

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 21 November 2007

- Present* Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr R M J Byrne), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Senior Lecturer (Dr C Kearney), Dr A Butterfield, Mr A Byrne, Ms M A Coffey, Dr J F Donegan, Dr A C Donnelly, Mr A Frenda, Dr J M Kelly, Dr H Rice, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr K J McGinley, Dr D P O'Donovan, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr J A N Parnell, Dr A J Piesse, Mr B Rock, Mr M Slevin, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.
- Apologies* Bursar (Dr D C Williams), Ms G M Clarke, Ms U Faulkner, Ms M Leahy, Dr S Ryan.
- In attendance*
- (ex officio)* Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary, Deputy Treasurer.

SECTION A

- BD/07-08/077 Minutes** The minutes of the meeting held on 24 October 2007 were approved and signed.
- BD/07-08/078 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/07-08/079, 080).
- BD/07-08/079 Restructuring (see minute BD/07-08/042 (iii) of 24 October 2007)** The Senior Lecturer advised Board that the work of the sub-groups established by the Restructuring Implementation Oversight Group (RIOG) was well advanced and that their recommendations would be presented to the RIOG in the near future. The Board noted that consultation had commenced with the Staff Group of Unions and the Partnership Committee on the formation of a Joint Industrial Council and that allowances for the new senior appointments were being discussed with the Department of Education and Science and the Department of Finance.
- In response to concerns that the College's approach to strategic planning may not conform to the requirements of 'Towards 2016' and that it had been referred to outside bodies for consideration, the Vice-Provost advised Board that the matter is the subject of on-going discussion and that it was hoped that the College's ICTU Group of Unions would submit a memorandum on this matter to the Strategic Planning Devolution Working Group in the near future.
- BD/07-08/080 Working Group on the Appointment of the Chief Operating Officer (COO) (see minute BD/07-08/042 (i) of 24 October 2007)** On the nomination of the Provost, the Board approved Mr Steve Cannon, Chief Operating Officer in the University of Aberdeen as a member of the Interview Committee for the post of Chief Operating Officer, noting that a nomination for a representative of the administrative staff would be advised to Board as soon as possible. The Board agreed that this nomination would be approved by written procedure.

In response to a concern about an advertisement appearing on the College's website, the Secretary advised Board that the reporting arrangements for the Chief Academic Officer outlined in the job specification for the post of COO had been included solely for the information of prospective candidates. He stated that, as the Board had not yet made any final decisions in this regard, they had been presented as indicative, based on previous Board discussions. The Board agreed that, for the avoidance of doubt as to the status of this information, it would be removed from publicly-accessible websites.

BD/07-08/081 Provost's Report

- (i) **Times Higher Education Supplement (THES) Rankings** The Provost invited Board's attention to the College's recent ranking as 53rd in the world by the Times Higher Education Supplement. The Provost, noting the care with which such rankings should be interpreted, paid tribute to the College community and spoke of the challenges facing the College to maintain this level of achievement in the future.
- (ii) **SFI Stokes Scheme** The Board noted that the College had been awarded fourteen new blood positions under the SFI Stokes Scheme, representing almost one quarter of the total number of awards made nationally.
- (iii) **Full Economic Cost Model (FECM)** The Treasurer invited Board's attention to the work which is underway across the sector to develop a full economic cost model for institutions' activities. She advised Board that the EU Framework Programme 7(FP7) will require applicants for funding to be in a position to identify the full economic cost of research, particularly overheads, by January 2010. If this information is not available it is expected that the level of overheads provided by the EU will be reduced from their current level. The Board noted that it is hoped that the full economic cost of all College activities will be a valuable input to external discussions with the HEA and research sponsors in the future. It will also be useful for internal purposes.

The Treasurer advised Board that funding to scope the development of a FECM had been received from the first phase of SIF and that this work is almost complete. The Board noted that the UK consultants, who had worked with HEFCE on the development of a similar model, had been employed to undertake this work. The Board also noted that the UK is currently the leader in the EU on this particular issue.

The Treasurer advised Board that the Presidents of the IUA had designated funding for the development of the model as a priority under the second phase of SIF, the outcome of which was awaited.

She stated that, if funding is made available from SIF, the parameters of the study will be completed within two to three months. The Board noted the importance of ensuring consistency across the sector in the application of the final model.

In response to queries, the Treasurer advised Board that:

- (i) while it was hoped that there would be consistency in approach across the sector, each institution would apply its individual cost base to the model. She emphasised the need for a robust testing of the model in order to ensure that the outputs are realistic and meaningful;
- (ii) it is not envisaged that the HEA's RGAM will be replaced by the proposed model, noting that it is expected that the RGAM will be in force in its current form for the next number of years;

- (iii) it is unlikely that it will be possible for the FECM to include measures of quality, noting that no model to date (Unit Cost, ARAM, RGAM) has incorporated such data;
- (iv) the College's four-year degree has been identified as a challenge in the application of the RGAM and the same issues are likely to apply in relation to the FECM.

The Treasurer clarified a number of technical issues associated with the proposed model and advised that it was hoped to have a presentation to Board in Hilary Term on its development.

- (iv) **Financial Outlook 2008** The Treasurer advised Board that data from the Government's Book of Estimates and discussions with the HEA have indicated that the recurrent grant allocation to the College is likely to be lower than expected resulting in a shortfall in funds to meet the College's needs. The Board noted the negative impact which the application of the RGAM has on the College's expected allocation.

BD/07-08/082 Milltown Institute of Theology and Philosophy (see Actum CL/07-08/036 of 7 November 2007) The Provost introducing the topic, invited Board's attention to the background to the College's proposed relationship with the Milltown Institute and the College.

Following a detailed discussion of the issues raised, the Board, noting the conclusions of the discussion at Council, agreed in principle to the proposed strategic alliance subject to further consideration of the detailed financial and governance arrangements in due course.

BD/07-08/083 Regulations for Election to Board The Secretary, referring to a previous request by Board, (minute BD/07-08/021 of 26 September 2007 refers), that the Regulations for Election to Board be reviewed to address the criteria for replacing those Board members who resign without completing their term of office, proposed that a sub-group of Board be established to consider the matter and develop proposals for approval. He also advised Board that the Regulations will have to be amended to address the inclusion of part-time staff. In response to a query, the Secretary agreed that the possibility of holding by-elections to fill mid-term vacancies on the Board would be considered. In response to a query, the Secretary clarified the provisions of the Universities Act in relation to the appointment of Governing Authorities. The Board approved the following membership of the sub-group, noting that none of these will be seeking election in 2008:

Professor H Rice
Dr E Mac Cárthaigh
Ms M Leahy

BD/07-08/084 Final Proposals to respond to the Statutes Review Working Party (see Actum CL/07-08/037 of 7 November 2007) The Registrar invited Board's attention to a draft memorandum to the Chair of the Statutes Review Working Party, dated 12 November 2007, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the memorandum encapsulated the points raised at two previous discussions at Board (minutes BD/07-08/021 and BD/07-08/046 of 26 September and 24 October 2007 respectively refer) and Council (minutes CL/07-08/011 and CL/07-08/037 of 10 October and 7 November respectively refer). The Board, endorsing the views expressed in the memorandum, agreed that it should be sent to the Statutes Review Working Party.

BD/07-08/085 Acta of the University Council The Board confirmed Acta of the University Council from its meetings held on:

- (i) 24 October 2007;
- (ii) 2 November 2007;
- (iii) 7 November 2007;

subject to further comments covering CL/0708/028, CL/07-08/029, CL/07-08/035, CL/07-08/036, CL/07-08/037, CL/07-08/038, CL/07-08/039, CL/07-08/040, CL/07-08/041, CL/07-08/047, CL/07-08/048, CL/07-08/049, CL/07-08/050(i). (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes.)

BD/07-08/086 Academic Appeals Committee (see Actum CL/07-08/035 of 7 November 2007) The Board confirmed the decision of the University Council to accept the recommendations of the Academic Appeals Committee from its meetings of 8, 10 and 11 October 2007.

BD/07-08/087 Membership of the Working Party on Council Composition (see Actum CL/07-08/038 (i) of 7 November 2007) The Board noted and approved the following membership of the Working Party on Council Composition:

Registrar	Chair
Senior Lecturer	Secretary to Council
Board representatives	Dr A Piesse
	Dr J Parnell
Council representatives	Dr V Campbell
	Ms F Haffey
Fellows' representative	Professor H Delany
Statutes Review Working Party Representative	Dr S Boyce
Student representative	Mr B Rock

BD/07-08/088 Election of the Dean of Health Sciences The Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 16 November 2007, which had been circulated outlining an issue which had arisen in relation to the election of the Dean of Health Sciences. He advised Board that, in his role as Returning Officer, and in accordance with the agreed procedures for the election of Deans, an appeal had been lodged to seek the inclusion of hospital staff within the School of Medicine among the electorate for the election of the Dean of Health Sciences, noting that this group had voted in some previous elections for Dean. The Secretary advised Board that he had referred this matter to the Board-approved Adjudicating Committee which had recommended that, in the context of precedent, legitimate expectation and justice, hospital staff, listed in the College Calendar and recognised by the College for at least the previous twelve months, should be entitled to vote in the election for the Dean of Health Sciences.

The Secretary sought Board approval for this recommendation and to the revised Regulations for the Election of Deans which would be required to give it practical effect. In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that hospital staff included in the Calendar have been formally nominated to, and approved by, Council and Board. He also clarified the circumstances whereby this group voted in some but not all previous elections to Dean.

In the course of a discussion on the proposal it was noted that the criteria for inclusion in the College Calendar differ for individual Schools within the Faculty of Health Sciences.

The Board, approving the proposal as presented, agreed that new Dean will develop proposals for approval by Board on:

- (i) criteria according to which hospital staff in all Schools in the Faculty of Health Sciences will, in future, be approved by Council and Board;
- (ii) the definition of electorates for future elections of Deans.

Professor Vij expressed reservations in regard to this matter.

The Board also approved the revised procedures for the Election of Faculty Deans as presented and agreed that the Provost would be delegated to ratify the outcome of the elections on behalf of the Board.

BD/07-08/089 Resource Management Committee Under Other Business, the Board approved the nomination of Professor O'Halpin to the Resource Management Committee to replace Professor Kelly who had resigned.

BD/06-07/090 Information Policy Committee Under Other Business, Dr Butterfield invited Board's attention to an issue which had arisen at the meeting of the Information Policy Committee which took place on 25 October 2007, the minutes for which had not yet been circulated to Board. He advised Board that the Library had secured funds from the HEA Research Equipment Renewal Grant Fund to the value of €750,000 to replace the Library Management System, with a requirement that the Library commit to the HEA to acquire the new system from one of a specified shortlist of suppliers by the middle of December 2007, with a final decision on the actual supplier being made by early April 2008. The Board noted that the Information Policy Committee will meet on 11 December 2007 at which a decision will be made whether to proceed to give the required commitments to the HEA.

Dr Butterfield advised Board that in order to fulfil the commitment to the HEA, and to replace the system, additional staff will have to be employed for which PAC approval will be required. He noted that due to the timing of relevant committee meetings, PAC will not have met in time to meet the December deadline for the HEA and he expressed concern about committing PAC to a course of action before it had an opportunity to consider the matter.

Following a discussion of the issues raised, the Board agreed that the Treasurer's Office and the Bursar should be involved in developing the proposal for consideration by IPC and that the Executive Officers Group should also be aware of the commitments being made to the HEA in this regard. It was agreed that, once adequate funding arrangements are in place to recruit any additional staff, this should not present any significant difficulties for PAC.

SECTION B

BD/07-08/091 Equality Committee

- (i) **Draft Minutes of the meeting of 5 November 2007** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Equality Committee from its meeting of 5 November 2007 with particular reference to:

Eqal/07–8/05 Up-date on the implementation of the Disability Act 2005 - Accessible Information Guidelines The Vice-Provost invited Board's attention to the guidelines for the production of documents which are accessible to people with disabilities, noting the recommendation that, where it is not practicable to produce all documents according to the guidelines, it should be specified that documents in a 'clear print' format are available on request. The recommendation that electronically accessible documentation

should also be accompanied by a statement indicating the availability of information in accessible format was also noted.

In the course of a short discussion it was agreed that the detailed technical issues raised by Board members would be referred to the Disability Services Coordinator who would be invited to prepare a document on the implementation of the guidelines and to make a presentation to IPC at some future date.

- (ii) **Annual Report of the Equality Committee and the Equality Officer 2006-2007** The Board noted the Annual Report of the Equality Committee and the Equality Officer 2006-2007 as presented.

BD/07-08/092 Heads of School Committee (see Actum CL/07-08/039 of 7 November 2007) The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Heads' Committee from its meeting of 23 October 2007 with particular reference to: **HC/07-08/08 College Risk Policy and High Level Risk Register** The Senior Lecturer invited Board's attention to the minute of the discussion on the College's Risk Policy and High Level Risk Register which had taken place at the Heads' Committee meeting on 23 October 2007. He stated that the Heads of School had stressed the importance of professional coordination of risk management across the College. He also invited Board's attention to the conclusion of the discussion which stated that each School would nominate a Risk Manager and that this person would liaise with the Secretary's Office. The Board also noted the Heads' recommendation that professional training should be provided to the appointed Risk Managers.

The Senior Lecturer advised Board that arising from this decision, the Secretary had requested Heads of School to nominate a Risk Manager who would liaise with him in relation to administrative and infrastructural risks and with the Senior Lecturer on academic risks, as defined in the College's Risk Policy, with a view to securing appropriate training for those nominated.

He advised Board that, at the subsequent meeting of the Heads' Committee, the Heads of School had expressed concern that College needs to put in place a coordinated and professional approach to academic risk management. The nomination of 24 Risk Managers, one in each School, without appropriate College support through a dedicated professional risk manager, would not suffice. The Heads of School agreed that they would prefer not to nominate Risk Managers until uncertainties about the role were clarified. The Board noted that Heads of School had expressed concern that documenting risks in certain areas could expose the College to additional risks and the Committee recommended that they should proceed cautiously in a coordinated and professional manner. The Senior Lecturer advised Board that, if the current Risk Policy stays in place until a new one is agreed, it will be difficult to make progress in relation to academic risks. The Secretary advised Board that the outcome of the situation, as reported by the Senior Lecturer, is that the Risk Register, which will be considered by Board in January 2008, will not cover academic risks.

In the course of a discussion, an apparent confusion between risk and safety was suggested as contributing to the Heads' Committee reluctance to engage with the process.

The Board, noting that the approved Code of Governance requires it to report to the HEA on the management of risk in the College, expressed serious concern that the Heads' Committee was not adhering to Board policy in this regard. The Board requested the Senior Lecturer to raise the matter again with the Heads' Committee with a view to achieving a level of compliance with the College's Risk Policy in the current year, and to report to the next Board meeting.

BD/07-08/093 Research Committee (see Actum CL/07-08/040 of 7 November 2007) The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Research Committee from its meetings of 4 October 2007.

BD/07-08/094 Site and Facilities Committee

- (i) **Draft minutes of the meeting of 6 November 2007** The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meeting of 6 November 2007 with particular reference to:

SF/07-08/27 Pavilion Bar Alterations Dr McGinley invited Board's attention to the Committee's reservations at the possible impact on the established symmetrical architecture of the Pavilion Bar arising from the scheme proposed by the architects and to the decision to revert to the previously approved scheme. The Board noted that planning permission would be sought as soon as possible for that scheme.

SF/07-08/32 An Post Site/Biosciences Development Dr McGinley advised Board that An Board Pleanala (ABP) has deferred its decision on the An Post Site/Biosciences Development for the second time to 9 January 2008, noting that the revised scheme requested from ABP for a reduced parapet height of the building will be submitted by the deadline of 29 November 2007.

SF/07-08/33 Operating Hours for College Buildings Dr McGinley invited Board's attention to the clarification being sought on the College's legal obligations to provide minimum heating levels for people choosing to work outside normal working hours when their presence is not a requirement.

- (ii) **Proposed Letting of Banking Hall, Foster Place** Following a clarification on the terms of the lease and the planned use of the income to the College, the Board approved the proposed letting of the Banking Hall, Foster Place as proposed.

BD/07-08/095 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/07-08/041 of 7 November 2007) The Board noted, and where appropriate, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 18 September 2007.

SECTION C

BD/07-08/096 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 23 October 2007, as circulated.

BD/07-08/097 Proctors' Lists for Autumn Commencements The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 6 November 2007.

BD/07-08/098 Sealing The Board noted:

Apollo House, Tara Street, Lease of 9th Floor The Seal of the College was put to a short term business letting agreement of the Ninth Floor, Apollo House, Tara Street, Dublin 2 between Cuprum Properties Limited and the Provost, Fellows and Scholars of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin.

[2/11/07]

BD/07-08/099 Prizes and Other Awards

- (i) **Entrance Awards**
 - (a) **Entrance Exhibition Awards** The Board noted and approved a memorandum and recommendations from the Senior Lecturer, circulated dated 15 November 2007;
 - (b) **Awards 2007** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated dated 15 November 2007.
- (ii) **Postgraduate Travelling Scholarship in Surgery 2007-2008** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the nominating committee (Calendar S40) to award the Postgraduate Travelling Scholarship (2007), Sheppard Memorial Prize and the Edward Halloran Bennett Medal in Surgery to Dr Paul McCormick.
- (iii) **Downes Exhibition 2007-2008** The Board approved the award to Ms A Brzozowicz (Value: €1,500).
- (iv) **John Bennett Fund 2007-2008** The Board approved the award to Ms A Wilson (Value: €507.90).
- (v) **Financial Assistance Committee** The Board noted and approved the recommendations as set out in a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated dated 18 October 2007.

BD/07-08/100 Bequests and Benefactions

- (i) **Estate of William Dowse - Will Trust** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 17 September 2007.
- (ii) **Estate of Professor Wesley Cocker Deceased** The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated dated 23 October 2007.

BD/07-08/101 Head of School - Chemistry The Board noted that following the resignation of Professor J Corish, Professor G Watson has been appointed interim Head of School from 5 October until 31 December 2007.

BD/07-08/102 Membership of Student Disciplinary Committee The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated dated 13 November 2007 and approved the following membership for the academic year 2007-2008:

Chair:

The Registrar

Six members of the academic staff:

Dr J Kallen

Ms E Oldham

Dr B O'Rourke

Dr A Piesse

Dr A Tuffery

Dr I Walsh

Two members of the non-academic staff:

Mr J Murphy

Mr T Peare

Six students of the College:

Mr S Hall

Mr R Kearns

Mr P Laird

Mr D MacSithigh

Ms R Palileo

Mr D Quinn

BD/07-08/103 Committees The Board noted and approved, where appropriate, the following changes to membership of Committees:

- (i) **Heads of Schools' representatives on Principal Committees**

Information Policy	Professor M Marsh
Personnel and Appointments	Professor W Binchy
Research	Professor J Ohlmeyer
Site and Facilities	Dr D Abrahamson
Student Services	Professor S Matterson
- (ii) **Deans' Representatives on Principal Committees**

Finance	Acting-Dean of Arts and Humanities (Professor N Grene)
Information Policy	Dean of Science (Professor P Coxon)
Personnel and Appointments	Dean of Engineering and Systems Sciences (Dr J Jones)
Site and Facilities	Dean of Students (Professor G Whyte)
Student Services	Acting-Dean of Social and Human Sciences (Professor H Delany)
- (iii) **Board Members on Committees**
 - (a) Professor H Rice to replace Dr S Ryan on the Personnel and Appointments Committee;
 - (b) Dr S Ryan to replace Professor M Lynch as Chair of the Equality Committee, following Professor Lynch's resignation from the Board.

BD/07-08/104 Senior Promotions The Vice-Provost invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Senior Promotions Committee, dated 13 November 2007 which had been circulated, seeking Board's approval for minor modifications including changes to the wording of the procedures/application form so as to achieve coherence across promotion categories. In response to queries about the proposed changes to the wording of the procedures regarding Senior Lecturer promotions, the Vice-Provost advised Board that the only amendment being proposed was to describe candidates for promotion as those 'wishing to be considered for promotion', thus making the wording consistent with that used for applicants for promotion to Associate Professorship and Personal Chairs. The Board noted that no other change to the wording of this part of the procedures was being proposed.

In response to concerns expressed by a number of Board members, the Vice-Provost advised Board that quotas for promotion had been abolished with the introduction of the new procedures in 2005 (BD/05-06/071 of 23 November 2005 refers). She clarified that candidates being considered for promotion were judged against the stated criteria and not against the achievements of other candidates.

Noting the Vice-Provost's clarifications, the Board approved the amendments to the procedures as presented.

SECTION D (Personnel Matters)

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings