



**Trinity College Dublin
The University of Dublin**

Minutes of the Human Resources Committee

**Thursday, 28th November 2019, 11am to 12.45pm
Trinity Board Room, Trinity Business School**

- PRESENT:**
- Prof. Deirdre Ahern (Chair)
 - Ms. Antoinette Quinn (Director of Human Resources)
 - Ms. Aine Mulcahy (Chief Financial Officer's nominee)
 - Ms. Patricia Callaghan (Academic Secretary)
 - Ms. Breda Walls (nominee of the Chief Operations Officer)
 - Ms. Stephanie Farrell (Board nominee)
 - Prof. Celia Holland, (nominee of the Dean of the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Sciences)
 - Prof. Robert Armstrong (nominee of the Dean of the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences)
 - Prof. Gareth Brady (nominee of the Dean of the Faculty of Health Sciences)
 - Mr. Peter Donohoe (External Representative)
 - Ms. Victoria Butler (Equality Committee Representative)
 - Ms. Shaz Oye (Graduate Students Union President)
- APOLOGIES:**
- Mr. Michael Slevin (Vice Provost / Chief Academic Officer's nominee)
 - Prof. Kevin Mitchell (Senior Lecturer)
- IN ATTENDANCE:**
- Ms. Gwen Turner (Head of Strategic Planning and Process Improvement) for item 7
 - Ms. Cora Mullins (Human Resources) for all items

Items for specific Board attention are denoted XXX

Section A

HRC/19-20/04

Minutes of Last Meeting

A member of the Committee noticed an incorrect title in the minutes of 1st October 2019.

ACTION: The minutes of 1st October 2019 will be amended and brought to the next meeting of the Committee to be signed by the Chair.

HRC/19-20/05

Matters Arising from the Minutes

The Committee was informed that a meeting had taken place with an external legal firm to gain an independent perspective on the University's position on Indefinite Duration (COID) and Permanent Contracts.

The legal firm has also been asked for their perspective on the conversion of COID staff to permanency.

ACTION: The Committee will be updated on the progress of the external legal firms' perspective on both situations at a future meeting.

When the funding on a research grant runs out and/or when a research project comes to a natural end, the Research posts become redundant, as the University cannot sustain long term obligations to the staff involved in such instances.

As research roles are not permanent by their very nature, the University is therefore looking for ways to develop research staff while they are in situ and give them permanent skills to progress their careers. The Irish Universities Association (IUA) has a new document on the topic which also calls for researchers to be allowed to teach.

ACTION: The Committee will be updated on the research development programme and the IUA document as each progress.

A discussion on teaching ensued and a member of the Committee queried if early career academics were required to have teaching experience on entry to the University. It was indicated that it is a desirable, not an essential requirement as there are another three pillars of academia; research, contribution to College and contribution to community.

Another Committee member raised an observation that full-time academics hiring teaching fellows to do their teaching so they can focus mainly on research. In doing so, the student experience can be impacted negatively as they expect an experienced academic but get an inexperienced substitute.

ACTION: The Director of HR will delve further into the matter.

HRC/19-20/06

Director of Human Resources Report

In April 2019, the Dignity & Respect Steering Committee invited members of the University Community to start a conversation on Dignity and Respect in Trinity. This conversation continued with a workshop called "Living Dignity & Respect; A Cultural Conversation".

The workshop was well attended by a diverse cohort of representatives from across the University community who discussed a new set of cultural behaviours in relation to Dignity and Respect.

Leaders from Cambridge University spoke of their experience implementing a 'Break the Silence' campaign to address harassment issues in their University. The Vice-President of Culture from the HSE and the Vice-President of HR for Facebook in Europe also attended to share their stories.

The outcome of the workshop will result in the development of a set of values and expected behaviours to change the culture in the University, which will be presented to Board. The Committee welcomed this and supported the evolution of change in a behavioral context.

The report arising from the HR Quality Review was presented to Council; however, there was little discussion on the recommendations made. The Provost subsequently suggested that the recommendations be formed into work streams and then be brought to Board. The Director of HR indicated that some work streams will be process driven whilst others are transformational, noting that this relates to a University wide transformation, not HR alone.

ACTION: The report arising from the HR Quality Review will be circulated to the Committee on Diligent Boards for their information.

Section B

XXX HRC/19-20/07 Draft Job Sizing Policy

The Head of Strategic Planning and Process Improvement informed the Committee that their recommendation was sought for the sizing of jobs where a person is already in the post.

In September 2019, a proposal on this element of the Career Framework was circulated to unions for their input, without any responses being received.

At an EOG meeting in October 2019, HR sought direction on the next steps for bringing the proposal to Board. EOG directed HR to proceed, whilst leaving the door open for the unions to re-engage.

Based on developments in the sector, an updated proposal was circulated to the unions for their input. On 25th November 2019, the union responses were received.

The Committee were appraised on the Trinity draft proposal, the union input into it and the developments in the Sector. The main points of discussion centered on filling the post when it is upgraded, composition of the Role Grading Committee, appeals, budget and timeline.

The Committee felt the Unions proposal for a thirteen-person Role Grading Committee comprising six union members, six HR members and an independent chair was excessive. The consensus was the compositions as proposed by the University or the Sector would work better.

Concern was expressed that there is no appeal mechanism. It was reiterated that the post is evaluated, not the person in the post. It was agreed that the post holder should be appointed to the post in cases where it is upgraded, noting that the post-holder must be in the role for at least 3 years before it can be assessed under the process.

In situations where there is a cohort of staff in the same role, the organisational structure within the area should be considered by the manager before requesting a review of role(s). Upgrading of one role may affect several post holders.

It is expected that role grading will be the exception not the norm, and that managers would only put forward posts for sizing where they consider the job has materially changed in scope.

The Committee recommended the following amendments:

1. The incumbent is confirmed in the post if it is upgraded after sizing
2. Posts that have been sized shall not be resized for at least another 3 years
3. The policy and process are subject to review after 12 months of operation
4. The Role Grading Committee should comprise of no more than 5 members

ACTION: The Committee approved the Draft Job Sizing Policy and Process with the recommendations above incorporated. The Policy, as amended will progress to a future meeting of Board for its consideration and approval.

Section C

HRC/19-20/08

Any Other Business

A member of the Committee enquired if there was any update on the next round of Ussher position.

ACTION: The Director of Human Resources will enquire and revert.

A query was raised on the status of the Leadership and Management Development Programme. The Director of HR confirmed this forms part of the Learning and Development Strategy and indicated it will likely roll out as part of the transformation in 2020.

Signed:

Date: