

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 21 January 2009

<i>Present</i>	Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast) (in the chair), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr W J Dowling, Ms O S Foley, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr A J Piesse, Mr C Reilly, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr H Sullivan, Dr J K Vij.
<i>Apologies</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Ms G Clarke, Dr D O'Neill, Mr B Sweeney, Dr K Walshe.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Acting, Secretary, Treasurer (Acting).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer. Representative of the Auditors, KPMG (Ms L Gallagher) (for BD/08-09/113) (Research Accounting Manager) Ms D Savage (for BD/08-09/113)

SECTION A

- BD/08-09/113 Funding Statements for year ended 30 September 2008** The Board noted the following documents which had been circulated for consideration under this item:
- (i) Funding Statements for the year ended 30 September 2008;
 - (ii) Funding Statements for the year ended 30 September 2008 - Additional Information;
 - (iii) Proposed Letter of Representation to KPMG concerning Funding Statements, dated 21 January 2009;
 - (iv) Memorandum from the Treasurer (Acting), dated 9 January 2009;
 - (v) Memorandum from the Chairman of the Audit Committee, dated 14 January 2009, together with letter from KPMG to the Chairman of the Audit Committee, dated 19 December 2008.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, introducing the topic, noted that any queries on the details of the Funding Statements which had been received from Board members in advance of the meeting had been dealt with. He invited the Board's attention to the work which the Finance Committee and the Audit Committee had undertaken on its behalf in relation to consideration and review of the Funding Statements for the year ended 30 September 2008. The Board noted the discussions which had taken place between these Committees and the Treasurer's Office and the College's external auditors (KPMG), in this regard. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer stated that, on the basis of the recommendations of these Principal Committees, which had been noted in their respective minutes (Agenda items B.1 and B.2 refer), the Board was being asked to formally approve the Funding Statements for the year ended 30 September 2008 and to authorise the Provost and the Treasurer (Acting) to sign the Funding Statements and the associated Letter of Representation to the external auditors.

The Treasurer (Acting) invited Board's attention to the memorandum, dated 9 January 2009, which had been circulated, in which he presented his report on the Funding Statements for the year-ended 30 September 2008. He stated that the accounts presented were the first part of the annual reporting cycle and represented the core

teaching and research activities in the Income and Expenditure Account in accordance with the harmonised basis of accounting. The Board noted that the second part will be the Consolidated Financial Statements prepared in accordance with GAAP which it is expected, will be undertaken in the coming months, pending the resolution of outstanding pension issues.

The Treasurer (Acting) tabled a presentation to Board on the Funding Statements including a review of the financial performance for the year, an analysis of trends and ratios and an overview of the financial challenges facing College in 2009. The Treasurer (Acting) invited Board's attention to the following issues as outlined in his presentation:

- The College's financial position as reported in the Income and Expenditure Account and Balance Sheet;
- Research income and expenditure;
- Capital developments and financial position;
- Underlying historical financial position;
- Funding concerns;
- Financial Flexibility within College;
- Acceleration of the Action Plan to deal with future challenges.

The Treasurer (Acting) also noted the impact of the decisions taken in relation to the provisions for the liabilities arising from the Fixed Term Workers Act. The Treasurer (Acting) noted the strength of the Balance Sheet and invited the Board's attention to future developments and the steps that the College must take to meet its strategic objectives in the context of the expected challenging economic environment. The Treasurer (Acting) advised that the College has put measures in place to deal with these challenges, including the acceleration of the approved Action Plan and the establishment of the Funding Group to explore all options open to the College. The Treasurer (Acting) further advised, that as previously indicated by the Provost to Board, all issues will be under review in order to ensure the College's continued level of success, including:

- Generation and diversification of future income streams
- Future pruning or ceasing of activities
- Rationalisation within the sector
- Possible sharing of services between institutions in the sector

The Treasurer (Acting) thanked the staff in the Treasurer's Office for their assistance throughout the year.

Dr McGilp, the Board member on the Audit Committee, invited Board's attention to the memorandum dated 14 January 2009, and the accompanying letter from KPMG dated 19 December 2008, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the audited Funding Statements had been the subject of detailed consideration by the Audit Committee subsequent to their review by the Finance Committee. Dr McGilp noted that the Audit Committee was not aware of any issues or concerns which would preclude Board approving the financial statements and the Letter of Representation for the year under review.

Ms Gallagher of KPMG, present by invitation, advised Board that there were no additional matters which she wished to bring to the Board's attention and that on receipt of the signed Funding Statements and Letter of Representation it was the auditors' intention to issue an unqualified audit opinion. In response to a query, Ms Gallagher advised Board that the negative assurance provided by the Audit Committee was standard practice and that she was confident that the control environment was strong. Ms Gallagher thanked the Treasurer (Acting) and the Treasurer's Office staff for their assistance and cooperation during the year.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In the course of a discussion, the Treasurer (Acting) clarified a number of technical issues raised by Board members. In conclusion, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer thanked KPMG, the Audit Committee and the Treasurer's Office. The Board approved the Funding Statements for 2007/2008 and the associated Letter of Representation and agreed that they should be signed by the Provost and the Treasurer (Acting) on its behalf.

BD/08-09/114 College High Level Risk Register The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, introducing the topic, invited Board's attention to the Provost's memorandum, dated 13 January 2009, and the College's High Level Risk Register for the academic, administrative and support areas, which had been circulated, stating that the Risk Register had been prepared in accordance with the College's Risk Management Policy. He advised Board that the Audit Committee had considered the register at its meeting on 19 December 2008 and the Executive Officers have over the last year put in place specific arrangements such as the Funding Group and the revised administrative management structure, which will enable the effective management of risk within College. The Board noted that in order to achieve ambitious goals an increased degree of risk taking can be necessary and that the focus needs to be on how risk is managed rather than trying to eliminate it entirely. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to the five highest risks areas identified in the Register currently facing College.

Dr McGilp, the Board member on the Audit Committee, invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Chairman of the Audit Committee, dated 14 January 2009, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the Audit Committee, while acknowledging the considerable achievements which have been made in recent months in identifying the College's risks, feels that the process should be more embedded in management procedures. He also noted that the Audit Committee welcomed College's e-strategy which it is hoped will facilitate with this process.

The Chief Operating Officer, advising Board that the Risk Register had been compiled following significant engagement across the College in order to identify the significant risks, stated that it had involved reviewing the individual supporting registers compiled by administrative units and the faculties. He advised Board that certain areas, such as Research Institutes and the Science Gallery, which have a semi-autonomous status have not yet been incorporated into the risk assessment process.

Noting that the College's Strategic Plan provides the context for the compilation of the Risk Register, Board members recommended that the wording of the risks, as presented, be reviewed, and, where necessary, revised to clarify their meaning, particularly in relation to staff retention, externally-funded research and the financial risks to the College.

In the course of a long discussion, Board members identified the following issues for inclusion in the Register:

- (i) the inability to retain technical support staff is of equal importance to the ability to retain academic staff, noting that retention of academic staff at all levels is of key importance to the College;
- (ii) the potential damage to the national and international reputation of the College due to inadequate provision of student services.

In the course of a discussion, it was stated by Board members that consideration should be given to informing all areas of College about the health and safety issues identified in the Risk Register with a view to embedding these risks in local risk registers. It was also stated that it may be prudent to initiate an investigation into future staffing needs and actions that may be taken in the context of the future funding difficulties.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In response to queries, the Chief Operating Officer stated that while the quantification of risks and their mitigating factors is a subjective exercise, internationally accepted Risk Evaluation Guidelines had been used to calculate the risks as presented. He also advised Board that the Risk Register is a 'living' document which will be reviewed on an on-going basis.

The Board approved College's High Level Risk Register subject to the issues raised by Board members being addressed, noting that the Register would be reviewed periodically throughout the year. The Board agreed that a paper on the College's pay policies and associated matters would be prepared by the Staff Secretary and reviewed by the Personnel and Appointments Committee on behalf the Board.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer thanked the Chief Operating Officer and the Acting Chairman of the Audit Committee for their contribution to the discussion.

The Senior Lecturer withdrew from the meeting.

BD/08-09/115 Disciplinary Panel The Board agreed that, due to the urgency of the matter, it would consider, at the Statutory meeting, the confidential report from the Chairperson of the Disciplinary Panel, dated 19 January 2009, which had been tabled. The Acting Secretary invited Board's attention to the Panel's clarification of the penalty it had imposed on a named staff member following a hearing which had concluded on 19 October 2008. Following consideration of the Panel's clarification, as outlined in the Chairperson's report, and following a discussion on its implications, the Board, in accordance with Chapter XII, Schedule 3, Section 42 of the Statutes, adopted the Panel's penalty and clarification, stipulating that the Senior Dean, using the discretion provided for in the clarification, must adhere to Chapter XII, Schedule 3, Section 13 (c) of the Statutes.

SECTION B

BD/08-09/116 Audit Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the meeting of the Audit Committee of 19 December 2008.

BD/08-09/117 Finance Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the meeting of the Finance Committee held on 17 December 2008, noting in particular:

- (i) Academic Facilities and Departments - Analysis of Recurrent Expenditure and Research Accounts, year to 30 September 2008 (see FN/08/09/30 OF 17/12/08);
- (ii) Memorandum from the Research Accounting Manager to the Finance Committee, dated 14 January 2009 (see FN/08/09/31 of 17/12/08);
- (iii) Ghala Limited - Financial Statements - year ended 30 September 2008;
- (iv) Letter of Representation to KPMG concerning Ghala Ltd, dated 4 December 2008;
- (v) Report to the Auditors to the Board of the University of Dublin, Trinity College ('College') Pursuant to Section 13 of the Prompt Payment of Accounts, Act 1997, dated 11 December 2008.

In response to a query, the Chief Operating Officer undertook to advise Board on plans for presenting annual reports from administrative and service areas to Board.

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings