The University of Dublin
Trinity College

Minutes of Research Committee Meeting, 6 December 2016

Present:

Professor John Boland, Dean of Research (DoR)

Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences
Professor Stephen Minton, Director of Research, School of Education
Professor Micheál Ó Siochrú, Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities
Professor Mark Bell, Director of Research, School of Law
Professor Fiona Newell, substituting for Director of Research, School of Psychology
Professor Gaia Narciso, Director of Research, School of Social Sciences and Philosophy
Professor Jacob Erickson, Director of Research, School of Religions, Peace Studies and Ecumenics

Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science
Professor Thorfinnur Gunnlaugsson, Director of Research, School of Chemistry
Professor Adrian Bracken, Director of Research, School of Genetics and Microbiology
Professor Sergey Frolov, Director of Research, School of Mathematics
Professor Jane Stout, Director of Research, School of Natural Sciences
Professor Martin Hegner, Director of Research, School of Physics (part meeting)
Faculty of Health Sciences
Professor Helen Sheridan, Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences

Professor Mani Ramaswami, Director, TCIN
Professor Orla Sheils, Director, TTMI
Mr Shane Collins, President, Graduate Students Union

Professor David Dickson (for item RS/16-17/18)

In attendance:

Dr Diarmuid O'Brien, Director of Trinity Research and Innovation
Ms Doris Alexander, Research Development Manager, Trinity Research and Innovation
Dr Geoff Bradley, Head of Academic Services and Operations, IT Services
Ms Helen Shenton, Librarian, Library
Dr Oonagh Kinsman, Trinity Research and Innovation, Rapporteur to the Committee

Apologies:

Professor Martina Hennessy, Associate Dean of Research (ADoRMH),
Professor Sam Slote, Director of Research, School of English

1

Professor Emma Creagh, Director of Research, School of Biochemistry and Immunology
Professor Luiz Da Silva, Director of Research, School of Engineering
Professor Seamus Donnelly, Director of Research, School of Medicine
Professor Neville Cox, Dean of Graduate Studies
Mr David O'Shea, Projects Accounting Manager, Financial Services Division

Not present:

Professor Peter Gallagher, Associate Dean of Research (ADoRPG)
Professor Brian Lucey, Director of Research, School of Business
Professor Ruth Barton, Director of Research, School of Drama, Film and Music
Professor Roja Fazaeli, Director of School of Languages Literatures & Cultural Studies
Professor Lorraine Leeson, Director of Research, School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences
Professor Trevor Spratt, Director of Research, School of Social Work and Social Policy
Professor Doug Leith, Director of Research, School of Computer Science and Statistics
Professor Gary Moran, Director of Research, School of Dentistry
Professor Geralyn Hynes, Director of Research, School of Nursing and Midwifery
Professor Stefano Sanvito, Director, CRANN
Professor Jane Ohlmeyer, Director, Trinity Long Room Hub
Professor Orla Hardiman, Director, TBSI
Mr Michael Cooke, Acting Chair, Trinity Research Staff Association

Actions arising / on-going:

Agenda Item	Owner	Action	Status
RS/15-16/63	Dean of Research and review working group	Progression in implementing Measuring Research Productivity and Excellence	*In progress*
RS/15-16/49	Dean of Research	Feedback on progress with Research Career Framework policy from Tony McMahon	*In progress*
RS/15-16/57	Dean of Research	Seek information on number of PhD students paying EU and non-EU fees and the source of funding	*In progress*
RS/15-16/62	Associate Dean of Research	Report to the Research Committee with policies on biobanking, data retention and stem cells	*In progress*
RS/15-16/64	Directors of Research	Submissions for the Dean of Research annual report by the 20 January 2017	*In progress*
RS/16-17/04	Directors of Research	All Overhead analysis and justification plans to be submitted by 1 December 2016	*In progress*
RS/16-17/10	Dean of Research	Feedback any information on SFI research integrity audits	*In progress*
RS/16-17/12	Dean of Research	Comparative Medicine Unit to provide a summary of planned activity for increased openness and information on similar activities planned in other Irish universities.	*In progress*

RS/16-17/13	Dean of Research	PIQA tool: A beta version will be trialled in one School from each faculty	*In progress*
RS/16-17/19	Dean of Research	Revised THE ranking for Trinity to be discussed	*Q1 2017*
RS/16-17/20	Dean of Research and President of Graduate Students Union	Consider postgraduate representative forum as a mechanism to raise research concerns in the Dail	*In progress*

RS/16-17/15   Matters arising from the minutes

The Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities asked that the draft minutes be revised to record that he had proposed that the section of PIQA relating to league tables of individual performances be removed and that this was supported by others.

The Research Quality Metrics for Ussher lecturers has been agreed for all faculties. The general criteria for the three faculties is in discussion or implementation. The Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities reported that within the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences it was deemed beneficial to send outputs to individuals to avoid misunderstandings. In the Faculty of Engineering, Maths and Science the Schools of Genetics and Microbiology will liaise with the School of Biochemistry and Immunology to get consensus of approach. However it is likely there will be variations across the other Schools in the Faculty. The Faculty Dean will provide further information. In the Faculty of Health Sciences the metrics have now been agreed and will now be submitted. The Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences commented that assistance will be given to those deemed 'research inactive' to discuss their future potential. (RS15-16/63)

An updated document on the role and sustainability of Trinity Research Institutes was circulated. (RS16-17/11)

The PIQA tool had been discussed with the Provost and Vice-Provost and a beta version will be tested in one school in each faculty and receive feedback. It is appreciated that the use of Web of Science / Scopus is limited in some disciplines. The Librarian informed that Siobhan Dunne in the Library was available to train super-users in Schools on appropriate analytical tools and that individual academics should be encouraged to use these tools to analyse their individual outputs. Note will be taken of the views of Heads of School on how they would find PIQA to be useful. The DoR emphasised that although each academics role varied in proportion of research time and commitment, his role is to ensure we analyse research activity, position Trinity appropriately and identify opportunity space. (RS/16-17/13)

RS/16-17/16   Update from the Dean of Research

Accession to LERU is a reputational boost for Trinity however the challenge now is to meet expectations of this organisation and to match the right people to the different working groups. He recognises the

3

quality of research in Trinity but that membership of LERU will give insights into what it takes to be a world class research-led university and what adaptions will be necessary.

Trinity's success in H2020 funding is reflected in recent data analysis comparing financial drawdown for organisations across Europe. Trinity is 19th or of 1337 organisations in the ranking of higher education establishments and 29th of all organisations with a drawdown of €53million. This puts us ahead of some LERU members. He acknowledged the large number of academics engaged with this activity including senior research fellows. The challenge is to retain this ranking with the last 2-3 years of a 7 year programme. The ERC success has been good but we need to feed the pipeline for this and other programmes. Valeria Nicolosi has been recognised in Europe for her outstanding number of ERC awards.

He asked the Director of TR&I to update the meeting on PRTLI. Indications are that the funding in 2017 will be small (<€50million) and a larger budget will be available in 2018. A loan to the government from the European Investment bank had been suggested but it is not clear if this will affect the balance sheet. It is also not yet confirmed which agencies would be responsible for the programme.

Implementation of the Cassels report is still in discussion. Loans to students has no clear political backing. The public's perception is that investment in primary and secondary education is necessary but that universities are doing all right. The Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences commented that a different demographic should be targeted to affect change in this perception and that citizens will be looking for impact of a university education and that with the increase in student numbers with no additional investment the standards have dropped. The message is being reiterated by industry. The DoR commented that industry can be persuaded to contribute to third level education but cannot support the infrastructure. Lilly has noted the slide in quality and Fionnula Walsh is a good spokesperson from this company to support these lobbying efforts. The crunch will come when issues with accreditation will arise through insufficient laboratory time for example. Professional degrees will also be under pressure.

There were 35 internal applications for the SFI Career Development Awards of which 12 names were submitted to SFI which is the required cap in number of applications.

The DoR presented a Research and Strategy overview. He emphasised interconnections between Research Education and Knowledge Exchange. However the research picture had many elements which impacted reputation. Trinity's research income was compared to six comparator universities ranked directly above and below Trinity in 2009 and the ranking comparison with the same universities. Our research income had been maintained over the last six years but the comparator universities had increased their income. Since 1981 Trinity has increased research income and industry partnerships dramatically. He outlined elements of the strategy for the period 2016-2019 for building research excellence and actions that each PI can make to maintain and develop Trinity's

reputation. He asked for comments and input to what can be done in the short term in the absence of significant funding.

The Director or Research, School of Genetics and Microbiology held a strong view that the absence of Irish funding in basic research especially in the biomedical sciences was significantly affecting recruitment and that change to this policy would assist the maintenance of excellence in specific disciplines which was built up over a number of years. The Director of TTMI emphasised the short sighted views in translational medicine which need investment in the best science. The Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities emphasised that with increase in student numbers there was a direct effect on research since the time available for research activity was reduced. He supported the buy-out scheme in his Faculty to assist ERC applications. The Research Development Manager suggested that the research focus be applied in all areas of Trinity , eg HR to ensure that we are maximising our potential and that we should ensure that we communicate the impact of our research to as wide an audience as possible. The Director of TCIN supported the view that there were areas of excellent research in Trinity that were not supported by Irish funding and that SFI funding required too much justification of their remit to be able to support the best ideas. The Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences drew attention to the significant spread of activities that was undertaken by most academic staff and that this effort underpinned the overall success of the institution. The DoR was engaged with the Provost to look at internal processes that have been historically applied and that should be adapted for a changed environment. Suggestions were put forward to influence the political agenda, to get key messages across and to seek industry support to emphasise the accreditation issues and support other lobbying initiatives.

RS/16-17/17   Open data and data management

The Librarian and the Head of Academic Services and Operations, IT Services described the movement towards open data mandated by the European Commission for all H2020 projects from 1 January 2017 which is also being embraced by other research funders. There is a possibility to opt out and the phrase put forward by the EC is "as open as possible and as closed as necessary". The top three reasons for opting out are privacy, intellectual property rights and jeopardising the project's main objective. The H2020 open data requirements were summarised including the data management plan. LERU has provided a roadmap for research data and identified the typical supports. The PI is responsible for the data but the Libraries are best placed to advocate for best practice in data management and data citation and Research services and Academic IT services have an important role to play and often first place for researchers. Data stewards or data managers are new roles that are being created. The Trinity Library web site now gives guidance and help including advice on possible repositories and sample data management plans. IT Services advises on data management at all stages of a project life cycle. Research data management is covered in the Good Research Practice policy document including sample Data Management Plans, ethics processes, data protection legislation, cloud computing policy, records management policy and freedom of

information considerations. The Good Research Practice policy specifies that the Principle Investigator is the data steward and is accountable for all aspects of data management and data security but that the Head of Unit/ Head of School is responsible for keeping the source date if the PI leaves or for authorising data transfers outside Trinity. Some data types and examples were given. The General Data Protection Regulation will come into force in May 2018. There will be a legal requirement for a Data Protection Officer who will be independent and report to Board. A data privacy impact assessment will need to be undertaken before data is collected. Fines will be imposed for breaches

It was requested that the presentations be circulated to the Research Committee. The Research Development Manager commented that the discussion of citizen science at EU level raised questions of how data collected from engagement with citizens will be handled. The Director of Research, School of Psychology Data commented that data collected for teaching purposes is no different from data collected for research. The Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities noted that records management policy is well covered in the Good Research Practice policy document but that secure storage after the life of the project is a serious consideration. The DoR contextualised the open data policy in terms of the possibility of re-use and research integrity. The Director of Research, School of Chemistry commented that the data retention period required by UK funders was causing a problem. SFI and HRB are looking to apply similar policies to H2020 and that the Director of SFI is willing to consider funding costs associated with the activity including for example a data manager position within a budget for a proposed new Centre.

Action: The presentations will be circulated to the Research Committee

RS/16-17/18   Trinity Centre for New Irish Studies

Professor David Dickson, School of Histories and Humanities reviewed the establishment and functioning of the Trinity Centre for Irish-Scottish and Comparative Studies and the development of the theme Making Ireland which had received an A grade in the super-review of themes. It was proposed to host the activities of the theme in the Centre, rename it as Trinity Centre for New Irish Studies and house it in the Long Room Hub. A revised governance structure for the Centre will then be presented to the TLRH for approval. The multi-disciplinary scope would remain but widen from the previous remit. There was an ambition to house a graduate school and creation of such a centre would enable fundraising in the future. The creation of the Trinity Centre for New Irish Studies was agreed.

RS/16-17/19   Rankings – what next?

The DoR outlined a discussion with the Provost and Executive officers on the strategy to support research excellence and what should be done now to maintain the rankings. Actions include publication strategies for PIs; self-audit publications using Scopus, augmenting the link with Teaching Hospitals; strategically use of adjunct profs programme; use of one ORCID for each PI; ranking message at international conference;

utilisation of visitors programme (TLRH, TVAP etc) and maximising the Brexit opportunity. He commented that the THE revised ranking for Trinity should be available in the New Year. He emphasised that the operations of the university have not changed with the development of the research intensive focus of the university. The discussion with the Provost and Executive Officers will include space, infrastructure, the development of a cancer research institute linked with the hospital, and support for junior faculty.

Action: The revised ranking will be discussed at a future Research committee

RS/16-17/20   AOB

Director of TR&I advised that key industry leaders who have ear of government could be used to advance the pressure for increased research funding in specific areas.

The President of the Graduate Students Union commented that in relation to lobbying there was a postgraduate representative forum to increase communication with the Dail. This forum represents five different institutions and 17,000 students. It would be a useful conduit to raise research concerns. The DoR will follow up with the President of the Graduate Students Union.

Action: DoR will consider the post graduate forum for raising research concerns and will liaise with the President of the Graduate Students Union.