BD/08-09/138 Review of the Strategic Plan 2003-2008 The Board noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated dated 21 January 2009.

BD/08-09/139 Disciplinary Procedures - Membership of Working Party to review Disciplinary Procedures The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated dated 20 January 2009, and approved the following membership:

Registrar *Chair*
Acting Secretary to the College

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Mr K O’Doherty
 Mr T Turpin
 Board representative (tbc)
 IFUT representative (tbc)
 Fellows’ representative (tbc)
 Ms S Mac Bride *Secretary* (in attendance)

BD/08-09/140 Permissions - Library - National Library of Wales - Proposed Loan of Manuscripts
 The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Librarian, circulated dated 20 January 2009.

BD/08-09/141 Memorandum of Understanding - St Patrick’s University Hospital The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Head of the School of Medicine, circulated dated 20 January 2009 together with a Memorandum of Understanding between Trinity College and St Patrick’s University Hospital.

BD/08-09/142 Senate - Degrees of MA (*j.o.*) The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, dated 28 January 2009, tabled.

The following item was withdrawn:

Research Matters - Dean of Research to report.

SECTION D

This information is restricted.

Signed:

Date:

Sealings

19th December 2008

Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus – Unit 27 & 29 Building Works

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Public Works Contract for the re-fit of Units 27 and 29 in the Trinity Technology and Enterprise Centre between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Pierse Building Services Limited.

Trinity Technology and Enterprise Campus – Unit 13 & 14 Building Works

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Public Works Contract for the re-fit of Units 13 and 14 in the Trinity Technology and Enterprise Centre between the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Pierse Building Services Limited.

23 December 2008

New Library Building – Surrender of Lease (Skovale)

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Surrender of Lease in relation to the New Library building between Skovale and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin.

The Provost also signed duplicate copies of the Particulars and Conditions of Sale on behalf of the College, as well as a Completion Letter addressed to Skovale.