

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 19 November 2014 at 11.15 a.m. in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Registrar, Dean of Undergraduate Studies/Senior Lecturer, Dean of Graduate Studies, Senior Tutor, Dean of Research, Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor E O'Dell, Professor M Junker-Kenny, Professor D Faas, Professor J Walsh, Professor R Dahyot, Professor I Donohue, Dean of Health Sciences, Professor JP Spiers, Professor M Clarke, Professor P Cronin, Professor D Kelleher, Ms D Alexander, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dean of Students, Ms K Byrne, Ms S Baker, Ms M Kenny, Mr A Hanna, Ms S Kearney.
<i>Apologies</i>	Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Professor C Comiskey, Dr S Bloomfield, Mr A Miller, Interim Chief Operating Officer.
<i>In attendance</i>	Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Librarian, Ms S De Brunner.
<i>Observers</i>	Secretary to the Scholars (Ms A P Worrall), Mr S Hatton (GSU).

SECTION A

The Provost requested that Council members declare any potential conflicts of interest in relation to the agenda items. Professor Spiers declared an interest in relation to C.03 (CL/14-15/065) and it was noted that he would leave the meeting for this item.

CL/14-15/050 Statutory Declaration

Two new members made the statutory declaration.

CL/14-15/051 Minutes

The accuracy of the wording 'declare any potential conflicts of interest' was discussed since the holding of an interest does not necessarily mean that this gives rise to a conflict of interest. Some consideration was given to the types of interests that should be declared by members, general interests or only those which might give rise to a conflict. It was noted that the wording would stand in the minutes but that the matter would be given further consideration by the College Secretary.

The minutes of 22 October 2014 were approved and signed.

CL/14-15/052 Matters Arising:

- (i) **CL/14-15/033:** Referring to the research reports presented at the last meeting of Council, a member commented on the lack of data presented on impacts from research in the arts and humanities since the only category of impacts being measured relates to citations. This measurement method favours those areas where the principal research output is the academic journal, which is not the case in the arts and humanities. She commented that it is somewhat misleading to state that 83% of citations are related to publications from 10 % of staff when not all staff members produce the type of publications which tend to be cited. She also drew the meeting's attention to data on

research funding and noted that given the traditional disparity in the level of research funding awarded to different subjects, this performance indicator similarly tends to undervalue the arts and humanities. She requested that a footnote to be added to the reports to clarify this data. Responding, the Dean of Research acknowledged the difficulties in capturing research outputs in the arts and humanities and noted that work is ongoing in this regard.

- (ii) **CL/14-15/032:** The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, referring to the Online Education Strategy II, notified members of a proposal related to the establishment of a separate legal entity to support the delivery of online courses, which was presented recently to the College Board. She emphasised that regardless of the mode of delivery chosen by College for online courses, academic standards would still come under the remit of Council and governance and financial matters would remain a matter for Board.

CL/14-15/053 Provost's Report

- (i) The Provost noted that the Strategic Plan 2014-2019 launched on 22 October 2014 and received positive reports in the media. He noted that significant amounts of work had already be carried out in relation to the Online Education Strategy II, which will return to Board for final approval in December, and the Global Relations Strategy II, which will be presented to Board within the next few months. He advised that both the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and he would visit each school during January and February 2015 following which schools will be required to produce their own strategic plans in line with the objectives of the College's plan. The process of developing school strategies will be led by the Faculty Deans and initial work in relation to this has already commenced. He signalled the start of the Trinity Education Project, scheduled for January 2015, and noted that he will chair its steering group.
- (ii) Speaking to a number of capital infrastructure projects, the Provost spoke briefly about the Trinity Business School and the E3 project. He outlined ambitious plans to build additional student residences, which should increase capacity to accommodate 2,000 students. Providing information about the new Cancer Institute, the Dean of Research informed Council that this is a planned joint initiative between Trinity College and St James's Hospital which would benefit the country as a whole. It will provide a focal point for research, cancer care and essential services and is due to be built on the St James's campus.
- (iii) The Provost noted that Trinity as co-trustee of the Marino Institute of Education (MIE), along with the Christian Brothers, has nominated three College representatives to sit on a strategy group to help develop MIE's strategic academic direction for the next five years. The group will consider MIE's overall direction and not only those areas of collaboration with Trinity College. Trinity's representatives are Ms Cliona Hannon, Professor Brendan Tangney and Professor Aidan Seery.

CL/14-15/054 Global Engagement Awards

A proposal for the establishment of the Trinity Global Engagement Awards, dated 6 November 2014, from the Vice-President for Global Relations, was circulated. Speaking to the document the Vice-President for Global Relations noted that the awards were being introduced to recognise those staff members who had made an exceptional contribution to furthering the global engagement aims of the University by building international relations, embedding internationalisation into Trinity's educational and research culture, and through the development of global education. She noted that up to three awards would be given annually, worth €2,000 each, and paid to a research or departmental account. It is envisaged that the funds would support the awardees in the advancement of their professional endeavours and engagement in a region specific to their School or profession, in collaboration with the Office of the Vice-President for Global Relations.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

She outlined the criteria and noted that nominees may be current or former academic, administrative or support staff members. Nominees for the Global Engagement Awards must demonstrate excellence in four of the following six criteria, or exceptional performance in one:

- (i) global relationship building that has led to strategic partnerships, student or staff mobility opportunities for Trinity;
- (ii) activities that contribute to the planning, design or development of innovations in international educational and global outreach programmes;
- (iii) contributions to development of institutions in other countries through technical assistance, programme development and administration, teaching or research;
- (iv) collaboration with peers and colleagues from outside Ireland in ways which advance Trinity's reputation in the world;
- (v) demonstrated leadership role in fundraising for the University;
- (vi) proven service to the College through internationally focussed administrative and management activities.

The recognition of students in relation to these awards was queried given the work being carried out by student ambassadors and those participating in the S2S peer support scheme, with very low levels of funding. The Vice-President for Global Relations indicated that this was considered initially but that the proposal relates to staff only. The Provost, on behalf of Council, commended the work of the S2S scheme. It was commented that the Dean of Student's Roll of Honor is being reviewed and the re-vamped scheme could provide the mechanism to recognise students who have made a significant contribution in this area.

In response to a query about how the prize would be awarded to former staff members, since they could not access research or departmental accounts, the Provost noted that the procedure used for the Provost's Teaching Awards would be applied. It was suggested that staff who support sporting activities as well as those who provide student supports should be included in the eligibility criteria.

Council approved the proposal for the establishment of the Trinity Global Engagement Awards subject to the inclusion of a specific mention to College sports activities and the amendment of the last criterion to read, 'proven service to the College through internationally focussed administrative, student support and management activities.'

CL/14-15/055 Quality Review: School of Mathematics

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 12 November 2014, was circulated with the external reviewers' report of the School of Mathematics and the responses from the Head of School and Faculty Dean. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that the report and the responses had been discussed in detail at the last meeting of the Quality Committee and that the Head of the School of Mathematics had attended.

The report was positive on the whole with the external reviewers commenting on the quality of the School, its research strengths in the areas of pure mathematics and string theory, its strong international reputation and its high position in global rankings. They did, however, highlight areas which require attention, such as the low number of registered research students, the lack of new funding available from the Science Foundation Ireland (SFI) for principal research topics in the School and the effect of research funding cuts, the inability to fill two professorial positions, not using the Hamilton Institute to its full potential and the poor state of the physical environment particularly caused by a leaking roof. The external reviewers recommended the following actions:

- (i) The filling of the vacant Erasmus Smith's Chair of Mathematics and the Accenture Professorship of Mathematics, or making two junior appointments instead of one of the two;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

- (ii) Increasing the number of postdoctoral fellows and research students;
- (iii) Better promotion of the School through publicity campaigns and for fund-raising initiatives;
- (iv) Address the problem of undergraduate retention especially in the Junior Freshman year;
- (v) Introduce a second taught master's programme in the School, only after careful consideration;
- (vi) The College should give greater priority to fundraising for the revitalisation of the Hamilton Institute;
- (vii) Address the poor state of the School's accommodation;
- (viii) Make the case for funding, to the SFI and the government, for fundamental research as part of a campaign to reinstate funding for pure mathematics and theoretical physics.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that both the Head of School and the Dean of the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science accept the recommendations and are committed to address them.

There was a discussion about staff numbers in the context of main research areas in certain schools and disciplines falling outside of the SFI's priority topics. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer acknowledged the financial difficulties faced by such schools and commented that increasing the number of non-EU research and postgraduate students on taught courses can help given that the core grant has reduced by 38% since 2008. She confirmed that College allocates an annual budget to the Faculty Deans who make decisions about its allocation within the Faculty. Citing the School of Mathematics as an example, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that a number of contract posts had been converted to permanent posts and that College had attempted to fill the two professorial positions. It was commented by a member that College could focus some of its marketing strategies at industry for courses like the postgraduate Certificate in Statistics rather than concentrating solely on marketing to non-EU students.

In relation to allocations to schools, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that faculty budgets are signed-off by the faculty executives following strategic discussions with schools. Board sets the parameters for, and has oversight of, the annual budgeting process, and ultimately decides the annual budget; faculties, schools and administrative areas must work within these parameters and the budgets available.

The Dean of Research commented that despite the small number of staff, the School of Mathematics achieves a high number of citations. He commented that the SFI does fund research in mathematics but has prioritised research in applied areas and that a case for research funding for fundamental research is often made. Apart from the SFI, he noted that the Irish Research Council, Horizon 2020 and the European Research Council all represent opportunities for funding. The School could consider greater levels of cross-subsidisation from more applied areas of mathematics

The matter of the attrition level in the Mathematics and Theoretical Physics courses was raised. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that this was specifically discussed at the Quality Committee and the Head of School provided information about the strategies being employed to improve retention. The Academic Secretary noted that students leaving these courses tend to transfer within the School or to other courses in Trinity rather than leaving College altogether. Following on from a query in relation to the general outcomes for graduates from these undergraduate courses, the Provost invited the Academic Secretary to discuss the production of graduate destinations report with the Director of the Careers Advisory Service.

Council noted and approved the external reviewers' report and the responses from the Head of School and the Dean of the Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science and requested

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

that the implementation plan be prepared and circulated to the Quality Committee in due course.

CL/14-15/056 College Alcohol Policy

A revised Alcohol Policy, dated 10 November 2014, was circulated. The Dean of Students noted that comments made previously at Council (CL/13-14/141) had been brought back to the working group charged with updating the policy and amendments had been made where relevant.

Responding to a query the Dean of Students confirmed that the updated policy relates only to students. The Provost asked the Secretary to the College to look into the status of a parallel policy concerning staff members.

During the discussion it was noted that the Students' Union would, most likely, require funding if it is to play an integral part in implementing this policy. Following a query concerning the development of a substance abuse policy, the Dean of Students confirmed that this was not planned since illegal drug use is already covered by national legislation. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that whilst policy development was not planned in this area, work could still be undertaken to raise awareness of relevant laws and the health implications related to drug use.

A member suggested the re-wording of one of the stated objectives in the policy, '[to] promote low-risk drinking and discourage high-risk drinking amongst those who choose not to drink', to ensure that it is not construed that the College is promoting the use of alcohol.

Council approved the Alcohol Policy 2014, subject to the minor re-wording of the objective related to low-risk drinking.

CL/14-15/057 Any Other Urgent Business

The Secretary to the College drew Council's attention to the tabled memorandum concerning the General Procedure and Protocol for the Approval and Recruitment of Professors, dated 19 November 2014. He noted that revised procedures were approved by Council in October 2013 (CL/13-14/010), however, these would have to be amended slightly to ensure that they are fully consistent with the Consolidated College Statutes 2010 in terms of Council's role in the process. Council noted and approved the proposed amendment.

Council noted the tabled memorandum under CL/14-15/070 concerning the nominations to professorial appointments.

SECTION B

CL/14-15/058 Graduate Studies Committee

The Dean of Graduate Studies drew Council's attention to the positive discussion at the Graduate Studies Committee (GSC) regarding the provision of feedback to students, however, she conveyed some concerns regarding the tight timeline, especially where schools are reliant on professionals to teach and assess students; the consensus view from the committee was that a period of 20-30 days was more realistic. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that the policy sets out the ideal timeline for students to receive feedback and endorses students' entitlement to know when they can expect to have course work returned. The policy already provides for situations where the provision of feedback may take longer than 20 days provided that students are informed of this in advance.

Council noted that the proposed timeline suggested by the GSC was within the existing parameters of the College Policy on the Return of Coursework and that the provision of feedback to students should not exceed 30 days.

The draft minutes of 30 October 2014 were noted and approved.

CL/14-15/059 International Committee

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 9 October 2014.

CL/14-15/060 Quality Committee

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 30 October 2014.

CL/14-15/061 Student Life Committee

The Dean of Students noted a correction in relation the designation of Ms M Lee which should read as President of the Graduate Students' Union rather than Vice-President.

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 16 September 2014.

CL/14-15/062 Undergraduate Studies Committee

The Dean of Undergraduate Studies highlighted the discussion in relation to the Foundation Scholarship and noted that some courses would introduce a separate general paper whereas others, being joint honors or multi discipline, would introduce compulsory general sections to existing papers. She also drew Council's attention to the recommendation from the Central Scholarship Committee, which was supported by the Undergraduate Studies Committee, that in order to be eligible for Scholarship, candidates must, in addition to achieving an overall first class result with a majority papers gaining marks in the first class range, achieve no lower than 65% in any paper. It was proposed that this criterion be implemented from the 2015/16 academic year onwards, along with the widespread introduction of general papers/sections. In response to a question, she confirmed that if this rule had been applied to the Scholarship examination in 2014, 71 out of the 100 elected scholars would have been eligible.

Council noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 28 October 2014.

SECTION C

CL/14-15/063 Membership of Council – University Senate

The Council noted that Professor Deborah Kelleher, Director of the Royal Irish Academy of Music, had been elected as the representative of the University Senate on Council for 2014-2016.

CL/14-15/064 Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners

The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 22 October 2014 and noted by Board on 5 November 2014, as circulated:

(i) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

MD Mairead Mary Bartley.

DChDent Eimear Ellen Mc Hugh; Marie O'Neill.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

(ii) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

PhD John Tavershima Agberagba; Jan Ćurn; Jenny Deakin; Erin Deyoung; David Brendan Donoghue; Ciara Fahey; Jonathan Hodgers; Patrick Kelly; Finn Lawler; Killian Louis Richard Levacher; Luca Longo; James Alexander Mc Elvaney; Stuart Alexander MacGowan; Joanne Mac Mahon; Keith Mc Mahon; Fergal Rory Maguire; Dan Marinescu; Mary Mooney; David Morgan; Omar Mothersill; Alison Murphy; Neasa Ni Chiaran; Susan Ni Chuileann; Rachel O'Dwyer; Maria Jolanta O'Reilly; Miriam Pauline O'Shea; Susan Quinn; Orla Rawley; Ilana Rozanes; Itunu Senami Oluwabukunola Soyingbe; Tat Chee Tsui; Teresa Tuohy; Lankani Priyangika Wijesinghe.

MSc Tahmineh Esfandani; Emer Emily Neenan; Aoife O'Rourke.

Professor J P Spiers withdrew for this item

CL/14-15/065 Junior Academic Progression Committee – Membership

The Council noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 11 November 2014, and approved the addition of Professor P Spiers to the membership set out below. The Council noted that in the context of the development of a tenure track system, current progressions processes will be considered, including the composition and role to the committee, which will be brought forward to Council in due course:

Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer *Chair*

Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies

Dean of Graduate Studies

Council representatives 2014-2015

Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences: Professor M Ó Siochrú

Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science: Professor P Murphy

Faculty of Health Sciences: Professor J P Spiers

NFSA/ASA appointees:

Professor C Laudet

Professor D Connolly

Professor A Loxley

The Manager, Staff Performance and Review (Ms L Power) (*in attendance*)

CL/14-15/066 Senior Academic Promotions Policy

The Council noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Interim Director of Human Resources, circulated, dated 10 November 2014 and approved the following amendments to the procedures:

- (i) Appendix 1 – Application for promotion to Professor (Personal Chair): insert the following, under the section entitled 'Criteria':

'● A *prima facie* case must be established before someone is shortlisted for interview.'

- (ii) Senior Academic Promotions Policy – Appendix 3 – Application for Associate Professor and Accelerated Advancement: insert the following:

'If applying for Associate Professor you must have proceeded over the Merit Bar on the Assistant Professor scale.'

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings

CL/14-15/067 School of Medicine

(i) **Anatomy – Head of Discipline**

The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor Nicholas Mahony as Head of Discipline for three years until 4 November 2017;

(ii) **Clinical Medicine – St James’s Hospital Campus – Interim Headship**

The Council noted and approved the nomination of Professor Nasir Mahmud as Interim Head for one year from 1 October 2014;

CL/14-15/068 Title – Personal Chair - Professor of Translational Immunology

The Council noted a memorandum from the Administrative Manager, School of Medicine, circulated, dated 10 November 2014 and approved the title of Professor Padraic Fallon to be ‘Professor of Translational Immunology’.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted

Signed

Date