



**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

**Minutes of Board Meeting of 21 November 2018**

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor K Mitchell), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Professor D Ahern, Professor L Brennan, Professor A Burke, Ms A Connolly, Mr J Cunningham, Mr S De Rís, Ms J Donoghue, Professor S M Draper, Ms S Farrell, Dr D Fayne, Mr D Grouse, Professor C Laudet, Professor K McTiernan, Professor R Moss, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor D R Phelan, Professor F Sheerin, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Professor R Timoney, Mr O Vince Coulter.
<i>Apologies</i>	Mr J Keogh, Professor A Seery.
<i>In attendance</i>	Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr I Mathews).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

**SECTION A**

- BD/18-19/050 Statement of Interest**  
The Secretary to the College advised that no statements of potential conflict of interest had been received.
- BD/18-19/051 Death of a Fellow Emeritus**  
The Provost advised the Board of the recent passing of Fellow Emeritus Dr William James Louden Ryan. He also noted that Professor Ryan was elected to Fellowship in 1956 and he was the most senior of the Fellows Emeriti. In accordance with the College protocol the flag is flying at half-mast. The Provost, on behalf of the Board, expressed his condolences to the family.
- BD/18-19/052 Minutes - Meeting of 3 October 2018**  
The minutes of the Board meeting of 3 October 2018 were approved and signed.
- BD/18-19/053 Matters Arising from the Minutes**  
The following items were raised under Matters Arising:
- (i) BD/18-19/038 Anti-money laundering data request. Re-opening of Davy Select trading account**  
The Secretary to the College thanked members of the Board for fulfilling the information request and confirmed that all information received had been forwarded to the Financial Services Division and deleted from the Secretary's Office files.
- (ii) BD/18-19/032 Athena SWAN Progress Update**  
In response to comments from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified that it is envisaged that a Gender Equality proposal is to be considered by the Equality Committee with a view to it being brought to a future meeting of Board for consideration and discussion.
- BD/18-19/054 Provost's Report**  
The Provost updated the Board on the following items:

- **Trinity Education Project (TEP)**

The Provost advised the Board that the first meeting of TEP Plenary had taken place in October. It had been held in the boardroom of the Trinity Centre for Literary and Cultural Translation at 37 Fenian Street and the Provost informed Board members that the venue is bookable by all staff members of the University for suitable business.

- **E3**

The Provost had recently chaired a number of E3 Steering meetings and it is planned to reconvene the Research Strategy Group to consider the needs of the E3 research building.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised that permission to demolish for the Biochemistry Building and the Roberts Laboratory had been received and that the process to identify a demolition contractor will now proceed.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation clarified that there would be a second phase of planned demolition which would incorporate the annexes currently assigned to the School of Natural Sciences.

- **Alumni Engagement and Student Engagement Agreements**

It was noted that the Provost had travelled to Japan where he gave an address in Kyoto and an alumni event was held in Tokyo. It was also noted that the first ever Provost-alumni event had recently been held in Perth.

While in Australia, Malaysia and Singapore, the Provost and the Vice-President for Global Relations had visited many universities with a view to establishing student exchange and collaboration agreements.

- **European Institute of Innovation and Technology (EIT)**

The Provost informed Board members that he had participated in a discussion on knowledge innovation and funding at an EIT meeting in early November.

- **Book of Durrow Loan**

The Provost advised the Board that he had attended the Anglo Saxon Kingdoms: Art, Wood, War Exhibition in the British Library in London where the Book of Durrow, which is on loan to the exhibition from Trinity, is on display.

- **League of European Research Universities (LERU) Rectors' Assembly**

Trinity hosted the LERU Rectors' Assembly on the 16 and 17 November 2018. Part of the Assembly saw the Chancellor of the University of Dublin, Dr Mary Robinson, give an evening address on Climate Change.

- **Provost's Address**

It was noted that the Provost's Address had been held on Monday 19 November 2018 in the Edmund Burke Theatre.

- **Irish Research Council (IRC) Laureate Awards**

The Provost advised the Board that Trinity researchers had performed extremely well in the recent IRC Laureate Awards receiving 13 of the 36 national awards. A reception had been held in the Provost's House to mark this achievement.

The successful applicants from Trinity in the 'Starting Laureate Awards' category for excellent early career researchers were:

- Sarah Doyle, Assistant Professor, School of Biochemistry and Immunology;

- Jeremy Piggot, Assistant Professor, School of Natural Sciences;
- Francis Ludlow, Research Fellow, School of Histories and Humanities;
- Isabella Jackson, Assistant Professor, School of Histories and Humanities;
- Stephen Power, Research Fellow, School of Physics.

And in the 'Consolidator Laureate Awards' category for excellent mid-career researchers:

- Yvonne Buckley, Professor of Zoology, School of Natural Sciences;
- Andrew Jackson, Associate Professor, School of Natural Sciences;
- Matthew Campbell, Assistant Professor, School of Genetics and Microbiology;
- Aline Vidotto, Assistant Professor, School of Physics;
- Jan Manschot, Assistant Professor, School of Mathematics;
- Andrei Parnachev, Assistant Professor, School of Mathematics;
- Immo Warntjes, Assistant Professor, School of Histories and Humanities;
- Paul Dockree, Associate Professor, School of Psychology.

In response to a comment from Board members, it was noted that the Provost's visit to Japan had been noted and welcomed by the Japanese Ambassador to Ireland. The importance of ensuring appropriate supports for visiting or exchange students was acknowledged.

The Provost thanked Board members for their comments and closed the item.

#### **BD/18-19/055 Trinity Business School Update**

*Professor Gerard Lacey (Programme Sponsor); Mr Leo Harmon (Independent Monitor); Mr Mervyn Green (TBS Steering Chair) and Mr Greg Power (Head of Capital Projects & Planning) joined the meeting for this item.*

Professor Lacey introduced the item with reference to his presentation which had been circulated. He provided the Board with a brief update on the activity in the School of Business to date noting that a significant level of growth continues to be observed. He also advised the Board that a successful catering contract had been negotiated and it is envisaged that there will be a very high specification café space in the new Business School building. Professor Lacey also provided Board members with an update on the building works noting that the remaining pieces of major construction were now underway and that it is envisaged that the building will be handed over to the university by the end of February 2019. Mr Power advised that stoppage days due to inclement weather had been factored in to this date. With respect to the project budget, Professor Lacey advised that significant efforts are being put in place to stay within the approved budget and noted that the outcome of the Sectoral Employment Order (SEO) would be considered in a separate process.

The Independent Monitor, Mr Leo Harmon, invited the Board's attention to his report dated 14 November 2018, which had been circulated. He advised Board members that in his opinion the budget for completion of the project was very tight. He also advised that ensuring adequate resources is proving problematic however, the quality of the works was good and that a clean and crisp design finish could now be observed. Mr Harmon noted that the team are committed to delivering the project with various members of the team now meeting on a weekly basis.

Mr Green also advised that the project is progressing well and noted the particular contribution of the Project Manager. He also commended Trinity's Commercial Revenue Unit for their work in negotiating the café facility. He advised of some concern regarding the SEO strategy noting that he and Mr Harmon would recommend considering the SEO and final budget negotiations together.

In response to a query from a Board member, Mr Power advised the Board that an internal review of the building works had been conducted and noted that this building project was subject to stricter building regulations than those previously in place for other projects. He also

reassured the Board that all required certification had been received and noted the benefits derived from having a Clerk of Works on site.

In response to comments from Board members in relation to securing the appropriate level of resources required to finish the project on time, Professor Lacey noted the significant increase in activity which has been observed across the construction sector which may result in resources not being available or rising costs. Mr Harmon suggested that for future projects consideration could be given to the use of prefabricated structures where appropriate.

Professor Burke advised the Board of the significant level of growth which had been observed in the School of Business and summarised the financial benefits of the project for the university as a whole. The Provost commended all members of the school for this achievement.

Responding to a query from a Board member, Professor Lacey advised that external legal advice is being sought in respect of the SEO and that efforts are being made to reach a mutual agreement with the contractor.

In response to a query from a Board member regarding the issuing of the catering contract, Professor Lacey advised that a robust financial analysis of the approach had been conducted and that the final arrangement resulted in capital and financial benefits for the university. The Chief Operating Officer also noted that a focus on the student experience and best practice would be observed.

The Provost thanked Professor Lacey, Mr Power, Mr Harmon and Mr Green for updating the Board on the project.

