

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

A meeting of the University Council was held on Wednesday 18 May 2011 at 11.15 am in the Board Room.

<i>Present</i>	Provost, Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Senior Lecturer, Senior Tutor, Dean of Graduate Studies, Dean of Research, Acting-Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences (Professor H Biehler), Dr M Ó Siochrú, Dean of Engineering, Mathematics and Science, Professor G Watson, Dr A McNabola, Dean of Health Sciences, Dr D Brennan, Professor M McCarron, Professor M Radomski, Dr H Mannan, Mr S Gannon, Professor G Whyte, Ms Cameron-Coen, Ms E Hennessy.
<i>Apologies</i>	Registrar, Dr E O'Dell, Professor J Wickham, Dr Z Rodgers, Dr D O'Donovan, Dr J P Labrador, Dr A O'Gara, Ms J Fox, Ms M Collins, Mr R Bartlett, Ms C Keating, Ms L Quigley (GSU), Secretary to the Scholars (Mr B Roantree).
<i>In attendance</i>	Librarian, Secretary to the College, Academic Secretary, Chief Operating Officer, Head of Central Academic Administration Services.

SECTION A

CL/10-11/157 Minutes of the meeting of the April 20, 2011 were approved and signed.

CL/10-11/158 Matters Arising: There were no matters arising.

CL/10-11/159 Provost's Report

- (i) *Royal Visit*: The Provost reported that the visit of Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II and His Royal Highness the Duke of Edinburgh on Tuesday, May 17th, 2011 had been a hugely significant and historic day for the College. The Provost hosted a reception in Trinity's Long Room where Ireland's wealth of talent in all aspects of research and education at both Trinity College Dublin and the wider university sector in Ireland, as well as in culture and the arts, and innovation and entrepreneurship were represented.

The Queen meet with members of Trinity's staff, students and academic community along with representatives from the sciences, medicine, arts, humanities and culture from both Trinity College and the wider university sector in Ireland, as well as those from leading Irish institutions and society.

The groups highlighted areas in which Ireland excels: biological and life sciences; music and visual arts; literature and theatre; history and culture; physical sciences; environment and energy; medicine; politics and society.

They were joined by representatives from the higher education sector; student body as well as the local community in the environs of Trinity College in Dublin.

The Provost paid tribute to everyone involved in ensuring the great success of the occasion, and in particular to Mr Noel McCann for his organisation of security for the visit.

- (ii) *Meeting of Heads of Universities with Minister for Education & Skills:* The Provost invited the Vice-Provost to report on the recent meeting held with the Minister, the employment control framework (ECF) being the main agenda item. While the Minister advised that he would express his intentions for third level education at an RIA (Royal Irish Academy) event on May 30<sup>th</sup> 2011, negotiations were going reasonably well regarding an alternative ECF. However, the Minister had cautioned that the final outcome would involve discussions with the Department of Finance and the Department of the Taoiseach, and that all the changes sought by the sector may not be realised. On a separate matter, the Minister expressed his desire to reform the junior and leaving certificate examinations and advised that he would be seeking the views of the universities in this regard. Council noted that it was expected that the issue of the ECF would be an agenda item at its next meeting.

#### **CL/10-11/160 Fitness to Practise**

A memorandum dated May 11, 2011 together the Fitness to Practise Policy incorporating proposed amendments had been circulated. In introducing this item, the Senior Lecturer advised Council that in April 2009 Board had approved a policy with regard to fitness to practice including provision for annual review. Following review by the Dean of Students of decisions made by School level Fitness to Practise Committees during the past year, it was proposed to amend the policy in order to (i) clarify requirements for principles of fair procedures in proceedings before School Fitness to Practise Committees; (ii) prescribe the procedures for taking an appeal to the College Fitness to Practise Committee (iii) amend the power to suspend provided for in the procedures so that it applies to placements only and not to suspension from College generally, (iv) empower School Fitness to Practise Committees to deal with some Fitness to Practise cases by requiring the student to complete a prescribed academic exercise in accordance with provisions of Schedule 3 to the Chapter on Student Conduct in the Consolidated Statutes.

In discussion it was noted that the definition of disability in the paper was taken directly from disability legislation approved by the Oireachtas. Council approved the recommendations as outlined subject to the inclusion of timeframes on notice required to be given to all parties in a case, and the provision of an accompanying diagram presenting a schematic representation of the process.

#### **CL/10-11/161 Dean of Research Annual Report**

The Annual Report 2009/10 by the Dean of Research had been circulated. The Dean of Research introduced this item noting it was the second such report, and was

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

structured along the research life cycle moving from applications, through success rates to contracts and outputs - both academic and commercial. There were extensive data presented in the document which served to illustrate the breadth and depth of the College's funded research activities. The composition, funding and function of the components of the Trinity Research & Innovation Unit were presented. It was clear that the majority of TCD's research support activities were funded from indirect costs arising from the research carried out within the institution itself.

The Dean highlighted key recommendations for improving the success rate of research applications and to streamline the process within College.

He drew attention to the detailed information on individual sponsor programmes and applications noting circa 1,200 applications for funded research annually (requesting circa €300m in funds) and the application processes (particularly those of exchequer funding agencies) had increased in complexity in terms of varied funding streams. Council noted the doubling of European Union Seventh Framework Programme (FP7) participation, which was on a trajectory to a more sustainable, diversified research funding base. College's overall success rates in EU funding were also noted. With regard to participation and success rates per school per scheme for all major funders during the period, the Dean invited Council members to examine those of interest to their own academic area - the report provided a context for both the quantum of funding available and an overview of the funding landscape within which each scheme operated.

The Dean drew attention to the activities of the contracts section, noting that this remained an area of significant risk for College due to staffing levels vis-à-vis the volume of complex work being processed by the office which had more than doubled, with only a 30% increase in fiscal value to College. The report detailed the stark fall-off in contract value which manifested in 2009/10, although steps were being taken to ameliorate the situation at a national policy level through government engagement and through increased targeting of non-exchequer funds. Referring to the output arising from research in the College and the limitations of what is actually recorded and measured, the Dean noted that the College's Research Support System (RSS) remained the most comprehensive source of data for TCD research outputs and the only source of data on TCD books and book chapters.

The Dean drew attention to the details presented in respect of the entrepreneurship & technology transfer activities for the year. Council noted the impact of the newly implemented campus company formation framework in accelerating the rate of start-up ventures from College in this period. In conclusion, the Dean noted that the College was still performing well, particularly given the constraints under which it now operates.

Council welcomed the report and congratulated the Dean of Research and staff in the Research and Innovation Office for their achievements in 2009-10. There was considerable discussion on several aspects of the report, including funding trends, future direction and strategy, the difficulties in measuring research output in the Arts and Humanities disciplines, research impact, citations, and league tables. It was suggested that the report did not do justice to the high quality of research in Arts and Humanities and that it gives the impression that Trinity's strength is largely in the Science areas. Referring to these concerns, the Dean commented that currently the Research Support System (RSS) was being developed to capture information on

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

research outputs which are currently not adequately captured. It was suggested that the THES (Times Higher Education Supplement) rankings for individual disciplines should be included in the report. The Vice-Provost, in response to a suggestion that the quality review of Schools should also assess research output, noted that this was difficult as reviewers often complain that they do not have sufficient time to read and assess a School's research output. He suggested that further consideration be given as to how to best assess research output for the Arts and Humanities and invited the Dean to address this at the Research Committee.

Council noted the Dean of Research's Annual Report 2009/10.

#### **CL/10-11/162 Review of Academic Year Structure**

A memorandum from the Vice-Provost / Chief Academic Officer dated May 11, 2011 had been circulated. The Vice-Provost advised Council that at its meeting of May 19, 2010, it had requested a review of the academic year structure (AYS) in 2010/11 following its substantial revision and implementation in 2009/10. Since the introduction of the new AYS, a number of Schools and the Students' Union had requested College to reconsider the policy that there would be no examination outside the annual examination period. College-wide consultation on the introduction of examinations at the end of Michaelmas term, and the placement of Study Week, commenced in February 2011. Initial discussions occurred at Undergraduate Schools Committee (USC) and the Graduate Studies Committee (GSC) following which comments were gathered and collated from School and Course offices. Early findings of the analysis were discussed by the Heads of School Committee, and final proposals brought back to USC and GSC. As the majority of Schools were not in favour of introducing examinations following the end of Michaelmas Term, both USC and GSC recommended that (i) the current academic year structure remain unchanged; (ii) School and Course Office be consulted on the maintenance on the third revision week in Trinity Term for 2010/11 only; (iii) provision of end of term assessment / class tests be further explored at a local level with those areas that have expressed a preference for this. As there had been no consensus on the scheduling of study week, the USC recommended its placement in both terms should remain as is.

In discussion, Council noted that the divergence of opinion on this matter reflected the divergence of activity across College, and noted that the requirement for a uniform structure was owing to students taking courses across Schools and Faculties. In response to a concern expressed that the consultation process was inadequate, the Vice-Provost commented that there was extensive consultation but that there was no consensus on a model that would fit all demands. The Provost noted that international developments in education are likely to compel Trinity College towards full semesterisation and modularisation in the future. It was noted, however, that stability was necessary for the coming two years, if the GeneSIS project is to be successfully implemented.

Council approved the proposals as presented to the meeting.

#### **CL/10-11/163 Graduate Studies Course Proposal - Postgraduate Diploma in Special Care Dentistry**

A memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies dated May 10, 2011 together with a course proposal leading to the award of Postgraduate Diploma in Special Care Dentistry from the School of Dental Science was circulated. The Dean of Graduate

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

Studies introduced this proposal noting that it was developed in response to an identified need for a course in which dentists could receive postgraduate training and a qualification to enhance the level of care provided to people with disabilities. The course had been designed to meet the wider patient and professional needs and would attract students from Ireland and the UK and fill an obvious gap in Irish postgraduate professional training and education; the course had received a very positive external assessment. The demand for the course was expected to be high and entry will be on a competitive basis. The course would be delivered on a part-time basis and would be of 18 months duration.

Council noted and approved the course proposals, leading to the award of Postgraduate Diploma in Special Care Dentistry.

#### CL/10-11/164 Quality Assurance

An implementation Plan for the School of Drama, Film and Music, dated April 14, 2011 had been circulated. The Pro-Dean of the Faculty of Arts Humanities & Social Sciences referring to the implementation plan noted that the School of Drama, Film and Music had sought to fully engage with the Reviewers' recommendations, however, the problem of contracting resources was posing a number of difficulties to their implementation. The School was building linkages with the creative arts and cultural institutions, but expressed concern about an over reliance on adjunct staff who could not wholly address the School's staffing requirements. With regard to the recommendation for a full-time school administrator, it was noted that a staffing submission had been made and was currently under consideration. Referring to the formulation of short-term strategies to address the lack of teaching resources, and a longer term accommodation plan, the Pro-Dean advised that while the School was keen to move to a single site in the long term, discussions were on-going regarding short-term solutions. While noting the significant contributions the School can make culturally and its creative approaches to-date, the Provost recognised the challenges of resource shortages. He advocated creative moves towards finding other avenues of funding, and highlighted the growing importance of engaging with practitioners in this regard.

In broader terms, it was noted that for Schools entering the cycle of reviews it was frustrating to be facing the same resource issues. It was suggested that consideration should be given to seeking creative thoughts and ideas of reviewers rather than recommendations for the allocation of unavailable resources.

Council noted the quality review implementation plan of the School of Drama, Film and Music.

#### CL/10-11/165 Any other urgent business

- (i) *Next meeting of Council:* Owing to the large volume of business expected to be considered at the last meeting of the Council for this academic year scheduled for the 15<sup>th</sup> June 2011, it was agreed to commence the meeting at the earlier time of 9.30 am.
- (ii) *ARAM results:* Council noted the concern expressed in relation to the recent ARAM data circulated to Schools portraying significant deficits in some areas

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Council meetings*

which had a highly negative impact on staff morale. Referring to the deficit the Vice-Provost stated that the data were reflective of reduced exchequer funding.

#### SECTION B

- CL/10-11/166** Graduate Studies Committee *draft* minutes of the meeting of May 5, 2011 as circulated were noted and approved by Council.
- CL/10-11/167** Undergraduate Studies Committee *draft* minutes of the meeting of April 19, 2011 were noted and approved by Council.
- CL/10-11/168** International Committee *draft* minutes of the meeting of April 7, 2011 were noted and approved by Council.
- CL/10-11/169** Research Committee draft minutes of the meeting of April 19, 2011 circulated were noted and approved by Council. The Dean of Research drew Council's attention to the change of policy in order to broaden participation in research funding (Actum RS/10-11/46). It was proposed that any member of staff could apply for / hold grants where the funding of salary was included and grants were cost neutral to College. The proposed policy would be forwarded to the Staff Office and the Finance Committee for comment on its implementation.

#### SECTION C

- CL/10-11/170** Schedule of Board and Council Meetings 2011-2012  
The Council noted a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 27 April 2011.
- CL/10-11/171** Higher Degrees—Reports of Examiners  
The Council noted and approved the reports of examiners on candidates for higher degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 30 March 2011, 1 April 2011 and 20 April 2011 and noted by Board on 5 May 2011:
- (i) 30 March 2011
    - (a) Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone
      - MD Alexandra Dudina; Charles Martin Gillham.
    - (b) Higher Degrees by Research Alone
      - PhD Franklyn Burke; Darren Caulfield; Federica De Sisto; Rachael Louise Fionda; Katherine Gitanjali Godinho; Sophie Joerg;

Iratxe Mijangos; Julian Perez Alzueta; David Patrick Power;  
Ronan Shaughnessy; Marcus Cheng Chye Tan; Orla Woods.

**MLitt** Nicholas Vincent.

(ii) **1 April 2011**

(a) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**MD** Charles Murphy.

(b) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**PhD** Daniel Adjei-Boateng; Andrew Barry; Sergio Di Bari; Edward Anthony Flood; Andrew Galbraith; Gerard Patrick Noonan; Aoife O'Halloran; Valerie Smith; Ronan Watson; Bridget McNally; Macdara O'Drisceoil; Liuz Felipe Cavalcanti Pereira; Julie Josephine Shearer; John Gerard Walsh; Karen Marguerite Anne Willoughby.

**MSc** Kylie L'Estrange.

(iii) **20 April 2011**

(a) **Professional Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**MD** Derek Hennessy.

(b) **Higher Degrees by Research Alone**

**PhD** Suzanne Martina Beggs; Arkaitz Bitorika; Anne-Marie Brady; Peter Byrne; John Patrick Cunniffe; Helder Cunha Pereira; Wellington Eniyoye Hudson; Raya Ali Kalaldehy; Nora Ellen Maguire; Claire Masterson; Niall McAlinden; Joseph McCarthy; David Mark McFadden; Mary Ida Milne; Elena Moore; Manuel Natali; Caroline O'Nolan; Iwona Pomianowska; David Rickard; Carmel Alice Anne Smith; Emma Williams,

**MSc** Níamh Sian Murphy.

**CL/10-11/172 School Directors 2011-2013**

The Council noted and approved the nominations of the following:

(i) **School of Education**

- (a) Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Dr M Shevlin;
- (b) Director of Teaching and Learning (Postgraduate): Dr C McGuckin.

(ii) **School of Linguistic, Speech & Communication Sciences**

- (a) Director of Teaching and Learning (Undergraduate): Dr P Sloane, first term beginning 13th July 2011;
- (b) Director of Research: Professor A N M Ní Chasaide, second term beginning 13th July 2011.

**CL/10-11/173 Heads of Discipline (2011-14)**

The Council noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) Centre for Language and Communication Studies Dr J Harris;
- (ii) Clinical Speech and Language Studies Dr M M Smith.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed .....

Date .....