Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Minutes of Board Meeting of 29 April 2015
held at St James Hospital, Dublin 8, by kind invitation.

Present
Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Bursar (Professor G J Lacey), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G Martin), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey), Dr O Braiden, Ms K Byrne, Mr F Cowzer, Professor P Coxon, Professor W J Dowling, Professor S Draper, Professor E Drew, Ms S Dunphy, Mr D Frost, Mr G J Garrahan, Ms M Lee, Professor C McCabe, Professor J F McGilp, Mr D McGlacken-Byrne, Mr I Mooney, Professor D O’Neill, Professor C O’Farrelly, Professor D R Phelan, Professor A Seery.

Apologies
Mr J Gallagher, Professor B Lucey, Professor M Ó Siochrú.

In attendance
Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms Victoria Butler).

(ex officio)
Secretary to the College (Mr John Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr Ian Mathews).

(by invitation)
Chief Operating Officer (Ms Geraldine Ruane).
The Interim Director of the Science Gallery, Mr Ian Brunswick and the Chair of the Science Gallery Board, Mr Shay Garvey for item BD/14-15/220.
The Dean of Research for item BD/14-15/243.

SECTION A

BD/14-15/215 Statement of Interest
Mr Garrahan declared a statement of interest in relation to item A.6 (i) Progress Report on the Library. It was agreed that he would remain in the room and take a full part in the discussions on this item.

BD/14-15/216 Minutes of the Meeting of 25 March 2015
The minutes of 25 March 2015 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

BD/14-15/184(ii) amend the last sentence to read ‘A new permanent campus is being constructed on Roosevelt Island with a view to having a campus in a metropolitan centre. He had also been an observer at an Engineering advisory board meeting.’

BD/14-15/189 amend the second sentence to read ‘61% attendance rate.’

BD/14-15/192(i) include the sentence: ‘it was noted that College retained its policy of encouraging open discussion and a wide variety of speakers’.

BD/14-15/217 Matters Arising from the Minutes
There were several matters arising from the minutes and these have been recorded below.
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

**BD/14-15/187 Student Charges – Revised Proposals**
In response to comments from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board of the context in which the revised proposals on student charges had been prepared and presented to Board for approval. A number of Board members clarified their view in relation to the decision taken to approve the revised proposals and clarification was provided in relation to the conduct of Board meetings in general. The distinction between recording a dissent and voicing an opinion was noted as was the fact that there had been consensus on the decision to approve the revised proposals and that a vote of the Board had not been requested. It was agreed that the minutes were an accurate reflection of this agenda item at the meeting of 25 March 2015.

**BD/14-15/183 Marriage Referendum**
The Secretary to the College provided an update in relation to the possibility of hosting a polling station on campus. He informed the Board that he and the President of the Students Union had met with officials in the Department of the Environment, Local Government and Community to explore the possibility of hosting a polling station in College. It was noted that this would not be a possibility for the upcoming referenda. In response to a query from a Board member, it was noted that significant efforts to assist students in registering on the electoral register and in applying for postal votes had been made.

**BD/14-15/192(i) Departures Framework Appointment**
In response to a query from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer assured the Board that confirmation would be provided that the contract issued for such appointments would contain details of the required deliverables and associated key performance indicators.

**BD/14-15/218 Provost’s Report**
The Provost provided an update to Board members on the following items:

(i) **Engineering, Energy, and the Environment (E3)**
The Provost advised the Board that he had recently travelled to San Francisco where he conducted philanthropic activity in support of the E3 project including a specifically targeted E3 fundraising dinner which had been attend by potential supporters of the project. He informed the Board that he would also be attending a meeting later that day with the Higher Education Authority HEA to discuss the E3 project.

(ii) **Working Group on Seanad Reform.**
The Provost advised the Board that the Working Group on Seanad Reform established by An Taoiseach had issued its report and invited the Secretary to the College to comment on this item. The Secretary to the College advised the Board that the report seems to accept the proposal for a single, six-member university/third level graduate panel, it does make some proposals for extending new technology to the postal voting system including allowing voters to download ballot papers rather than having to have them posted out to them. Also, in the future, it is proposed that graduates may choose to vote either on the third level panel or on one of the other panels. He advised the Board that it is likely that the next election may be held under the existing rules with any changes applying to the election after that.

(iii) **Admissions Criteria**
The Senior Lecturer provided the Board with an update in relation to the proposed national changes to third level admissions criteria and Leaving Certificate grading bands. She noted that the Minister for Education and Skills is expected to make an announcement on this item later in the day. She advised the Board of the some of the proposed amendments, noting that Universities are to retain the right to set their own admissions criteria, and that many of the proposals had already been discussed by Council.
The Provost welcomed the Chair of the Audit Committee and the Internal Auditor who attended for this item.

The Chair of the Audit Committee thanked the Board for the opportunity to discuss the Audit Committee Annual Report 2014-15 and then provided a summary of the key items addressed in the report.

In particular, the Chair of the Audit Committee noted the successful publication of the College’s Strategic Plan 2014-2019. She advised the Board that the Audit Committee is keen to be effective in its role and to contribute to the successful realisation by the Board of the goals in the plan. This would be achieved by the Committee providing independent and objective views of issues and by the Committee reviewing the underpinning systems of internal control.

The Chair of the Audit Committee drew the Board’s attention to some of the current governance challenges for College as detailed in the report noting that the decreasing level of State funding and the increased State focus on value for money and return on investment add to those challenges and to the importance of maintaining good systems of control and compliance. She advised the Board that the introduction of training for Heads of School and the recent Data Protection training which had been provided was welcomed in helping to ensure awareness of policies and procedures in a widely devolved structure, noting that the broadening of awareness and the extension of training should be a constant feature of strengthening governance.

Speaking in relation to the strategic planning process, the Chair of the Audit Committee informed the Board that the identification of owners for specific goals in the plan, and the development of explicit targets with timelines to underpin the plan, was particularly welcome as well as the assessment of the risks associated with them. She advised that the Committee recommended the development of appropriate management information systems to facilitate the monitoring of progress towards achieving those targets and that the risk assessment of the Plan should be kept under review as a live document to assist in that regard.

The Chair of the Audit Committee noted the importance of effective risk management as an essential element in good governance and noted that further embedding of a risk management framework was required in the College, which is being developed by the Chief Operating Officer and a working group. She also welcomed the assessment of the risks associated with the implementation of the Strategic Plan and advised that this now needs to be broadened to give visibility to all College risks and embedded at operating levels to assist in monitoring progress on achievement of strategic goals. She noted that the Audit Committee recommends that the revisions to the risk management process are completed and implemented with urgency.

Speaking in relation to the organisation of College governance, the Chair of the Audit Committee noted the completion of START and the recent audit of the implementation of FIS which was undertaken. She advised the Board of the need for the capacity to continue to implement changes to the standard system where necessary to meet genuine user requirements and the need for urgent focus on the business transformation and intelligence elements of the FIS project. Drawing on the experience gained in the FIS implementation audit, she encouraged Board to reflect on issues which had arisen due to the devolved structures and perceived boundaries between Schools and central administration and questioned whether there is scope to improve how administrative processes are handled in academic areas and develop better understanding between academic areas, school administration and central administration.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
The Chair of the Audit Committee thanked the Board for its decision and support for the recruitment of a Deputy Internal Auditor and noted that while no appointment had as of yet been made, the recruitment process for this position was continuing.

Referring to work carried out during the period, the Chair of the Audit Committee drew the particular attention of the Board of the audit of the SFI-funded Research Centre for Advanced Materials and Bioengineering Research (AMBER) which reinforced some issues seen in the FIS implementation audit and The Irish LongituDinal Study on Ageing (TILDA) which highlights some significant risks. She particularly welcomed the proactive engagement of staff and the efforts made to address issues which had been identified in these audits. She also drew attention to some of the significant internal control matters and the Committee’s opinion on internal control as set out in the report.

Noting that some of the previous recommendations of the Audit Committee remain outstanding, the Chair of the Audit Committee advised the Board that until such recommendations are implemented there will be some element of associated on-going risk carried by the College.

The Provost thanked the Chair of the Audit Committee and opened the item for questions or comments. He advised the Board that the Executive Officer Group would prepare a detailed response to the report for consideration at a future meeting.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Chair of the Audit Committee advised that much progress had been made in broadening communication on policies and procedures across the College and welcomed the provision of training to Heads of Schools. She also advised the Board that change management and the benefit realization process can typically present difficulties for organisations and that this would need to be monitored in College. The Provost noted that this issue would be considered when drafting the response to the report. He also noted that it might be timely to review the current procedures for the appointment of Faculty Deans and Heads of Schools with a view to ensuring that the recruitment process is robust and enables the attraction of suitable candidates.

The Provost invited the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer to comment in relation to the section in the report on the FIS project. Noting that the FIS project was a large scale project, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer acknowledged and welcomed the observations contained in the report. He assured the Board that the FIS team is focused on the challenges ahead and that on-going training and engagement with staff would occur including via the User Group. He advised the Board that some changes would be implemented in the project and that a detailed update on the project would be brought to a future meeting of the Board. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that it could sometimes be difficult to get acceptance for the new procedures as there was sometimes a preference in the Schools for the existing methods and that efforts were being made to address this. The Provost advised the Board that further changes would be required under FIS and that work would continue to ensure that there is an effective system in place that meets genuine user requirements.

In response to a comment from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that the Dean of Research and the Librarian and College Archivist were reviewing procedures for the retention of research data sets and data protection. The Chair of the Audit Committee informed the Board that the Audit Committee were very aware of the serious risks in this area and would continue to monitor this.

In response to comments from Board members regarding the selection and appointment of Heads of School, the Provost advised the Board that it may be appropriate to supplement the existing election process with a more defined set of roles and responsibilities for the post and an enhanced mechanism to attract candidates.

The Chair of the Audit Committee concluded her remarks by thanking the members of the Audit Committee for their contributions over the last year and noted the recent retirement of an...
external member of the committee after six years of service. She also thanked the Internal Auditor and staff.

The Board noted and welcomed the Audit Committee Annual Report which had been circulated and the recommendations contained therein. It was noted that a response to the report would be prepared by the Executive Officer Group and would be brought to a future meeting of the Board for consideration.

The Provost, on behalf of the Board, thanked the Chair of the Internal Audit and the Internal Auditor who left the meeting at this point.

**BD/14-15/220 Science Gallery Annual Review 2014**

The Provost welcomed the Interim Director of the Science Gallery, Mr Ian Brunswick and the Chair of the Science Gallery Board, Mr Shay Garvey to the meeting.

The Interim Director invited the Board’s attention to a presentation outlining the activity in the Science Gallery Dublin in 2014. He provided an update to the Board on the performance of the Science Gallery for 2014 under the following 5 headings:

- Attendance
- Touring
- Trinity Involvement
- Innovation Academy
- New Entrants Survey.

The Interim Director informed the Board that there were 406,982 visitors to the Science Gallery in 2014, the core group of which were 15-25 years old. He noted that 45% of new entrants to the College were aware of the Science Gallery before starting their course. It was also noted that exhibitions toured Taipei and San Diego and that future tours were planned for Kuala Lumpur, Barcelona and Melbourne.

The Chair of the Science Gallery Board provided the Board with an overview of the financial statements of the Science Gallery for 2014. He advised the Board that it had been a positive year for the Science Gallery with a 9% increase in income on the previous year. He noted that the significant growth in income from touring activity had contributed to this and that it is envisaged that this activity would be further developed. It was also noted that ESB Ireland had joined the Science Circle group of supporters. The Chair of the Science Gallery Board also advised the Board that all non-priority spends had been removed from the operational budget and that a repayment had been made to the College for the start-up funding originally provided.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that a significant effort had been made by the management of the Science Gallery to grow income generating activity and to reduce costs. She also noted that this had been achieved during a period of significant change including a change in Director and that the Science Gallery team should be commended for this.

The following comments were noted:

- The programme of events is commendable;
- The sustainability of the model was satisfactory;
- The possibility to develop Scholarship opportunities should be explored.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Interim Director advised the Board that the funding profile of the Science Gallery was being explored and that applications were being submitted for funding under the Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme.
Following a comment from a Board member in relation to the use of social media channels to promote the activity of the Science Gallery, the Interim Director informed the Board that work was underway to further develop this area of activity.

In response to a query from a Board member the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer clarified that VAT had been recovered on a one off, cumulative basis and that this would be factored in to the future financial projections for the Science Gallery.

The Vice-President for Global Relations emphasised to the Board the importance of the touring programmes of the Science Gallery to the Global Relations Strategy. She advised the Board that the tours had made a significant contribution to international student recruitment and the showcasing of research.

The Board approved and noted the Science Gallery Annual Review 2014. The Provost thanked the Chair and Interim Director who left the meeting at this point.

**BD/14-15/221 Quality**

(i) **Progress Report on the Library**
The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited the Board’s attention to the Progress Report for the Library which had been circulated and her memorandum dated 20 March 2015. She advised the Board that a Progress Report on the implementation of the Reviewers’ Recommendations was considered by the Quality Committee at its meeting on the 5 March 2015 and the Librarian attended for the discussion. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that all of the recommendations as identified by the reviewers had been completed or were in train. She also noted the appointment of the Librarian and College Archivist and the change in the reporting structure where the Library now forms part of the Academic Services Division. In particular, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer drew the Board’s attention to the Library materials storage issue noting that significant work was being conducted to address this issue both at a College and a national level.

The Board noted and approved the Progress Report of the Library, dated 20 March 2015. The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer for the comprehensive report.

(ii) **Review Reports**

(a) **Day Nursery**
The Chief Operating Officer introduced this item noting that the quality review had been very insightful and helpful. She advised the Board that the Review Report and recommendations were discussed at the Quality Committee on 5 March 2015. In particular she advised the Board of an external review which had also been conducted. She noted that staff in the Nursery were very engaged in the review process. She invited the Board’s attention to some of the issues which had been identified by the review, the Chief Operating Officer noted that the relevant policies for the Day Nursery were under review and that actions were being taken to ensure comprehensive fire, health and safety compliance.

The Provost thanked the Chief Operating Officer and opened the item for discussion. In response to comments from Board members, the Chief Operating Officer advised the Board that immediate actions were being taken to address any issues identified as part of the review. In response to a query from a Board member, the Chief Operating Officer clarified that a review of the Day Nursery is scheduled for every seven years.

The Provost advised the Board that this item would be brought to a future meeting of the Board for consideration through the implementation reports and that the Board would have the opportunity to consider the most appropriate way to address any

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
outstanding issues. The contribution of the staff of the Nursery was noted in that reliable childcare where children were happy was being provided.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Chief Operating Officer clarified the timeline for the implementation plan and advised the Board that weekly meetings with the staff in the Day Nursery were in place.

The importance of providing childcare facilities to staff was noted and in particular, the importance of this service in attracting staff and students.

The Provost thanked Board members for their comments and noted that the implementation plan would come to a future meeting of the Board.

The Board noted and approved the Review Report for the Day Nursery, dated 20 March 2015.

(b) College Health Service

The Chief Operating Officer introduced this item noting that the College Health Service was a key service for the College. She noted that the Health Service had been expanding the range of services provided even though funding to the service had decreased in recent years. She informed the Board that the issue of waiting lists was being addressed by a ticketed waiting list system and that the Director of the College Health Service was actively liaising with her office and the Interim Director of Human Resources to address the staffing levels in the service. It was noted that it is envisaged that the Health Service will relocate to Oisín House once the space becomes available.

The Bursar/Director of Strategic Innovation advised the Board that it is envisaged that the Oisín House redevelopment would be completed in 2017.

In response to comments from Board members, the importance of the services offered by the College Health Service, and in particular to international students, was noted.

Following comments from a Board member in relation to patient: doctor ratios, health service charges and the findings of the review it was suggested that the Chief Operating Officer could discuss this issue further with the Board member, with a view to addressing the points raised in the Implementation Report which will be submitted to the Board.

Following comments from a Board member, the Provost clarified for the Board that this review was part of a quality review and that budgetary matters would be addressed through the Annual Budgetary Cycle. In response to a comment from a Board member as to why the Director of the College Health Service was not invited to the Board meeting, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that the Director of the Health Service was invited to discuss this review at the Quality Committee.

In response to comments from a Board member, the Chief Operating Officer advised the Board that the Director of Estates and Facilities was currently reviewing suitability of the reception area of the Health Service and the area outside of the building where queues can form.

The Provost thanked all who had been involved in the review of the College Health Service noting the importance of this service to such strategies as the Global Relations Strategy. He also noted comments from a Board member in relation to the use of the service and the relationship with the students’ local GP practices.

The Board noted and approved the Review Report for the College Health Service, dated 20 March 2015.
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that the College is operating in very constrained circumstances and yet continues, where possible, to fill vacancies and recruit staff. She noted that once the College-level division of budgets are made (which are made according to the Board-agreed principles) the further decision as to the areas in which staff are recruited is made at a Faculty level. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer suggested and it was agreed that she would bring data in relation to trends in the staff student ratios at College, Faculty and School levels to the next Board meeting, and that the other aspects of the 15/16 budgetary allocations would be brought to Board via the Planning Group Report scheduled to be presented for the June 27th Board meeting.

A Board member highlighted the need to address the issue of equity between all levels of staff in relation to teaching load.

A Board member commented on the academic consequences of delivering a balanced budget. It was noted that the requirement to deliver a balanced budget at a College level can pose difficulties for areas with a need to recruit staff but which are financially constrained and that perhaps this decision should be reviewed. The need to monitor staff workloads and to ensure balance across all staff was also noted.

In response to comments from a Board member regarding the need to further raise awareness of the reduction in financial investment in the sector, the Provost advised that the ABC meetings, chaired by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, are the most appropriate forum for a School and Faculty to address budgetary concerns.

Section B

BD/14-15/226 Board Business
(i) Callover
The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 25 March 2015.

(ii) Outcomes
The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 25 March 2015.

BD/14-15/227 Audit Committee
The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of 14 April 2015.

BD/14-15/228 Coiste na Gaeilge
The Chair of the Committee advised the Board that following a complaint from the Language Commissioner, corrective action had been taken and the matter was now resolved. A monitoring report on the implementation of the second language scheme 2013-2016 had also been provided to the Language Commissioner and it was noted that the Irish Language Officer is working with the Schools to ensure that voicemails on College phones are also recorded in Irish.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the meeting of 19 February 2015.

SECTION C

BD/14-15/229 Higher Degrees
The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 25 March and 15 April 2015, as circulated:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
BD/14-15/230  Proctors’ Lists for Spring Commencements
The Board noted that the Proctors’ Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 31 March 2015.

BD/14-15/231  Board Meeting of 24 June 2015 – Attendance of incoming SU/GSU representatives
The Board noted and approved the attendance of incoming SU/GSU representatives as observers at the last meeting of Board.

BD/14-15/232  Heads of School
The Board noted and approved the nomination of the following to Head of School:
(i)  **Languages, Literatures and Cultural Studies (2015-2018)**
Professor Juergen Barkhoff, 29 June 2015;
(ii) **English (2015-2018)**
Professor Chris Morash;
(iii) **Psychology (2015-2016)**
Professor Ian Robertson;
(iv) **Social Sciences and Philosophy (2015-2018)**
Professor Gail McElroy.

BD/14-15/233  Prizes and Other Awards
(i) **Mr W Henry Naylor and his sister Mrs Henrietta Downes Bursary**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Head of History and Art and Architecture, circulated, dated 14 April 2015;
(ii) **St Patrick’s Mental Health Service Award**
to note a memorandum from the School Administrator, School of Nursing and Midwifery, circulated, dated 31 March 2015 and to approve the Calendar entry;
(iii) **Law Centenary Fund**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Student Support Officer, circulated, dated 13 April 2015;
(iv) **Taverners Cricket Sports Bursary**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Student Support Officer circulated, dated 13 April 2015.

BD/14-15/234  Committees – International Committee Membership
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the International Committee, circulated, dated 13 April 2015.

BD/14-15/235  Science Gallery International – Members and Directors
Board noted and approved a memorandum from Dr Michael John Gorman, CEO Science Gallery International, circulated, dated 12 April 2015.

BD/14-15/236  Permissions – Library – Loan of Papyrus MS PAP F.18
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Librarian and College Archivist, circulated, dated 26 March 2015.

BD/14-15/237  Charities Regulatory Authority
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the College Solicitor, circulated, dated 22 April 2015.
BD/14-15/238  Charities Regulatory Authority

In response to a query from a Board member, the Secretary to the College clarified that to the purpose of his memorandum, dated 22 April 2015, was to seek Board approval for the nomination of the Provost, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer and the Secretary to the College as Trustees for the purpose of registration of the College as a charity with the Charities Regulatory Authority (CRA). He advised the Board that Board approval was sufficient to complete this process and no further documentation was required.

SECTION D

*In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted*

Signed: ........................................

Date: ........................................