#### **Action/Decision**

**055.1** The Board considered and approved the following: the report from the Programme Sponsor, Professor Gerard Lacey dated 14 November 2018 and the report from the Independent Monitor, Mr Leo Harmon, dated 14 November 2018.

*Professor Lacey, Mr Harmon, Mr Green and Mr Power left the meeting at this point.*

#### **BD/18-19/056 Gender Action Plan - Progress Report**

*Ms Aoife Crawford, Equality Officer, joined the meeting for this item.*

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item with reference to his presentation, dated 21 November 2018, which had been circulated. He advised the Board that this being the second progress report on the Trinity Gender Action Plan, which consolidates the HEA's recommendations, the Athena SWAN 2015 application, the Strategy for Diversity and Inclusion and the "Mind the Gap" report. He then provided the Board with a summary of how the various actions contained in the report were progressing noting some of the steps taken to implement the various actions, including the assignment of the responsibility for Equality to himself as a senior College Officer. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer concluded by outlining the proposed next steps including an Athena SWAN bronze renewal application at the end of the month.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and opened the item for discussion. In response to comments from several Board members where concern was expressed regarding the management of data and the possible disconnect between the three plans, the potential for the development of silos and miscommunication was noted. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that currently a level of oversight was in place through the Gender Equality Implementation Subcommittee of the Equality Committee, which he chairs, and noted that each of the relevant actions had an identified owner which in many cases is a College Officer. He also noted that the HEA is to provide funding to support equality initiatives.

In response to comments from Board members, the Equality Officer clarified that the Athena SWAN initiative does not currently extend to professional staff or to students and noted that a significant level of engagement with the Schools had taken place to date. The importance of reporting robust and accurate data was acknowledged in addition to the benefits of being able to review historical data.

In response to suggestions from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer agreed to explore additional ways of publicising the many actions being taken to promote equality in the university.

Following comments from Board members the importance of ensuring a balanced approach to gender equality which includes a narrative in respect of men was acknowledged.

Responding to a comments from a Board member, the Provost acknowledged that additional Human Resources practices could be adopted to improve the recruitment and retention of staff members and the need for full communication of exit interviews was noted.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, responding to comments from Board members, clarified that while gender balance was important in the appointment and promotion processes, academic excellence would always be the primary criteria.

Following further discussion regarding the need to review data collection processes and ensure there is centralised co-ordination of all of the activities and reporting, the Provost suggested, and it was agreed, that a review of the relevant internal structures would be undertaken which will be brought to the Executive Officers' Group and if necessary to the Board for consideration.

The Provost thanked Ms Crawford acknowledging her significant contribution to date and she left the meeting at this point.

**Action/Decision:**

**56.1** The Board considered and approved the report from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated November 2018.

**56.2** It was agreed that a review of the relevant internal structures would be undertaken which will be brought to the Executive Officers' Group and if necessary to the Board for consideration.

*Professor O'Halpin left the meeting at this point.*

**BD/18-19/057 University Council**

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 17 October 2018.

**BD/18-19/058 Any Other Urgent Business**

There were no items of any other business.

**SECTION A.2**

**BD/18-19/059 Meeting Hours Policy**

The Board approved the Policy from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 14 November 2018.

**BD/18-19/060 Risk Management Policy**

*Ms Julia Carmichael, Chief Risk Officer, joined the meeting for this item.*

The Provost welcomed Ms Carmichael to the meeting introducing her to Board members. He then invited comments on the revised policy from Board members.

Ms Carmichael, responding to a query from a Board member, noted the need for a risk management policy to be dynamic, outlining the approach to be taken to managing risk and advised that a risk management framework is being implemented.

Following some comments from a Board member in respect of including the steps to be taken to facilitate the elimination and mitigation of risk, the Chief Risk Officer advised of a planned review of risk registers across the university and it was agreed that the Chief Risk Officer is to liaise directly with the Board member with a view to modifying the policy.

In response to comments from Board members in relation to the role of Heads of School in respect of risk management, the Chief Risk Officer noted the discussions being held at the Risk Management Group and the level of engagement held to date with the Heads of School on this matter.

#### **Action/ Decision**

**60.1** The Chief Risk Officer is to liaise directly with the Board member with a view to modifying the policy.

**60.2** It was agreed that a revised version of the Policy is to be brought to the next meeting of the Board.

### **SECTION B**

#### **BD/18-19/061 Board Business**

- (i) Callover  
The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 3 October 2018.
- (ii) Outcomes  
The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 3 October 2018.

#### **BD/18-19/062 Audit Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft Minutes of meeting of 23 October 2018, including the Revised Terms of Reference for the Audit Committee. The Board nominee on the Committee observed that in reviewing previous recommendations of the Committee, it may be worthwhile for the Committee in the future to focus more on the wider risks effecting the university as a whole.

#### **BD/18-19/063 University Safety Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft Minutes of meeting of 4 October 2018.

#### **BD/18-19/064 Quality Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft Minutes of meeting of 4 October 2018, including:

- (i) Revised Terms of Reference for the Quality Committee including changes to the membership of the Committee to include (a) approval for the Chief Operating Officer to nominate a delegate (Ms Breda Walls, Director of Student Services) to attend meetings, (b) addition of the Chief Risk Officer (Ms Julia Carmichael) as an *ex-officio* member to reflect the alignment of quality and risk, and (c) change in status of

attendance of the Deputy Librarian and the Assistant Secretary to *ex-officio* members.

and

- (ii) the General Procedure for Quality Reviews.

**BD/18-19/065 Finance Committee**

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer invited the Board's attention to those minutes of particular relevance. The Board noted and approved the draft Minutes of meeting of 1 October 2018.

**BD/18-19/066 Human Resources Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft Minutes of meeting of 18 October 2018.

**BD/18-19/067 Library and Information Policy Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft Minutes of meeting of 28 May 2018.

**SECTION C**

**BD/18-19/068 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted the Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 26 September and 17 October 2018.

**BD/18-19/069 Proctors' Lists for Autumn Commencements**

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 24 October 2018.

**BD/18-19/070 Assistant Warden of Trinity Hall**

The Board noted and approved the appointment of the Dr Bevin McGeever, B.A., M.RES. (I.C.L.), PH.D. (I.C.L.) as Assistant Warden of Trinity Hall, from 1 November 2018 for a two-year term.

**BD/18-19/071 Appointment of Assistant Junior Deans**

The Provost invited the Board's attention to a memorandum from the Junior Dean, Professor Tim Trimble, dated 15 November 2018 which had been circulated. He clarified for the Board that appointments of Assistant Junior Deans would be brought annually to Board in keeping with the process currently followed for the appointment of Annual Officers. The Provost, in the context of current General Data Protection Regulations, also noted the importance of ensuring a formal recruitment process is followed when making such appointments, as Assistant Junior Deans can often have access to confidential student data.

**Acton/Decision 071:** The Board approved the memorandum from the Junior Dean, Professor Tim Trimble, dated 15 November 2018 and the seven nominations of Assistant Junior Deans contained within.

**BD/18-19/072 Financial Signatories**

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, dated 15 November 2018 and the following financial signatories with immediate effect and on an interim basis:

- Ms Louise Ryan, Deputy Chief Financial Officer – 1<sup>st</sup> Signature
- Ms Deirdre Savage, Director of Financial Planning & Risk Management – 2<sup>nd</sup> Signature.

**BD/18-19/073 Sealings**

The Board noted the Sealings, as circulated, and attached as Appendix 1 to this Minute.

**BD/18-19/074 Prizes and Other Awards**

- (i) Gold Medals

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum, circulated, from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies dated 14 November 2018;

(ii) Entrance Exhibitions

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum, circulated, from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies dated 13 November 2018;

(iii) Lucy Gwynn Prize

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum, circulated, from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, dated 15 November 2018.

**BD/18-19/075 Equality Committee Annual Report 2017-18**

The Board noted the Report, as circulated.

**BD/18-19/076 Representation - Committee of Management of the Alfred Beit Foundation**

The Board ratified and approved Professor Carmel O’Sullivan, School of Education, as a member of the Committee of Management of the Alfred Beit Foundation for a second four-year term from 27 June 2016 to 26 June 2020.

**BD/18-19/077 Related Entity Financial Reporting**

The Board noted the Memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, circulated, dated 14 November 2018.

**BD/18-19/078 Irish School of Ecumenics-TCD Advisory Board**

The Board noted the minutes of the meeting of 15 November 2017.

**BD/18-19/079 Committee on Student Conduct and Capacity**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 14 November 2018.

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed: .....

Date: .....