

**The University of Dublin
Trinity College**

Minutes of Research Committee Meeting, 20 January 2015

Present:

Professor Vinny Cahill, Dean of Research (DoR) and Chair
Dr Diarmuid O'Brien, Director of Trinity Research & Innovation (TR&I) and Secretary
Professor Martina Hennessy, Associate Dean of Research (ADoR)
Professor Paul Coughlan, Director of Research, School of Business
Professor Andrew Loxley, Director of Research, School of Education
Professor Balazs Apor, Director of Research, School of Languages, Literatures & Cultural Studies
Professor Paul Scanlon, Director of Research, School of Social Sciences and Philosophy
Professor Trevor Spratt, Director of Research, School of Social Work and Social Policy
Professor Andrew Pierce, Director of Research, School of Religions, Peace Studies and Theology
Professor Daniela Zister, Director of Research, School of Biochemistry and Immunology
Professor Wolfgang Schmitt, Director of Research, School of Chemistry
Professor Jane Stout, Director of Research, School of Natural Sciences
Professor Carl Vogel, Director of Research, School of Computer Science and Statistics
Professor James O'Donnell, Director of Research, School of Medicine
Professor Carol Newman, Acting Director of the Institute for International Integration Studies (IIS)
Professor Mike Peardon, Director of Research, School of Mathematics
Professor Shane O'Mara, Director of Research, TCIN
Professor Luiz Da Silva, Director of Research, School of Engineering
Professor Martin Hegner, Director of Research, School of Physics
Professor Gary Moran, Director of Research, School of Dental Science
Dr Michael Cooke, Chair, Trinity Research Staff Association (TRSA)
Professor Lorraine O'Driscoll, Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences

In attendance:

Ms Doris Alexander, Research Development Manager, Trinity Research & Innovation
Dr Fiona Killard, Research Strategy Officer, Trinity Research & Innovation and Rapporteur to the Committee and (item RS/14-15/38)
Mr David O'Shea, Acting Research Acc. Manager, Financial Services Division
Mr John Murphy, Director of Information Systems Services
Niamh Brennan, Programme Manager for Research Informatics (item RS/14-15/36 only)

Apologies:

Professor Lorraine Leeson, Director of Research, School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences
Professor Ruth Byrne, Director of Research, School of Psychology

Professor Aoife McLysaght, Director of Research, School of Genetics and Microbiology

Ms Megan Lee, President, Graduate Students Union

Not present:

Professor Martin Adams, Director of Research, School of Drama, Film & Music

Professor Aileen Douglas, Director of Research, School of English

Professor Micheál Ó Siochrú, Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities

Professor Blanaid Clarke, Director of Research, School of Law

Professor Gabrielle McKee, Director of Research, School of Nursing and Midwifery

Professor Stefano Sanvito, Director of Research, CRANN

Professor Aideen Long, Dean of Graduate Studies

Professor Juergen Barkhoff, Director, Trinity Long Room Hub

Professor Luke O'Neill, Director of Research, TBSI

RS/14-15/33 Minutes of 02 December 2014

The minutes of the last meeting were accepted with the following revisions:

The Director of Research for the School of Business noted that the following item (*RS/14-15/30 Any Other Business*) had been omitted from the minutes: The Director of Research for the School of Business informed Research Committee that the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences (AHSS) have established a Faculty-level Research Committee as a forum for AHSS Directors of Research to more effectively discuss items raised by the College's Research Committee. Minutes from this Committee will be noted at the AHSS Faculty Executive Committee.

The Dean noted that the first theme review panel (item RS/14-15/24) had taken place in November not January.

It was also noted that the term 'broadened' should replace the term 'redressed' in item RS/14-15/24.

RS/14-15/34 Matters Arising from the Minutes

The DoR reported meeting apologies.

The Dean formally welcomed the new Associate Dean of Research (ADoR), Prof. Martina Hennessy, to the Research Committee. The Dean informed the members that, as part of her role, the ADoR would have oversight of research ethics policy implementation and research centres, and would also play a pivotal role in shaping the 'Global Research Question'.

The Dean informed members that the International Funding Research Projects Officer (RDO) has undertaken further consultation around the clarification of College policy on dual-use research (see RS/14-15/17) and will submit a revised paper to February's Research Committee meeting.

It was noted that the College's new visual identity has been accepted by board and is being implemented across the College

The ADoR informed members that she had raised the issue of the Wellcome Trust position paper on the Protection of Animals Used for Scientific Purposes (item RS/14-15/26) at a recent IUA meeting. This item was raised at the IUA on the basis of the Research Committee's endorsement of this paper. The ADoR reported that other universities had not yet had sight of this paper, and that copies had now been sent to them for their consideration.

Action: ADoR to gather feedback from other Irish universities on the Wellcome Trust position paper.

The Dean also updated members on the College's IP policy (item RS/14-15/27). The Committee was informed that the revised policy had been approved at the 19 December sitting of the Finance Committee and would now go before Board.

Members were informed that approximately 115 Pathfinder 2015 (item RS/14-15/07) applications had been received. This item is to be discussed further later in this meeting (item RS/14-15/40).

RS/14-15/35 Dean of Research Update (DoR)

The Dean updated the Committee on the SFI Targeted Research Professorships Programme 2014. Members were informed that Expressions of Interest (Eols) were sought by SFI on the basis that universities would cover salary costs. Five Eols were submitted by College with all five being accepted by SFI. Nationally there were 27 Eols submitted with 20 of these finally being accepted by SFI. The five areas are Smart and Sustainable Cities, Energy, Creative Technologies, Cognitive Neuroscience and Bioengineering. In the Cognitive Neuroscience area an unconditional offer of the Thomas N. Mitchell Chair of Cognitive Neuroscience (2006) has been made with acceptance pending. The other four candidates have been made conditional offers pending the successful outcome of their full applications to SFI. The Committee was also informed that one further application had been made to the SFI open call for Research Professorships and a further application by College to this programme is being considered.

The Dean updated members on the College's success in the European Institute of Innovation and Technology's (EIT) Knowledge and Innovation Communities (KICs) initiative. The EIT KICs are a component of Horizon 2020 (H2020), which is the European Commission's funding instrument for research and innovation. Under FP7 three KICs were funded addressing climate change, ICT, and sustainable energy. Trinity was recently successful as a partner in bids for the two new H2020 KICs in Raw Materials and Healthy Living, and now participates in two pan-European consortia involving more than 150 partners from 20 countries. This represents a significant achievement for College as KICs are large, high-value, focused

undertakings with a strong focus on innovation and translational research resulting in new start-ups and new ventures. InnoLife (now EIT Health) led by Prof. Richard Reilly supported by Dr. Alexis Pacquit focuses on healthy living and active ageing related research. RawMatTERS (now EIT Raw Materials) led by Prof. Michael Lyons supported by Dr Damaris Fernandez is involved in sustainable exploration, extraction, processing, recycling and substitution related research. These KICs have a very broad agenda and the Dean informed members that there would be College-wide programmes and opportunities for many schools to participate. The Committee noted that each KIC will be a separate legal entity and that researchers had the opportunity to bid in to these entities for funding. The leaders of the KICs were congratulated by the Dean for their success with the KICs and for creating these opportunities for colleagues.

The Dean updated members on the on-going Research Themes Review process noting that three panel reviews have now been completed in Internationalism, Smart and Sustainable Planet and the Biosciences (Cancer/Immunology, Inflammation and Infection). The Committee was informed that so far the review process had been interesting and that the international reviewers provided valuable feedback. The Dean informed members that it was his intention to have all of the reviews completed by the first quarter of this year. The Dean also noted with appreciation the excellent input of colleagues into the review process.

RS/14-15/36 University Rankings Strategy

The Dean addressed the Committee on issues relating to the University Rankings Strategy noting in particular that the College's position in the rankings could be improved. Members were informed that in an effort to improve the visibility of the College a number of initiatives had been proposed as outlined in the Rankings Strategy document circulated to members.

The Programme Manager for Research Informatics then presented to members on the current College rankings status. The Committee was informed that there is a need to double the number of responses Trinity receives in ranking surveys. The College also needs to communicate more effectively that rankings are valued by the College. The Programme Manager for Research Informatics pointed out that the College was proactively implementing measures to increase our position in the rankings, however, she pointed out that there was a lot more that could be done. The Programme Manager for Research Informatics also noted that the Times Higher Education (THE) and Quacquarelli Symonds (QS) were the most important/significant rankings. Members were informed that Trinity peaked in 2009 at 43, but was now at 71 in QS and 138 in THE rankings.

It was also noted that publications, citations and reputation were the most important metrics in these rankings and that citations were very strong for Trinity historically. The Programme Manager for Research Informatics also highlighted the fact that publications and reputation

(academic, teaching, research and employer) were of significance with 40% of the QS ranking based on an academic survey and 10% on an employer survey. Similarly, 22% of the THE ranking is based on survey responses. The importance of encouraging more votes for Trinity was therefore highlighted. The Dean also outlined the need to maintain both the output of papers and especially the quality of the output of papers.

The Programme Manager for Research Informatics informed the Committee that the THE surveys would be issued in the winter of 2015. Trinity's reputational score could be improved in this survey as responses are coming from areas with which Trinity has significant collaborations. The College's visibility was reported to be very low among respondents to this survey and this was noted as a weakness. The Dean noted that academic performance, research productivity, and strategic hiring were all addressed in College strategy.

A member queried the budget allocation for the Rankings Strategy and it was noted that each prospective activity is currently being mapped out along with resource implications and that the Visiting Professorship Programme in particular may require significant budget. Another member also raised a query about the optimal time to contact collaborators to invite them to vote for Trinity. The Programme Manager for Research Informatics informed members that the THE survey is currently closed, however, the QS is open and anyone can take part. The Committee was also informed that College cannot solicit responses.

Action: Members to nominate or volunteer to be involved in a Rankings Strategy group/academic focus group.

The Dean informed members about a proposed Visiting Professor Scheme as part of the Rankings Strategy which would aim to build and strengthen College's network of international collaborators. Members were informed that a number of analogous programmes have existed in College in the IIS and now in TLRH and the Visiting Professorships and Fellowships Benefaction Fund which is disbursed annually by the Faculty Deans. The College is considering the development of a Visiting Professorships Programme that would build on the success of the Targeted Professorship Programme which was advertised widely and created much international visibility for Trinity.

The ADoR also noted that information submitted by the College to the rankings agencies is gathered from a number of sources including HR and that efforts are taken to ensure that the data submitted is as accurate as possible. It was also noted that SCOPUS is used as a single source of data for THE, QS and Shanghai rankings. Directors of Research were therefore encouraged to monitor SCOPUS as a number of omissions had been noted in these data that need to be addressed and there is still sufficient time to rectify these gaps. The Programme Manager for Research Informatics noted that a major piece of work had been undertaken with Thompson Reuters to identify gaps and this now needs to be done in SCOPUS. It was reported that there was a need to disambiguate author names as many variations were noted

and that 'Trinity College Dublin' should be used as the affiliation on all publications.

Action: The slides presented by the Programme Manager for Research Informatics are to be circulated to members.

RS/14-15/37 Research Ethics Policy Committee Matters

The ADoR updated members on Research Ethics Policy Committee (REPC) matters and provided the Committee with a document summarising these issues. She noted that three new Research Ethics Committees have now been approved by the REPC and are being put forward for approval by the Research Committee and subsequently Council. The ADoR informed members that all of the recommendations relating to the Biochemistry and Immunology Ethics Committee had now been implemented. It was also noted that each School is required to put in place a policy clearly identifying, where there is no school research ethics committee, to which committee(s) applications should be submitted. This policy should also be clearly stated on relevant websites.

The ADoR informed members that all approved Ethics Committees could commence immediately. Five RECs need to establish a web presence clearly outlining their processes. This is currently in progress and the ADoR will update the Research Committee in due course. The ADoR also outlined the 'next steps' for the REPC. It was noted that the College's Lone Researcher Policy will be brought before the next sitting of Research Committee for approval.

The minutes from April, May and December 2015's REPC meetings were approved by Research Committee and the three Ethics Committees were approved.

ACTION: The ADoR submit the College's Lone Researcher Policy to Research Committee for approval.

RS/14-15/38 European Research Council Calls 2015

The Research Strategy Officer (RDO) updated members on European Research Council 2014 and 2015 calls. It was noted that Ireland's success rate in the ERC Starting Grant Call was second only to Israel's and that this represented a considerable improvement nationally. Eight ERC Starting Grants were awarded nationally with three of these coming to Trinity and two applications that did not secure funding were 'A' rated. It was also reported that 14 applications had been made by College researchers to the ERC Consolidator 2014 call and that seven of these had been short-listed for interview. A further eleven ERC Advanced Grants have been submitted to the 2014 call with results expected in April 2015. Members were urged to encourage applications to the 2015 Advanced Call which is due out on the 10 February. It was also noted that three ERC Starting Grant applications had been awarded to Social Science and Humanities researchers in other Irish HEIs, and that Trinity needs to encourage more ERC

applications from our stellar Social Science and Humanities researchers.

The Dean noted that the ERC represented a recruitment opportunity and that these awards also bring significant funding to College. It was further noted that Board recently approved a modification to College's policy on the Exceptional Appointments Process as this could previously only be invoked for those at chair level, but this has now been broadened for ERC awardees. The members were also informed that SFI is due to launch a new scheme which will provide additional funding for ERC awardees that take up a position in Ireland. It was noted that SFI have had a supplement scheme for some time but that this was now being rebalanced to encourage ERC awardees to relocate to Ireland making Ireland an attractive location for ERC holders. This is not a competitive scheme.

RS/14-15/39 Dean of Research Report

The Dean informed members that schools will shortly be requested to submit information highlighting their achievements in terms of impact. This year the College's Industry Marketing and Communications Officer, Mr. Kevin Ennis (TR&I) will assist with the coordination of this activity and will work with Schools to shape their inputs. The Dean requested that DoRs be more proactive in chasing these submissions which are due by the end of February 2015.

ACTION: School contributions to the DoR Report are to be submitted by the end of February 2015 with the encouragement of DoRs.

RS/14-15/40 Pathfinder 2015

The Dean informed members that the closing date for Pathfinder 2015 (item RS/14-15/07) submissions was Friday 16 January. It was reported that approximately 115 applications were received from across all Faculties. It is expected that in the region of ten applications will be funded and this programme was therefore very heavily oversubscribed. It was noted that significant effort would be required to review these applications and the Dean sought advice from the Committee on the review process. The DoR suggested that there could be a 3-5 person panel established in each Faculty. This panel would then reach consensus on the top ten Faculty applications. The shortlisted applications from each Faculty would then be submitted to a University-level panel which would then decide which applications would ultimately secure funding. Review panels needs to be clear on the remit of the scheme and should be briefed on the thrust of the initiative. The Dean also noted that co-funding has been a requirement of past schemes and some schools may be willing to co-fund which would allow more applications to be funded.

ACTION - nominees

RS/14-15/41 Items for Discussion at Future Meetings

The Committee was informed that items relating to the College's Overheads Policy, an item on Full Economic Costing, the Lone Researcher Policy, and a redrafted paper on the College's policy on dual-use research would be brought before members at future sittings of the Committee.

RS/14-15/42 AOB

The Dean informed members that the Forensic Science Laboratory has requested that a research collaboration be developed with Trinity. The DoR asked members to solicit interest from Schools in developing such a collaboration. Activities that could be considered are adjunct positions, applying for joint funding together, training opportunities, internships, etc. The Dean invited any School with an interest to email him.

ACTION: Schools with an interest in developing a research collaboration with the Forensic Science Laboratory to contact the Dean.

DRAFT

Summary of status of REC Applications

EXTANT RECs	Chair	Status
Animal REC	Anne Molloy	Accepted by REC and approved by REPC
Faculty of Health Sciences REC Level 2	Ruth Pilkington	Approved by REPC
HPM/CGH REC Level 2	Charles Normand	Approved by REPC
School of Business Level 1	Gemma Donnelly-Cox	Approved by REPC
School of Computer Science and Statistics Level 2	Mary Sharp	Approved by REPC
School of Education Level 2	Colette Murphy	Approved by REPC
School of Engineering REC	TBC	School intends to apply for approval in the next academic year.
School of Linguistics....REC Level 2	Lorna Carson	Conditionally approved by REPC - Still awaiting details of legal member.
School of Psychology Level 2	Richard Carson	Conditionally approved by REPC - Still awaiting details of legal member.
School of Religions REC Level 1	David Tombs	Approved by REPC
SSSP REC Level 1	Gaia Narciso	Approved by REPC
SWSP REC Level 2	Trish Walsh	Conditionally approved by REPC - Still awaiting details of legal member.
NEW RECs May 2014		
Faculty AHSS REC Level 2	Dean	REPC recommends approval conditional on the creation of an appropriate website. (Completed)
Faculty EMS REC Level 2	Dean	REPC recommends approval conditional on the creation of an appropriate website. (Completed)
School of Dental Science Level 1	Gary Moran	REPC recommends approval conditional on the creation of an appropriate website. (Completed)
School of Nursing and Midwifery REC Level 1	Gabrielle McKee	REPC recommends approval conditional on the creation of an appropriate website. (Completed)

School of Pharmacy REC Level 1	Sheila Ryder	REPC recommends approval conditional on the creation of an appropriate website. (Completed)
New RECs December 2014		
Medicine (Level 1)	Thomas Rogers	Dec. 9th 2014 - REPC recommends approval
History (Level 1)	Micheál Ó Siochrú	Dec. 9th 2014 - REPC recommends approval
Biochemistry & immunology (Level 1*)	Jean Fletcher	Jan. 12th 2015 - All recommendations implemented & REPC recommends approval.