

The University of Dublin  
Trinity College

Minutes of Research Committee Meeting, 5<sup>th</sup> March 2013

- Present:
- Professor Vinny Cahill, Dean of Research and Chair
  - Associate Professor Derek Sullivan, Associate Dean of Research
  - Professor Paul Coughlan, Director of Research, School of Business
  - Professor Kevin Rockett, Director of Research, School of Drama, Film & Music
  - Assistant Professor Aidan Seery, Director of Research, School of Education
  - Associate Professor Aileen Douglas, Director of Research, School of English
  - Professor Ailbhe Ní Chasaide, Director of Research, School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences
  - Assistant Professor Carol Newman, Director of Research, School of Social Sciences and Philosophy
  - Assistant Professor Iain Atack, Director of Research, School of Religions, Theology and Ecumenics
  - Assistant Professor Ed Lavelle, Director of Research, School of Biochemistry and Immunology
  - Associate Professor Carl Vogel, Director of Research, School of Computer Science and Statistics
  - Associate Professor Anthony Quinn, Director of Research, School of Engineering
  - Professor Seamus Martin, Director of Research, School of Genetics and Microbiology
  - Professor Stefan Sint, Director of Research, School of Mathematics
  - Assistant Professor Andrew Jackson, Director of Research, School of Natural Sciences
  - Assistant Professor Gary Moran, Director of Research, School of Dental Science
  - Associate Professor Gabrielle McKee, Director of Research, School of Nursing and Midwifery
  - Assistant Professor Lorraine O'Driscoll, Director of Research, School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences
  - Professor John Boland, Director of Research, CRANN
  - Professor Juergen Barkhoff, Director of Research, Trinity Long Room Hub
  - Professor Louis Brennan, Director of Research, IIS
  - Professor Veronica Campbell, Dean of Graduate Studies
  - Dr Dermot Frost, Vice-Chairperson, Trinity Research Staff Association (TRSA)
  - Martin John McAndrew, President, Graduate Students Union
- In attendance:
- Ms Deirdre Savage, Research Acc. Manager, Treasurer's Office
  - Ms Doris Alexander, Research Development Officer, Trinity Research & Innovation
  - Dr Camilla Kelly, Research Projects Officer, Trinity Research & Innovation and Minute Secretary to the Committee
  - Associate Professor Eoin O'Dell, School of Law, for Item RS/12-13/50

Mr Paddy Naughton, FIS Project Manager, for Item RS/12-13/51  
Assistant Professor Jim Quinn, School of Business, for Item RS/12-13/52

Apologies: Professor Georg S. Duesberg, Director of Research, School of Chemistry  
Assistant Professor Clemens Ruthner, Director of Research, School of Languages, Literatures & Cultural Studies .  
Mr John Murphy, Director of Information Systems Services  
Assistant Professor Caoimhin MacMaolain, Director of Research, School of Law

Not present: Associate Professor Micheál Ó Siochrú, Director of Research, School of Histories and Humanities  
Professor Robert Gilligan, Director of Research, School of Social Work and Social Policy  
Professor Malcolm MacLachlan, Director of Research, School of Psychology  
Professor Martin Hegner, Director of Research, School of Physics  
Professor Yuri Volkov, Director of Research, School of Medicine  
Professor Shane O'Mara, Director of Research, TCIN  
Professor Luke O'Neill, Director, Trinity Biosciences Institute (TBSI)  
Dr James Callaghan, Associate Director of Trinity Research & Innovation and Secretary

## Section A

### RS/12-13/46 Introduction

The Dean of Research (DoR) welcomed everyone to the meeting.

### RS/12-13/47 Minutes of 22<sup>nd</sup> January 2013

The minutes of the meeting were approved by the Committee.

### RS/12-13/48 Matters Arising from the Minutes

Item RS/12-13/34 (referring to Items RS/12-13/20 and RS/12-13/04).  
The DoR informed the Committee that the first meeting of the RSS User Group took place recently. The primary goal of the meeting was to define a work plan for the User Group and, eventually, the RSS team. The initial focus will be on the useability of the RSS and on broadening the categories of research outputs recognised by the system.

Item RS/12-13/34 (referring to Items RS/12-13/20 and RS/12-13/05).  
The DoR noted that decisions had been reached on the recent call for locally-based research officer posts. One three-year post was awarded to TCIN, while two further posts were offered to the Faculty of Health Sciences/School of Medicine - one each to support the Ageing and Cancer thematic areas. The two posts were made possible because, in addition to support from the School, the faculty

provided additional resources from its strategic funds. The latter posts will be for two years initially.

Item RS/12-13/34 (referring to Items RS/12-13/20 and RS/12-13/14). The DoR noted that, to date, only 9 out of 29 units have provided inputs for the DoR Annual Report, which is now being edited. Further input from Schools and TRIs would be welcomed.

Item RS/12-13/35: Web page update. The DoR, at the request of the Web Design Office, asked members to suggest suitable external academics to review and comment on the website.

Item RS/12-13/36: Research Ethics. The DoR informed the meeting that the proposal had been accepted by Council subject to a minor amendment. The next step is to implement the policy, which means convening the Research Ethics Policy Committee. The DoR nominated Orla Sheils to chair this Committee and the Committee approved the nomination.

Item RS/12-13/37: Trinity Research Institutes. The DoR noted that the proposal was approved by Executive Officers, Council, and the Finance Committee, subject to some minor amendments. The document will now go to Board.

Item RS/12-13/39: Student Company Incubator. The DoR informed the Committee that, following a student competition to pick a suitable name, the incubator has been named 'Launch Box'. LaunchBox is getting significant support from Alumni, and the Dean encouraged Schools and TRIs to also provide support in the form of access to equipment etc.

Item RS/12-13/42: Steering Group for College Innovation and Entrepreneurship Strategy Development. The DoR noted that this item is on the agenda for today's meeting.

#### **RS/12-13/49 DoR Update**

The DoR started his update with a summary of results of the recent SFI Centres call. Eleven applications (nationally) went out for peer review. Of the 3 applications submitted by TCD (as lead), only one was funded - AMBER, led by Professor John Boland, who was congratulated on his success. Feedback from SFI indicated that the two unsuccessful proposals were excellent, however there was not enough funding available to fund them. The DoR noted that the result was particularly disappointing in view of the fact that external peer reviewers ranked both unsuccessful proposals very highly in terms of scientific excellence, and flagged both as suitable for funding. However, the SFI impact Panel did not make use of the ranking that emerged from the peer review in deciding final outcomes, noting other factors (impact) to be more significant. This result highlights very clearly the importance of impact in applications to SFI. Another Centres call is expected in Q3/Q4 2013; however this is likely to be a themed rather than an open call.

Anyone thinking of preparing a submission to this call should contact the DoR as soon as possible.

The DoR noted that SFI's portfolio of funding programmes is becoming more fragmented. The Investigators Programme has been reformulated into a single stream, and now only researchers with 15 peer reviewed publications are eligible to apply. This new criterion excludes many researchers that would have been eligible for the Investigator Project Grants as well as some that were successful in previous rounds of the Investigators Programme. Calls in the future are likely to focus more around themes. The SIRG programme is currently undergoing some restructuring and this may address some of the eligibility gaps in the new Investigator programme.

The DoR concluded the discussion on SFI by noting that all Schools and TRIs are welcome to forward comments to the DoR.

The DoR also updated the meeting on developments with the Annual Budgetary Cycle (ABC). In devising the ABC, work was undertaken to define KPIs for secondary allocations to Schools with a view to using them for secondary allocations to Schools in the 2014/15 cycle. The DoR noted that these KPIs could also be used as a basis for comparators against other HEIs. KPIs were defined under Research; Innovation; Teaching; and Civic Engagement. With respect to research, the KPIs are: percentage of research productive staff; scaled research income; percentage of staff holding research accounts (any accounts that support research activity); and number of ERC awardees. The aspiration is that eventually research KPIs will address research excellence rather than just counting outputs.

In response to a query from the meeting on whether any algorithms or weightings are used in the allocations, the DoR noted that under the ABC there is no algorithm per se. KPIs are used to inform secondary allocations.

The DoR concluded by informing the Committee that the proposal had gone to Board.

#### **RS/12-13/50 Research Integrity**

The Committee noted a proposed response to the IUA's Draft Policy Statement on Ensuring Research Integrity in Ireland, which was circulated in advance of the meeting. Associate Professor Eoin O'Dell spoke to the document.

