

**Trinity College Dublin** Coláiste na Tríonóide, Baile Átha Cliath The University of Dublin

## Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

# Minutes of Board Meeting 27 May 2020

This meeting was conducted remotely using the Zoom application and was hosted in the Yeats Room.

PresentProvost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor J Barkhoff), Senior<br/>Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor K Mitchell), Registrar (Professor P Murphy),<br/>Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Professor D Ahern, Professor S<br/>Alyn Stacey, Ms L Beston, Professor L Brennan, Professor A Burke, Mr K Byrne, Ms J Donoghue,<br/>Professor D Faas, Ms S Farrell, Dr D Fayne, Mr D Grouse, Ms A Leen, Ms N McCay, Professor R<br/>Moss, Professor B O'Connell, Professor E O'Halpin, Ms S Oye, Professor D R Phelan, Professor A<br/>Seery, Professor F Sheerin.

Apologies Professor K McTiernan.

- In attendance Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
- (ex officio) Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).
- (by invitation) Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

# **SECTION A**

## BD/19-20/232 Statements of Interest

The Secretary to the College advised that a potential conflict of interest had been identified for Mr Byrne and Ms Farrell in relation to Agenda item A.11 Board Elections. He advised the Board that he had discussed the matter with those members and with their agreement, recommended that they should be given the opportunity to comment on the agenda item and then leave the meeting for the remainder of the discussion on this item. This recommendation was accepted by the Board.

The Secretary to the College also advised that a potential conflict of interest had been identified for Professors Barkhoff, Campbell, Hussey, Mitchell and Seery in relation to Agenda item A.12 Annual Officers as their names would be included in the nominations. He advised the Board that he had discussed the matter with those members and with their agreement, recommended that they should leave the meeting for this item. This recommendation was accepted by the Board.

## BD/19-20/233 Minutes

The Board approved the minutes of the meeting of 20 April 2020.

The Board approved the minutes of the meeting of 22 April 2020 subject to a minor amendment to minute BD/19-20/214 Public Affairs and Communications Strategy. The second last sentence is to read as follows:

'It was also noted that a proposed launch would be rescheduled accordingly.'

BD/19-20/234 Matters Arising from the Minutes

There were no matters arising.

#### BD/19-20/235 Provost's Report

The Provost provided a report to the Board under the following headings:

#### (i) Covid-19

The Provost advised Board members that in addition to the four groups on Covid-19 related matters which he reported to the Board on 22 April (BD/19-20/211(iii), a Phased Resumption of Activities on Campus Group had also been established. It was noted that the Provost is Chair of the Group and the College Secretary is the Deputy Chair. The initial focus of the group was on the resumption of research activities and there is a sub-group on the Resumption of Teaching looking preparing plans for the coming academic year where it is envisaged that teaching will commence on 28 September 2020 with all undergraduate and postgraduate students to receive some elements of face to face teaching, allowing for public health advice.

The Provost also advised that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Vice-President for Global Relations were preparing a communication to be issued to students in respect of Erasmus and exchange programmes.

The need for teaching arrangements for staff and students who are immunocompromised or have caring responsibilities to be carefully considered by Schools was acknowledged.

#### (ii) Board Review Working Group

The Provost advised Board members that the work of the Board Review Working Group was continuing and that it is envisaged that a discussion paper will be brought to the last meeting of the Board in June.

#### (iii) Ongoing Business

It was noted that work continued to progress in respect of the recruitment of Chair Professors, meetings of the Provost's Council and the E3 Research institute.

#### (iv) Financial Assistance for the University Sector

The Provost informed the Board that the Irish Universities Association (IUA) had submitted a request to the Government for financial assistance for the University Sector to address the financial deficits envisaged due to the Covid-19 pandemic. Contrary to actions observed in other countries across the world the request had not been accepted by the Irish Government at this time.

#### (v) Board Confidentiality

The Provost, noting the obligation of Board members to adhere to the Statutes, reminded Board members of the importance of Board confidentiality and that under the Statutes, the Provost is the spokesperson for the Board. He advised Board members that should they receive queries from journalists in respect of Board business they should refer the query to Public Affairs and Communications.

The Provost concluded his report and opened the item for discussion.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of ensuring the appropriate resources are available to enable staff to work remotely and to deliver teaching online, the Provost advised that the Deputy Chief Financial Officer is preparing information in respect of tax rebates and other such initiatives that are available to staff and echoed the importance of ensuring that staff have the right facilities to enable them to fulfil their working requirements.

The Provost, responding to comments from a Board member, acknowledged the importance of face to face teaching in respect of student recruitment and noted that there are several ways to

achieve some aspect of face to face teaching for students; including small group teaching and 1 on 1 dissertation meetings. He also acknowledged the increasing demand on the Irish student market as more technological universities are established.

Responding to a query from a Board member in respect of the strategy for securing financial assistance, the Provost advised that the IUA plans to continue to seek support and that the formation of a new Government may also present opportunities.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of the registration process for students on professional programmes it was agreed that the Board member is to discuss the matter with the Chair of the Phased Resumption of Teaching Sub-Group.

In response to queries from Board members in relation to the resumption of teaching on campus, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted the dynamic nature of the current situation and the fact that the implications for teaching are constantly changing. He advised Board members that the vast majority of Heads of Schools and Course Directors had expressed a preference for undergraduate and postgraduate teaching to commence at the same time in the new academic year. The Provost, noting the significant reduction in the capacity of the teaching spaces due to social distancing, also noted that important value of face to face teaching in a hybrid teaching environment.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Provost advised that it is proposed that Non-EU students availing of College accommodation could be invited to arrive earlier and to use their accommodation for the purposes of self-isolating.

Following comments from Board members, the importance of trying to deliver all aspects of the student experience and of teaching, including field trips and laboratory work, was acknowledged and the Provost noted that a proposal in respect of what may be feasible for Freshers' Week has been requested. The importance of utilising the College accommodation to its best effect and in thinking broadly to ensure activities resume on campus as much as possible was also noted.

## BD/19-20/236 Dartry Accommodation Project Update

Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O'Kelly and the Deputy Head of Capital Projects, Mr Greg Power, joined the meeting via Zoom.

Professor O'Kelly introduced this item with reference to his presentation dated 27 May 2020, which had been circulated. He provided Board members with an update on the progress of the project. He advised Board members that the planning application had been successfully submitted but that the Cobid-19 pandemic would result in a delay to the issuing of a decision in respect of the application. Professor O'Kelly summarised the project concluding with an overview of the project and provided a financial update in respect of the project concluding with an overview of the programme of work for the project.

The Provost thanked Professor O'Kelly for the update and opened the item for discussion. In response to a query from a Board member in respect of the need to plan for single use bathrooms, Professor O'Kelly clarified that there had been no directive given in this respect and that it is proposed to proceed as originally planned with shared bathroom facilities, as is commonly observed in many domestic buildings used for student and other accommodation.

Some Board members raised queries in respect of the impact of Covid-19 on the project and, in particular, the likely decrease in market demand due to a possible reduction in international student numbers in the coming years. Responding to this, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation clarified that the financial impact of the Pandemic on the project would be reviewed Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

and Professor O'Kelly advised that a revised business case could then be brought to a future meeting of the Board for approval. The Provost noted the importance of such an exercise being conducted for all current capital projects so that key strategic decisions in respect of viability can be made.

#### Action/Decision

**236.01** The Board received the update from the Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O'Kelly and a further presentation would be made to the Board before further significant expenditure was incurred.

**236.02** The business case for the Project will be reviewed as part of a review of the overall capital programme, which would be brought to the Board.

Professor O'Kelly and Mr Power left the meeting at this point.

#### BD/19-20/237 Annual Officers

This item was considered at this point.

Professors Barkhoff, Campbell, Hussey, Mitchell and Seery left the meeting for this item.

The Provost invited the Board's attention to his memorandum, dated 19 May 2020, which had been tabled and read out the names of the nominated Annual Officers for 2020/2021. He noted that the incoming Dean of Students is to take up office on 29 June 2020 and that the incoming Dean of Graduate Studies is to take up office on 13 July 2020 with all other Officers commencing in their roles on 1 June 2020.

## Action/Decision

**237.01** The Board approved the memorandum from the Provost, dated 19 May 2020, which had been tabled, and the nominations of the Officers contained within.

*Professors Barkhoff, Campbell, Hussey, Mitchell and Seery re-joined the meeting at this point via Zoom.* 

# BD/19-20/238 Historic Accommodation Buildings Project Update

*Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O'Kelly and the Deputy Head of Capital Projects, Mr Greg Power, re- joined the meeting via Zoom.* 

Professor O'Kelly introduced this item with reference to his presentation dated 27 May 2020, which had been circulated. He provided Board members with an update on the project to date noting that in comparison to 'new-build' projects, a significant number of additional surveys are required prior to preparing designs and submitting a Planning Permission application. Professor O'Kelly updated Board members in respect of the proposed design and layout of the works and advised that in order to provide access to the Chief Steward's House, the possibility of enabling access through House 10 is being explored. This would be in keeping with the access provided to the Provost's House, through House 1, on the other side of Front Square.

In respect of the refurbishment works to the Rubrics, Professor O'Kelly informed Board members that a full energy analysis would be required once all of the initial surveys are completed. He also provided some visual images representing the proposed layouts of the staff and student apartments. He noted that The Covid-19 pandemic is having an impact on the project schedule with the full extent not yet known and that the date to submit a Planning Permission application has now moved to mid-September 2020.

Professor O'Kelly concluded his presentation by thanking the Senior Dean and the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation for their extensive engagement with the Fellows in respect of the project.

In response to a comment from a Board member in respect of potential EU funding possibilities for the project, Professor O'Kelly expressed his thanks for the information and noted that he would follow up accordingly.

The Provost, in response to a query from a Board member about the cashflow implications, clarified that this project is one of essential maintenance to existing buildings and noted the importance of maintaining the current buildings on the campus.

Responding to a query from a Board member in respect of potentially placing the electrical plant room underground, Mr Power clarified that this option is being explored.

The Provost thanked Professor O'Kelly and Mr Power for their contribution to the item.

#### Action/Decision

238.01 The Board received the presentation from the Project Sponsor, Professor Kevin O'Kelly.

Professor O'Kelly and Mr Power left the meeting at this point.

# BD/19-20/239 Public Affairs and Communications Strategy

*Mr* Tom Molloy, Director of Public Affairs & Communications joined the meeting via Zoom for this item.

Mr Molloy introduced this item with reference to his document dated 20 May 2020, which had been circulated. He thanked the Board members for the advice and feedback on the Strategy he had received at the last meeting of the Board and summarised the changes that had been made to the Strategy in light of that feedback. These included a new conclusion, a change from the name of Public Affairs and Communications to Trinity Communications and a more defined set of outcomes for the Strategy.

Several Board members welcomed the Strategy, noting that the revisions had enhanced it and also noting the importance of Trinity being able to capitalise on the diverse range of expertise available to it, embodied by staff across the University.

Responding to comments from a Board member, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer noted that sustainability is featured in the Strategic Plan 2020-2025 and clarified that there are no plans at present for the University to invest in Exchange Traded Funds. The Registrar advised that much has been achieved by the University on sustainability matters and clarified that she was in agreement with the amendments made by Mr Molloy to the Strategy.

In response to comments from a Board member in respect of Equality, Diversity and Inclusion matters, it was agreed that the Strategy would be further revised to further reflect these core values.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Provost clarified that a robust business case for any proposed recruitment would need to be considered by the Recruitment Sub-Group.

Mr Molloy, responding to a query from a Board member, advised the Board that the implementation of a new content management system for the website should result in improvements to efficiency and to search engine optimisation.

Following comments from a Board member proposing amendments to some of the wording used to ensure gender neutral terminology, Mr Molloy agreed to revisit the text of the Strategy and to

# Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

# Action/Decision

239.01 The Board approved the Public Affairs and Communications Strategy subject to some revisions to further reflect the Equality, Diversity and Inclusion values in the Trinity Community.239.02. Mr Molloy is to revisit the text of the Strategy and amend the wording as appropriate to ensure gender neutral terminology is used throughout.

# BD/19-20/240 Science Gallery Dublin Annual Review 2019

Interim Director of Science Gallery Dublin, Dr Andrea Bandelli, and Chair of the Science Gallery Board, Ms Kathryn O'Donoghue, joined the meeting through Zoom.

Dr Bandelli introduced the item with reference to the Science Gallery Dublin Annual Review 2019, which had been circulated in advance. He advised Board members of some of the highlights of the year which included Science Gallery Dublin's first national touring exhibition: Plastic. He also noted that in light of Covid-19 some activities had moved online and that plans were underway for a physical re-opening at the appropriate time.

The Provost expressed his gratitude to Ms O'Donoghue for taking up the role of Chair of the Science Gallery Board and also extended his sincere thanks to Dr Bandelli for taking up the role of Acting Director of the Science Gallery while continuing in his role as Director of the Science Gallery International.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer also thanked Ms O'Donoghue and Dr Bandelli for the work on the Science Gallery Board and in reviewing the financial situation of the Gallery.

In response to a query from a Board member regarding the potential for increasing online activities, Dr Bandelli advised that several options are being explored to expand the range of offerings from the Science Gallery including holding events and exhibitions outside and the use of virtual reality.

Some Board members, while welcoming the activities of the Gallery and the Review, queried the reasons behind the current financial position of the Science Gallery. Dr Bandelli advised that in 2019 an increase in competition in respect of alternatives to the Gallery exhibitions themselves and also in respect of the shop and café had been observed.

In response to queries from Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified the funding model which had been in place for the Gallery in 2019, noting that a revised business case is being prepared which would enhance the sustainability of the Gallery for both income and expenditure. Dr Bandelli also advised that further partnership with industry is also envisaged.

The Provost concluded the item noting that the Board fully supports all efforts to ensure the financial sustainability of the Science Gallery.

#### Action/Decision

**240.01** The Board approved the Science Gallery Dublin Annual Review 2019.

Dr Bandelli and Ms O'Donoghue left the meeting at this point.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation left the meeting at this point.

#### BD/19-20/241 Emergency Financial Management Group Update

Noting the importance of Board confidentiality, the Provost invited the Treasurer/Chief Financial

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Officer to introduce this item. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer invited the Board's attention to the presentation from the Emergency Financial Management Group, dated 21 May 2020, which had been circulated. Mr Reynolds summarised the Terms of Reference of the Emergency Financial Management Group for Board members and gave an overview of the estimated financial implications of Covid-19 for the University over the next 18 months. He also summarised the key assumptions underpinning the financial forecasts which included an envisaged decrease in EU and Non-EU student fee income and a reduction in commercial activity. Mr Reynolds outlined some of the mitigating actions in place in respect of Non-EU student income.

In respect of operating costs, Mr Reynolds advised the Board that there is a need to target a reduction in addressable operating costs and to deliver a significant sum in annualised savings to help close the forecasted financial gap. To help the University achieve this, he outlined some of the proposed actions including a recruitment freeze and potential Procurement savings amongst other measures. Mr Reynolds also noted that all capital projects in the budget are under review with some already impacted by delays due to Covid-19.

Mr Reynolds also summarised the Covid-19 impacts on the projected cashflow for the coming 18 months and some of the mitigating actions to combat this. He advised Board members that the University is working closely with the IUA and the other Irish Universities to develop funding proposals and the significant contribution of universities to the economy was noted.

Mr Reynolds concluded by summarising the next steps in the work of the Emergency Financial Management Group noting that further updates would be brought to the Finance Committee and the Board in due course.

In response to comments from a Board member, the importance of face to face teaching for the student experience and for maintaining staff and student morale was acknowledged. The Provost also advised that a document in respect of the review of all capital projects in light of Covid-19 was being prepared and would be brought to a future meeting of the Board.

The Provost, in response to comments from a Board member, noted that the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer and other colleagues would be considering the options for the expansion of the use of instalments for fee payments.

In response to comments from a Board member, the significant drop in Government funding to Universities in recent years was noted and the resulting dependency of the University on diversifying income generating strategies was acknowledged. Further analysis on the sustainability of the core teaching and research activities was being undertaken.

Responding to queries from a Board member in respect of the forecasted financial implications for Trinity in comparison to other universities, the Treasurer/Chief Financial officer clarified that some other Irish universities would not have the same level of Non-EU student recruitment or commercial activity as Trinity would and so the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic is greater for Trinity.

## Action/Decision

**241.01** The Board received the report from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer.

## BD/19-20/242 Associate Dean of Undergraduate Common Architecture

The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 21 May 2020 and the creation of the Annual Officership of the Associate Dean of Undergraduate Common Architecture as contained within. It was noted that the name of the person taking up this Officership would be brought to a future meeting of the Board.

## BD/19-20/243 2010 Consolidated Statutes – Proposed Changes to Schedule 2 to the Chapter on Committees.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

7

The Registrar introduced this item with reference to her memorandum dated 19 May 2020, which had been circulated. She summarised the proposed amendments for Board members noting that the proposed changes are designed to meet the College's commitment to equality training for Chairs and Members of Committees. She advised the Board that as part of the successful renewal of our Athena SWAN Bronze Institutional Award (2019), Trinity has committed to ensuring that all Chairs of Principal Committees of Board, Academic Committees of Council and Compliance Committees have undergone appropriate equality training and that the amendments were proposed to assist the University in meeting these commitments.

## Action/Decision

**243.01** The Board approved the memorandum from the Registrar dated 19 May 2020 and the proposed amendments to Schedule 2 to the Chapter on Committees as contained within.

#### BD/19-20/244 Board Elections

Mr Byrne and Ms Farrell left the meeting for this item.

The Secretary to the College introduced this item with reference to his memorandum dated 26 May 2020. He provided Board members with a summary of a proposal for the conduct of Board Elections in the context of the Covid-19 pandemic noting that the proposal had been agreed with the Registrar. He informed the Board that in particular Board members were being asked to approve the conduct of elections in the Fellows' and Fellow Professors' Constituency and the Academic Staff (Non-Fellow) Constituency by electronic means, with the Electoral Register of 24 April 2020 and the postponement of elections in the Technical, Administrative and Support Staff constituency to Michaelmas term 2020, with a detailed plan for this constituency including timeline to be brought to the first Board meeting of 2020/21.

# Action/Decision

**244.01** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 26 May 2020 and the proposals contained within.

**244.02** The Board noted that the following will be brought to the Board meeting of 24 June for consideration and approval:

- The extension of membership terms of Ms Stephanie Farrell and Mr Kevin Byrne.
- The proposed amendments to the Statutes Schedules developed by the Statutes Schedules Working Party to: allow the extension of these Board members' terms and to confirm the conduct of the elections to the Fellows' and Fellow Professors' Constituency and the Academic Staff (Non-Fellow) Constituency by electronic means.

## BD/19-20/245 University Council

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 13 May 2020.

# BD/19-20/246 Any Other Urgent Business

The following items were raised:

## (i) Senior Academic Promotions

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that much consideration has been given to the Senior Academic Promotions process, particularly in light of the Covid-19 pandemic and it is proposed that the current promotions round is to proceed. The Treasurer/Chief Financial officer noted the financial implication of this process and provided the Board with reassurance in respect of proceeding at this time.

## (ii) Out-going Registrar

The Provost, on behalf of the Board and the whole College Community, extend his thanks to the Registrar, Professor Paula Murphy, for her commitment to the office of Registrar and for her

valued contribution to the Board during her term as Registrar. Board members showed their appreciation with a round of applause. The Registrar thanked the Board and the Provost for his kind remarks.

## **SECTION A.2**

# BD/19-20/247 Revised Web Policies and Cookie Policy

*Ms Maura Horan, Head of Web Design and Development, joined the meeting via Zoom for this item.* 

The Board considered the memorandum from the Head of Web Design and Development dated 6 April 2020 and the accompanying policies. In response to comments from a Board member, Ms Horan clarified the cost implications for areas undertaking web updates.

Responding to queries from a Board member regarding the resources required for frequent updating of website content and the appropriate level of oversight required, it was noted that the Chair of the Library and Information Policy Committee (LIPC) would engage with the Board member and that the revised policy would be brought to a future meeting of the LIPC and Board for approval.

Ms Horan advised that her team are always happy to assist all areas of the University in updating the web content on their webpages.

#### Action/Decision:

**247.01** Following further revisions the revised policy would be brought to a future meeting of the LIPC and Board for approval.

# SECTION B

All items of business in this section were deferred to the next meeting of the Board.

#### SECTION C

- **BD/19-20/248** Inter-Institutional Collaboration Agreement with the National College of Art and Design The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Associate Dean of Undergraduate Science Education dated 19 May 2020.
- BD/19-20/249Borrowing Framework and Loan GuaranteesThe Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Project Appraisal Manager, Financial<br/>Services Division, dated 20 May 2020.
- **BD/19-20/250**Financial Services Division Annual Report 2018/19The Board noted and approved the Financial Services Division Annual Report 2018/19.
- **BD/19-20/251** Associated Companies Directors' Reports The Board noted the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 19 May 2020.
- BD/19-20/252
   Representation Alfred Beit Foundation, Company Member and Committee of Management

   Member
   The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 20

   May 2020.
   May 2020.
- BD/19-20/253 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 13 May 2020.

# BD/19-20/254 Proctors' Lists for Summer Commencements

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 27 April 2020 and 22 May 2020.

# BD/19-20/255 Heads of School

The Board noted and approved the following nominations:

- Professor Christine Morris as Head of School of Histories and Humanities for a threeyear term, commencing 1 June 2020;
- Professor Patrick Wyse Jackson as Head of School of Natural Sciences for a second three-year term, commencing 1 June 2020.

# BD/19-20/256 Sealings

The Board noted the Sealings. (See appendix 1 to this minute). This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.

# BD/19-20/257 Attendance of incoming Students' Union (SU) and Graduate Students' Union (GSU) Presidents at Board

The Board noted and approved the attendance of the incoming SU President, Eoin Hand, and the incoming GSU President - election to be held on 29 May 2020 - as observers at the Board meeting of 24 June 2020.

# SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed: .....

Date:	
20.00.	