



Trinity College Dublin

Coláiste na Tríonóide, Baile Átha Cliath

The University of Dublin

Board Meeting 22 February 2023

This meeting was held in the Trinity Board Room

- Present:** Provost (Dr L Doyle), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor O Sheils), Registrar (Professor N Cox), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor D Shepherd), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor E Denny), Professor K Ahmad, Professor I Arnedillo Sánchez, Professor L Brennan, Professor S Browne, Mr K Byrne, Professor N Campbell, Mr P Farrell, Ms G Fullam, Mr D Grouse, Professor D Jones, Professor C Leahy, Ms R Mathews-McKay, Prof R McManus, Mr Matt Murtagh-White, Professor A Nolan, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor F Sheerin, Ms C Staunton.
- Apologies:** Ms Z Cummins, Professor R Kenny, Professor L Roe, Professor J Walsh.
- In attendance:** Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
- (ex officio)** Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).
- (by invitation)** Chief Operating Officer (Ms O Cunningham), Vice-President for Global Engagement (Professor E Stokes).

SECTION A

BD/22-23/136 Board Membership – Postgraduate Student
This item was taken at this point in the meeting.

The Board noted and approved that Mr Matt Murtagh-White has been nominated following an election process to represent postgraduate students as a Board member for the remainder of 2022-23.

Mr Murtagh-White joined the meeting at this point.

BD/22-23/137 New Members Declaration
The Provost welcomed Mr Murtagh-White to the Board. At the invitation of the Provost, the incoming Board member made the declaration as required under the Consolidated Statutes 2010 and introduced themselves to the Board.

BD/22-23/138 Statements of Interest
The Provost advised the Board that a statement of potential conflict of interest had been received from the Secretary to the College and Assistant Secretary in relation to agenda item D.32 Position of Secretary to the College – Permission to Commence Recruitment Process. Having discussed the item with the Secretary to the College and with the Assistant Secretary, the Provost proposed, and it was agreed, that they both would leave the meeting for the discussion on this item.

Professor Arnedillo Sánchez joined the meeting at this point.

BD/22-23/139 Minutes of the Meeting 25 January 2023

The Board approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 25 January 2023.

BD/22-23/140 Matters Arising

There were no items was raised under matters arising:

Professor McManus joined the meeting at this point.

BD/22-23/141 Board Composition and Governance Update

The Registrar introduced the item with reference to a memorandum from himself and the Secretary to the College dated 14 February 2023, which had been circulated in advance.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Registrar clarified that it was agreed that should Board members have wished to have any of the proposed Statute amendments discussed at the meeting they were to contact the Registrar by 5pm on Monday 20 February identifying the relevant issue. He reminded the Board that due to the large number of proposed changes the discussion at the Board meeting needed to be focused and, as such, the various amendments were grouped under six headings and Board members would be asked to approve, in turn, all of the changes under each of the headings.

Responding to comments from a Board member, the Secretary to the College clarified the long-standing process by which Board members receive documents for meetings of the Board.

The Provost clarified that, following the detailed discussions at previous Board meetings and the special purpose Board Away Day on 9 February, it would not be practicable to propose further amendments at this stage and advised the Board that approval was sought to forward the proposed amendments to the Fellows for assent.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation joined the meeting at this point.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Registrar clarified the process for approval of amendments to the Chapters of the Statutes which require the approval of the Board, the assent of the Fellows and the approval of the Visitors.

Mr Byrne joined the meeting at this point.

The Registrar sought the approval of the Board to the proposed Statute amendments in groups as follows:

- Miscellaneous changes
- Role of the Visitors
- Composition of Board
- Election and appointment to Board
- Functions of Board
- Reform of Principal Committees of Board.

In respect of the proposed amendments relating to the composition of the Board, the Registrar advised the Board that the wording largely replicated the wording in the Higher Education Authority Act, 2022 and the Supplemental Charter of 2022 with an additional paragraph to facilitate the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer to be a member of Board as one of the 6 Fellow members, to which the Fellows will be asked to assent in a separate subsection.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Registrar clarified that should the Fellows not assent to the proposal in respect of the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer it would not preclude the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer from being in attendance at Board meetings. He asked the Board to

approve the proposal as presented which will give the Fellows an opportunity to either assent or not assent to the proposal. The Provost advised that the amendment was presented in this way in response to the request of Fellows made by the Standing Committee of Fellows to make it a separate point so there will be a clear way for Fellows to agree or disagree.

In response to comments from a Board member which had been raised in advance of the meeting, it was agreed that the staff members on the relevant committees would be staff members as nominated by the group of unions.

The Provost extended her thanks to Registrar and the Secretary to the College for their work on this item.

In response to queries from a Board member in respect of the new committee structures, the Provost clarified that the Chairperson of Board will nominate the Chairs of the relevant committees and noted that there is greater flexibility to further amend the Statutes in respect of the committees as the relevant provisions are contained in the Schedules which are subject to Board approval only.

Action/Decision

141.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar and the Secretary to the College dated 14 February 2023 and the accompanying amendments to the Statutes.

BD/22-23/142 Climate Action Roadmap

Professor Jane Stout, Vice-President for Biodiversity and Climate Action, and Mr Mike Clark, Director of Campus Infrastructure, joined the meeting for this item.

The Provost welcomed the visitors to the meeting. The Vice-President for Biodiversity and Climate Action advised the Board that Trinity, as a public body, is required, as part of the Government's Climate Action Plan 2021, to complete a Climate Action Roadmap. In the first Roadmap, to be completed by the end of Q1 2023, public bodies were requested to focus most attention on plans for reducing total energy related emissions and fossil fuel related emissions from operations, in line with the targets in the Climate Action Plan 2021. Professor Stout advised the Board that Trinity is motivated and ambitious in this regard but is constrained by resource availability and that meeting targets will require significant financial input and external assistance will be required.

Professor Stout provided the Board with an overview of the current governance of Climate Action in Trinity and also gave a summary of the 2030 targets. In addition she provided the Board with an overview of some of the sustainability achievements to date.

The Provost advised the Board that the University is required to submit the Roadmap to the Sustainable Energy Authority of Ireland (SEAI) and to continue to report ongoing progress. In tandem with this the University will gather further information to inform a wider Sustainability Strategy and will regularly update the Board on progress being made.

A Board member noted the formidable task ahead of the University and noted the significance and importance of the work to be done.

Following comments from Board members the importance of aligning the Sustainability Strategy with the immediate and long-term needs of the University was noted and it was acknowledged that careful decisions will need to be taken in light of existing strategic plans and commitments.

The Provost, responding to queries from a Board member clarified the role of the newly proposed Environment and Sustainability Committee noting that this principal committee will inform and advise the Board so that strategic and effective decisions can be made.

Professor Stout, responding to comments from Board members in respect of the targets set and carbon emissions, advised the Board that information gathering and carbon reporting is underway and that given financial resources are limited there will be a need for careful decision making and

prioritising in respect of sustainability initiatives actioned. She also noted that the Roadmap is focused on energy emissions and energy efficiencies but that Trinity's Sustainability (Biodiversity and Climate) Strategy and Action Plan will go beyond this.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of the modes of transport used by staff in the university to travel to and from work, it was noted that the overwhelming majority of staff avail of public transport.

Responding to a query from a Board member, the Provost clarified that the targets set in the Roadmap were targets for the whole of Trinity including all of the campus locations occupied by the University.

Responding to a query from a Board member in respect of car parking on campus, Mr Clark advised that a strategy in respect of car parking will be developed and the Provost noted that the University has flexibility to develop its own plan in this regard.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of staff resources, Mr Clark and the Chief Operating Officer advised that consideration is being given to the nature of some roles in Estates and Facilities with a view to increasing effectiveness and support for green initiatives.

Professor Stout and Mr Clark left the meeting at this point.

Action/Decision

142.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Vice-President for Biodiversity and Climate Action dated 15 February 2023 and the accompanying Climate Action Roadmap.

BD/22-23/143 Trinity Legacies Review Working Group (TLRWG)

This item was taken at this point in the meeting.

The Senior Dean and Chair of the Trinity Legacies Review Working Group, Professor Eoin O'Sullivan, joined the meeting for this item.

The Provost welcomed Professor O'Sullivan to the meeting and introduced the item noting that the role of the Trinity Legacies Review Working Group (TLRWG) is to document historical evidence on specific legacy issues, to seek evidence-based submissions from the College and wider community on each identified issue, and, based on the evidence collated, provide options for consideration to the relevant decision-making authority (College Board, Faculty Executive or School Executive) as is appropriate as determined by the working group. It was noted that the TLRWG reports directly to the Provost.

Professor O'Sullivan provided the historical context of the Inishbofin crania held by the College and advised the Board that following requests from the island community to repatriate the crania to the island, the TLRWG had conducted an evidence-based review, prepared and published a working paper and had received public submissions. In addition to his visit to Inishbofin to meet the community, consultation with the National Museum of Ireland had been held and it had been established that there was no specific restriction or legal impediment to the return of the crania.

Several Board members commended the contribution of the Senior Dean and members of the Working Group and welcomed the way in which the process had been conducted in particular the academic input and the high degree of sensitivity.

A Board member welcomed the proposal to return the crania to the Inishbofin community and the Senior Dean noted that this had been a request from the islanders themselves. The Senior Dean also advised that the working paper will be updated as appropriate and that much reflection will be given to the process in general so that it can inform future matters should they arise.

The Provost advised the Board that should the Board support the proposal as presented she will ask Professor O’Sullivan to issue a communication to the College and to further engage with the island community on this matter noting that the process by which the crania are returned should be informed by a constructive dialogue between the Inishbofin community and Trinity.

Responding to a query from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that the skulls would have facilitated and informed craniological studies and research.

A Board member welcomed the proposal and noted the significance of the return of the crania.

Action/Decision

143.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 21 February 2023 and the proposal as set out within.

The Senior Dean left the meeting at this point.

Ms Staunton left the meeting at this point.

BD/22-23/144 Strategic Capital Projects Dashboard

The Board noted the Dashboard as presented and received the verbal update from the Chief Operating Officer.

BD/22-23/145 E3 Learning Foundry Capital Project Update

Professor Gerard McHugh, Dean of Development and E3 Capital Programme Sponsor, Ms Edwina Hegarty, E3 Programme Manager, and Mr Greg Power, Head of Capital Projects and Planning, joined the meeting for this item.

The Provost welcomed Professor McHugh, Ms Hegarty and Mr Power to the meeting.

Professor McHugh introduced this item with reference to a presentation dated 14 February 2023 which had been circulated in advance. He provided the Board with an overview of the progress of the project to date noting that the basement structure of the building was complete, the nucleus area has progressed to level 2, and the steel frame structure to the wing area has progressed to level 3. Professor McHugh advised the Board that there was a delay to the timeline of the project as a result of a number of factors and that the team are concentrating efforts to minimise any further potential delays. In addition, Professor McHugh also provided the Board with an update in respect quality and the project budget.

The Provost thanked Professor McHugh and opened the item for questions and comments.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the delay potentially impacting on teaching and research for a particular Discipline, Professor McHugh advised the Board that the project team is working closely with the members of the Discipline to identify potential solutions and to minimise any disruption.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of the delay to the project, the Provost noted the complexities of the Public Procurement Framework with which the University was obliged to engage with. Mr Power advised the Board of other factors which were impacting on the project including significant supply chain issues arising from the war in Ukraine and the Pandemic but noted that it is envisaged that the project is approaching a point where any further potential slippage may be minimised.

Responding to a query from a Board member in respect of seeking amendments to the Framework, Mr Power advised that he has been actively engaged on behalf of the University on this matter including being a member on relevant external committees, making campaigns to seek amendments and seeking meetings with the Higher Education Authority to discuss the matter.

A Board member queried the potential financial implications for Schools arising from the delay in the

project and Professor McHugh clarified that the business case for the project will be carefully reviewed and monitored with input from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer and the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation.

Mr Power and Ms Hegarty provided some clarifications to a Board member in respect of the materials being used and the project budget.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of potential remedial works required for a particular School it was noted that should such works be required they will be conducted under a separate project.

In response to comments from a Board member, the role of the Independent Monitor was clarified and Mr Harmon's report was noted.

Action/Decision

145.01 The Board noted and discussed the update from Professor Gerard McHugh, Dean of Development and E3 Capital Programme Sponsor, and Ms Edwina Hegarty, E3 Programme Manager, dated 14 February 2023.

145.02 The Board noted the report from Mr Leo Harmon, E3 Independent Board Monitor, dated 13 February 2023.

BD/22-23/146 Postgraduate Renewal Programme – Proposals for financing PG Research Students: (a) Internal Awards; (b) Fee Differentials.

Professor Martine Smith, Dean of Graduate Studies/Sponsor, Postgraduate Renewal Programme, and Mr Paul Coote, Project Appraisal Manager, joined the meeting for this item.

The Provost welcomed Professor Smith and Mr Coote to the meeting.

The Dean of Graduate Studies introduced this item with reference to the memorandum from herself and Ms Leona Coady, the Director of Postgraduate Renewal Programme, dated 16 February 2023, which had been circulated in advance. She provided the Board with an update on the Postgraduate Renewal Programme noting that over the past six months, the Postgraduate Renewal Programme has undertaken extensive analysis of the funding landscape of postgraduate research (PGR) students at Trinity. Following consultation with key stakeholders, two separate and complementary proposals had been developed and were before the Board for consideration and approval. She also noted that postgraduate research students are strategically important to the viability and sustainability of the University's research activities.

(a) Internal Awards

Inviting the Board's attention to a presentation from herself and the Director of Postgraduate Renewal Programme dated 22 February 2023, the Dean of Graduate Studies advised the Board that following consultation with key stakeholders it is proposed to consolidate the three existing PGR awards into one Trinity Award which would have the following overarching features:

- a) pay a stipend of €25,000 per annum;
- b) four years' duration (full-time);
- c) continue write down of the tuition fee;
- d) maintain the student's EU/Non -EU status.

Ms Staunton re-joined the meeting at this point.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Dean of Graduate Studies clarified that internal awards already address any EU and non-EU differentiation in fees.

In response to queries from Board members in respect of how the awards are to be allocated, the Dean of Graduate Studies advised that no set distribution is presently envisaged to allow flexibility in

determining the best way to allocate these awards.

In response to queries from a Board member, the Dean of Graduate Studies clarified that the proposal is in respect of the stipend and that no additional funding for travel or equipment is proposed. In addition, she noted that while there are also School-level research awards it is proposed to address the stipend of centrally-awarded awards in the first instance. The Dean of Graduate Studies also advised that from September 2023 there will be a requirement for all teaching and learning supports to be paid directly to the student.

In response to a query from a Board member in respect of funding the proposals, the Dean of Graduate Studies advised that the proposals would not financially impact on the current activities in the University and that Trinity Development and Alumni is actively exploring philanthropic opportunities to support the proposals.

Several Board members welcomed and supported the proposals and the importance of student-led research was acknowledged.

Action/Decision

146.01 The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies and the Director of Postgraduate Renewal Programme, dated 16 February 2023 and the proposals for financing postgraduate students as contained within.

146.02 The Board considered and approved the consolidation of the three existing PGR internal College awards (1252, Ussher, Provost PhD awards) into one Trinity postgraduate research award with a stipend of €25,000 for four years (full-time).

146.03 The Board considered and approved to fund 208 annually (52 new awards each year) noting the ambition to achieve 284 awards within a five-year window with the support of Trinity Development and Alumni.

146.04 The Board considered and approved the introduction of this measure with effect from the academic year 2023-24.

(b) Fee differentials

The Dean of Graduate Studies continued her presentation and advised the Board that it is proposed that from 2023-24 all new entrant PGR students (EU and non-EU) will continue to be charged the current fee bands / rates. However, for those PGR students recruited through competitive processes funded by Irish State agencies that limit the permitted research budget allocation for fees, any residual tuition fee should be written down (cost covered internally by Trinity) enabling Schools and PIs to recruit the best and most qualified students without the constraint of affordability.

Several Board members welcomed and supported the proposals noting the benefit it will bring to research across the Schools.

In response to queries from a Board member, the Dean of Graduate Studies clarified that the proposals apply only to Irish State agency funding awards (e.g. SFI, IRC) noting that broader discussion at sectoral level on fee-capping policies is required.

The Provost commended the significant piece of work being conducted by Professor Smith, Ms Coady and Mr Coote in respect of the Postgraduate Renewal Programme and brought the item to a close, following a round of applause.

Action/Decision

146.05 The Board considered and approved reducing the cost of the PGR fee differential met by Schools: for those PGR students funded by Irish State agencies that limit the permitted research budget allocation for fees, any residual tuition fee should be written down eliminating the constraint of 'affordability' from the recruitment process. The scheme should be introduced on a phased basis for new entrants only from 2023-24 to enable full interrogation of its impact.

Professor Smith and Mr Coote left the meeting at this point.

BD/22-23/147 Revised Annual Board Work programme

The Secretary to the College invited the Board's attention to his memorandum dated 20 February 2023, which had been circulated in advance, and summarised the amendments to the Annual Board Work Programme for the Board members.

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 20 February 2023 and the revised Annual Board Work Programme.

BD/22-23/148 Annual Officer

The Board approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 22 February 2023 which was tabled and the nomination of Professor Sinéad Ryan FTCD to the position of Dean of Research as contained within. The Provost commended the outgoing Dean of Research, Professor Wolfgang Schmitt for his work in the role.

BD/22-23/149 University Council

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 8 February 2023 and the revised Acta of the Council meeting of 18 January 2023.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that amendments had been made to the Acta of the Council meeting of 18 January 2023 and thanked again the Board member for raising queries on the relevant minute.

BD/22-23/150 Any Other Urgent Business

There were no items were raised under other urgent business.

SECTION A.2**BD/22-23/151 Policy for the Management of Legal Affairs and Legal Costs**

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, and the College Solicitor/Information Compliance Officer, dated 30 January 2023 and the accompanying revised Policy for the Management of Legal Affairs and Legal Costs.

BD/22-23/152 Gift Voucher Policy

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Financial Operations Manager dated 10 February 2023 and the accompanying revised Gift Voucher Policy.

SECTION B**BD/22-23/153 Board Business****(i) Callover**

The Board noted the callover updated to 25 January 2023.

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board outcomes from the meeting of 25 January 2023.

BD/22-23/154 Audit Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 7 December 2022.

BD/22-23/155 Finance Committee

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the meeting of 30 January 2023.

BD/22-23/156 Human Resources Committee

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of:

- (i) 24 September 2021
- (ii) 29 October 2021
- (iii) 18 November 2021

- (iv) 21 January 2022
- (v) 3 March 2022
- (vi) 8 June 2022
- (vii) 13 October 2022
- (viii) 17 November 2022.

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that it would be unusual for multiple sets of minutes to be brought together to the Board for consideration and that a process had been put in place to minimise the potential for future recurrences. He also advised the Board that there are no items that required particular Board approval in the minutes presented.

Professor McManus, as Chair of the Human Resources Committee, advised the Board that the Committee is satisfied that any items that required consideration by the Board had been brought forward as appropriate.

BD/22-23/157 Quality Committee

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the meeting of 1 December 2022 and the draft minutes of the meeting of 26 January 2023 and the accompanying appendices:

- (a) Annual Quality Report to QQI 2021/22
- (b) Revised Linked Provider Quality Review Procedures.

BD/22-23/158 Remuneration Committee

The Provost introduced the item with reference to the minutes of the Remuneration Committee of 20 February 2023 which had been circulated in advance, and the memorandum from the Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences, dated 27 January 2023, which had been tabled.

A number of Board members voiced concerns in respect of the general utilisation of the Departures Framework, the need for engagement with the Framework and the potential impact on staff generally.

The Provost advised the Board that this was a Government approved framework which allows universities some flexibility to support the Schools with their strategic resourcing decisions. She noted that wide-ranging consultation across the University would be required should there be any proposal to alter engagement with the Framework as there would be implications for the strategic plans of the Schools.

Responding to the comments, the Secretary to the College clarified for the Board that the Departures Framework was provided for in the Universities Act, 1997.

The Provost, responding to comments from Board members, advised the Board that the Departures Framework had been in place for several years and that similar proposals had previously been considered and approved by the Board in recent years.

As notified at the start of the meeting, the Provost gave her apologies and left the meeting at this point due to prior travel commitments and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer chaired the remainder of the meeting.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of the process involved, the roles

of the Head of School, the Faculty Dean and Human Resources in respect of the process were clarified. A number of Board members commented on the timeline followed on this occasion.

Responding to comments and queries from Board members in respect of the role of the Board, the Secretary to the Board clarified that the proposal was before the Board for approval. He also clarified that all parties involved were aware that the proposal was subject to Board approval.

Some Board members noted their support for approving the proposal and it was acknowledged that a review of the process could be timely.

Reflecting on comments from Board members in relation to the process and role of the Board, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that there could be further consultation across the University about the Departures Framework in general.

The Board noted and approved the minutes of the meeting of 20 February 2023 and the memorandum from the Dean of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences dated 27 January 2023.

The dissent of Mr Byrne was noted and the dissent of Professor Alyn-Stacey in respect of the decision of the committee was also noted.

SECTION C

- BD/22-23/159 Membership of Committees of Board and Council**
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 15 February 2023.
- BD/22-23/160 Planning Group Report #27 to Board**
The Board considered and approved the memorandum the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 15 February 2023.
- BD/22-23/161 Financial Services Division Annual Report 2021/22**
The Board noted and approved the report.
- BD/22-23/162 Higher Degrees**
The Board noted the Higher Degrees, approved by Council on 8 February 2023.
- BD/22-23/163 Acting Head of School**
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 20 February 2023.
- BD/22-23/164 Prizes and Other Awards – Entrance Exhibitions**
The Board noted and approved the memorandum the memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies dated 9 January 2023.
- BD/22-23/165 Senate Business – Recommendations for award of the degree MA (jure officii)**
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 15 February 2022.
- BD/22-23/166 Representation on the Agency for Legal Deposit Libraries**
The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Librarian and College Archivist dated 13 February 2023.
- BD/22-23/167 Associated Companies – Reports of Directors to Board**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 15 February 2023.

BD/22-23/168 Related Entity Financial Reporting

The Board noted the memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 10 February 2023.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: