

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 19 November 2008.

Present Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr W J Dowling, Ms O S Foley, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr A J Piesse, Mr C Reilly, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr H Sullivan, Dr J K Vij, Dr K Walshe.

Apologies Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Ms G Clarke, Mr B Sweeney.

In attendance Ms S Mac Bride.

(ex officio) Acting Secretary, Treasurer (Acting).

(by invitation) Chief Operating Officer.

Mr J White (PA Consulting) for BD/08-09/061.

BD/08-09/057 Minutes The minutes of the meeting held on 22 October 2008 were approved and signed.

BD/08-09/058 Matters Arising from the Minutes One matter arising from the minutes was discussed and has been recorded below, (see minute BD/08-09/059, 060).

BD/08-09/059 Provost's Report (see minute BD/08-09/030 of 22 October 2008) The Provost advised Board of College's continued commitment to the implementation of the Board's Action Plan, noting the achievements to date.

BD/08-09/060 Trinity Academic Medical Centre (TAMC) (see minute BD/08-09/031 of 22 October 2008) In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that as yet, the interim Chief Executive Officer of the TAMC had not been appointed.

BD/08-09/061 Provost's Report The Provost advised Board that the purchase of the final periphery building on Pearse Street was now complete, noting the opportunities which this acquisition will offer the College in the future.

The Provost noted that the call for proposals under PRLTI5 was expected in the coming weeks.

BD/08-09/062 Future Facing Resource Planning Model The Bursar invited Board's attention to memorandum, dated 11 November 2008 which had been circulated, and welcomed Mr White from PA Consulting, present by invitation, to present the report 'Further

Development and Full Implementation of the College's Academic Resources Allocation Model (ARAM)', which had also been circulated to Board.

Mr White advised Board of the strengths and weaknesses of the current ARAM system including an analysis of related income and expenditure. He also outlined the variation of movements within the model. Mr White drew Board's attention to a comparative study between College's ARAM and Resource Allocation Models used by peer universities in the UK, highlighting the need to move from a retrospective approach to a 'future facing' model.

Mr White advised Board that the introduction of ARAM has had a number of positive effects for College, in that it has resulted in better financial management, greater planning and financial transparency across College as well as greater equity in the allocation of resources. It is now proposed that College moves from a retrospective approach to a planned 'future facing' approach to resource allocation. A future facing model would support College's Strategic Plan while providing the effective means by which to manage College budgets.

Mr White invited Board's attention to the organisational and governance changes that would be necessary to support a future facing model including the establishment of a Planning Unit and the full involvement of the new faculty structure. Mr White noted the key issues which would have to be addressed in the transition from the current ARAM to the proposed future facing model including the need to:

- plan and manage the process effectively;
- secure the support of the College community for the new model;
- address historical deficits and surpluses;
- put a robust planning tool in place to support the new model;
- identify and manage the associated risks.

In the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board Members:

- (i) when considering the distinction between the present model and the future facing model, clarity is needed in relation to the fairness of the weighting system and how it will affect self-financing courses;
- (ii) due to the variable level of inputs to the model, compared to the relatively predictable level of input in peer universities in the UK it will be difficult to predict accurately the output of the model;
- (iii) consideration must be given as to how any new financial tool for the future facing model will be introduced;
- (iv) there is a need to consider the future facing model in the context of College's five year Strategic Plan;
- (v) as administration is a fixed cost it must be established how it will fit into the future facing model and what will drive these costs;
- (vi) the implications of forgiving previous school deficits in the context of the introduction of the future facing model must be considered;
- (vii) clarity is needed in relation to the reporting arrangements for the proposed Planning Unit.

In response to queries, Mr White clarified a number of technical issues in relation to the operation of a future facing model, stating that:

- (i) the issue of weightings will be dealt with in the next phase of introducing the future facing model to Board;
- (ii) the predicted outputs of the future facing model will have a high degree of accuracy despite the varying factors influencing input;
- (iii) any new ARAM financial tool would be used in parallel with the current system during the transition period;
- (iv) the College's Strategic Plan should be re-assessed annually taking ARAM-related matters into account;
- (v) administration costs will be included as an input to the future facing model together with all other inputs;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (vi) Schools must agree deficits that can realistically be paid back using a planned approach, noting that prudent planning would support the establishment of contingency funds;
- (vii) the terms of reference of the Planning Unit would be brought to Board at a later date;
- (viii) the proposed software tool would facilitate regular reporting and monitoring by Heads of School, noting that quarterly reporting would be the norm.

The Board agreed to proceed in principle with the proposals contained in Mr White's report noting that there would be a report to the next meeting on the adjustments and weightings to be used. The Provost thanked Mr White for his presentation to the Board.

BD/08-09/063 E-strategy (see BD/07-08/369 of 9 July 2008) The Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to the report on the implementation of an e-strategy for College, which had been circulated.

He advised Board that e-strategy was required to allow College to function more efficiently and remain competitive in the international environment. He highlighted that the e-strategy programme must have a strategic focus, be inclusive across teams, have clear divisions of responsibility between oversight and implementation and be supported by a strong programme manager with authority to allocate resources appropriately.

The Provost emphasised the importance of introducing an e-strategy for the College, noting that inadequate IT Systems are the most critical risk to the achievement of the College's objectives. He stated that, as previously advised (minute BD/07-08/369 of 9 July refers), the College has allocated €5 million to the project from which the costs associated with the feasibility study proposed by the Chief Operating Officer would be funded. He advised Board that at the end of the feasibility study a clear plan to implement e-strategy, with associated costs and timings, would be presented to Board.

The Chief Operating Officer outlined the proposed governance structure which will include the establishment of a College-wide Steering Group and the appointment of a Programme Manager, four Project Managers and one Programme Administrator. He noted that business analyses would be included in functions for the Project Managers in their first year. He also outlined the tasks which would be undertaken during the first year of the programme, including a needs' analysis, a review of the sustainability of the current IT systems and a detailed analysis of realisable cost savings.

In the course of a discussion the following issues were raised by Board Members:

- (i) there must be a commitment to change academic administrative processes in the future with a clear understanding as to the scope and extent of e-strategy and the role IT systems can play in its delivery;
- (ii) representatives from the College community should be included on the Steering Group;
- (iii) clarification is required in relation to the deployment of human resources which the introduction of e-strategy may cause;
- (iv) engagement is required with those members of the College community who will be directly affected by the introduction of e-strategy;
- (v) risk assessment must be included in the operation of e-strategy with clarification on who will be responsible for the successful implementation of the project.

In response to queries from Board Members the Chief Operating Officer clarified a number of issues, advising that:

- (i) e-strategy requires support from all areas of the College Community;
- (ii) the Steering Group will include representatives from relevant end-user groups;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- (iii) a full cost analysis of e-strategy prior to the implementation of the programme will be a pre-requisite for the success of the project and will be presented to Board at the end of the feasibility study;
- (iv) the four Project Manager positions proposed are required to address the areas of Student Administration, Finance, Human Resources and the interface with College systems;
- (v) the implementation of e-strategy will ultimately release resources throughout the College which can be re-directed to the College's core activities.

Dr McGinley and Ms Murphy invited Board's attention to concerns about the possible implications for both the proposed e-strategy programme and the College should there not be adequate and appropriate engagement with relevant staff on its implementation.

The Chief Operating Officer advised Board that the document would be revised to take account of the points made and that the final membership of the Programme Steering Group would reflect the proposals made by Board members. He stated that a fully costed proposal based on the selection of an agreed implementation partner would be presented to Board in due course.

Subject to the concerns expressed by Board members being addressed, Board approved the first year of the programme and associated staffing, as proposed by the Chief Operating Officer, noting that it would receive regular progress reports over the coming year.

BD/08-09/064 Disciplinary Panel The Secretary (Acting) invited Board's attention to the confidential report of the Chairperson of the Disciplinary Panel regarding a named staff member, which was tabled at the meeting.

The Board, having considered the findings, in accordance with Section 42, Schedule III, Chapter 12 of the Statutes accepted the Panel's recommendations in principle, subject to clarification from the Panel as to the exact interpretation it should place on the sanction. The Board also accepted the Chairperson's recommendation in relation to the costs of the case.

The Board requested the Secretary (Acting) to advise the relevant parties of the Board's decision and of the Panel's findings, with due regard for the confidentiality of the individuals involved.

Following a brief general discussion of the College's disciplinary procedures, the Board requested the Registrar to review the operation of current statutory staff disciplinary procedures and to report his findings to Board.

BD/08-09/065 University Council The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meetings held on:

- (i) 29 October 2008 (Personal Chair);
- (ii) 5 November 2008 (Personal Chair);
- (iii) 5 November 2008

subject to further comments covering CL/08-09/023, 024, 029, 030 (ii), 31,32, 43, 44 (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).

BD/08-09/066 Personal Chair (See Actum CL/08-09/023 of 29 October 2008) The Board noted that Professor Vogel, recommended to Personal Chair by the University Council, had now withdrawn.

BD/08-09/067 Personal Chair (See Actum CL/08-09/024 of 5 November 2008) The Board confirmed the recommendation of the University Council and appointed the following to a Personal Research Chair, from a date to be agreed:

Professor M Caffrey, B.Agr.Sc. (N.U.I.), M.S. (Cornell), Ph.D. (Cornell)

BD/08-09/068 Academic Appeals Committee (See Actum CL/08-09/029 of 5 November 2008) The Board confirmed the decision of the University Council to accept the recommendations of the Academic Appeals Committee from its meetings of 8, 9, 10 and 13 October 2008.

BD/08-09/069 Postgraduate Appeal (See Actum CL/08-09/030(ii) of 5 November 2008) The Board confirmed the decision of the University Council in the matter brought before it concerning the appeal of a postgraduate student.

BD/08-09/070 Resignation of Board Member Under Any Other Business the Board noted the resignation of Mr M Slevin as a Board Member and that, in accordance with the current regulations governing the elections to Board, a by-election may be required to replace him. The Board thanked Mr Slevin for his contribution during his period as a member of the Board.

SECTION B

BD/08-09/071 Audit Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Audit Committee from its meeting of 15 October 2008.

BD/08-09/072 Research Committee (See Actum CL/08-09/031 of 5 November 2008) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Research Committee from its meetings of 8 May 2008 and 19 June 2008 with particular reference to:

RS/05 -06/32 Policy on Research Groupings within Trinity College Dublin The Board approved the Policy on Research Groupings within Trinity College Dublin.

RS/07-08/41 Funding of Trinity Research Institutes The Board approved the policy on the Funding of Trinity Research Institutes.

RS/07-08/52 Indirect Costs Policy The Board approved the policy on Indirect Costs. In response to a query the Treasurer (Acting) confirmed that all requests for information relating to indirect costs would now be made in accordance with the new system.

BD/08-09/073 Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 4 November 2008 with particular reference to:

SF/08-09/16 Biosciences Development Dr McGinley, Chair of the Site and Facilities Committee, acknowledged Board's decision to grant space in the new Biosciences Building to the School of Nursing and Midwifery.

SF/08-09/24 Biosciences Project Dr McGinley informed Board that alterations to the substructure design of the Biosciences Building will be necessary due to changes by Iarnród Éireann to the proposed line and depth of the rail interconnector tunnels under the site. The total cost of redesign due to these changes could amount to €1

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

million. Dr McGinley advised Board that the College was acting on legal advice and intends to recoup this expense from Iarnród Éireann.

BD/08-09/074 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/08-09/032 of 5 November 2008) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 16 September 2008.

SECTION C

BD/08-09/075 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 28 October 2008.

BD/08-09/076 Proctors' Lists for Autumn Commencements The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 4 November 2008.

BD/08-09/077 National Institute for Bioprocessing Research and Training Limited The Board noted the Directors' report and financial statements, period ended 31 December 2007, as circulated.

BD/08-09/078 Prizes and Other Awards

- (i) **Entrance Exhibitions Report 2008** The Board noted a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 11 November 2008, and approved 594 Entrance Exhibition Awards for 2008;
- (ii) **Awards 2008** The Board noted a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 11 November 2008 and approved recommendations in relation to the Reid Entrance Awards, Annie Anderson Memorial Prize, William Anderson Exhibition and the Biggs Memorial Prize;
- (iii) **Henry Flood Research Scholarship for 2008-2009** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Graduate Studies Committee that the 2008-2009 award should be made to Mr T Herbert (04170601), value €8,000;
- (iv) **Jean Montgomery Fund** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Senior Tutor that the 2008-2009 award should be made to Ms K Mackey (06754856).

BD/08-09/079 Centre for Microscopy and Analysis - Directorship The Board noted and approved the nomination of Dr D Nolan (School of Biochemistry and Immunology) as Director of the Centre from 1 January 2009.

BD/08-09/080 Student Disciplinary Committee The Board noted and approved the membership of the Student Disciplinary Committee for the academic year 2008-2009, as set out in a memorandum from the Registrar, tabled, dated 18 November 2008, in accordance with section 13 of Schedule 2 of Chapter XII of the 1966 Consolidated Statutes:

Registrar *Chair*
Members of the Academic Staff (6)
 Professor C Begley
 Ms D Connolly
 Dr L E Doyle
 Dr M Manzke
 Dr B O'Rourke
 Dr M O'Siochru

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Students (6)

Mr S Hall
Ms C Kassis-Crowe
Mr R Kearns
Ms S E Molan
Ms R Pe Palileo
Ms F Sharp

Non-academic Staff (2)

Ms O Lombard
Mr F O'Rourke

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: