Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

XX = Board relevance

Trinity College Dublin
The University of Dublin

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 12 February 2020 at 11.15 am in the Trinity Board Room.

Present
Provost, Registrar, Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Research, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor D. Murchan, Professor D. Shepherd, Professor M Monaghan, Professor M. Ruffini, Professor R.A. Kenny, Professor M. Clarke, Professor M. Corry, Dr. S. Kerr, Professor A. Long, Ms. D. Kelleher, Ms N. McCoy, Ms. E. Black, Mr D.O’Reilly, Ms G. Scanlon, Dr. A. Guha.

Apologies
Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Dean of Students, Professor A.M. Brady, Professor S. Alyn Stacey, Professor C. Kelly, Ms. I. Lis.

In attendance
Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Librarian and College Archivist, Director of Student Services, Assistant Academic Secretary.

Observers
Mr F. Frank, Ms L. Peters.

SECTION A

The Provost welcomed everyone to Council. He requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda. The Secretary to the College noted that there were a number of conflicts of interest reported in relation to the agenda. These were as follows: item 5 (ii) Postgraduate Course Proposal: MSc in Cancer Survivorship, in consultation with Prof. J. Hussey and Prof. M. Clarke it was agreed that as Prof. J. Hussey was on the academic team that developed the proposal, Prof. Hussey would leave the meeting for the discussion of this item, and as Prof. M. Clarke was not involved in the preparation of the proposal that she would remain in the meeting; item D25 ‘Personnel Matters: Senior Academic Promotions Committee Recommendations’, the Secretary to the College advised that the four Council members recommended for Senior Academic Promotions, Prof. S. Draper, Prof. D. Shepherd, Prof. M. Ruffini and Prof. C. Kelly (apology) would be absent from the meeting for the discussion of this item.

CL/19-20/077  Declarations by new Members and Observers

A new member of Council made the required statutory declaration.

CL/19-20/078  Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of Council on 4 December 2019 were approved and signed.
CL/19-20/079  Matters Arising

There were no Matters Arising.

CL/19-20/080  Provost’s Report

(i) The Provost updated Council on projects funded by Trinity’s philanthropic campaign ‘Inspiring Generations’. He advised that a development group co-chaired by the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation and the Deputy Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of St. James’s Hospital had been established for the Trinity St. James’s Cancer Institute and that the work is progressing well. He highlighted that the Cancer Institute would not be possible without philanthropic funding and funding from the Health Services Executive (HSE), adding that the Cancer Institute will transform cancer care in Ireland by integrating research, medicine and training with clinical trials. The Provost referred to the conservation of the Old Library highlighting that the redevelopment plan draws on 21st-century design and technology to safeguard the Old Library structure and to conserve the precious collections for future generations. He noted that structural and environmental upgrades are required, and there is a need to digitise the priority collections to conserve them and to make them accessible online. The Provost reported that the Engineering, Environment and Emerging Technologies (E3) Learning Foundry is also progressing well and invited the Dean of Research, as lead of the design brief of the E3 Research Institute to update Council.

The Dean of Research advised Council that the E3 Research Institute will draw on expertise from Engineers, Natural Scientists and Computer Scientists to create technologies that will contribute to preserving the planet. She highlighted that the Institute will be the largest research institute in Ireland with 650 academic staff and approximately 200 Masters’ students. She reported that significant work is being undertaken across educational research and clinical trials with Trinity and St. James’s working together in five main areas:

- Cancer prevention
- Cancer survivorship and wellbeing
- Molecular oncology
- Precision oncology
- Cancer immunology

(ii) The Provost updated Council on his recent travels reporting that he attended events in New York and Philadelphia, and a fund-raising dinner in Cambridge where an address was given by the President of Harvard University leading to a discussion on creating the right type of environment for open discussion and debate. The Provost reported that he was in Brussels on the 3 and 4 February 2020 for a meeting of the European Institute of Innovation and Technology on promoting entrepreneurship and innovation, observing that Trinity is ahead of many European countries in the entrepreneurship arena.

(iii) The Provost reported that Board had established a Board Review Working Group, chaired by Mr. Dermot McCarthy, former Secretary-General of the Department of An Taoiseach, to examine the future governance of Trinity and Board membership. He advised Council that Trinity will propose its own governance model, and the Board Review Working Group will make recommendations on this in due course.

The Provost reported that State funding once accounted for 85% of Trinity’s income, now it accounts for 40% of income. The block grant, he remarked is very small. He emphasised the importance of funding ‘blue sky research’ adding that no funding has come from Science Foundation Ireland (SFI) in three years for such research. He noted the importance of research centres for Trinity highlighting the importance of principal
in incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings.

The Provost updated Council on the Trinity Strategic Plan 2020-2025, which is now printed and ready for distribution. He advised that the Strategic Plan will be launched during the second week of March 2020.

(iv) The Provost reported that he attended a signing ceremony in the Science Gallery where it was announced that Atlanta-based Emory University will become the latest member of the global network of Science Gallery locations. He explained that Trinity is home to the world’s first Science Gallery location established in 2008, which is a significant achievement.

The Provost referred to the debate of the education spokespeople of the main political parties held in Trinity prior to the general election, commenting that Trinity is in a good position to manage the transition to a new administration. He acknowledged that any proposal to abolish the student registration fee will have implications for Trinity and the higher education sector generally.

The Provost invited questions and comments on his report. A member referred to the update on the Trinity St. James’s Cancer Institute advising that University College Dublin (UCD) and the Royal College of Surgeons Ireland (RCSI) are also working on developing national cancer institutes that aim to provide comprehensive cancer care in Ireland, and asked the Provost for his view on how well the Trinity St. James’s Cancer Institute is positioned to respond to this. The Provost acknowledging the political dimension commented that Trinity’s work on the Trinity St. James’s Cancer Institute is well progressed with the accreditation from the Organisation of European Cancer Institutes (OECI) being awarded in the summer. He noted that there is a need to look at how comprehensive cancer care is provided in Ireland, explaining that good practice recommends a national cancer institute for a population of six million. He emphasised the importance of collaboration noting the role that Trinity and St. James’s Hospital can play in working with other Universities and hospitals to deliver healthcare in Ireland.

The Librarian and College Archivist stated that she was very pleased to report that the new case for the Book of Kells has arrived. She highlighted that the upgrading of the Treasury containing the Book of Kells is the first step of the conservation plans for the Old Library. The Librarian and College Archivist advised that the Old Library Redevelopment Project is making progress, and that the architects and Trinity team have been working on an integrated design which incorporates the conservation, environmental control and protection of the Old Library and its collection, together with a new Research Collections Study Centre and new exhibition and improved visitor facilities.

**CL/19-20/081 Examination Process for PhD/Research Masters Students**

The Dean of Graduate Studies introduced the proposal on amending the examination process for PhD and Research Masters students highlighting the need for the introduction of a new streamlined examination process for postgraduate research students. He advised that all PhD students must have a Viva Voce examination, and that in some cases Research Masters students may also have one. The Dean of Graduate Studies explained that as exam reports are submitted by examiners in their own time after the Viva Voce examination significant delays can occur due to reports not being submitted for a considerable time after the Viva Voce exam. He added that examiners are often unclear on what constitutes ‘minor corrections’, and that examiner reports can lack consistency being either too brief or too lengthy.

The Dean of Graduate Studies presented two proposals to amend the examination process to address these issues. The first, involves moving to a new model whereby examiners exchange reports a week before the Viva summarising their views on the thesis. The examiners then complete a joint ‘post-viva form’ immediately following the Viva presenting the agreed result.
and list of changes that is sent to the Academic Registry (AR) on the same day as the Viva. He indicated that this process will apply to Research Masters students also in the event that a Viva Voce is required. He advised that the process is in line with standard practice in many top UK and EU universities, and that he expects it to speed up the examination time for research students. The second proposal relates to the proposed amendment of guidelines sent to all postgraduate research examiners to provide greater clarity on what constitutes ‘minor’ corrections.

The Provost thanked the Dean of Graduate Studies and invited questions and comments.

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies expressed his support for the proposals and noted that they are in line with best practice. The Registrar concurred, noting that change is needed. She raised one concern relating to the pre-submission of examiner reports, asking if these were submitted centrally prior to the Viva Voce examination. The Dean of Graduate Studies clarified that there is a designated email for correspondence and that reports are uploaded to a student file through the designated email address.

A member highlighted the challenge of sourcing appropriate external examiners, especially in disciplines where expertise in an area may not be widely available. She highlighted that the existing criteria for the selection of external examiners can act as a barrier to securing external examiners with the necessary expertise and asked if the criteria could be reviewed. The Dean of Graduate Studies advised that the criteria are currently under consideration by the Graduate Studies Committee and a memorandum on this will be presented at a subsequent Council meeting.

A concern was raised that external examiners may not follow the guideline to circulate reports in advance of the Viva Voce and may not prepare a report immediately following the Viva Voce. The Dean of Graduate Studies indicated that in exceptional circumstances external examiners may not reach agreement on the outcome of the Viva Voce examination and advised that the Chair of the Examination in this instance will mediate in order to reach agreement. However, in the event that agreement is not reached it will be referred to the Dean of Graduate Studies for consideration and decision.

A discussion on the Freedom of Information Acts (FOI) section on page 5 of the document took place with a member emphasising the need for students to have access to the examiners’ reports without having to submit an FOI request. The Dean of Graduate Studies highlighted that current practice is for the texts of the external and internal examiners’ reports to be initially sent to Schools and then onto students. The Provost agreed that the process should be transparent and that students should automatically have access to their reports. The Dean of Graduate Studies agreed to revisit this with the Graduate Studies Committee.

The Senior Tutor drew Council’s attention to the new requirement that external examiners need to have a Personal Public Service (PPS) number in order to secure the honorarium. He highlighted that this may be a barrier in recruiting suitable external examiners.

Decisions:
CL/19-20/081.1: Council approved the proposal as presented for Trinity to move to a new model whereby examiners exchange reports a week before the Viva and complete a joint ‘post-viva form’ immediately following the Viva, outlining the agreed results and compiling an agreed list of changes.
CL/19-20/081.2: Council approved the amended guidelines for examiners of candidates for the Ph.D.
CL/19-20/081.3: Council approved the proposed Calendar, Part III, Section I and II changes.

Actions:
CL/19-20/081.4: The Dean of Graduate Studies to bring a memorandum on revised criteria for the selection of external examiners to a subsequent meeting of Council.
CL/19-20/081.5: The Graduate Studies Committee (GSC) to be invited to consider and review the existing policy on FOI on page 5 of the ‘Guidelines for Examiners of Candidates for the PhD’.
CL/19-20/081.6: The Dean of Graduate Studies to look into the requirement that external

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings
examiners require a PPS number in order to receive the honorarium.

12.10pm: Prof. M. Ruffini left the meeting

**CL/19-20/082 Postgraduate Course Proposals**

(i) **Postgraduate Certificate in Orofacial Pain**

The Dean of Graduate Studies presented the proposal for the Postgraduate Certificate in Orofacial Pain to Council. He advised that the 30 ECTS blended programme, delivered by the Trinity School of Dental Science in collaboration with the Herman Ostrow School of Dentistry, University of Southern California, is a Special Purpose Award at National Framework of Qualifications (NFQ) level 9. Students who successfully complete the programme receive a Postgraduate Certificate in Orofacial Pain awarded by Trinity. The course, which received a very positive external review from Professor Dr Gregory Murray, Sydney Dental School, Faculty of Medicine and Health, University of Sydney in Australia, will be delivered to a minimum of 10 and maximum of 20 students. He added that the programme is not dependent on recruiting non-EU fee paying students. The Dean of Graduate Studies reported that due to increasing professional and legal requirements there is a growing demand specifically for postgraduate education in the area of advanced practice training for dentists nationally and internationally.

The Provost raised the Irish honours primary degree in Dental Science entry requirement and asked if candidates with qualifications from outside of Ireland could be considered for entry. The Dean of Graduate Studies advised that there may be circumstances in which a qualification obtained in Dental Science from outside of Ireland is considered. He also added that Trinity academic staff will be teaching on the course, and that the syllabus has been heavily influenced by the Herman Ostrow School of Dentistry, University of Southern California, which is recognised as a global world leader in this area. A member added that there are a number of Trinity staff in Dental Science who have well established links with the University of Southern California, and that the Herman Ostrow School of Dentistry is very well respected.

(ii) **MSc in Cancer Survivorship**

The Dean of Graduate Studies presented the proposal for the MSc in Cancer Survivorship to Council. He advised that the programme aimed at health care professionals from a wide range of backgrounds, including medicine, nursing and allied healthcare disciplines, offers an evidence-based approach to the management of physical and psychosocial issues that arise in cancer survivorship. The proposal developed by the School of Medicine offers three direct application entry routes, namely; an MSc consisting of 90 ECTS delivered full-time over one year or part-time over two years; a postgraduate diploma consisting of 60 ECTS delivered full-time over one year; and a postgraduate certificate (minor award) consisting of 30 ECTS delivered full-time over one year. Students can progress from the postgraduate certificate to the postgraduate diploma programme, and from the postgraduate diploma to the MSc programme.

This MSc will be offered under the education programme of the Trinity St James’s Cancer Institute, a collaborative joint enterprise between Trinity and St James’s Hospital combining excellence in cancer care.

The Dean of Graduate Studies reported that the proposal received a very positive external review from Professor Kathleen Lyons, Head of the Directorate of Diagnostic Radiography, School of Health Sciences, Institute of Clinical Sciences, Assistant Professor of Psychiatry at Geisel School of Medicine and Investigator in the Cancer Control Program, Norris Cotton Cancer Center, Dartmouth University in the USA. The Dean of Graduate Studies added that there is a strong market appeal for the programme, which aligns with the Irish National Cancer Strategy 2017-2026 and with Trinity expertise in this area. He added that the focus...
of the programme is on survivorship, rehabilitation and quality of life.

The Provost thanked the Dean of Graduate Studies for his presentation of the programme and invited the Vice-President of Global Relations to comment.

The Vice-President of Global Relations thanked the Dean of Graduate Studies for his presentation of the programme highlighting that ‘survivorship’ is an important theme of the new Trinity St. James’s Cancer Institute, and that the Irish Cancer Society is very supportive of the programme.

The Vice-President of Global Relations left the meeting for the discussion of this item.

The Dean of Health Sciences in responding to a question from the Provost advised that the programme is aimed at healthcare professionals working in the area. She advised that the blend of modules offered on the programme is noteworthy. A student member observed that the programme is open to physiotherapists and occupational therapists and asked if clinical psychologists could apply also. The Dean of Graduate Studies confirmed that clinical psychologists are welcome to apply once they hold the necessary qualifications.

A number of members and the Dean of Research stated that they welcomed and endorsed the programme. The Dean of Research emphasised the importance of developing programmes that align with the research mission of the Trinity St. James’s Cancer Institute. She highlighted the importance of research in informing the development of programmes that provide professional development to healthcare professionals leading to enhanced knowledge and skills.

The Provost raised a concern in relation to the lack of involvement of other staff in the School of Medicine, outside of occupational therapy and physiotherapy, in the programme. He noted for instance, that Professor Maeve Lowery, Professor of Translational Cancer Medicine is not involved in Module 4: Clinical Trials and Health Economics. Prof. Kenny acknowledged that key areas especially in the School of Medicine and related institutes should be considered in the programme.

The Vice-President of Global Relations re-joined the meeting.

(iii) MSc in Business Analytics

The Dean of Graduate Studies presented the proposal for the MSc. in Business Analytics to Council. He advised that the one-year full-time/two-year part-time programme, delivered by the Trinity Business School, leads to the award of MSc. in Business Analytics (90 ECTS) and a Postgraduate Diploma in Business Analytics (60 ECTS exit award) at level 9 of the NFQ. The programme will be delivered to a minimum of 20 EU/non-EU students and a maximum of 50 EU/non-EU students.

The Dean of Graduate Studies reported that the proposal received a very positive external review from Professor Rohit Nishant, Department of Information Systems and Organization, Faculty of Business, Universite Laval in Canada. He added that there is an increasing market demand for a specialised postgraduate course in Business Analytics, and that the course is a key part of the Trinity Business School’s development and growth strategy.

Decisions:

CL/19-20/082.i:1: Council approved the proposal for a course in Orofacial Pain delivered in collaboration with the University of Southern California Herman Ostrow School of Dentistry, leading to a Trinity awarded Postgraduate Certificate in Orofacial Pain with a first intake in September 2020.

CL/19-20/082.i:2: Council approved the Memorandum of Understanding between the University of Southern California, on behalf of its Herman Ostrow School of Dentistry and the Dublin Dental University Hospital/School of Dental Science, Trinity College Dublin.

CL/19-20/082.ii:1: Council approved the proposal for a course in Cancer Survivorship
with direct application entry to the postgraduate certificate in Cancer Survivorship; direct application entry and progression routes to the postgraduate diploma in Cancer Survivorship and the MSc. in Cancer Survivorship with the exit award of postgraduate diploma, with a first intake in September 2020.

CL/19-20/082.iii:1: Council approved the proposal for a course in Business Analytics leading to an MSc. in Business Analytics with an exit award of postgraduate diploma, with a first intake in September 2020.

CL/19-20/083 Any Other Urgent Business

The Provost noted that it was the last meeting of Ms. L. Peters and he thanked her for her contribution.

SECTION B

CL/19-20/084 Undergraduate Studies Committee

(i) Minutes of the meeting of 10 December 2019
(ii) Minutes of the meeting of 21 January 2020 noting the following appendices:
   a. Reassessed, Deferring, Off Books, Repeat Year, Course Transfer and Visiting Students and Facilitating Pathway and Module Selection
   b. Proposal for Mainstreaming of Trinity Electives: Academic and Operational

Trinity Education Project (USC/19-20/031)
The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies referred Council to the memorandum on ‘Reassessed, deferring, Off Books, Repeat Year, Course Transfer and Visiting Students and Facilitating Pathway Module Selection’ appended to the minutes of the meeting of 21 January 2020. He advised Council that USC had considered circumstances whereby students fail and defer assessment, defer the year (off books/off books with assessment), repeat the year or transfer course, and to visiting students, and how these students will be facilitated in making their pathway and module selections at the end of their first and second years (USC/19-20/031). He highlighted that a mechanism has been agreed for places to be held in the system until reassessment results are issued, and then for stage selections to be either confirmed or withdrawn. To achieve this end, he advised that the open modules ‘maximum capacity’ will be reduced by 10% for the June selection and then increased for the post-reassessment opening of enrolments.

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies highlighted that students who must repeat the year/OBA/OB will make their selections the following year.

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies drew Council’s attention to the ‘Proposal for Mainstreaming of Trinity Electives: Academic and Operational’ advising that recommendations for the academic governance and administration of the Trinity Electives from 2020/21 had been considered and approved by USC (USC/19-20/031). He highlighted that the proposal recommended the establishment of a Trinity Electives Sub-Committee reporting into USC be established from 2020/21, and the operational arrangements for mainstreaming of Trinity Electives, including timetabling, and selection and allocation processes.

Decision:
CL/19-20/084.ii:1: The minutes of the meeting of 21 January 2020 with appendices: Reassessed, Deferring, Off Books, Repeat Year, Course Transfer and Visiting Students and Facilitating Pathway and Module Selection, and the Proposal for Mainstreaming of Trinity Electives: Academic and Operational were noted and approved.

Schol (USC/19-20/032)
The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies referred Council to minute number USC/19-20/032 on ‘proposed changes to the Structure and Timing of the Scholarship Examination’. He
advised that the proposal had been discussed at USC with a more final proposal document to be brought to USC at a later date. The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies outlined the main elements of the proposal as:

- To use the module results from the first semester in second year as part of the criteria for the award of Scholarship.
- To have students sit an additional single general paper in a chosen subject as an additional part of the assessment towards the award of Scholarship.
- That this special examination be held in the week immediately following the current first semester assessment week, possibly on the Monday.

He highlighted the perceived benefits as making the Scholarship examinations more accessible to students, condensing the period required for the examinations by having one general paper per subject/programme, incorporating more diverse modes of assessment in line with TEP, and freeing up the first week of the second semester, which could become the first week of the teaching term providing students with an additional reading week at the end of term. He added that the proposed approach will maintain the special nature of the Scholarship examinations through the use of a general paper.

The Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies advised that the Central Scholarship Committee (CSC) had discussed the general proposal and was generally in support of it, though the Secretary of Scholars had expressed reservations. He reported that USC is broadly supportive of reviewing the examinations in the context of TEP, though USC had expressed some concerns and reservations relating to the calibration of criteria, and on altering the nature of Senior Fresh assessments making them more competitive.

The Secretary of Scholars highlighted the need for the process to be carefully considered and not rushed. He advised that Scholars have expressed reservations with the proposed changes, especially on the proposal to take course work into account, which will put students under more pressure. He emphasised the need for consultation with relevant parties such as the Scholars, past Scholars and Fellows. The Provost advised that opportunities for consultation would be provided, and clarified that Council is not being asked to make a decision on the proposals at this meeting.

The Dean of Graduate Studies emphasised the need for the Graduate Studies Committee to discuss any proposed changes to the Academic Year Structure (AYS), as such changes may have an impact on the delivery of postgraduate education and on students. The observer reported that he had no issue with the proposed change in timing of the Schol exam.

In response to a query on whether changes introduced to the AYS had an impact on the number and profile of students achieving Schol the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies reported that there had been no changes.

Decisions:

**CL/19-20/084.i:1:** The minutes of the meeting of 10 December 2019 and 21 January 2020 were noted and approved.

**CL/19-20/085**  
Global Relations Committee  
The minutes of the meeting of the 27 January 2020 were noted and approved.

**CL/19-20/086**  
Graduate Studies Committee  
The minutes of the meeting of 23 January 2020 were noted and approved.

The Dean of Graduate Studies informed Council that the process on postgraduate teaching awards was concluded on 10 February and that there were three excellent recipients of the awards.
CL/19-20/087 Human Resources Committee

The minutes of 28 November 2019 were noted and approved.

CL/19-20/088 Research Committee

The Dean of Research referred Council to the minutes of 12 November 2019 and the new Clinical Trials Sponsorship Policy that applies to the sponsorship of the regulation of clinical trials of investigational medicinal products and clinical investigations of medical devices led by authorised academic investigators (B.1). She highlighted that the new policy will facilitate Trinity in taking on trials that may not have been undertaken before.

The Dean of Research drew Council’s attention to the approval of the Trinity Centre for National Products by the Research Committee at its meeting in November 2019 (B.3). She advised that Professor Helen Sheridan from the School of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences had taken the lead on this.

The minutes of 12 November 2019 and 10 December 2019 were noted and approved.

CL/19-20/089 Student Life Committee

The minutes of 12 November 2019 were noted and approved.

SECTION C

CL/19-20/090 Higher Degrees – Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the circulated reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 4 December 2019 and 15 January 2020 and noted by Board on 29 January 2020:

(i) Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone

MD Catherine Margaret Dolan

D.CH.DENT Edward Madeley

(ii) Higher Degrees by Research Alone

PhD Joana Blanquer; Raffaele Bonadio; Brigit Katharine McCon; Kieran Nolan; Sheila Julia O’Hare; Dylan Gerard Ryan; Julia Zahra Jane Wisdom

Paola Aprile; Jill Adrienne Browning; Moacir Gomes De Oliveira; Marjolein Kamermans; Emma Margaret McGrath; Juliette Anne O’Connell; Karin O’Sullivan; Sonya Brigid Perkins; Mehran Rafiee; Soracha Ward; Lucy Ann Kathy Whiston

MSc Michael Slevin

Aoife Marie Josephine Murtagh

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings