



Trinity College Dublin

Coláiste na Tríonóide, Baile Átha Cliath

The University of Dublin

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Board Meeting 24 May 2023

This meeting was held in the Trinity Board Room

Present: Provost (Dr L Doyle), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor O Sheils), Registrar (Professor N Cox), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor D Shepherd), Professor K Ahmad, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor I Arnedillo Sánchez, Professor S Browne, Mr K Byrne, Professor N Campbell, Ms Z Cummins, Mr P Farrell, Ms G Fullam, Mr D Grouse, Professor D Jones, Professor R Kenny, Professor C Leahy, Professor A Nolan, Mr M Murtagh-White, Professor F Sheerin, Ms C Staunton, Professor J Walsh.

Apologies: Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor E Denny), Professor L Brennan, Ms R Mathews McKay, Professor R McManus, Professor L Roe, Vice-President for Global Engagement (Professor E Stokes).

In attendance: Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).

(ex officio) Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).

(by invitation) Chief Operating Officer (Ms O Cunningham).

The Provost, on behalf of the Board, extended congratulations to Chloe Staunton on her new employment and as this was Ms Staunton's last Board meeting thanked her for her service on the Board.

SECTION A

BD/22-23/245 Statements of Interest

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from Professor Sheerin in relation to agenda item C.21 Heads of School. It was proposed and it was agreed, with the agreement of Professor Sheerin, that he would not be present in the meeting for that item.

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from Professor Nolan in relation to agenda item A.4 Institutional Athena Swan Silver Submission 2023. The Secretary to the College, having discussed the matter with Professor Nolan, proposed and it was agreed, that she would not be present in the meeting for that item.

He noted that he had also received a second statement of potential conflict of interest from Professor Nolan in respect of agenda item A6(ii) External Board Member-Ministerial Nominee. The Secretary to the College, having discussed the matter with Professor Nolan, proposed and it was agreed, that she would not be present in the meeting for that item.

The Provost advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from the Secretary to the College and the Assistant Secretary in relation to Agenda item D.29 Revised Interview Panel-Secretary to the College/Director of Governance. Having discussed the

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

matter with the Secretary to the College and the Assistant Secretary, the Provost proposed, and it was agreed, that they both would leave the meeting for the discussion on this item.

BD/22-23/246 Minutes

(i) Draft minutes of the meeting of 24 April 2023 (Trinity Monday)

The Board approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 24 April 2023 (Trinity Monday).

(ii) Draft Minutes of the Meeting 26 April 2023

The Board approved the draft minutes of the meeting 26 April 2023 subject to the 2 amendments which had been circulated in advance.

BD/22-23/247 Matters Arising

The following items were raised under matters arising:

(i) BD/22-23/220 Annual HR Metrics Report

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that following liaison with Human Resources the Annual HR Metrics Report had been amended in light of the discussion on the Report at the previous Board meeting and that the Revised report would be circulated to Board members.

(ii) BD/22-23/224 Board Composition and Governance

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that it was likely that the provisional meeting of the Board scheduled for 28 June 2023 would be required and asked that Board members continue to hold this date in their diaries.

Professor Arnedillo Sánchez joined the meeting at this point.

(iii) BD/22-23/224 (iii) Board Composition and Governance Update

The Secretary to the College advised Board members that the revised membership and Terms of Reference for the Nominations Committee had been approved by the Board on 4 May 2023 through electronic means and was on the agenda for noting in Section C.

BD/22-23/248 Strategic Capital Projects Update

The Chief Operating Officer provided the Board with a verbal update in relation to the on-going strategic capital projects noting that a detailed update on the E3 Learning Foundry and Old Library Redevelopment Project would be provided at the next meeting of the Board.

A Board member expressed their concern in respect of possible rising costs and potential delays to the Old Library Redevelopment Project which was noted by the Board.

Action/Decision

248.01 The Board noted the Dashboard as presented and received the verbal update from the Chief Operating Officer.

BD/22-23/249 Board Composition and Governance Update

This item was taken at this point in the meeting.

(i) Update

The Secretary to the College provided the Board with an update on this item noting that every effort is being made to secure Ministerial approval as soon as possible on the regulations and process relating to the selection, election, nomination or appointment of members of the Board. He advised the Board that he, the Registrar and the Assistant Secretary had meet with officials from the Department to progress the matter and had submitted a response to queries and comments which had been received from the Department.

The Secretary to the College advised that in the meantime some preparatory work was being conducted in respect of the communications to be issued, the development of an online portal for nominees to self-assess against the criteria specified in the Skills and Experience Matrix in addition to

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

agreeing an approach where potential candidates would be invited in to meet with a subset of the Nominations Committee.

He concluded by noting that if the process could commence in the near future, it may be feasible to bring proposals in respect of external members to the meeting scheduled for 28 June 2023.

In response to a query regarding nominations submitted directly by Board members to the Secretary's Office, the Secretary to the College confirmed that those submitting such proposals would be informed of the process required to ensure that their nominations were brought to the attention of the Nominations Committee.

Responding to a query from a Board member in respect of the timeline for identifying external members of the Board, the Secretary to the College advised that once approval of the regulations and process by the Minister is received it is anticipated that the process will run in a timely and smooth manner.

Action/Decision

249.01 The Board received the verbal update from the Secretary to the College

(ii) External Board Member - Ministerial Nominee.

Professor Nolan left the meeting for this item

The Secretary to the College, noting that there are to be 3 Ministerial nominees on the incoming Board, advised the Board that, at the request of the Provost, he had discussed the matter of her Board membership with Professor Nolan, who has advised that she would be willing to continue to serve on the Board should that be the decision of the Minister.

He noted that given this the Provost, in her capacity as Chair of the Board, proposes to write to the Minister to advise him that Professor Nolan has served 3 of the 4 years of her first term on the Board and that the Board would welcome the opportunity for Professor Nolan to serve the remainder of that term, should that be the Minister's decision.

Professor Walsh joined the meeting at this point.

The Provost advised the Board that in addition to suggesting that Professor Nolan might continue on the Board as a nominee of the Minister there may be an opportunity at a future date to suggest other suitable candidates for the Minister's consideration in relation to the Ministerial nominations. In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the timing for contacting the Minister in this regard, the Secretary to the College advised the Board that it was understood that the Department would be open to Trinity taking this step.

Action/Decision

249.02 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 22 May 2023.

BD/22-23/250 Institutional Athena Swan Silver Submission 2023

Professor Lorraine Leeson, Associate Vice-Provost for Equality, Diversity and Inclusion, and Dr Siobán O'Brien Green, Acting Equality Officer, joined the meeting for this item and Professor Nolan was not present in the meeting for this item.

Professor Leeson invited the Board's attention to a presentation dated 24 May 2023 which had been circulated in advance. She provided the Board with a summary of the new Athena Swan Ireland Charter requirements noting that having this award is a requirement in respect of research funding.

Professor Leeson advised the Board that there is a requirement to present evidence-driven actions that will be worked on over the coming four years. This information was contained in the text of the submission and, in more detail, in the Action Plan, where milestones and outcomes are indicated, along

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

with owners for each item.

She advised the Board of demonstrable achievements noting that as of last week the University had 18 Athena Swan Bronze Awards across the Schools and she also commended the recent launch of the 4 female sculptures in the Long Room of the Old Library. She also informed the Board that Trinity had been awarded an EU Sustainable Gender Equality Champion Award presented by EU Commissioner for Innovation, Research, Culture, Youth & Sport, Mariya Gabriel, on 8 March 2023.

A Board member voiced their concern with the submission particularly as a promotions process for professional staff had not yet been implemented and they noted the distinction between open competition and promotion processes. Professor Leeson acknowledged that while recognition and reward for staff was a criteria under the Athena Swan Charter there were a myriad of things that could be done during the four year Action Plan and offered to meet the Board member to discuss the matter further.

Responding to comments to Board members in respect of consultation with staff representative bodies and key stakeholders, Professor Leeson clarified that contributions and feedback are always welcome and that a meeting with the staff representatives had been sought and a meeting with union representatives had taken place with Dr O'Brien green, the Chief Operating Officer advised that there is to be a meeting in advance of the deadline for submission.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of postgraduate students and research staff Dr O'Brien Green acknowledged that there are further actions to be considered in respect of these cohorts which are usually addressed in School level Athena Swan Applications and it was noted that careful consideration should be given to the terminology and data reports used for such cohorts.

Several Board members welcomed the submission and thanked all involved in gathering the extensive data and for preparing the submission. Following comments from a Board member, it was acknowledged that gathering data across all grades of staff would be useful and that insofar as we currently have relevant data, this is included in the application and serves as our initial benchmarking in this initial submission under the new Charter, which asks us to report on all staff for the first time.

A Board member paid tribute to Professor Eileen Drew and Professor Margaret Fine-Davis who had in previous years contributed to EDI initiatives across the University. In addition, the Board member noted the importance of ensuring balance in any approaches to be taken, of promoting competency and merit and of ensuring that any initiatives are appropriately resourced.

A Board member, congratulating all involved for the work on the submission to date, provided some examples of potential ways to further support female staff on campus including increasing childcare facilities and potential discounts for summer camps. In addition, the Board member also suggested that further consideration could be given to supports for staff members with caring responsibilities for parents.

Responding to a query from a Board member Professor Leeson advised the Board of the current staff resource in the EDI Office and a second Board member noted the importance of people having enough time and energy to commit to projects in a meaningful way.

In response to comments from Board members, the importance of ensuring a balanced approach and gender equality for all genders was acknowledged and a Board member suggested that a review of the Dignity and Respect Policy would be beneficial.

Following comments from Board members it was acknowledged that further consideration could be given to having more structured approaches to consultation processes. It was noted that the draft submission had also been considered by the Human Resources Committee and that there had been an all-staff survey conducted.

In response to a query from a Board member, Professor Leeson clarified that the deadline for

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

submission of the application was 16 June 2023 noting that there was still some work to do to reduce the text to meet the required word count but that all feedback was welcomed.

It was noted that a follow-on meeting with the group of unions would be scheduled prior to the submission of the application.

Action/Decision

250.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Associate Vice-Provost for Equality, Diversity and Inclusion and the Acting Equality Officer dated 17 May 2023 and the accompanying Athena Swan Silver Application Submission and Action Plan.

Professor Leeson and Dr O'Brien Green left the meeting at this point and Professor Nolan re-joined the meeting.

BD/22-23/251 Student Fees for Annual/Single Year Students Financial Year 2024/25

Mr Paul Coote, Project Appraisal Manager, Ms Jillian Heery, Financial Operations Manager, and Professor Catherine McCabe, Dean of Students, joined the meeting for this item.

Mr Coote, with reference to a memorandum and presentation from himself, the Dean of Students and the Financial Operations Officer, FSD, provided the Board with the context for the proposal which was before the Board for approval.

He advised the Board that there had been consultation with the Students' Union President and the new Postgraduate representative to Board where the cost of living, high accommodation costs and other challenges faced by students at this time were highlighted. In addition there had been discussion with the Global Engagement team where the importance of continuing to remain attractive for international students to ensure the growth in student numbers remains in line with the Strategic Plan had been acknowledged.

Mr Coote concluded by advising the Board that the recommendation to the Board was to approve Scenario 1 which would result in a 2.33% increase in fees in Financial Year 2024/25 in line with fee certainty for multi-annual students and he noted that the recommendation had been considered and approved by the Planning Group, the Executive Officers' Group and the Finance Committee

Responding to a query from a Board member who noted the current rate of inflation, Mr Coote clarified that a fee increase higher than what was proposed could result in the loss of students pursuing courses in the University and so a balanced approach was suggested.

Several Board members expressed their support for the proposal noting the importance of ensuring some courses remain attractive. In addition, it was noted that further consideration should be given to how best to continue to attract students to the University.

In response to a query for a Board member, Mr Coote advised that the potential to seek derogations remains and that any potential derogations from the proposal could be considered by the Finance Committee.

Some Board members expressed their concerns in respect of the proposal noting limitations on staff available to meet the needs of the growing student population in addition to the continued lack of a sufficient level of Government funding.

Responding to a query from a Board member, Mr Coote clarified the proposed increase will help meet some of the rising operational costs and noting that the proposal represented a fair and balanced approach.

Action/Decision

251.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Project Appraisal Manager and the Financial Operations Manager dated 16 May 2023.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The dissent of Professor Ahmad and Professor Alyn Stacey was noted.

BD/22-23/252 Proposed Changes to the 2010 Consolidated Statutes

The Registrar with reference to his memorandum dated 17 May 2023, which had been circulated in advance, advised the Board that following discussions with the Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science a number of amendments to the Statutes were now proposed.

The Registrar provided the Board with a summary of the proposed amendments to the Statutes, providing an explanation for each and noting that in the majority amendments to the Schedules were proposed. However, he noted that there were some minor amendments to the Chapter on Board which would require the assent of the Fellows and the approval of the Visitors. A timeline in respect of this assent process was contained in Section C of the agenda for the meeting.

Responding to comments from a Board member in respect of the role of the Department and Minister in approving the Trinity regulations, the Registrar clarified that the proposed amendments were to further ensure that the Statutes accurately reflect the provisions of the Higher Education Authority Act, 2022. He noted that discussions were on-going with the Department in respect of any other outstanding matters.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Registrar clarified that the Minister must approve the regulations and process by which individuals are appointed to the Board rather than the potential candidates themselves.

Responding to a query from a Board member, the Registrar also clarified that any co-option to the Board would follow the practice to date whereby Board members are co-opted from the relevant constituency to fill any vacancies that arise.

Action Decision

252.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 17 May 2023 with the proposed amendment to the Statutes including the provision that the regulations may only be amended in accordance with the law.

The dissent of Professor Alyn Stacey was noted.

BD/22-23/253 Seanad Éireann University of Dublin Constituency

This Secretary to the College introduced the item with reference to a memorandum from himself and the Registrar dated 17 April 2023. He provided the Board with an update in light of a recent Supreme Court judgement and outlined the current Trinity position in respect of seats in the Seanad. The Secretary to the College noted the submission to the Government Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government made on behalf of the Board of Trinity, in April 2014. He concluded by outlining an alternative proposal which, in light of the ruling, and given the tight timeline to legislate, would also provide a way forward at this time.

A Board member welcomed the proposals noting that in the future there may be a review of the panels of the Seanad.

A Board member noted the benefits of having representation in the Seanad and welcomed the possibility of exploring how the allocation of seats could be done so in a more equitable way across the 3rd -Level Education Sector.

Following comments from Board members, the Provost suggested, and it was agreed that the proposals be forwarded to the Minister for Housing, Local Government and Heritage.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Registrar clarified that he intended to bring this item to the attention of the Fellows at a scheduled meeting of the Fellows' due to take place the next

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

day.

Action Decision

253.01 The Board noted and discussed the memorandum from the Secretary to the College and the Registrar dated 17 April 2023.

BD/22-23/254 Honorary Degrees

(i) Nominations

The Registrar introduced this item with reference to his memorandum dated 19 May 2023 which had been tabled providing an overview of the nominations contained within.

Action/Decision

254.01 The Board approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 19 May 2023.

(ii) Revised Processes for Honorary Degrees

The Registrar introduced this item with reference to his memorandum dated 19 May 2023 which had been circulated in advance noting the importance of empowering the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees to continue to follow a rigorous process and to exercise due diligence in respect of potential nominations.

A number of Board members welcomed the proposals. In response to comments from a Board member, the role of the Board in overseeing the process was noted and the Registrar clarified that the Board should have confidence that a good process has been followed when bringing nominations forward.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of student membership on the Advisory Committee, the Registrar agreed to follow up directly with the Board member on this matter.

The importance of the confidentiality of the Honorary Degree nominations process was noted.

Action/Decision

254.02 The Board noted and discussed the memorandum from the Registrar dated 19 May 2023.

BD/22-23/255 University Council

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 10 May 2023.

In response to a queries and comments from Board members in respect of the development of a proposal to realise the vision that all undergraduate students will engage with climate action/justice issues within and beyond their discipline, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies clarified that the proposal is expected to be available by the end of the calendar year. Responding to a further query from a Board member in respect of staff representation on the Working Group developing this proposal, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate agreed to follow up with the Board member separately on this matter as it is envisaged there will be a wide-reaching consultation process on the proposal.

In response to a query from a Board member regarding alternative entry routes for students from Northern Ireland the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies and the Vice-President for Global Engagement were actively considering proposals.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, responding to queries from Board members, outlined the process for the review of the Senior Academic Promotions Process whereby Heads of School had been asked to nominate 4 colleagues from across the academic grades to attend workshops in early June. She advised the Board that Professor Bert Overlaet, former Director of Human Resources at KU Lueven had agreed to conduct the review on Trinity's behalf. It was also noted that the Senior Dean was conducting a review of promotions processes in similar universities to inform the discussions.

The Provost concluded the item by advising Board members that they are welcome to contact the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer directly to discuss the review process and express any concerns they may have.

BD/22-23/256 Provost's Report

Due to the full meeting agenda and to ensure time sensitive matters were discussed, there was no report from the Provost on this occasion.

BD/22-23/257 Any Other Urgent Business

The following items were raised under any other urgent business:

(i) Pride Flag

The Provost sought the approval of the Board for the Pride Flag to be flown for Pride month this year and in all future years. The Board approved this request.

(ii) Leaving Certificate Results

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that she had been notified that the Leaving Certificate results are to be issued on 25 August 2023.

SECTION A.2

BD/22-23/258 Changes to the Procedures for Progression within Assistant Professor Grade

This item was deferred to the next meeting of the Board.

BD?22-23/259 Updated Vetting/Foreign Police Certification Policy for Staff

This item was deferred to the next meeting of the Board.

SECTION B

BD/22-23/260 Board Business

(i) Callover

The Board noted the callover updated to 26 April 2023.

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board outcomes from the meeting of 26 April 2023.

BD/22-23/261 Equality Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the following meetings:

(i) 22 February 2023

(ii) 12 April 2023.

The Registrar, responding to a comment from a Board member, agreed to follow-up in relation to student membership of the committee.

BD/22-23/262 Finance Committee

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the meeting of 4 May 2023.

BD/22-23/263 Quality Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of minutes of the meeting of 20 April 2023.

SECTION C

BD/22-23/264 Board Business Approved by Written Procedure

The Board noted that the memorandum from the Registrar, dated 28 April 2023 was approved by Board on 4 May 2023.

BD/22-23/265 Timeline for Assent of the Fellows

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 22 May 2023.

Professor Sheerin left the meeting for the following item.

BD/22-23/266 Heads of School

The Board noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) Professor Jonathan Coleman as Head of School of Physics for a second term to the end of Trinity term 2025.
- (ii) Professor Fintan Sheerin as Head of School of Nursing and Midwifery for a second term to the end of the academic year 2025/26.

BD/22-23/267 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by Council on 10 May 2023.

BD/22-23/268 Draft Almanack 2023-2024

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Editor of the University Calendar dated 16 May 2023.

BD/22-23/269 Prizes and Other Awards

(i) Gold Medals

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduates Studies dated 11 May 2023.

(ii) Establishment of the Mary Carson Book Prize in Chemistry

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Head of School of Chemistry dated 5 May 2023.

BD/22-23/270 Borrowing Framework and Loan Guarantees

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Project Appraisal Manager and the Treasury Accountant dated 16 May 2023.

BD/22-23/271 Related Entity Financial Reporting

The Board noted the memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 16 May 2023.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: