

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 11 September 2013

| | |
|------------------------|---|
| <i>Present</i> | Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor G J Lacey), Professor S D C Barrett, Professor M Bourcoche, Dr O Braiden, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Mr D Frost, Mr J Gallagher, Mr G J Garrahan, Mr S Garry, Professor H Gibbons, Mr R Kenny, Mr J Leahy, Mr T Lenihan, Professor N Marples, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor D O'Neill, Professor M Ó Siochrú, Professor H J Rice. |
| <i>Apologies</i> | Professor E Drew, Professor R Gilligan, Professor J McGilp, Professor J Ohlmeyer. |
| <i>In attendance</i> | Assistant Secretary (Ms V Butler), Ms S Mac Bride. |
| <i>(ex officio)</i> | Secretary to the College (Mr J Coman), Treasurer (Mr I Mathews). |
| <i>(by invitation)</i> | Chief Operating Officer (Ms D Kneafsey). Chair of FIS Project Board, Mr B Fitzgerald (for BD/13-14/011) Project Manager of FIS, Mr P Naughton (for BD/13-14/011) |

SECTION A

BD/13-14/ 001 Statutory Declaration

Messrs. Garry, Kenny, Leahy and Lenihan, attending their first meeting, made the statutory declaration as required under the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.

BD/13-14/002 Assistant Secretary

Further to the update provided to the Board on 26 June 2013 (BD/12-13/342) it was noted that Ms Victoria Butler had since been appointed to the position of Assistant Secretary. The Board welcomed the Assistant Secretary, who will act as minute secretary for the Board, to the meeting.

BD/13-14/003 Statement of Interest

The Provost requested Board members to declare any potential conflict of interest they may have in relation to any issues on the Board agenda.

With reference to item A.6, Professor Barrett declared a potential conflict of interest in relation to his membership of the Seanad. The Board agreed that he should present his views on the matter and then withdraw from the meeting for the item.

BD/13-14/004 Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 26 June 2013 were approved and signed.

BD/13-14/005 Matters Arising

A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/13-14/006, 007, 008, 009 below).

BD/13-14/006 START Update (see minute BD/12-13/330 of 26 June 2013)

The Secretary advised Board that the paper on START, as discussed at the meeting of 26 June 2013, had been released to two trade unions upon request.

BD/13-14/007 GeneSIS Update (see minute BD/12-13/332 of 26 June 2013)

The Treasurer informed Board that the nomination for appointment of an Independent Monitor was before Board for approval under item C.8. (see Minute BD/13-14/027 below).

BD/13-14/008 Cluster Governance Principles (see minute BD/12-13/335 of 26 June 2013)

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised the Board of the establishment of a Working Group comprising of the four Heads of the relevant Institutes and the four Heads of Departments/ Schools of Education from Trinity, UCD, NCAD and MIE to oversee the establishment of a new Institute of Education. It was noted that a final proposal would be brought to Board for consideration before the end of the academic year and that any proposals regarding governance will be brought to Board in draft format in advance of their finalisation. Board also agreed that a guiding principle for this process should be to ensure that input from the relevant academic subject areas is taken in to account as appropriate.

BD/13-14/009 Consolidated Financial Statements y/e 30 September 2011 (see minute BD/12-13/324 of 26 June 2013)

The Treasurer advised the Board that he had formally confirmed with the EIB their satisfaction with the existing loan repayment arrangements. The Board noted that the Treasurer had also liaised informally with the HEA regarding the repayment structure of the EIB loan and the possible review of same. The Treasurer was requested to engage in a formal dialogue with the HEA on this matter in due course in the context of future capital projects approved by the Board.

BD/13-14/010 Provost's Report

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, as Chair for this item, directed the Board's attention to the memorandum, dated 4 September 2013, from the Provost outlining a programme of work to be undertaken during the coming academic year, and invited the Provost to speak to the objectives and priorities of the work plan. The Provost addressed the four main items of the programme as follows:

(i) Strategic Planning, and consolidation of existing plans

The Provost highlighted to Board that the Strategic Plan (2014-2019) is to be developed over the coming year and will be ready for launch at the end of the

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

academic year. Noting that the Vice-Provost/ Chief Academic Officer will be responsible for the delivery of the plan to Board, the Provost emphasised the importance of consolidating the existing strategies that have been developed in the last two years into the new Strategic Plan. The Provost noted the significant potential to increase revenue to College arising from these strategies which could result in an increase in recruitment potential and will enable College to maintain a lower staff: student ratio. The Director of Communications and Marketing had recently started and the College branding strategy would be launched with the Strategic Plan. A number of key strategic issues would be brought to Board in the strategic planning process, including whether the College should increase in size substantially from its current level of 17,000 students.

(ii) Projects

The Provost advised Board of the main projects he will monitor in the coming academic year, in conjunction with the relevant Executive Officer. These are listed as follows:

- i. eStrategy projects (GeneSIS, FIS, Core HR, and Identity Management)
- ii. Infrastructure projects, including
 - a. Business School/ Central Services Building;
 - b. E3 - Engineering, Energy and the Environment;
 - c. Student Residences
- iii. Online Education project
- iv. START - Administration and support services reform
- v. Admissions feasibility project
- vi. Trinity Global Graduate Forum project

The Provost noted that the outcomes of all these projects will inform the development of the Strategic Plan, and enable it to be implemented

(iii) External Relationships

The Provost advised Board that the development of relationships and the representation of the College externally will continue to be central to his activities. In particular good relationships will need to be maintained with the Government in light of the central issues relating to the Landscape process/clusters, the Heads of Bill to amend the Universities Act, the Employment Control Framework, and the Haddington Road Agreement. The Provost noted that a good interaction will also need to be maintained with the Higher Education Authority with a view to completing the mission-based compacts and the College engaging with the development of governance for the Dublin Pillar 1 cluster. The Provost also noted the importance of building strong relationships with philanthropy, peer institutions, funding bodies and industry.

(iv) General Management

The Provost advised Board that he will continue to chair Board, Council, and Finance Committee as well as Executive Officers, professional appointment panels and promotion review committees taking ultimate responsibility for the effective delivery of the educational and research mission of the university.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer thanked the Provost for presenting the work plan and opened the item for discussion.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In the course of the discussion, the following observations were expressed by Board members:

- (i) there has been significant contribution from academic staff in the School of Engineering and the School of Natural Sciences in developing the E3 strategy,
- (ii) the urgent need for an increase in student accommodation should be addressed,
- (iii) retaining a focus on governance, in particular project governance, should be prioritised,
- (iv) the issue of staff engagement in College administrative roles and posts of responsibility should be considered in the work programme.

In response to the items raised by Board members, the Provost clarified that while staff in the two schools have indeed been actively engaged in the E3 project; further progress was required in relation to fundraising. He also noted that he and the Bursar are to take a leadership role in pursuing an increase in student accommodation which is a current priority for College.

Referring to the Board approved policy on project governance; the Provost assured Board members that all current and future projects are to be conducted in line with this policy.

The Board noted the memorandum from the Provost as presented outlining a programme of work to be undertaken during the coming academic year and noted that he will present a report providing an update on progress to Board in June 2013.

Noting that the work programme for the academic year 2013-14 is to incorporate the following items:

- (i) Strategic Planning, and consolidation of existing plans
- (ii) Projects
- (iii) External Relationships
- (iv) General management,

it was noted that the Provost would include the issue of staff engagement in College administrative roles and posts of responsibility in the work programme and is to discuss this item with the Director of Human Resources.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer thanked the Provost and noted that an update on the work plan will be presented to Board at the end of the academic year. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer was excused from the meeting at that point in order to attend a briefing in the HEA.

BD/13-14/011 Financial Information System

The Chair of the FIS Project Board, Mr Brian Fitzgerald and the Project Manager, Mr Paddy Naughton, present by invitation, presented to Board an update on the Financial Information System project.

Mr Fitzgerald commended the work of the project team in following best practice, ensuring a high degree of engagement with all stakeholders and the strict adherence to project governance which was demonstrated over the past 15 months.

It was noted that great attention to the change management process would now be required as the project is entering the benefits realisation phase.

In response to a query the Treasurer advised Board that a clear business case was in place and that through a detailed programme of discussion and communication, significant consultation would be conducted with the relevant decisions makers to facilitate staff redeployment as the need for this emerges.

Mr Fitzgerald, in response to an observation regarding the pause to the HR system development due to the concentration on the FIS project, acknowledged that the College is working to a broad programme of change at present and noted that it is envisaged that the HR system development will remain in a position to deliver its own objectives.

The Board noted the presentation by Chair of the Project Board as presented. The Board also noted the go-live implementation date of the 1 October 2013 for the FIS Project.

The Provost, on behalf of the Board, thanked all who have been involved in this process to date and the Board commended the work of all involved in achieving the delivery of this project on time and within budget to date.

BD/13-14/012 Honorary Degrees

The Registrar invited Board's attention to the recommendations of the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees which was tabled at the meeting. The Registrar reminded Board of the confidential nature of the recommendations and asked for the Board to review and approve the nominations.

During the course of a discussion the Board noted some observations by Board members in relation to future awards as follows:

- (i) consideration should be given to acknowledging the trade union movement in Ireland and in particular the centenary of the 1913 Labour Lockout,
- (ii) the importance of ensuring a gender balance,
- (iii) the potential such awards provide for College with respect to inviting high profile attendees.

The recommendations of the Advisory Committee were approved as presented.

BD/13-14/013 Seanad Éireann

The Provost invited Board's attention to a briefing note, dated 4 September 2013, which had been circulated to members only in advance of the meeting.

Professor Barrett, having declared a potential conflict of interest, was invited to present his comments on the matter and began by providing a brief history of the Seanad. Professor Barrett also noted the following:

- (i) the significant contribution of those Senators elected to the Seanad in the University of Dublin Constituency throughout history,
 - (ii) the University of Dublin constituency of the Seanad as a vehicle for participation from Northern Ireland in the Oireachtas,
 - (iii) the significant body of work conducted by the Seanad including encouraging student engagement and collaborations with the university sector,
- the benefits of a bicameral system of Parliament and the fact that, despite media coverage that some countries have abolished their second houses, there were other countries with substantial populations where second houses had been created.

Professor Barrett then withdrew from the meeting for the remainder of the discussion on this item.

The Provost opened the item for discussion. A discussion then followed where members of the Board expressed their views on the approach the College should take in relation to the upcoming referendum on the abolition of the Seanad. The merits of a bicameral system, the significant contribution of previous Senators and the benefits of a two way dialogue between the Seanad and the university sector were also noted. It was noted that the Students' Union and the Graduate Students' Union had not yet established their position on the referendum.

Noting the important role the College has played to date in the Seanad it was suggested that the College should facilitate a public debate on the matter. The Board were advised that the Students' Union is in discussions with the Communications Office in relation to holding a radio debate on this item on the campus.

The Provost noted that irrespective of any position which the Board might take on the matter, individual staff members and students were certainly at liberty to engage in the debate.

Following discussion, while noting that the consensus view of the Board favoured reform of the Seanad, it was agreed that the College should play a role in facilitating and informing the national debate. The Board noted the memorandum from the Provost and College Secretary as presented.

The Board agreed that the following actions should now follow:

- (i) College should include on its website information on the overall benefits of a bicameral system.
- (ii) The contributions to the Seanad of Senators elected in the University of Dublin Constituency over the years should also be captured on the website.
- (iii) College should endeavour to provide a public forum for open debate on the matter. The Provost and the Senior Lecturer are to explore the possibilities on this.

Professor Barrett was invited to re-join the meeting.

BD/13-14/014 Equality Monitoring Annual Report 2012-2013

The Chair of the Equality Committee invited Board's attention to the Equality Monitoring Annual Report 2012-2013, which had been circulated.

The Board noted that there was a gender imbalance prevailing in relation to grade distribution across academic and administrative posts in the College. Significant disparities were also noted in relation to the number of Fellows and the application process for Fellowship, applications for senior promotion, administrative promotion and contract types.

It was noted that the College is performing well in relation to meeting strategic targets with respect to diversity, non EU student numbers and underrepresented groups. Areas for further consideration include limited junior staff representation on

committees and decision making bodies, limited provision of part-time or flexible programmes and staff reluctance to disclose disabilities.

Opening the item for discussion, the Provost thanked Professor Bouroche for her comments and commended the contributions of all involved in producing the report. In response to a query the Senior Lecturer advised the Board that the College was taking the lead in trying to address the inadequacies of the HPAT student admission process. Noting some minor amendments and that there are areas for future consideration, Board members noted and welcomed the report, in particular the detailed statistical breakdown and data, and commended those who had prepared it.

It was also noted that a report was being prepared for the Board on gender issues relating to Fellowship.

BD/13-14/015 Nomination of Annual Officer

Under any other urgent business, the Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Provost nominating Professor Werner Blau to Annual Office in 2013-14 as Junior Proctor.

BD/13-14/016 Resignation of Board Member Technical, Administrative and Support Staff Constituency - Administrative, Professional, Library, Technical Category

Under any other urgent business, the Secretary advised the Board that Ms Noreen Murray had resigned her Board membership with effect from 10 September 2013. It was agreed to call a by-election to fill the vacancy for the remainder of the term of office until the end of this academic year 2013-2014.

BD/13-14/017 College Branding

Under any other urgent business, it was agreed that the Director of Communications and Marketing would provide an update on the branding project to the Board in the current term.

BD/13-14/018 Artwork in the Boardroom

Under any other urgent business, the Board agreed to ask the Curator of College Art Collections to arrange the inclusion of a female portrait in the artwork on display in the Boardroom.

SECTION B

BD/13-14/019 College Safety Committee

The Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to the minutes of the College Safety Committee 10 May 2013, which were then noted and approved.

SECTION C

BD/13-14/020 Administrative Procedures in the Summer Session

The Board noted and approved memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 3 September 2013.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/13-14/021 College Safety Committee Annual Report 2011-2012 (Minute SA/12-13/21 of 10 May 2013 refers) (see Minute BD/13-14/019 above)

The Board noted the College Safety Annual Report 2011-2012 as circulated.

BD/13-14/022 Committee on Student Conduct and Capacity - Annual Report 2012-2013

The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 3 September 2013.

BD/13-14/023 Board Business**(i) Callover**

The Board noted the callover of business, as circulated.

(ii) Outcomes - Meetings of 19 and 26 June 2013

The Board noted the outcomes, as circulated.

BD/13-14/024 Sealings

The Board noted Sealings, as circulated and attached as Appendix 1 to these minutes.

BD/13-14/025 Prizes and Other Awards**(i) School of Medicine Prizes and Medals 2012-2013**

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Administrative Officer, School of Medicine, circulated, dated 8 August 2013;

(ii) Postgraduate Travelling Scholarship in Surgery 2013-2014/Sir Edward Halloran Bennett medal in surgery/Sheppard Memorial Prize

The Board noted and approved the recommendation of the nominating committee (Calendar S43) that the above awards should be made to Dr Siun Murphy;

(iii) Visual and Performing Arts Fund 2012-2013

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 18 December 2012.

BD/13-14/026 Memorandum of Agreement - Joint Postgraduate Certificate in Innovation and Entrepreneurship

The Board noted that a Memorandum of Agreement had been signed between the College and the Queen's University, Belfast and University College Dublin, National University of Ireland in relation to a joint Postgraduate Certificate in Innovation and Entrepreneurship.

BD/13-14/027 GeneSIS Project - Independent Monitor

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, circulated, dated 28 August 2013.

BD/13-14/028 Committees - Finance Committee - External Member

The Board noted and approved the nomination of Ms Caroline Curtis, FCCA, VP Finance EMEA at Nuance Communications Ireland Ltd as an external member of the Finance Committee.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/13-14/029 Changes to the College Calendar for 2013-2014 and 2014-2015

The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 4 September 2013.

BD/13-14/030 Tutorship

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 2 September 2013 and a memorandum dated 9 September 2013, tabled.

BD/13-14/031 Scholarship - Intermissions of Foundation and Non-Foundation Scholarship

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 3 September 2013.

BD/13-14/032 Science Gallery Governance Structure

The Board noted and approved the Memorandum from the Secretary, dated 3 September 2013.

In response to a query, the Provost clarified that the Director of the Science Gallery Dublin reports to the Chief Operating Officer and also reports to the Board of Science Gallery International, of which the Provost is a member.

It was agreed that an update on the governance of Science Gallery and of Science Gallery International would be prepared for Board.

BD/13-14/033 Science Gallery Bangalore

Noting the memorandum from the CEO of Science Gallery International, dated 3 September 2013, the Board agreed that the proposed contract should include the previously agreed branding protocol. It was also agreed that the Director of Communications and Marketing would bring an update on the College Branding Policy to the Board.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts information in minutes BD/13-14/ 034-036 is restricted.

BD/13-14/037 Staff Retirements

The Board noted the members of staff due to retire at the end of September and the Provost, on behalf of the Board, having named each retiree individually, thanked them for their much valued service and contribution to College.

BD/13-14/038 Outgoing Board Minute Secretary

The Provost on behalf of the Board thanked the outgoing minute secretary to the Board, Ms S Mac Bride, for her contribution to the business of the Board.

Signed:

Date:

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Sealings

10 May 2013

Memorandum of Agreement

between

**The Queen's University, Belfast and
University College Dublin, National University of Ireland, Dublin and
the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of Board, of the College of the
Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin**

Joint Postgraduate Certificate in Innovation and Entrepreneurship

The Seal of the College was put in triplicate to a Memorandum of Agreement between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and the Queen's University, Belfast and University College Dublin, National University of Ireland, Dublin in relation to a joint Postgraduate Certificate in Innovation and Entrepreneurship.

5 July 2013

University Limited and the Founding Institutions

The Seal of the College was put to an Agreement between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and the Founding Institutions¹ relating to the establishment of University Limited.

¹ University College, Dublin, National University of Ireland, Dublin; The National College of Art and Design; Dun Laoghaire Institute of Art, Design and Technology; National University of Ireland Galway; University of Limerick; Royal Irish Academy of Music; Singman Limited Trading as the Gaiety School of Acting, the National Theatre School of Ireland; Burren College of Art; L.A. Make-up Academy Limited; Dublin Institute of Technology; Dublin City University; Cork Institute of Technology; Galway-Mayo Institute of Technology; National University of Ireland, Maynooth; Institute of Technology Tralee; Waterford Institute of Technology; Institute of Technology Sligo; the Open University; University College Cork – National University of Ireland, Cork; Dale Entertainments Limited trading as Pulse College and Windmill Lane Recording Studios; City of Dublin Vocational Education Committee, for and on behalf of its sub-committee, Ballyfermot College of Further Education; the Provost, Fellows, Scholars, and the other members of Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin; University of Ulster; Celtic Educational Ltd.