

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting of 28 May 2014

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Bursar (Professor G J Lacey), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J H Ohlmeyer), Professor S D C Barrett, Professor M Bouroche, Dr O Braiden, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Ms S Dunphy, Mr D Frost, Mr J Gallagher, Mr G J Garrahan, Mr S Garry, Professor H Gibbons, Mr R Kenny, Mr J Leahy, Mr T Lenihan, Professor J F McGilp, Professor N Marples, Professor M Ó Siochrú, Professor H Rice.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor R Gilligan, Professor D O'Neill, Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman).
<i>In attendance</i>	Assistant Secretary to the College (Ms Victoria Butler), Ms Monica Alcock.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr Ian Mathews).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Interim Chief Operating Officer (Ms Geraldine Ruane).

Mr Paddy Naughton, FIS Project Manager and Dr Diarmuid O'Brien, Director of Trinity Research and Innovation attended for item BD/13-14/265.

Mr Tony McMahon, Director of Human Resources attended for item BD/13-14/272.

SECTION A

It was agreed that Agenda Item A.6 Financial information System(FIS)-Project Update would be considered in advance of item A.5 Review of Global Relations Strategy.

BD/13-14/259 Statement of Interest

The Provost requested Board members to declare any potential conflict of interest they may have in relation to items on the Board agenda.

As a current external member of the Board, Dr Olive Braiden declared a statement of interest In relation to Agenda item A.8. External Member of the Board.

Mr Frederick Cowzer declared a statement of interest in relation to Agenda items A.6 FIS Project Update as he is a member of the FIS Steering Committee and A.8. External Member of the Board as he is a member of the Sub-Committee of Board currently

tasked with making a recommendation to Board in respect to external Board membership.

Prof Melanie Bourroche declared a statement of interest in relation to Agenda item A.10 Annual Office 2014-2015 as the continuation in office of the Dean of Research had resource implications for her School.

BD/13-14/260 Minutes

The minutes of 30 April 2014 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments in relation to BD/13-14/241 (ii):

- amend the last line of the paragraph on START to read: 'the benefits realization phases of both projects were ongoing';
- amend the last line in the last paragraph on the Strategic Plan 2014-2019 to read: 'the Enterprise Centre was an option for the development of student accommodation'.
- Insert a third paragraph on page 3 to read as follows: 'In response to a comment from a Board member, the Provost advised that line managers should engage and communicate with Staff during the START process and that further consideration should be given to appropriate methods of communication. It was noted that engagement between the START project team and Staff representative bodies should be encouraged.'

BD/13-14/261 Matters Arising from the Minutes

There was one matter arising from the minutes which was discussed and has been recorded below, (see minute BD/13-14/262).

BD/13-14/262 Incident at Front Gate

The Chief Operating Officer updated Board in relation to minute BD/13-14/240 noting that an external contractor had been engaged to repair the front gates and the associated costs would be absorbed by a third party.

In response to a comment from a Board member, the Chief Operating Officer agreed to review the current practice in relation to early morning access to the College.

BD/13-14/263 Provost's Report

The Provost provided an update to Board members of current legislative developments that could have significant implications for the College with particular reference to the Technological Universities Bill. He advised Board that the Government had announced, in the legislative programme, its intention to publish a Higher Education Reform Bill, noting that the exact implications of the bill were unclear at present.

In response to a comment from a Board member, the Provost informed the Board that he is scheduled to meet with the Minister for Education and Skills and will seek further insight in to Government plans for legislation with respect to the Higher Education Sector.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/13-14/264 Strategic Plan 2014-2019 - Update**(i) Mission, Vision, Values**

The Board noted the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, dated 21 May 2014.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer drew Board's attention to a list of members, which had been tabled, of the Mission, Vision and Values Working Group and of the four pillar working groups, and invited the Provost, as chair of the Mission, Vision and Values Working Group to inform Board in relation to the proposed draft Values, and Mission and Vision statement for the University for the Strategic Plan 2014-2019.

The Provost outlined the context in which the proposed values of the College were drafted, i.e., that Trinity is a dynamic, entrepreneurial and creative university that builds on its unique achievements and founding values. In particular he advised the Board of the five values being proposed by the Working Group as follows:

- 1) Multidisciplinary excellence;
- 2) Diversity and inclusivity;
- 3) Dialogue, civic action and global citizenship;
- 4) Responsible governance;
- 5) Academic freedom.

He then drew the Board's attention to the proposed Vision statement and in particular the importance of noting the contribution of the University to Ireland and the world.

Speaking to the proposed Mission to be included in the Strategic Plan 2014-2019, the Provost emphasised the importance of providing a liberal environment where independence of thought is highly valued and noted the three core elements of the mission as being focused on education, research and innovation and society engagement.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer thanking the Provost opened the item for discussion.

In response to a comment from a Board member, it was noted that an amendment was required on page 1 of the document to replace the word 'British' with 'English'.

The Board welcomed the proposed Mission, Vision and Values and the following comments were noted:

- The context in which the new Strategic Plan is being prepared should reflect the difficult financial environment in which the College is currently operating and in particular the constraints being imposed by the Higher Education Authority;
- Consideration should be given to amending the last paragraph on page 3 of the document to read 'Trinity aspires to grow in reputation...' to reflect the challenges facing the College and the commitment of the College to remaining positive and aspirational.
- Consideration should be given to the inclusion of Bishop George Berkeley in the list of graduates included in the document.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

(ii) Strategic Objectives

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited the Board's attention to a presentation of the draft strategic objectives as linked to each of the components of the Mission. In particular she outlined the underpinning focus on people, systems and the next level for each of the key objectives.

She advised the Board that the draft text of the strategic plan along with some high level costings would be circulated in advance of the joint meeting of the Board and Council scheduled for Wednesday, 18 June 2014 with a view to having final sign off on the text of the plan in September 2014.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer for the presentation, noting that the presentation is also being given to the 3 Faculty Executives, and opened the item for discussion.

The Board welcomed the presentation, noting the importance of having an ambitious strategic plan and welcomed the objectives viewing them as exciting and inspiring.

In response to a comment from a Board member the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that it is envisaged that there will be published targets and measures set in line with the objectives in the Strategic Plan.

Noting comments from Board members, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer agreed to give consideration to emphasising the centrality of Ireland in Trinity's profile as well as addressing wider global issues. She also advised the Board that further discussion would be needed in relation to the proposed development of new career tracks for academics and how this would be reflected in the Strategic Plan. The inclusion of a specific element relating to clubs and societies was also welcomed.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that by way of reflecting the impact of government policy on the college in the Strategic Plan, the introduction to the plan would detail the context in which the plan has been prepared.

It was noted that the Provost and the Dean of Research are endeavouring to identify sustainable ways of diversifying research income and that further discussion on this issue could take place at the upcoming joint meeting of Board and Council.

The Board noted the presentation from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and it was agreed that a document outlining the key elements of the presentation would be circulated to Board members.

(iii) Scenario Planning for Growth in Non-EU Student Numbers

The Board noted the memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, dated 21 May 2014.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer invited the Board's attention to the memorandum, in particular the updated 5-year Consolidated Net Income and Expenditure projections and 3 growth scenarios which could inform the number of non-EU students, both additional and substituted, required over the life of the Strategic Plan to return College to financial sustainability i.e. a target of achieving a minimum of a 2% surplus year on year by 2018/19.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Provost thanked the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer for providing detailed options for the board to consider and opened the item for discussion, during which the following issues were raised:

- That a growth in non-EU student numbers would significantly impact on administrative and support functions of College;
- The difficulty in trying to plan when the exact reduction in public sector funding remains unknown;
- That there will be additional space and resource requirements to accommodate a growth in student numbers.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised the Board that a percentage of the additional income generated from a growth in non-EU student recruitment would be reserved to fund the associated administrative and support resource requirements. He also clarified that the scenarios as outlined in the memorandum did not include costs for any capital project requirements.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised the Board that the College was operating in a very challenging environment and facing very competitive markets in relation to non-EU student recruitment. Noting the requirement to diversify income sources and the continued reduction in government funding, he reminded the Board of the modest growth anticipated in EU student numbers as outlined in the Indecon report previously considered by Board (See BD/13-14/242), emphasising the need to further enhance non-EU student recruitment activity.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer clarified that while new College strategies may not directly result in benefit realisation in relation to academic staff, there may be other opportunities permitted within the Haddington Road Agreement that will facilitate the achievement of such academic benefit realisation.

In response to comments from Board members, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer clarified that under the funding statements as required by the Higher Education Authority, the College relied on the use of reserves to return a breakeven position in 2012-2013 and that in respect of consolidated reporting the College will be returning a deficit for 2013-14 due to upfront investment in key college strategies, noting it is envisaged that at an operational level a breakeven position is forecast. Informing Board members of the high cost base of the College, he advised the Board of the requirement to diversify income sources and the significant potential to be found in a growth in non-EU student recruitment.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board that third scenario, Scenario C, is currently the preferred scenario and plans for an 18% increase in non-EU student numbers and as such would not result in a reputational risk for the College.

The Board agreed the requests as outlined in the memorandum and as follows:

1. College should pursue a non-EU growth strategy.
2. Sources of revenue other than non-EU student number growth are required.
3. Benefits realisation could be expanded to academic staff.
4. Consideration should be given to re-profiling existing activity to reduce costs and the level of accumulated deficit to more manageable levels.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

It was noted that the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer is to bring further information to the next meeting of the Board regarding the financial position of the College for 2012/13 and 2013/14.

It was also noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer is preparing a discussion document for the joint meeting of Board and Council scheduled for 18 June 2014.

The Provost advised the Board that on review of the performance of comparable UK universities, an 18% increase in non-EU student numbers is viewed as achievable and thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer and the Planning Group for their work on this item to date.

Mr Jackie Gallagher left the meeting at this point.

BD/13-14/265 Financial Information System (FIS) Project Update

Mr Paddy Naughton, FIS Project Manager and Dr Diarmuid O'Brien, Director of Trinity Research and Innovation attended for this item.

The Board noted the memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, dated 21 May 2014.

The Director of Trinity Research and Innovation drew Board's attention to a progress report from the Chairman of the FIS Project Steering Committee, Mr. Brian Fitzgerald, dated 20.05.2014, as an update to the presentation made to Board in September 2013 (Board minute BD/13-14/011 of 11.09.2013 refers). It was noted that Phase I was now nearing completion with 1,200 users at present and Phase II had commenced. The Board was advised that while usage of the new financial systems is growing steadily, the issues initially experienced had now stabilised. It was also noted that the project is expected to finish on time and within budget. The Director of Trinity Research and Innovation advised the Board that benefits realisation remains a primary focus of the steering committee and it is envisaged that these will begin in 2015. He also advised the Board of the requirement for continued support from the Board of the College.

The Provost thanked the Director of Trinity Research and Innovation and opened the item for discussion.

In response to comments from Board members, the Director of Research and Innovation clarified that the steering committee was clear of the role of the Board in oversight and accountability and that it would continue to report to the College Board as appropriate. It was also noted that continued support by College Board and Executive Officers is required for the Project as originally approved in May 2012.

In response to comments from Board members regarding benefits realisation, the FIS Project Manager advised the Board that the business case for the project noted that benefits realisation would begin in year two. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer advised the Board that the contingency fund used to facilitate the embedding of the system was pre-approved through the appropriate governance structure. It was noted that the original baseline for the anticipated benefits to be realised from the project

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

had now decreased due to budget reductions and as such the expected level of benefits would need to be adjusted correspondingly.

The Board noted the progress update as provided by the Chairman of the FIS Project Steering Committee and presented by the Director of Trinity Research and Innovation.

BD/13-14/266 Review of the Global Relations Strategy

The Board noted the memorandum from the Vice-President of Global Relations, dated 21 May 2014.

The Vice-President for Global Relations provided an overview for the Board of the review of the Global Relations Strategy (GRS) noting that the review focused on how Global Relations and internationalisation can contribute to strengthening the education and research reputation of the College and securing financial stability. She invited Board's attention to the two charts on reputation and financial stability contained in the review and provided a summary of the Global Relations achievements to date. In particular, she advised the Board that the College had performed well in the recruitment of postgraduate taught non-EU students and in visiting 1 year students and that the College was on track to meet the GRS target of 14% of the student population being non-EU students by 2015/2016.

With reference to the preferred growth scenario as discussed under Item A.4 (iii) Strategic Plan Update - Scenario Planning for Growth in Non-EU Student Numbers, the Vice-President for Global Relations advised the Board that recommendations for the next phase of the Global Relations Strategy are structured around eight interconnected headings:

1. Direct student recruitment
2. Online delivery
3. Partnerships
4. Research campus
5. Research collaborations
6. Alumni engagement
7. Scholarships
8. Short-term programmes.

She advised the Board that she is working closely with the Dean for Online Education in relation to the online education initiative and also with the Faculties to encourage close partnerships with Universities across the globe.

The Vice-President for Global Relations concluded her remarks by advising Board that adequate capacity and fit for purpose IT systems would be required to facilitate a growth in the number of non-EU students in College.

The Provost thanked the Vice-President for Global Relations and opened the item for discussion and comment.

The Board welcomed the review and during the course of the discussion the following issues were raised:

- Robust supports will be required for the increased number of international students;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- The importance of building on the good relationships between the College and the United States and Canada;
- The need to manage the risk of being perceived as diminishing the skills and expertise of the countries of origin.

The Vice-President for Global Relations informed the Board of lack of capacity in countries such as India to meet the 3rd level educational needs of their population and as such the significant opportunities for international student recruitment which were open to the College.

The Registrar welcomed the inclusion of Alumni engagement and advised the Board that civic engagement in the countries from which the non-EU students are recruited should be encouraged. She also emphasised the need for clear definitions and College policies in relation to joint, dual and partnership degree programmes. In response to a comment from a Board member, the Vice-President for Global Relations advised the Board of the requirement to align College systems with the needs of the international student market. There was a general consensus that the examination cycle should be reviewed to allow flexibility to meet the needs of the planned growth in non-EU student numbers.

Responding to a query from a Board member, the Vice-President for Global Relations informed the Board that a review of the methods by which international students are recruited for the College is ongoing with a report to be submitted to the Executive Officers Group for consideration.

The Senior Lecturer informed the Board of the goodwill of Alumni whom he had encountered while on a visit to the United States and the attractiveness of the current postgraduate taught courses offered by the College to the North American market was noted.

The Vice-President for Global Relations clarified for the Board that as there were existing undergraduate courses in Canada which are very attractive to undergraduate students, the College was stronger in the recruitment of postgraduate students in that country.

The Provost thanked all who had contributed to the review document and it was noted that the integrated information provided in the review of the Global Relations Strategy would be considered in the preparation of the new Strategic Plan 2014-2019.

BD/13-14/267 Amendments to KPIs

This item was deferred until the meeting of 25 June 2014.

BD/13-14/268 External Member of the Board

Speaking to a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, the Assistant Secretary advised the Board that the sub-committee of Board, as established at the meeting of 30 April 2014 and chaired by the Provost, had met and now proposed five organisations from which nominations for an external member of Board could be sought. The sub-committee recommended a four year term of appointment, as with the current incumbent, and that each organisation be asked to nominate up to two individuals.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, dated 21 May 2014.

BD/13-14/269 Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees

The Board noted the memorandum from the Registrar dated 28 May 2014, which was tabled at the meeting. Following comments from Board Members in relation to one of the nominations, the Board asked that the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees reconsider the list of nominees as presented.

BD/13-14/270 Annual Office 2014-2015

The Provost invited Board's attention to a Memorandum dated 9 May 2014, which had been tabled advising Board of the nominations for Annual Officers for 2014-15 with effect from 25 August 2014.

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Provost.

The Board thanked the outgoing Officers for their contributions to date.

BD/13-14/271 University Council

The Board confirmed the draft Acta of the meeting of the University Council of 14 May 2014.

BD/13-14/272 Any Other Urgent Business

Professor of Business Studies - Departures Framework Appointment

The Director of Human Resources attended for this item.

At the invitation of the Provost, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Provost, dated 28 May 2014, which had been tabled. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer outlined the recruitment process which had been followed to date in respect of the Professor of Business Studies position. Noting that the preferred candidate currently has an offer of employment from another university, she informed Board of the proposal to invoke the Departures Framework under the Universities Act, 1997 (Agreed Framework between the Universities and the Higher Education Authority for Departures from Approved Levels of Remuneration, Fees, Allowances and Expenses for University Employees). She emphasised that this is a critical appointment for the University and the School of Business which is embarking on a major strategic development of the School and noted that it is envisaged that the newly appointed Professor of Business Studies will undertake an integrative role in leading the University's new innovation and entrepreneurship strategy. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer then invited the Director of Human Resources to outline the specific requirements of the request being put to the Board.

The Director of Human Resources informed the Board that a provision of the Departures Framework requires that the Governing Authority confirms that the Departure is necessary and secondly, as well as can be ascertained, confirms that the departure will have no adverse implications. The Director of Human Resources informed the Board that he had advised the Higher Education Authority of the

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

College's intention to invoke the Framework and it was confirmed that the proposed approach in relation to pay and pension arrangements is consistent with the requirements of the Framework. He advised the Board that the proposed departure was viewed as being within the norms of practice and similar departures had been exercised in other universities in the country.

It was noted that the pay arrangement is proposed for an initial period of five years, with the option to renew for a further five years, at which point the appointee may revert to standard pay arrangements.

During the course of a discussion the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (i) The issue of reputational damage and the risk of creating a precedent for future appointments should such a departure be agreed;
- (ii) The possibility that the position may only secure the candidate for the short term, regardless of the efforts of the College;
- (iii) The importance of ensuring that this is a world-class appointment.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Director of Human Resources quantified the monetary value of the proposed departure and confirmed that the counter offer of employment had been verified.

In response to a request from Board members to provide written notification to the Higher Education Authority, the Provost and the Director of Human Resources confirmed that such notification would be made.

Following a comment from a Board member, the Provost advised the Board that the potential reputational risk had been considered and it was viewed that the risk to the strategic development of the School of Business should this departure not be approved, would be of greater concern to the College.

In response to a comment from a Board member the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that the proposed increase in remuneration for this position would be performance-related and that the preferred candidate had been asked to outline a strategy to develop the School of Business as part of the recruitment process.

The Provost advised the Board that in view of the strategic importance of the appointment to the College and the calibre and mobility of the preferred candidate it is viewed that the departure is necessary.

The dissent of Professor Gibbons was noted.

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Provost dated 28 May 2014 subject to written notification on the proposal being provided to the Higher Education Authority.

Section B

BD/13-14/273 Board Business

(i) Callover

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 26 March, reconvened on 2 April 2014.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In response to a query from a Board member, the Assistant Secretary agreed to circulate further details in relation to the proposal to conduct Board business electronically.

(ii) **Outcomes**

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meetings of 26 March, reconvened 2 April 2014.

Following a comment from a Board member, the Provost advised the Board that the Secretary's Office endeavours to ensure that the circulation of Board papers is conducted in a timely manner and that every effort will be made to minimise delays, where possible, for future circulations.

Section C

BD/13-14/274 Joint Board and Council Meeting - 18 June 2014

The Board noted that a joint meeting of Board and Council had been convened to discuss the Strategic Plan 2014-2019, at 10 a.m. on Wednesday, 18 June 2014 and members of Board and Council have been advised of the arrangements.

BD/13-14/275 Board Membership - Graduate Students' Union

The Board noted that Ms Megan Lee has been elected President of the Graduate Students' Union and would serve as a member of the Board for 2014-2015.

BD/13-14/276 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 14 May 2014, as circulated.

BD/13-14/277 Headship of Schools - Faculty of Engineering, Mathematics and Science - 1 July 2014 to 30 June 2017

The Board noted and approved the following nominations:

- (i) **School of Biochemistry and Immunology**
Professor Gavin Davey, Associate Professor in Neuroscience, Biochemistry;
- (ii) **School of Computer Science and Statistics**
Professor Jeremy Jones, Associate Professor in Computer Science, Computer Systems;
- (iii) **School of Physics**
Professor Igor V Shvets, Professor of Applied Physics (2007), Physics;
- (iv) **School of Natural Sciences**
Professor Fraser J G Mitchell, Professor in Quaternary Ecology, Botany;
- (v) **School of Genetics and Microbiology**
Professor J Charles Dorman, Professor of Microbiology (1975), Microbiology.

BD/13-14/278 Deanship of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences (2014-2019)

The Board noted that Professor Darryl Jones has been elected to the Deanship of the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Science with effect from 30 June 2014 to the last day of Trinity Term 2019.

BD/13-14/279 Tutorship

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 20 May 2014.

BD/13-14/280 GeneSIS Project Observation Report (BD/13-14/201 of 26 March 2014 refers)

The Board noted a memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, circulated, dated 21 May 2014.

BD/13-14/281 Related Entity Financial Reporting - National Digital Research Centre (NDRC) - y/e 31 December 2012

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, circulated, dated 31 March 2014.

BD/13-14/282 Committees - Organ Committee - Revised Terms of Reference and Membership

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 21 May 2014.

BD/13-14/283 Prizes and Other Awards - Calendar Entry (Page T20) - Professor John G Byrne Prize

The Board noted and approved the following *Calendar* entry:
'This prize was established in 2014 with funds provided by *Alumni* of the School in honour of Professor John G Byrne, Chair of Computer Science 1973-2003, and Head of the Department of Computer Science from its founding in 1969 to 1987 and from 1990 to 2001. In celebration of excellence, the prize is awarded annually to the student who achieves the highest overall result in the Masters Year of the Integrated Computer Science course provided it is at Distinction level. Value, €1024.'

Section D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted

Signed:

Date: