



**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

**Minutes of Board Meeting of 30 January 2019**

- Present* Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor K Mitchell), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Professor D Ahern, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor L Brennan, Professor A Burke, Ms A Connolly, Mr J Cunningham, Mr S De Rís, Ms J Donoghue, Professor S M Draper, Ms S Farrell, Dr D Fayne, Mr D Grouse, Mr J Keogh, Professor K McTiernan, Professor R Moss, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor D R Phelan, Professor F Sheerin, Mr O Vince Coulter.
- Apologies* There were no apologies.
- In attendance* Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler), Deputy Chief Financial Officer (Ms Louise Ryan).
- (ex officio)* Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Interim Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr P Reynolds).
- (by invitation)* Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

**SECTION A**

*The Provost welcomed the Interim Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, Mr Peter Reynolds and the Deputy Chief Financial Officer, Ms Louise Ryan to the meeting.*

**BD/18-19/116 Death of a Board Member**

The Provost noted with sadness the recent death of Board member Professor Richard Timoney. The Provost, on behalf of the Board, had expressed his condolences to the family.

**BD/18-19/117 Statement of Interest**

The Secretary to the College advised that no statements of potential conflicts of interest had been received.

**BD/18-19/118 Minutes – Meeting of 12 December 2018**

The minutes of the Board meeting of 12 December 2018 were approved and signed.

**BD/18-19/119 Matters Arising from the Minutes**

The following item was raised under Matters Arising:

**(i) BD/18-19/056 Gender Action Plan - Progress Report**

The Secretary to the College advised that in respect to the agreed Equality Review that the process to select the reviewers was underway.

**BD/18-19/120 Provost's Report**

The Provost provided the Board with a report under the following headings:

- **Strategy**

- (i) Trinity Education Project (TEP)**

The Provost advised the Board that he continues to chair meetings of the TEP Plenary Group. He commended those involved in the development of Trinity electives noting the impressive promotional videos which were being produced.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer provided the Board with an update on the progress of the project noting that a policy on time-tabling has been prepared and will be brought to Undergraduate Studies Committee and Council for approval.

- (ii) Global Relations Strategy 3 (GRS)**

Noting the potential benefits of the new Global Relations Strategy, the Provost advised the board that the official launch of the strategy is planned for 14 February 2019.

- (iii) Research Excellence Strategy**

It was noted that the Research Excellence Strategy will be brought to a future meeting of the Board.

- **Projects**

- (i) Trinity Business School**

It is noted that the launch of the new building is planned for 23 May 2018.

- (ii) E3**

The Provost advised that a new governance structure for the E3 project is being developed which will be brought to Board in due course. The three Schools involved in the project are currently actively planning new undergraduate programmes. It was noted that the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation is to establish a Steering Committee for the E3 Learning Foundry.

- (iii) Cancer Institute**

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised the Board that she is liaising with the Chief Executive Officer of St James's Hospital to determine the membership and terms of reference for a working group to advance this project.

**(iv) Printing House Square**

While this project is progressing well the importance of ensuring that the timeline for the project is adhered to was noted.

**(v) European Universities Networks**

The Provost advised that a proposed consortium to apply for funding has been agreed and sees Trinity partnering with the University of Barcelona, the University of Montpellier, Eötvös Loránd University in Budapest and Utrecht University.

The Provost, responding to comments from a Board member, advised that there is the potential to invite another university to join the consortium.

**(vi) New Strategic Plan 2019-2024**

It was noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer is overseeing the drafting of the next Strategic Plan and that the Mission, Vision and Values for that plan have been identified. The draft Plan will be brought to the Board for consideration.

**(vii) Pro-Chancellors**

The Provost advised the Board that Dr Sean Barrett and Professor Sheila Greene had recently been inaugurated as Pro-Chancellors of the University. He further advised that Dr Stanley Quek would also be inaugurated in the coming weeks and noted that this would see the full complement of 6 Pro-Chancellors being filled.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies advised that there will be clear guidance in respect of fixed time-tabling available which can be considered when developing new course proposals.

In relation to the governance of the Trinity education Project, and following comments from a Board member, it was noted that students would be represented in the governance structures.

In response to queries from a Board member, the Bursar/Director of Strategic innovation advised that the business case for the refurbishment of the Old Library would be brought to a future meeting of the Board and that at present the facilities to be included in the scope of the proposal were being considered.

Following comments from a Board member in respect of works being conducted on Fellows Square, it was agreed that the Chief Operating Officer is to liaise with the contractor conducting the works in relation to the storage of tools and equipment in the vicinity of the sculpture by Alexander Calder there.

**Action/Decision**

**120.01** It was agreed that the Chief Operating Officer is to liaise with the contractor conducting works on Fellows Square in relation to the storage of tools and equipment in the vicinity of the sculpture by Alexander Calder there.

**BD/18-19/121 Brexit Risk Working Group Update**

*The Chief Risk Officer, Ms Julia Carmichael and the Director of Public Affairs and Communications, Mr Tom Molloy joined the meeting for this item.*

Ms Carmichael invited the Board's attention to her presentation, dated 24 January 2019, which had been circulated in advance. She advised the Board of the establishment and remit of the recently formed Brexit Risk Working Group. Ms Carmichael provided the Board with a summary of the timelines, key Brexit risks for Trinity and gave an overview of the actions of the working group to date. Briefly commenting on the risk related to failure to treat postgraduate fees in the same manner as undergraduate fees, she noted that the Department of Education and Skills were indicating that postgraduate fees would indeed be treated in the same manner as undergraduate fees.

With reference to the postgraduate fees highlighted by Ms. Carmichael, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that at a recent meeting of the Irish Universities Association (IUA) Registrars' Group it was agreed by the respective Members of the IUA that postgraduate students are to be treated in the same manner as undergraduate students so that the student grant and tuition fee arrangements that are currently in place will continue to apply for those students entering higher education in 2019/2020 and for the duration of their studies.

The Director of Public Affairs and Communications noted the importance of acknowledging the opportunities that Brexit presents for the University and to communicate the positive aspects in respect of student and staff recruitment.

In response to comments from Board members, the potential difficulties posed in respect of British philanthropic relationships was acknowledged and it was noted that the Risk register would cover that issue. The potential issues posed by Brexit in respect of procurement were also acknowledged and Ms Carmichael advised that a template had been issued to all areas to capture current supplier relationships and to assist in planning for alternatives should there be a need to do so. The need to align qualifications and to safeguard relationships with British based postgraduate research training centres was also noted.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Chief Risk Officer is to invite the President of the Students' Union to join the Brexit Risk Working Group.

**Action/Decision**

**121.01** The Board noted and approved the update as provided by the Chief Risk Officer and the Director of Public Affairs and Communications.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

**121.2** The Chief Risk Officer is to invite the President of the Students' Union to join the Brexit Risk Working Group.

**121.3** The Chief Risk Officer is to provide an overview of the dependency of Trinity on UK suppliers based on returns from all areas of the College in the next Brexit briefing to the Board.

*Ms Carmichael and Mr Molloy left the meeting at this point.*

**BD/18-19/122 Trinity Mission-Based Performance Compact**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item with reference to his presentation, dated 30 January 2019, which had been circulated in advance. He provided the Board with an overview of the six key system objectives as contained in the Compact document and the corresponding agreed set of targets to be met by Trinity.

Responding to queries from Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that the targets set in the Compact were agreed following engagement with the relevant stakeholders and were deemed to be realistic and achievable. He also advised that the Higher Education Authority (HEA) allocates funding on a pro-rata basis and that penalties could be applied should there be serious failings in governance identified. The Provost clarified that there were no noted issues with the current requirements. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer also noted that there had been no recent communications in respect of sectoral clusters. The importance of further enhancing the learning environment and facilities across the university was acknowledged.

Responding to queries and comments from Board members, it was clarified that consideration will be given to rotating the external audit firm at the end of the current contract which has two more years to run and it was noted that this was not an element of the Compact under discussion.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the team in the Office of the Vice-Provost for their contribution to this item.

**Action/Decision**

**122.01** The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and approved the TCD Mission Based Performance Compact 2018-2021 and Data return for submission to the HEA.

**BD/18-19/123 Health and Safety Management**

*The Head of Safety, Dr Katharine Murray joined the meeting for this item.*

The Provost welcomed Dr Murray to the meeting and invited Dr Murray to introduce herself to the Board as this was the first meeting which she was attending in her role as Head of Safety for the University. Dr Murray invited the Board's attention to her

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

presentation, dated January 2019, which had been circulated in advance. In particular, she advised Board members of the legislative requirements and liabilities in respect of health and safety and provided an overview of the proposed work plan in respect of health and safety matters for the University.

In response to a queries from Board members, the Chief Operating Officer clarified that a sub-group of the Safety Committee was in place to consider general safety requirements and issues, i.e. the Lone Working Policy and Safety Statement. Dr Murray advised the Board that the process of retrieving and assessing safety statements across the university was underway and a new Framework Safety Statement for the university is being drafted.

Following comments from Board members, the proposed introduction of annual safety inspections of laboratories was welcomed. The need to further strengthen the oversight of health and safety matters and to enhance compliance was noted and it was agreed that Annual Health and Safety Reports are to be given greater consideration at the relevant committees. It was also agreed that the Safety Committee be asked to further consider ways of enhancing the oversight of and escalation process for health and safety issues. The Committee is also to consider the development of a policy in respect of the treatment of asbestos on campus.

#### **Action/Decision**

**123.01** The Board considered and noted the presentation from the Head of Safety.

**123.02** It was also agreed that the Safety Committee be asked to further consider ways of enhancing the oversight of and escalation process for health and safety issues and that Annual Health and Safety Reports are to be given greater consideration at the relevant committees. The Committee is also to consider the development of a policy in respect of the treatment of asbestos on campus.

*Dr Murray left the meeting at this point.*

#### **BD/18-19/124 University Council**

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 16 January 2019.

#### **BD/18-19/125 Honorary Degrees**

The Board received a report from the Registrar and approved her memorandum dated 30 January 2019, which was tabled.

#### **BD/18-19/126 Any Other Urgent Business**

##### **(i) Outstanding Student Fees Issue**

In response to queries from Board members, the Chief Operating Officer provided Board members with a summary in respect to recent outstanding student fees issue which had been identified in the Academic Registry. She advised the Board of the steps taken to rectify the situation including the establishment of a taskforce and the recruitment of

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

Finance Partner for the Academic Registry. The Chief Operating Officer apologised to the Board for the error which had occurred and provided assurance that sufficient corrective action was being taken. In particular, she noted that a significant percentage of outstanding fees had now either been paid or arrangements for repayment were being made. It was noted that the provision of financial assistance for some students involved is to be explored by the Senior Tutor's Office.

Following further queries from Board members including a query from a Board member on whether the matter should be addressed by the statutory Board, the Chief Operating Officer noted further steps that are being taken to minimise the risk of any possible reoccurrence and noted that the Director of Student Services position had been filled.

## SECTION A.2

### **BD/18-19/127 Fraud Policy**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, dated 22 January 2019 and the accompanying Fraud Policy.

### **BD/18-19/128 Equality Proposal**

Professor Phelan introduced this item and provided the Board with a summary of a memorandum, dated 10 December 2018, which had been prepared by himself and some other Board members. In particular, he noted the contribution of the late Professor Timoney to the document. He advised the Board that the proposal was not a critique of the good work already being conducted across the University in respect of equality matters but a proposal to review the current perspective and practices to ensure that all underrepresented and marginalised groups are considered when developing equality action plans.

In the course of discussion the following issues were noted by Board members:

- The scope of Athena SWAN has now broadened to include other underrepresented groups and is now more inclusive;
- Efforts have been made to ensure gender balance is better reflected in the membership of the Equality Committee;
- There are many complexities to be consider when trying to capture the appropriate data to inform equality discussions;
- The Equality Fund has the remit to fund non-gender based projects;
- There are some specific disciplines which experience an under-representation of men and appropriate actions should be taken to address this;
- There are concerns in respect of the introduction of gender specific professorships;
- The importance of being conscious of and focused on inclusivity.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer noted that the membership of the Equality Committee includes a colleague from the Disability Service and the Director of Diversity and Inclusivity and that the next iteration of the Athena SWAN Charter is envisaged will look at equality in a holistic way. He also acknowledged that further consideration could

be given to the types of data captured and how the relevant information is portrayed when preparing the Annual Equality Monitoring Report.

Responding to comments from Board members, Professor Phelan noted the importance of ensuring that the Annual Equality Monitoring Report is appropriately informed from all perspectives and that the appropriate data is collected.

The Provost, reflecting on the discussion, advised that the views, as expressed in the proposal, should be considered when preparing the Annual Equality Monitoring Report. It is agreed that the issue raised by the proposers be the subject of specific treatment in the Annual Equality Monitoring Report and to this end there is to be appropriate engagement with the proposers in advance of preparing the next Report which will be considered by the Equality Committee as a sub-committee of the Board. It was also noted that the Equality Officer post is currently vacant and recruitment is underway. As such, some delays in producing the report may arise.

#### **Action/Decision**

**128.01** It is agreed that the issue raised by the proposers be the subject of specific treatment in the Annual Equality Monitoring Report and to this end there is to be appropriate engagement with the proposers in advance of preparing the next Report which will be considered by the Equality Committee as a sub-committee of the Board. It was also noted that the Equality Officer post is currently vacant and recruitment is underway. As such, some delays in producing the report may arise.

*Professor O'Halpin left the meeting at this point.*

#### **BD/18-19/129 Policy, Practice and Regulations on Intellectual Property**

*The Director of Trinity Research and Innovation, Mr Leonard Hobbs and the Head of Office of Corporate Partnership and Exchange, Mr Declan Weldon joined the meeting for this item.*

Mr Hobbs introduced this item with reference to his presentation which had been circulated and provided the Board with a summary of the revisions which had been made to the Intellectual Property Policy.

In response to queries from Board members, Mr Weldon described the advantages of having flexibility in the percentage equity stake to be applied on various business ventures. Mr Hobbs also clarified steps to be taken to minimise the potential for the misuse of intellectual property.

#### **Action/ Decision**

**129.01** The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Director of Trinity Research and Innovation, Mr Leonard Hobbs dated 23 January 2019 and the accompanying Policy, Practice and Regulations on Intellectual Property.

### **SECTION B**

#### **BD/18-19/130 Board Business**

##### **(i) Callover**

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 12 December 2018.

**(ii) Outcomes**

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 12 December 2018.

**BD/18-19/131 Finance Committee**

The interim Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer invited the Board's attention to those minutes of particular relevance to Board members.

In response to comments from a Board member, it was agreed that minute FC/18-19/25 is to be clarified at the next meeting of the Finance Committee.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the Finance Committee dated 23 November 2018.

**SECTION C**

**BD/18-19/132 Ad Hoc Appeals Committee**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 21 January 2019.

**BD/18-19/133 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted the Higher Degrees approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 16 January 2019.

**BD/18-19/134 Board Membership: Fellows' and Fellow Professors' Constituency**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 22 January 2019.

**BD/18-19/135 Trinity Ball 2020**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 22 January 2019.

**BD/18-19/136 School of Medicine Studentships**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the School of Medicine, circulated, dated 23 January 2019.

**BD/18-19/137 Prizes and Other Awards**

**(i) Establishment of Yvonne Scannell Prize**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Head of School of Law, circulated, dated 23 January 2019.

**(ii) Establishment of De Montfort Prize**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the School of Linguistic, Speech and Communication Sciences, circulated, dated 22 January 2019.

**BD/18-19/138 College Safety Committee – Revised Terms of Reference**

The Board noted and approved the revised Terms of Reference of the College Safety Committee, circulated.

**BD/18-19/139 Charities Regulatory Authority (CRA) – Nomination of Replacement Trustee**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 22 January 2019.

**BD/18-19/140 Gold Medal Recommendation 2018 (see Appendix 1)**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Senior Lecturer / Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 24 January 2019.

**SECTION D**

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed: .....

Date: .....

Appendix 1 to Minute BD/18-19/140

**Gold Medal 2018**

<b>Course</b>	<b>Name</b>
Nursing Studies	Rossiter, Nicola