

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 26 June 2006

Present Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost (Dr R M J Byrne), Registrar (Dr D J Dickson), Bursar** (Dr D C Williams), Senior Lecturer (Dr C Kearney), Dr W J Blau, Dr A Butterfield, Ms G Clarke*, Dr A Donnelly, Mr H Kearns, Dr J M Kelly, Mr C Larkin, Ms M Leahy, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Mr D McCormack, Mr J Mannion, Dr D O'Donovan, Dr J Parnell, Dr A Piesse, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij.

Apologies Dr N Biggar, Ms M Coffey, Dr M A Lynch, Dr K J McGinley, Ms S O'Brien, Dr E O'Halpin, Mr B Sweeney.

In attendance

(ex officio) Secretary, Treasurer, Assistant Secretary.

(present for) * BD/05-06/350 (pt.) – 361
** BD/05-06/344 - 352

SECTION A

BD/05-06/344 Minutes The minutes of the meeting held on 13 June 2006 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments.

BD/05-06/324 Strategic Planning

- (i) The phrase 'Executive Officers' was replaced with 'Strategic Planning Task Force' on line 9 of the first paragraph.
- (ii) The phrase 'by the Board' was inserted after the word *consideration* on the third line of the penultimate paragraph of the minute on page 6.

BD/05-06/329 Pensions in the context of the Protection of Employee (Fixed Term Work) Act 2003 The phrase 'with effect from 1 October 2005' was inserted after the word 'holders' on the second line of the third paragraph.

BD/05-06/331 Annual Office 2006/2007 The word 'approval' was replaced with the word 'election' in the first line of the minute.

BD/05-06/338 Student Services Committee The term 'Site and Facilities' was replaced with 'Student Services' on the second line of the minute.

BD/05-06/345 Matters Arising from the Minutes A number of matters arising from the Minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see Minutes BD/05-06/346, 347, 348, 349).

BD/05-06/346 Pensions in the context of the Protection of Employee (Fixed Term Work) Act 2003 (FTW Act) (see minute BD/05-06/329 of 13 June 2006) The Board noted Professor Vij's comments in relation to the fact that prior to 2003 when the legislation was introduced,

Principal Investigators had signed multi-year contracts with external research funders without knowing that there would be an obligation to fund the pension costs for fixed-term researchers funded from these sources. The Secretary advised Board that the College has a responsibility to fund these pension costs and that there will have to be a case-by-case review with Principal Investigators in this regard.

In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that all organisations, in both the public and the private sectors, were experiencing difficulties in meeting the costs arising from the FTW Act and that the Provost had raised the matter at the highest levels in the government. The Treasurer stated that the matter was linked with the work of the HEA's Pensions Review Group and advised Board that it was expected that all pension-related issues of concern to the sector would be dealt with in that forum.

BD/05-06/347 ARAM (see minutes BD/05-06/322 and BD/05-06/325 of 13 June 2006) The Board noted Dr Parnell's request that the differences between the HEA funding model and the ARAM be provided as an input to the Board's future consideration of ARAM. Dr Kelly advised Board that the Senior Lecturer had arranged a meeting of a sub-group of the Board and a sub-group of the Heads of School Committee to take place on 30 June 2006.

The Secretary advised Board that arising from the discussion at the previous meeting an ARAM workshop for Board members had been arranged to take place on the morning of 4 October 2006 and that there would be a special Board meeting to consider ARAM issues on the morning of 1 November 2006.

BD/05-06/348 Annual Office 2006/2007 (see minute BD/05-06/331 of 13 June 2006) In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that nominations for the Officerships of Junior Proctor and Senior Dean would be advised to Board as soon as possible.

BD/05-06/349 Student Services: Reviews of Careers Advisory Service, Student Counselling Service, Disability Service (see minute of BD/05-06/327 of 13 June 2006) The Senior Lecturer advised Board that preliminary discussions had taken place to consider where the Student Learning Support Programme, currently under the auspices of the Student Counselling Service, should be located.

BD/05-06/350 Provost's Report The Provost invited Board's attention to a number of issues, in both the internal and external environments, which he suggested would require action by the Board if the College is to meet its long-term objectives. In particular, he invited the Board's attention to the following issues:

Internal factors

1. **ARAM:** The Board had previously decided that decisions would be taken in Michaelmas Term 2006 following a briefing workshop for Board members.
2. **Academic Restructuring:** The Provost noted that it was likely that proposals on the clustering of Schools to facilitate greater devolution of administrative and support functions would be presented to Board following a discussion at the Council meeting on 28 June. He noted that it would be important to make a decision on this matter without undue delay, to remove the uncertainties which prevail in the College community.
3. **Administrative and support services restructuring:** The Board, noting that the report from Task Force 1 would be considered later on the agenda, also noted that it

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

was necessary to finalise academic restructuring before final decisions could be made on the devolution of administrative and support services. The Provost invited the Board's attention to the recommendation from Task Force 2 that consideration be given to appointing a Chief Administrative Officer to clarify reporting arrangements in administrative and support areas.

4. **Strategic Plan:** The Board noted that a final decision on the Updated Strategic Plan would be required at the Board meeting on 5 July 2006.
5. **Internal decision making:** The Provost advised Board of his concerns that the College's decision-making processes at an operational level can be slow and thereby impede progress and development across a range of areas.

External factors

1. **Competition:** The Provost invited the Board's attention to the current level of resources which the College allocates to its Communications Office compared to other institutions (two full-time staff in Trinity compared to five or six in other Irish institutions). He stated that in an era of increasing competition (in regard to recruitment of students and to research) from institutions outside Ireland, and within the country, there is a need to adopt a more strategic approach to communicating the College's strengths and successes. The Board noted that there is currently a duplication of effort in relation to external communications across a number of College functions and that this also needs to be addressed.
2. **Sectoral staff mobility:** The Board noted that other institutions are aggressively recruiting academic staff in an effort to enhance their research standing. The Provost advised Board that other universities appear to be able to offer financial inducements to staff to move and he proposed that consideration be given to exploring how the College might generate additional funds to assist in the retention of staff.
3. **Staff Office:** The Provost invited Board's attention to the resignation of the Staff Secretary as noted under item C.8 of the agenda. He advised Board that the Staff Office is currently severely under-resourced and he advised that sufficient resources must be allocated to the area.

In the course of a long and detailed discussion, Board members noted with regret the resignation of the Staff Secretary, and agreed that, if the College is to meet its legislative obligations, proposals for the adequate resourcing of the Staff Office should be developed.

The lack of resources, and the associated risks, across many areas of the College, including the building stock, IT systems and support for administrative and support areas were noted. The Board, noting that retaining both academic and administrative and support staff was a key priority, agreed that ensuring that staff saw themselves as being valued as members of the College community could be an important factor in this regard.

The value of the democratic decision-making processes was noted and it was agreed that this process had served the College well in the past, and it was further noted that some of the issues currently being experienced arise from the recent academic restructuring. The need to maintain the participation of students in College decision-making was noted. In response to a suggestion that the Board should meet more frequently to enable more timely decision-making, the Provost advised Board that, in his experience, the delays in decision-making occurred at levels below the Board. He also noted that it was not the function of the Board to become involved in day-to-day decision-making but rather its decisions should be concerned with policy: this view was supported by other members of the Board. Concern was expressed that Heads of School

are not directly involved in decision-making by Board and Council and it was recommended that this be addressed as soon as possible.

In considering the opportunities for raising additional funds to support academic development, Board members expressed concern that, in the absence of increased public funding, or of opportunities to dispose of assets, there could be a risk that the College would incur significant financial deficits in pursuing this objective. It was also noted that efforts should continue to convince the government that the College's core grant needs to be increased.

Board members noted that there is a need to improve both internal and external communications activities in the College. Comments in relation to the approach which should be used in communicating with potential students and other stakeholders of the College were noted. It was also noted that an enhanced communications activity could contribute to fund-raising from *alumni* as is the case in the Ivy League Colleges in the U.S. The Board noted a suggestion that all communications activities be combined into an Office for External Affairs which would encompass all student recruitment as well as communication with external bodies and funders. The importance of communicating with the College community was emphasised by a number of Board members and the role of Board members in communicating with their constituencies was also noted.

In conclusion, the Board agreed that:

- (i) emerging issues in relation to academic restructuring would be progressed through Council and Board;
- (ii) consideration would be given at the earliest opportunity as to whether a Chief Administrative Officer should be appointed;
- (iii) opportunities for the identification and generation of additional College funds would be explored;
- (iv) proposals on enhancing the Communications Office and the Staff Office would be presented to the next Board meeting;
- (v) improvements in the College's decision-making processes would be developed which would ensure that the democratic value of the existing procedures would not be lost.

BD/05-06/351 Statutes: University Council The Registrar invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 26 June 2006, which had been tabled. He advised Board that following the determination of the Visitors that newly-elected Fellows should be given the opportunity to vote in the assent-seeking process to amend the Statutes in relation to the University Council, the deadline for receipt of assents had been extended to 16 June 2006. The Board noted that the assents had been counted in the presence of the Chair and Secretary to the Fellows and that, as insufficient assents had been received, the Statutes in relation to the University Council would remain unchanged.

The Registrar advised Board that consideration must now be given as to how the Faculty representatives currently on Council, whose terms of office are now expiring, would be replaced. He invited Board's attention to the following two options:

Option 1: Each Dean to nominate two observers to attend Council until such time as the composition of Council is settled in conformity with the wishes of the Board and the assent of the Fellows.

Option 2: Each Dean to hold elections immediately for the return of two representatives from each Faculty in conformity, as far as possible, with existing practice in this regard.

The Registrar advised Board that if Option 2 were to be adopted, the following issues would have a bearing on how the elections would be conducted.

- (a) Chapter XXVI, Section 27, of the Statutes, setting out the elections to Council, states that representatives should be elected to serve 'beginning on the first day of the academic year following his election'. Faculty elections would therefore have to be completed before the beginning of the Michaelmas term if those elected are to be full Council members in 2006/7.
- (b) The Board would have to consider whether to permit the elections to Council to take place beyond the dates specified in Schedule (1) to Chapter XIII of the Statutes (15 May to 15 June) and to permit the elections to take place during vacation period.
- (c) There are now five Faculties, two of which have a substantially different composition since the Board's decisions on restructuring last year, and elections can only be conducted by the Deans and in the Faculties as now constituted: this will necessarily reduce representation from the Arts and Humanities area of College.
- (d) There is the issue of whether the two representatives from each of the present five Faculties (one senior, and one junior, as set out in Chapter XXVI, Section 27) be each required to serve for two years. The Board noted the proposal that, in the current circumstances, all Faculty representatives would serve a full two-year term together – in the expectation that alterations in the statutory composition of Council will have been agreed before the end of that period.

In the course of a discussion, the Secretary and the Registrar clarified a number of technical issues and confirmed that legal advice had been sought on the proposals as presented. In response to a query, the Registrar advised Board that one of the objectives of the proposed new Statutes had been to allow for a re-balancing of the representation of the combined Faculties in the Arts and Humanities areas on the University Council, but as the proposed amendments had not been approved, the Board had no option but to operate within the existing Statutes in this regard.

The Board approved the adoption of Option 2 and agreed that the elections should commence immediately and could continue during the summer vacation so that the results will be available before the beginning of Michaelmas Term 2006 (11 September 2006). The Board also agreed that two Faculty representatives elected to Council would both serve a co-terminus two-year term of office.

BD/05-06/352 Task Force 1 – Location, Value for Money and New Structures of College's Administrative and Support Structures The Bursar presented the background to, and work to date of, Task Force 1. He noted that the Task Force had been asked to examine and report on value for money issues, including:

- a) optimum location of services as between the centre and schools, or clusters thereof;
- b) costs of services and benchmarking against other institutions;
- c) impact of e-strategy;
- d) whether parts of any one service might be best located in another service area.

Its membership comprises the Bursar (Chair), the Treasurer, the Acting Academic Secretary, the Staff Secretary, the Heads of School of Natural Science, Engineering, Histories and Humanities, and Business, two Board members (Dr McGinley and Ms Leahy) and the Manager of MIS, IS Services. The Bursar advised Board that the Task Force had met 14 times and that the notes of all meetings had been placed on the College's website. The Board noted that the Task Force's Report had also been placed on the website and that the College community had been invited, via email, to submit their

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

comments to the Bursar. The Partnership Committee and Executive Officers, as well as Board, had been briefed from time to time on the Task Force's work.

The Bursar advised Board that, after an initial review of the terms of reference of the Task Force, a number of principles were agreed which subsequently informed its work.

The Bursar invited Board's attention to the results of the pilot studies in the Graduate Studies Office, the Staff Office, Information Systems Services and the Director of Buildings Area.

He introduced the proposal to develop an e-strategy to deliver Administrative and Support Service change in an integrated, cost-effective and rational manner. The Board noted that work on the development on an e-strategy could not commence until final decisions in relation to the academic restructuring had been made by Board.

The Bursar invited Board's attention to the following recommendations outlined in the Task Force's report:

- (i) Administrative and Support Services must underpin new academic structures and provide a transparent, value for money service.
- (ii) Administrative and Support services should be assessed for best fit to support academic structures by a process based on e-strategy.
- (iii) The e-strategy project should be tightly controlled for costs and process by a Steering Group representative of the major stakeholders.
- (iv) The e-strategy project should be funded through an application to the Strategic Innovation Fund.
- (v) Changes being made to administrative and support structures as part of e-strategy must proceed in parallel to academic change as far as possible, must not produce additional layers of administration, must demonstrate their 'best fit for purpose' in supporting academic activities, and must demonstrate value-for-money over current structures and operations.
- (vi) Ongoing change in such areas must be considered in the light of an overall e-strategy.
- (vii) In the interim period before and during implementation of change, a budgeting mechanism must be put in place for funding administrative and support services. This would be based on a value-for-money report from each area. This would be reviewed during Michaelmas Term 2006 by the relevant Principal Committee with budget recommendations from the Committees being considered by Executive Officers during the Estimates process.
- (viii) Parity of esteem between academic and administrative leaders must be a cornerstone of the change process.
- (ix) A well-structured communications process and an internal Conciliation Forum, in addition to the normal process for negotiation, is essential for a successful outcome to this project.
- (x) Devolution of administrative and support services can best be achieved if College is structured as three academic groupings, and decisions on such a structure must precede implementation of e-strategy or any further change.

In conclusion, the Bursar invited Board's attention to the estimated costs of implementing the e-strategy proposal, which it was estimated would amount to approximately €15m.

The Board noted that the Task Force's Report had been welcomed by the Information Policy Committee which had noted that there was a need for a cost-benefit-analysis to demonstrate the benefits of introducing an e-strategy. The Information Policy Committee had also recognized that flexibility needed to be incorporated into the

implementation of the e-strategy to ensure that progress could be made in the event that full funding would not be available. The Board noted that the proposal to develop an e-strategy had been accepted by the Heads of School Committee and that consultation would take place with the Partnership Committee during the coming week.

The Bursar advised Board that the report had been presented for discussion and that no decisions were required at that meeting.

In the course of a discussion, Board members commented on the expected costs of external consultants for the implementation of the e-strategy and noted the opportunities offered by expert College staff in this area. In response to a query, the Bursar advised that it was expected that wherever possible the College would build on off-the-shelf software products to be used in the implementation of the e-strategy and he stated that in order for this to be cost effective, the College would have to review its work practices to improve efficiency and to capitalize on the technological opportunities offered in this regard rather than trying to fit state-of-the-art technology to all existing work practices.

Comments in relation to the quantification of the opportunity costs of introducing the e-strategy were noted. The Bursar advised Board that the implementation of the e-strategy would be the responsibility of a Steering Committee which would report directly to Board.

The Provost thanked the Bursar and Task Force 1 for their very comprehensive report and he invited Board members to send any further comments they may have to the Bursar.

BD/05-06/353 Audit Committee - Annual Report 2005 – Response from Executive Officers The Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 20 June 2006, which had been circulated, outlining the response of Executive Officers to the issues raised in the Audit Committee's Annual Report to Board, which had been considered by Board on 13 December 2005, (minuteBD/05-06/105 refers). The Board noted the following responses from Executive Officers:

1. ***Internal Control and Risk Management and resourcing the Internal Audit function***
 - The appointment of a permanent Assistant Internal Auditor had been approved. One of the key tasks of this appointee will be the review of internal controls, noting that the Chairman of the Audit Committee had previously indicated to the Board that this will provide further, but limited, assurances in this regard.
 - The College's high-level risk register was presented to Board on 3 May 2006 and Executive Officers will be working with the College's management to formalise risk management at all levels in the College.
 - The College's Risk Policy was approved by Board on 3 May 2006.
2. ***Information Technology Security***
 - Funding has been allocated for the refurbishment of the backup computer room which will include fire detection, generator backup, air conditioning and other necessary facilities.
 - IS Services are also in the process of establishing an offsite disaster recovery location. Individual components of the disaster recovery plan will be tested on an ongoing basis.
 - Newly-appointed staff are circulated with the IT Code of Conduct along with their contract and also sign a statement of Compliance with College

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Policies as part of their acceptance of employment. The Board noted that there are currently insufficient resources available to introduce a similar scheme for existing staff.

3. *Multi-institutional research ventures*

A College policy on participation in multi-institutional research joint ventures was approved by Board on 31 May 2006.

- A report on the DMMC addressing the concerns raised in the Audit Committee report was presented to Board on 13 June 2006.
- The Board was updated on 31 May 2006 on the Haughton Institute and was advised that the relationship with the Associated Hospitals is such that continued engagement with that Institute is vital. This will be addressed in the longer term in the context of the discussions underway on the development of an Academic Medical Centre as reported to Board on 31 May 2006. In the meantime, an annual report of the activities of the Institute will be provided to Board.

4. *Equipment registers*

- Executive Officers, while noting the importance of maintaining an accurate equipment register, decided that, in an era of scarce resources, there could be no additional investment in the development of a more accurate register, pending the introduction of the new financial system. The Board noted this.

5. *Compliance*

- The annual verification letter for 2004/2005 was sent to the HEA on 6 April 2006.
- The first formal annual report, as defined in the Universities Act 1997, will be presented to Board with the Consolidated GAAP Accounts on 5 July 2006.
- A Draft Code of Practice for the Governance of Third Level Institutions is currently being drafted. The IUA is representing the sector in discussions with the HEA and the Department of Education and Science. The Audit Committee will be asked to review the draft document at the earliest opportunity.

6. *External Auditors*

- Following a tender process, and on the recommendation of the Audit Committee, the Board, at its meeting on 31 May 2006, re-appointed KPMG as College auditors for a period of four years.

7. *Revised terms of reference for Audit Committee*

- The Board approved revised terms of reference for the Audit Committee on 13 December 2006.

8. *Review of governance structures*

- Executive Officers have reviewed a report on governance issues prepared by the Internal Auditor, and the Registrar and Secretary had a meeting with the Audit Committee which will present a report to Board in July 2006.

The Treasurer invited the Board's attention to the following actions in relation to financial matters:

9. *Financial reporting*

The following sets of financial statements have been prepared by the Treasurer's Office, audited by the external auditors and reviewed on behalf of

the Board by the Audit Committee and presented for consideration by Board, the dates on which they were considered by Board are shown in parentheses:

- Funding Statement for 2004/2005 (26 January 2006)
- Trust Funds (Benefactions) financial statements for 2004/2005 (23 November 2005)
- Consolidated GAAP Accounts for 2002/2003 and 2003/2004 (26 January 2006)
- Consolidated GAAP Accounts for 2004/2005 (will be presented on 5 July 2006)

When the Statutes are being reviewed, consideration will be given to reviewing the date by which the Funding Statements will be considered by Board so as to permit simultaneous consideration of the Funding Statements and Consolidated GAAP Accounts. In view of the time required to prepare the consolidated GAAP accounts it would be unlikely, for the present, that the two sets of accounts would be available for consideration by Board before June of any year.

As the preparation and use of consolidated GAAP accounts is at a very early stage, and as all universities are at different stages in preparing their accounts, it is considered premature to develop a sectoral approach to the development of high quality financial information derived from these accounts. The HEA Report on the Financial Position of Irish Universities at 30 September 2003 raised the issue of the suitability of consolidated financial statements for use across the sector. Developing indicators for College use from these accounts may be useful to the College in the future and will be considered in the context of available resources.

In response to a query, the Treasurer advised Board that the College's Financial Statements are available on the College's website.

The Board noted the report as presented.

BD/05-06/354 Annual Report 2004-2005 The Secretary invited Board's attention to the draft Annual Report for 2004-2005, which had been circulated. He advised Board that, as previously decided by Board, it was intended to publish this report together with the Consolidated Financial Statements and Funding Statements for 2004-2005. Noting that the Provost's introduction and the conclusion of the report have yet to be prepared, the Secretary invited Board's comments for inclusion in the final version of the Report which would be circulated for approval at the next Board meeting.

In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that comparative data with other institutions, while not part of the College's Annual Report could be presented when the report is being launched. The Treasurer advised Board that details on the College's financial deficit would be presented at the next Board meeting.

The Provost thanked the Secretary and his staff for their work in preparing the Report and invited Board members to submit their comments to the Secretary.

BD/05-06/355 Pension Scheme – Actuarial Valuation 2005 The Secretary invited Board's attention to an Actuarial Valuation Report of the Trinity College Pension Scheme, as at 31 March 2005, which had been tabled for Board members only.

The Secretary invited Board's attention to the main points arising from the valuation. He noted that, in common with virtually all Pension Schemes, the College's scheme showed a Discontinuance Funding Level of 72% at the date of the valuation: this compared to a level of 103% at the previous valuation in 2001. In order to remedy this to ensure that Members' benefits are maintained at their expected level, the Employer's (i.e. the College's) contribution rate should increase from 15% at present, to 26.4%, which would result in an additional cost to College of some €8m per annum.

The Secretary advised Board that the Trustees of the Pension Fund see this as a very serious situation, having regard to the implications for their legal obligations. In normal circumstances, they would be bringing some options to the Board. The Board noted that these options would be a matter for the Board and not the Trustees of the Fund. The matter would also have to be taken up with the Pensions Board.

The Secretary advised Board that at this stage, however, the Trustees requested Board to note the position without recommending any specific action, because Trinity is not unique in this regard, many public bodies and other universities in the sector, are experiencing similar difficulties. Furthermore, the Board noted that the current Pension Fund difficulties have been raised at the most senior levels of government and that discussions are taking place at a sectoral level through the IUA.

The Board noted that, arising from the sectoral discussions, the HEA, under the Chairmanship of the Chair of the Authority, has established a Pensions Review Group, comprising representatives of the Authority, the Department of Education and Science, the Department of Finance and the universities. The universities are represented by the Bursar of UCD and the Secretary of TCD. The Secretary advised Board that the HEA Review Group has met a number of times and that the universities, and the Trustees of their Pension Funds has been asked to take no action pending the outcome of the Review Group's deliberations, which will be considered by the Department of Education and Science and the Department of Finance.

The Secretary concluded by advising Board that the key issue in this regard is whether the Government is the ultimate guarantor of pensions in the university sector. If so, a different view can be taken regarding funding, and, if not, the Trustees will bring proposals to Board.

In response to queries, the Secretary advised Board that all new entrants to College now become members of the Model Scheme which is similar to the Civil Service Scheme and that early retirements approved by the College in recent years have been cost-neutral to the pension fund.

BD/05-06/356 Senior Promotions The Provost advised Board that the Senior Promotions Committee, having considered the applications for academic senior promotion this year, had noted that there were many more applicants who had reached the criteria for promotion than the previously agreed quotas for both Associate Professorship and Senior Lectureship.

In light of these circumstances, and in view of the fact that the quotas for promotion would cease in 2006/2007, the Board approved the Provost's proposal that the removal of the quota for promotion to Senior Lectureship should come into effect from 2005/2006 and that there should be fourteen promotions to Associate Professorship. The Board also approved the Provost's proposal that the Senior Promotions Committee should have delegated authority to ensure that all those proposed for promotion would meet the criteria for each grade.

In response to a query, the Board agreed that the procedures for senior academic promotion, which had been introduced this year, would be reviewed during 2006/2007. The Board noted that, under the ARAM, the associated salary costs of promotions would be borne by the Schools and Vice-Deaneries.

BD/05-06/357 Acta of the University Council The Board confirmed Acta of the University Council from its meetings of:

- (i) 7 June 2006 subject to further comments covering: (CL/05-06/179, 185, 192);
- (ii) 16 June 2006 subject to further comments covering CL/05-06/206.

BD/05-06/358 Governance Structures (see Actum CL/05-06/179 of 7 June 2006) The Senior Lecturer advised Board that subsequent to the meeting with the Heads, Vice-Deans and Aspirant Heads on 9 June 2006, to discuss proposed governance arrangements, meetings had taken place with the Heads of School Committee (20 June), Student Representatives (22 June) and Deans' Committee (23 June). The Board noted that a proposal on academic restructuring would be considered by Council at its next meeting and then by Board.

BD/05-06/359 Nominations for Appointment (see Actum CL/05-06/185 of 7 June 2006) The Board, on the recommendation of the University Council, approved the appointments as summarised in Appendix 1 to these Minutes.

Under Other Business the Board made the following appointments:

- (i) **Regius Chair of Greek (1761) – Brian Charles McGing, BA (Dubl), MA (Tor), PhD (Tor)** with effect from 1 October 2006, on the fifth point of the scale, with increment in 2007, and with pension provision.
- (ii) **Chair of Latin (1870) – Anna Chahoud, MA (Bologna), PhD (Pisa)** on the third point of the scale, with increment in October 2006, and with pension provision.

In response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that the point on a salary scale to which a person is appointed depends on his or her experience to date and the current market conditions. Dr Piesse's disquiet at the difference in the starting salary of the two positions was noted.

BD/05-06/360 Deanship - Faculty of Engineering and Systems Sciences (see Actum CL/05-06/192 of 7 June 2006) The Board noted the election of Dr J O Jones to the Deanship from 13 July 2006 to 12 July 2009.

BD/05-06/361 Chair of Civil Engineering (1842) (see Actum CL/05-06/206 of 16 June 2006) The Board, on the recommendation of the University Council from its meeting of 16 June 2006, approved the appointment, from a date to be agreed, of Margaret Mary O'Mahony, B.E. (N.U.I.), M.A., D.Phil. (Oxon), CENG, FIDE, FIHT, FCIT, MICE, MIEI, MIAT, FTCD.

BD/05-06/362 Labour Court Ruling Under Other Business, and in response to a query, the Secretary advised Board that the effect of the recent Labour Court ruling in relation to a part-time lecturer is as yet unclear. The matter is under review.

SECTION B

There was no business under this section.

SECTION C

- BD/05-06/363 Higher Degrees** The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 20 June 2006, as circulated.
- BD/05-06/364 Proctors' Lists for First Summer Commencements** The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 13 June 2006.
- BD/05-06/365 Permissions – Library** The Board approved the request of the Librarian, subject to agreement on conditions of transport and display, to loan to the Literaturhaus Berlin a number of Samuel Beckett MS for exhibition from 14 July to 10 September 2006:
- (i) MS 10402/111, 112, 125 (letters to Thomas MacGreevy);
 - (ii) MS 10962 (student notebook);
 - (iii) MS 8114/7 (notebook of Thomas MacGreevy).
- BD/05-06/366 Calendar – Homan Potterton Prize** The Board noted and approved new wording as follows: The prize is awarded to the student of History of Art who has achieved the highest overall grade in continuous assessment exercise carried out during the Junior Sophister year and who intends to take Moderatorship Part 2 in the History of Art and Architecture. Value €300.
- BD/05-06/367 Prizes and Other Awards – A J Leventhal Scholarship 2006** The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the Selection Committee to award the 2006 Scholarship to Mr M Raftery-Skehan, value €2,285.
- BD/05-06/368 Technical Staff Committee – Membership** The Board noted and approved the following changes in membership:
- (i) **Academic Staff Representatives** Dr N M Marples and Dr F J G Mitchell to replace Dr M E G Lyons and Dr C A O'Sullivan;
 - (ii) **Constituency 1** Mr R Keaveney;
 - (iii) **Constituency 3** Dr W Cullen.
- BD/05-06/369 Chaplaincy – Presbyterian and Methodist Chaplain** The Board noted and approved the reappointment of the Revd Katherine P Meyer as Presbyterian and Methodist Chaplain for three years from 1 September 2006 to 30 August 2009.
- BD/05-06/370 Staff Matters**
- (i) **Early Retirement** The Board noted and approved the early retirement of Ms M O'Donnell (Treasurer's Office) on 31 October 2006.
 - (ii) **Change of Title** The Board noted and approved the title of Deputy Director of Information Systems Services for Mr J P Murphy [existing title: 'Assistant Director (Computer and Network Systems)];
 - (iii) **Resignation** The Board noted the resignation of Ms M Kelly (Staff Secretary) with effect on and from 31 August 2006.

- BD/05-06/371 Fellowship** The Board noted resignation of Professor M J Gibney, with effect from 1 September 2006.
- BD/05-06/372 Scholarship (see Minute BD/04-05/287 (i) of 11 May 2005)** The Board noted and approved the request of the Senior Lecturer that the second year of intermission for the academic year 2005-2006 for Foundation Scholar, 00057738 be cancelled, as the student had registered for a post-graduate course in January 2006.
- BD/05-06/373 Board Membership – Graduate Students’ Union** The Board noted that Ms R Pe Palileo, having been elected President of the Graduate Students’ Union, will be a member of the Board of the College with effect on and from 13 July 2006 to 12 July 2007.
- BD/05-06/374 Nominating Committees** The Board noted the following memberships:
- (i) **Senior Lecturer’s Area (Trinity Access Programme) – Administrative Officer (Administrative Grade 3/2) (3-year contract)**
Acting Assistant Academic Secretary (Ms A Anderson)
Ms C Hannon
Dr D P O’Donovan
 - (ii) **Treasurer’s Office – Senior Buyer – (Administrative Grade 3/2) (permanent)**
Deputy Treasurer
Mr B Hartnett
Dr L E Doyle
Mr D Gaynor (NUI Maynooth)
[committee to replace that approved on 5 April 2006, BD/05-06/235 (vi)]
 - (iii) **SFI CRANN Research Centre – Facility Manager (Chief Technician Grade 2/1) (contract of indefinite duration)**
Dr D O’Brien
Professor J Boland
Mr J Doyle
Ms K Murphy
Mr P Dunne
 - (iv) **Treasurer’s Office – Finance Operations Manager (Senior Administrative Grade 1/Senior Administrative Grade 3) (permanent)**
Treasurer
Mr I Mathews
Professor D G Little
Ms A Quinlivan (Limerick)

Signed:

Date:

Appendix 1 to Minute BD/05-06/359

Nominations for Appointment (see Actum CL/05-06/185 of 7 June 2006)

Department	Post	Name and Qualifications	Start date	Termination date (if contract)
Biochemistry & Immunology	Research Fellow	KNOX, Andrew, B.Sc., Ph.D. (NUI)	01-06-2006	31-05-2009
CLCS	Visiting Academic	DU, Haili, B.A., M.A. (Yunnan), Grad.Cert. in English & Literature (Dali Teachers' College)	01-10-2006	30-09-2007
CLCS	Visiting Academic	WANG, Xexia, B.A. (Lanzhou), M.A. (Jilin), Ph.D. (Northeast Normal)	01-10-2006	30-09-2007
CLCS	Visiting Academic	YU, Aiju, B.A.(Central South University), P.G.Dip. (Huanghe), P.G. Dip. (Henan)	01-10-2006	30-09-2007
CLCS	Research Fellow (Part-time)	CRAVEN, Florence Elizabeth Vivienne, B.A. (NUI), Dip. Statistics (Dubl.)	21-04-2006	15-10-2006
Centre for Telecommunications Value-Chain Research	Research Fellow	TAN, Hwee-Pink, B.Eng., M.Sc. (Sing.), Ph.D. (Israel Institute of Technology)	01-07-2006	31-06-2007
Clinical Medicine	Lecturer/Registrar	SHUHAIBAR, Mary, LRCP & SI, M.B., B.Ch., B.A.O. (NUI), MRCPUK	01-07-2006	30-06-2007
Computer Science & Statistics	Visiting Professor	PARR, Gerard, B.Sc., C.Eng., Ph.D. (Ulster)	13-07-2006	12-07-2008
Computer Science & Statistics	Visiting Professor	WOODCOCK, James Charles Paul, B.Sc., M.Sc., Ph.D. (Liv.), M.A. (Oxon.)	13-07-2006	12-07-2008
Electronic & Electrical Engineering	Research Fellow	MELNIKOV, Vasily, Ph.D. (Lomonosov)	01-04-2006	31-03-2007
Electronic & Electrical Engineering	Research Fellow	PERERA, Athluge Dona Lalitha Chandani, M.Sc., Ph.D. (Tokyo Institute of Technology)	01-04-2006	30-06-2006
French	Language Assistant	BARCAT, Charlotte	01-10-2006	31-05-2007
French	Language Assistant	CHAMBON, Anne-Sophie	01-10-2006	31-05-2007
French	Language Assistant	LENGLET, Mickäel	01-10-2006	31-05-2007
French	Language Assistant	LOUVET, Marie-Violaine	01-10-2006	31-05-2007
French	Language Assistant	MINNE, Camille	01-10-2006	31-05-2007
French	Language Assistant	MORILLOT, Caroline	01-10-2006	31-05-2007
French	Language Assistant	MURAT, Julie	01-10-2006	31-05-2007

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

French	Language Assistant	TETARD, Pierre	01-10-2006	31-05-2007
Genetics	Research Fellow	LOGUE, Susan, B.Sc., M.Sc. (Belf.), Ph.D. (NUI)	01-01-2006	31-12-2006
Geology	Research Associate	PARKES, Matthew Alastair, B.Sc. (Sheff.), M.A. (Leic.), Ph.D. (NUI)	01-05-2006	30-04-2009
Haematology	Research Fellow	BRAIOTTA, Anne-Marie, B.Sc. (Adel.)	01-03-2006	31-12-2006
IIIS	Research Associate	AGARWAL, Raj, B.Eng. (IIT Delhi), M.B.A., D.B.A. (Kent State University)	01-04-2006	31-03-2008
IIIS	Research Associate	AHERNE, Deirdre, L.L.B. (Dubl.), Dip. E-Commerce (Law Society of Ireland)	01-05-2006	30-04-2008
IIIS	Research Associate	BATTEN, Jonathan A., B.B.S. (NRCAE), M.B.A. (NSW Institute of Technology), Ph.D. (Sydney)	01-03-2006	30-04-2008
IIIS	Visiting Research Fellow	CINER, Cetin, B.A. (Bogazici University), Ph.D. (Louisiana State University)	31-05-2006	22-06-2006
IIIS	Research Associate	HOLOHAN, Ann, B.A. (Dubl.), M.A. (Calif.), M.Sc. (LSE)	01-03-2006	31-03-2009
IIIS	Research Associate	HUTSON, Elaine, B.Bus. (Kuringai CAE), B.Bus., Ph.D. (Technol.Syd.)	01-01-2006	01-01-2009
IIIS	Research Associate	NEUFELD, Blain, B.A. (Tor.), M.Phil. (Oxon.), Ph.D. (Mich.)	01-02-2006	01-02-2009
IIIS	Research Associate	O'NEILL, Ailbhe Grainne, LLB (Dubl.), LLM (Cantab.), BL (King's Inns), Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01-05-2006	30-09-2007
IIIS	Research Associate	RHODES, Mary-Lee, B.A. (Yale), Dip. Statistics (Dubl.), M.B.A. (Wharton School), M.Sc. (LSE)	01-02-2006	01-02-2009
IIIS	Research Associate	RIZOV, Marian, M.Sc., Ph.D. (Catholic University of Leuven)	01-12-2005	01-12-2008
IIIS	Research Associate	SHAMBAUGH, Jay, BA (Yale), M.A.L.D. (Tufts Univ.), PhD Economics (Univ. of Calif., Berkeley)	01-05-2006	01-05-2009
IIIS	Research Associate	WARNOCK, Frank, B.A. (Johns H.), Ph.D. (North Carolina)	01-05-2006	01-05-2009
Law	Part-time Lecturer	McMULLEN, Sinead, LL.B. (Dubl.), B.C.L. (Oxon.), B.L.	01-01-2006	31-10-2006
Mathematics	Lecturer	FROLOV, Sergey, B.Sc. (Moscow State University), Ph.D. (Steklov Mathematical Institute of the Russian Academy of Sciences)	01-09-2006	Permanent
Mathematics	Lecturer	SINT, Stefan, DEA en Physique Theoretique (d'Aix-Marseille II), Ph.D. (Hamburg)	01-09-2006	Permanent
Pharmacology & Therapeutics	Research Fellow	COAKLEY, Peter David, M.B. B.A.O. B.Ch. B.A. (Dubl.)	01-07-2006	30-06-2009
Pharmacology & Therapeutics	Research Fellow/Project Co-ordinator	NAUGHTON, Corina, R.N. (NUI), M.Sc. (London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine)	01-10-2006	30-09-2007
Policy Institute	Visiting Research Fellow	MURPHY, Mary, B.A. (Dubl.), Grad. Dip. Bus. Studies Training & Development (DIT)	03-07-2006	10-01-2007

Physics	Research Fellow	HILTON, James, M.Sc. (Royal Holloway, London), Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01-07-2006	30-06-2007
Physics	Research Fellow	SAADATFAR, Mohammad, B.A. (Mazandaran), M.Sc. (Institute for Advanced Studies in Basic Sciences, Zanjan), Ph.D. (ANU)	01-09-2006	31-08-2007
Psychiatry	Clinical Tutor	LASIM, Mohd Hairi Mohd, M.B. B.Ch. (NUI), LRCP(SI)	01-10-2005	30-09-2008
Psychiatry	Part-time Lecturer	MORAN, Tom, M.B. B.Ch. B.A.O. (NUI), Dip. Child Health, Dip. Obstetrics, MRCPsych., FRCPsych.	01-10-2005	30-09-2008
Psychology	Research Fellow	CONNOLLY, Colm G., B.Sc., Ph.D. (NUI)	01-04-2006	30-09-2007
Public Health & Primary Care	Research Fellow	KEOGH, Karen, B.A. (NUI), M.Sc. (KCL & UCL)	13-03-2006	12-03-2008
Religions & Theology	Lecturer	RODGERS, Zuleika, B.A., Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01-10-2006	Permanent
Russian & Slavonic Studies	Language Assistant	CZERKIES, Tamara Grazyna, P.G.Dip., M.A. (Jagiellonian)	01-10-2006	30-06-2007
Russian & Slavonic Studies	Language Assistant	KUCHINA, Elena Dmitrievna, B.A. (Nizhniy Novgorod State Linguistics university)	01-10-2006	30-06-2007
Zoology	Research Associate	POOLE, William Russell, B.A., Ph.D. (Dubl.)	01-01-2006	31-12-2010