



# Trinity College Dublin

Coláiste na Tríonóide, Baile Átha Cliath

The University of Dublin

## Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

### Minutes of Board Meeting of 15 November 2017

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor C Morash), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G S Martin), Registrar (Professor P Murphy), Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation (Professor V Campbell), Professor D Ahern, Professor S Alyn Stacey, Dr O Braiden, Mr S Collins, Ms S Dunphy, Dr D Fayne, Ms S Farrell, Professor R Gilligan, Mr K Keane, Mr J Keogh, Mr T Keohane, Professor C Laudet, Professor B M Lucey, Ms A MacPherson, Professor C McCabe, Mr D McClean, Professor R Moss, Professor E O'Halpin, Professor D R Phelan, Professor A Seery, Professor R Timoney.
<i>Apologies</i>	Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G S Martin), Professor S M Draper.
<i>In attendance</i>	Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms V Butler).
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr I Mathews).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer (Ms G Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

### SECTION A

- BD/17-18/051 Statement of Interest**  
The Secretary to the College advised that the Chief Operating Officer had made a statement of interest in relation to Agenda Item A.5 Appointment process for Chief Operating Officer (COO) position. It was suggested, and the Board agreed, that she would leave the meeting for the discussion on this item.
- BD/17-18/052 Minutes - Meeting of 18 October 2017**  
The minutes of the Board meeting of 18 October 2017 were approved and signed.
- BD/17-18/053 Matters Arising from the Minutes**  
The following items were raised as a matter arising:
- (i) **BD/17-18/034 Department of Education and Skills Guidance Note on the Use of Fixed Term Contracts**  
The Chief Operating Officer advised the Board that the Director of Human Resources is engaged in consultation with staff representatives in relation to this matter and that a further update would follow. She noted that the ongoing discussions have regard for the operating deficit and the need to maintain flexibility.
  - (ii) **BD/17-18/038 Finance Committee**  
The Treasurer/ Chief Financial Officer advised the Board that the Finance Committee reconsidered the proposed increase in student fees under Matters Arising at the meeting of the Finance Committee on 17 November, as had been requested by the Board at the October meeting. It was noted that the Finance Committee had decided to affirm their original decision.
  - (iii) **BD/17 -18/038 Finance Committee**  
Following comments from the President of the Graduate Students' Union it was agreed that a working group would be established to explore the powers of agency which are granted to the Finance Committee and in particular section 3 (2) (d) in relation to determining the fees,

charges and the like payable to College by students in the Schedule on Finance Committee as contained in the Consolidated Statutes 2010. The working group is to be chaired by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the membership will include the College Secretary (who shall act as secretary), the Deputy Chief Financial Officer and the Presidents of the Students' Union and the Graduate Students' Union with the option for the group to co-opt other members. The Secretary will co-ordinate the first meeting and the group will review the rationale of granting powers of agency to the committee and assess if this assignment remains appropriate. The findings of the working group will be considered at a future meeting of the Board.

**(iv) BD/17-18/040 2010 Consolidated Statutes - Changes to Schedule 1 to Chapter on Committees**

The Secretary to the College advised the Board that on further consideration it was proposed that the wording for the membership of the Human Resources Committee, as had been presented to the Board on 18 October 2017, was accurate and that no amendment was required. Therefore, the references to "a nominee of" and "or nominee" will remain in the membership of the Human Resources Committee.

**BD/17-18/054 Provost's Report**

The Provost provided a report to the Board under the following headings:

**• E3 Project**

It was noted that there had been two meetings of the E3 Steering Committee in the past month. Consideration had been given to the financial aspects of the project and the potential growth in staffing proposed in the three schools.

The Bursar, at the invitation of the Provost, advised that consideration is also being given to the proposed design of a building for the E3 Learning Institute, which is phase 1 of the project. She noted that it is envisaged that any proposed building should facilitate and accommodate new ways of teaching and contain flexible spaces. She also noted that the size and lay out of any building would have financial implications for the business case for the project. The Provost informed the Board that while philanthropic funding for this project was progressing well there would be a need to secure public funding and as such, he was making representations in relation to State funding.

**• Senior Academic Promotions**

It was noted that the interviews for Senior Academic Promotions were underway and it is envisaged all interviews would be complete by the end of Michaelmas Term.

**• IUA Council**

The Provost had attended the recent IUA Council meeting after which he had attended a graduation ceremony where the former Taoiseach, Mr Enda Kenny, T.D., had been awarded an Honorary Degree by the National University of Ireland.

The Provost voiced his concerns regarding a possible amendment to the Technological Universities Bill regarding a provision by which the Higher Education Authority (HEA) may appoint an inspector to investigate issues of concern in the universities. At the invitation of the Provost, the Secretary to the College provided the Board with an update noting as of yet no wording has been published. The Provost emphasised the potential implications for the university and will keep Board informed.

**• Trinity Fundraising Campaign and meetings with other universities and alumni abroad**

The Provost advised of some of the recent meetings he had participated in, both in England and Canada and the United States, where fundraising and potential academic partnerships had been discussed, including a Trinity/St James Hospital Cancer Institute.

- **Former Warden of Trinity Hall**

The Provost advised the Board that a reception was held on 13 October 2017 to mark the end of the term of office of Professor Brendan Tangney after 13 years of service there as Warden of Trinity Hall. The Board extended its appreciation and thanks to Professor Tangney for his contribution to student life over this time.

- **Dr Conor Cruise O'Brien Centennial Symposium**

It was noted that a symposium on the life and work of Dr Conor Cruise O'Brien had taken place on 2 and 3 November 2017 at which the Provost had delivered the opening address.

- **COIMBRA and 30<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of Erasmus Programme**

The Provost informed the Board that the Coimbra group high-level seminar on Education Policy: Internationalisation of the Curriculum was held on 13 November 2017. In addition, a dinner to mark the 30<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Erasmus programme was held in the Dining Hall, attended by Guest of Honour Ms Helen McEntee, T.D., Minister of State for European Affairs.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Provost noted the passing of the late Dr Charles Benson and extended his sympathies. The Board acknowledged Dr. Benson's contribution to the university over his years of service.

In response to comments from a Board member on the E3 project, the Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation commented that design issues such as the provision of gender-neutral toilets and breast feeding facilities would be for a later stage.

**BD/17-18/055 Proposed Sustainability Policy from the Provost's Advisory Committee on Sustainability and Low Carbon Living**

The Registrar with reference to her memorandum dated 6 November 2017, which had been circulated, advised the Board that the current Sustainable Development Policy was drafted in 2008 and so a revision was now timely. In particular, she noted that the policy should reflect the university's commitment to institutional leadership in sustainability as contained in the Strategic Plan 2014-2019.

She advised the Board that the proposed Sustainability Policy was discussed, developed and approved at meetings of the Provost's Advisory Committee on Sustainability and Low Carbon Living and had been approved by the Chief Officers' Group on 24 October 2017.

She noted that the proposed revised policy is more specific and extensive than the current policy and will support the university's objective of joining the International Sustainable Campus Network (ISCN).

Responding to comments from a Board member, the Registrar agreed to follow up on the specific issue raised in relation to disposal of perishable foodstuffs and to liaise with those concerned directly.

In response to queries from Board members, the Registrar advised that a report on sustainability will be brought to Board on an annual basis with the next report on the agenda for the December meeting of the Board and that the policy itself being reviewed every five years.

Following comments from Board members in respect of single use plastics, it was noted that the student initiative was to be discussed and supported at the next meeting of the Provost's Advisory Committee on Sustainability and Low Carbon Living.

**Action/Decision**

**055.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Registrar, dated 6 November 2017, and the Sustainability Policy contained within.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

**055.2** It was noted that a Sustainability Report would be brought to Board for consideration on an annual basis.

**055.3** It was also noted that the student initiative in support of the ultimate elimination of single use plastics was to be discussed and supported at the next meeting of the Provost's Advisory Committee on Sustainability and Low Carbon Living.

**BD/17-18/056 Appointment process for Chief Operating Officer (COO) position**

The Secretary to the College, with reference to his memorandum dated 7 November 2017, which had been circulated, provided a summary of the previous recruitment and appointment processes which had been followed in relation to the post of Chief Operating Officer.

He advised Board members that it is proposed that the Board would appoint an Assessment Board to review the performance of the current post holder against the current job description and to assess her suitability for a further appointment against the updated job description, which had also been circulated. He advised the Board of the proposed membership of the Assessment Board noting that the final recommendation in relation to the appointment would be brought to the Board.

In response to queries from a Board member, the Secretary to the College advised that legal advice had been received in relation to the university's legislative obligations and it had been confirmed that the proposed appointment process was appropriate.

The Provost, in response to a query from a Board member, advised that it is envisaged that there will be consultation with key stakeholders and that the proposed members of the Assessment Board possess the appropriate experience and expertise.

**Action/Decision**

**056.1** The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College dated 7 November 2017 and the appointment process contained within.

**BD/17-18/057 Financial Sustainability**

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer with reference to his memorandum of 8 November 2017 and his presentation, which had been circulated, advised the Board of the financial sustainability challenges faced by the University and provided a summary of the steps currently being taken along with a number of options available to manage the University's return to a surplus position.

In particular, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised the Board that the university has been reporting deficits for a number of years now, the State grant continues to reduce, interest from deposits had declined and there is a capital renewal programme for the university which must be funded largely by non-exchequer funds identified by the university itself. He also advised the Board of the recently approved Baseline Budgeting Model which is envisaged will support income generation activity at School level and incentivise growth.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer noted that a Section 37 Letter had been issued to the Higher Education Authority with a meeting held with the HEA in early November 2017 and concluded with some key messages. He advised the Board that the focus should now be on closing the sustainability gap with tangible progress required within the next few years, as previously noted to the Board that if the gap was not addressed the university's autonomy could be at risk.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised that a shared services agenda forms part of the 21st Century Administration project and that there had been the introduction of new IT solutions to assist in facilitating a shared service model where possible.

Following a query in relation to the sectoral position, it was noted that financial stability varied across the universities and that the IUA Finance Officers had suggested an increase in the amount of student contribution charged may be one measure which may address the funding challenges to universities.

The cost implications of a failure of State funding to keep pace with public service pay restoration on the financial position of the university were acknowledged and the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer reminded the Board of the need to address the true economic cost of conducting research which is not being received by the university.

It was also acknowledged that further consideration should be given to the development of postgraduate education which would have the effect of generating further income.

**Action/Decision**

**057.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 8 November 2017.

**057.2** A further analysis of academic fee income and student numbers, including a breakdown of postgraduate taught and postgraduate fee income, is to be provided for consideration at a future meeting of the Board.

**057.3** The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, liaising with the Chief Operating Officer and the Commercial Director, is to provide further clarification on the correlation of the 'Other Income' figure as captured in the presentation with the activities of the Commercial Revenue Unit including off-term rental income from student accommodation. This document and details on the re-investment of commercially generated funds are to be provided to a future meeting of the Board.

**BD/17-18/058 New Senior Academic Promotions**

The Provost welcomed the Director of Human Resources who joined the meeting for this item.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced his memorandum of 7 November 2017 and the attached procedure and his presentation, which had been circulated noting that the Senior Academic Promotions procedures had been revised following the recommendations, which had been contained in the Sanders Report. He then provided the Board with a summary of the key changes as outlined in his presentation, which had been circulated.

Following comments from Board members, the Provost clarified the criteria on which referees are selected with consideration being given to gender balance, distribution and academic seniority as appropriate. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer also clarified that due consideration is to be given to applicants who were subject to special circumstances in the period prior to application and the importance of referees being independent of the applicant's work was noted.

The Director of Human Resources advised that the application form is to be revised following appropriate consultation and that a draft would be circulated to the relevant committees for review and presented to Board for approval in due course.

Potential difficulties arising from the fact that the Senior Academic Promotions process is conducted within a set financial envelope were acknowledged.

**Action/Decision**

**058.1** The Board considered and approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/CAO, dated 7 November 2017, and the Senior Academic Promotions procedure contained within.

**058.2** It was noted that the application form is to be redesigned and will be brought to future meetings of Council and Board for noting.

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**

*The Director of Human Resources left the meeting at this point.*

*Professors Gilligan and O'Halpin and Mr Keohane left the meeting at this point.*

**BD/17-18/059 Trinity-Columbia Dual BA Programme Collaboration Agreement**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer introduced this item advising the Board that the academic proposal for the Trinity-Columbia dual BA programme had been approved by Council on 25 October 2017.

He extended his thanks to the Vice-President for Global Relations for her contribution to the development of this programme.

He advised the Board to that it is proposed that the Board would approve the contract, which had been circulated, on the following basis:

- Subject to review of an American law expert on behalf of Trinity College Dublin;
- With approval for immaterial amendments to be made following Board approval;
- With the understanding that a separate agreement on data protection will be agreed between the parties in advance of any sharing of student information.

The importance of agreement in principle at this stage to facilitate student recruitment in February 2018 was noted.

In response to comments from Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer clarified the financial aspects of the programme and the Vice-President of Global Relations informed the Board that the relevant Schools were in agreement with this development and that sufficient consideration had been given to any potential impact on the existing workload of the relevant academics.

**Action/Decision**

**059.1** The Board considered and approved the document from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer dated 13 November 2017.

**BD/17-18/060 University Council**

The Board noted and approved the draft Acta of the Council meeting of 25 October 2017.

**Action/Decision**

**060.1** The Board noted the proposal to change the criteria for the allocation of Entrance Exhibitions as had been approved by Council (minute CL/17-18/032 refers).

**060.2** It was also noted that due to the date of Easter in 2019, Trinity Week will be the second week of Trinity Term, week starting Monday 29 April 2019 (minute CL/17-18/034 refers).

**BD/17-18/061 Any Other Urgent Business**

There was one item of any other business:

**(i) Trans Day of Remembrance**

The Welfare Officer advised the Board that to commemorate Trans Day of Remembrance, Trinity Students' Union and Q Soc- Trinity LGBT will be hosting a candle-lit vigil in the Rose Garden on Monday 20 November 2017 at 18.00, where people will speak and a moment of silence will be held. He then extended an invitation to members of the Board to attend.

The Board noted the invitation to attend the vigil marking the Trans Day of Remembrance in The Rose Garden.

**SECTION B****BD/17-18/062 Board Business**

## (i) Callover

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 18 October 2017.

## (ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 18 October 2017.

**BD/17-18/063 Audit Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meetings of (i) 10 October and (ii) 17 October 2017.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Provost advised that a business case for systems development to ensure delivery of decisions on academic year structure and awards and progression has been developed and the importance of engagement with the college community was acknowledged.

*Professor Phelan left the meeting at this point.*

**BD/17-18/064 Finance Committee**

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer invited the Board's attention to those minutes of particular relevance to the Board.

In response to comments from a number of Board members who expressed disappointment that the Finance Committee could not achieve some form of compromise in relation to the proposed increase in student fees, the Provost advised the Board that compromise proposals had been considered at the Finance Committee but had not been accepted.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 20 October 2017.

**BD/17-18/065 Coiste na Gaeilge**

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting 2 June 2017.

The Board noted that the Irish Language Officer, Mr Aonghus Dwane, had left the university to take a role elsewhere and that the recruitment process for the Irish Language Officer post was on-going.

**BD/17-18/066 Quality Committee**

The Board approved the minutes of meeting of 5 October 2017, subject to the correction of the word 'immersion' in the fourth paragraph of minute QC/17-18/005.

**Action/Decision**

**066.1** It was noted that a revised procedure in relation to linked provider quality assurance procedures as required under the Qualifications & Quality Assurance (Education & Training) Act 2012 would be brought to a future meeting of Board for approval.

**BD/17-18/067 Human Resources Committee**

The Board noted and approved the draft Minutes of meeting of 19 October 2017. It was noted that draft policies were reviewed by the Executive Officer Group before being submitted to the relevant Board committee for consideration.

**SECTION C****BD/17-18/068 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted Higher Degrees, circulated, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 25 October 2017.

**BD/17-18/069 Visual and Performing Arts Fund 2017/18**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 20 October 2017.

**BD/17-18/070 Proctors' Lists for Autumn Commencements**

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 1 November 2017.

**BD/17-18/071 Prizes and Other Awards****(i) Eddie Hyland Prize**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Head of School of Social Sciences and Philosophy, circulated, dated 19 October 2017.

**(ii) William Lyons Prize**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Head of School of Social Sciences and Philosophy, circulated, dated 19 October 2017.

**(iii) Lennox Bursary**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Student Support Officer, circulated, dated 2 November 2017.

**BD/17-18/072 Committee Membership - Student Conduct and Capacity**

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 7 November 2017.

**BD/17-18/073 Related Entity Financial Reporting**

The Board noted the memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer dated 10 October 2017.

**BD/17-18/074 Sealings**

The Board noted the sealings, as circulated.

**This information is restricted due to commercial sensitivity.**

**SECTION D**

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed: .....

Date: .....

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**