Professor O'Dell noted that the version of the Draft Policy Statement on Ensuring Research Integrity as circulated by the IUA might require TCD to make changes to its Statutes in order to comply with the policy. Changing Statutes at TCD could be a lengthy process. The simplest solution would be to submit some appropriate revisions to the draft policy document - revisions that do not change the principles of the document, but that would ensure that TCD could comply with the policy without the need for changes in Statutes.

The Committee thanked Professor O'Dell for his efforts.

The DoR emphasised to the Committee that Irish Funding agencies are very keen that the national policy document on research integrity is accepted sooner rather than later, and that it is important that TCD is involved in shaping the process.

The Committee approved the decision to submit a response to the IUA document, as outlined by Professor O'Dell.

**Action:** ADoR to submit TCD's response to the IUA in advance of the deadline for submissions of 8<sup>th</sup> March 2013.

**RS/12-13/51 FIS (Financial Information System) Update**

Mr Paddy Naughton, FIS Project Manager, gave a brief presentation to the Committee on the FIS project, highlighting items of particular relevance to researchers and the research community.

The Committee thanked the presenter for his briefing.

**RS/12-13/52 College Innovation and Entrepreneurship Strategy Development**

The Committee noted a number of documents (Building an Innovation and Entrepreneurship Strategy for Trinity; College Innovation and Entrepreneurship Strategic Review - Terms of Reference; Strategy for Innovation Entrepreneurship - Mission Statement; and minutes from the Steering Group for College Innovation and Entrepreneurship Strategy Development meetings of the 3<sup>rd</sup>, 17<sup>th</sup>, and 7<sup>th</sup> January), which were circulated in advance of the meeting.

Assistant Professor Jim Quinn, School of Business, gave a brief presentation to the Committee.

This project was initiated by Provost. It represents an opportunity for Trinity to develop a University-wide strategy for pulling together Innovation and Entrepreneurship in a cohesive way.

Professor Quinn noted that the strategy document is a work in progress; for example, there are no contributions from Arts & Humanities as yet - this is in progress.

The first step in the process was information gathering. Amongst exemplars examined were Stanford, MIT and Oxford, and HEIs in Finland and the Netherlands, which would be closer in scale to TCD. All point to a number of common elements - they have a much higher level of integrated activity; and Schools of Engineering/Computer Science together with Business Schools often form a locus for activity, which is then shared across the institution.

Professor Quinn was congratulated for his efforts on the draft document.

One of the Committee noted that connectiveness within the institution would be essential. The current institutional culture and mindset needs to be addressed.

Another member asked whether a physical centre would be part of any plan. In response, the DoR noted that space would be very important in any form of interdisciplinary activity. There is a plan to develop a new building on campus to host the School of Business, and some administrative functions. This strategy could feed into that plan.

The discussion was concluded by the DoR thanking the presenter for his briefing.

**RS/12-13/53 Any Other Urgent Business**

The meeting extended its thanks to Dr James Callaghan for his role as Secretary to the Committee.

**Section B**

**RS/12-13/54 Research Committee Self-Evaluation**

The Committee noted a questionnaire, which was circulated in advance of the meeting.

**RS/12-13/55 IP Policy Working Group**

The Committee noted the membership, terms of reference and a copy of the slides presented by Dr Margaret Woods (TTO Manager) at meeting of 18<sup>th</sup> February 2013, which were was circulated in advance of the meeting.

**RS/12-13/56 WHO Guidelines on Interaction with the Tobacco Industry**

The Committee noted an e-mail from the HEA and a copy of the Guidelines for Implementation of Article 5.3 of the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control, which were was circulated in advance of the meeting.

**RS/12-13/57 Any Other Urgent Business**

**Section C**

**RS/12-13/58 Items for Discussion at Future Meetings**

- a. Research Committee Budget
- b. Annual Dean of Research Report
- c. Updates from Research Committee Working Groups Subcommittees
  - i. Associated Staff Working Group

- ii. WISER Strategic Group
- iii. Knowledge Transfer & Innovation Committee
- iv. RSS User Group
- v. Research Ethics
- vi. IP Policy Working Group

**RS/12-13/58 Any Other Urgent Business**  
None

Signed: .....

Date: .....