

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 1 May 2013

*Present* Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor G J Lacey), Professor S D C Barrett, Professor M Bourcoche, Dr O Braiden, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Professor E Drew, Mr R Dunne, Mr D Ferrick, Mr D Frost, Mr J Gallagher, Mr G J Garrahan, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Mr M J McAndrew, Professor J F McGilp, Professor N Marples, Ms N Murray, Ms A S Ní Chonaire, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor D O'Neill, Professor M Ó Siochrú, Professor H J Rice.

*Apologies* Chief Operating Officer.

*In attendance* Ms S Mac Bride.

*(ex officio)* Secretary to the College, Treasurer.

*(by invitation)* Vice-President for Global Relations.

GeneSIS Project Sponsor; Ms P Callaghan (for BD/12-13/270)  
GeneSIS Project Director; Mr J Hegarty (for BD/12-13/270)  
Directors in Ernst & Young; Mr P Miles and Mr I O'Brien (for BD/12-13/270)

**BD/12-13/240 Declaration of Interest**

Mr Garrahan declared an interest in respect of agenda item A.5 (i) and C.6. The Board agreed that Mr Garrahan could remain for the items.

**BD/12-13/241 Minutes**

(i) The minutes of the meeting held on 27 March 2013 were approved subject to the following amendment:

**BD/12-13/214 Research Matters**

The last sentence at the end of the first paragraph on page 6 was replaced with the following: 'The Board noted that the College plans to participate in the European Institute of Innovation and Technology initiatives in energy and ICT'.

(ii) The minutes of the meeting held on 8 April 2013 were approved, noting that the Treasurer/Acting Chief Operating Officer be recorded as being in attendance at the meeting.

**BD/12-13/242 Matters Arising from the Minutes**

Several matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/11-12/244 and 245 below).

**BD/12-13/243 Chief Operating Officer**

The Board noted that the Treasurer would act as Acting Chief Operating Officer in the absence of the Chief Operating Officer.

**BD/12-13/244 Trinity Foundation Report - November 2012 (see minute BD/12-13/209 of 27 March 2013)**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that no specific fundraising priority activity had been agreed by the School of Medicine Executive and that it should not have been reported in the School of Medicine's submission for quality review purposes in that manner. The Board noted that the School of Medicine is involved in a number of priority fundraising activities.

**BD/12-13/245 Ad hoc appeals committee - Senior Promotions 2012: Report and Recommendations (see minute BD/12-13/212 of 27 March 2013)**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to a report on the 2012 Academic Promotion Statistics which had been tabled, noting that the data will be included in the Ad Hoc Appeals Committee Recommendations. She advised Board of the statistics on the basis of gender and grade, noting that gender was not given in those grades where there were only a very small number of applicants to ensure their anonymity is protected. In response to a query, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that while the number of appeals was high, the percentage was in proportion to previous years. The Provost advised Board that the Senior Promotions Committee will be meeting on 2 May 2013 to review the applications which relate to the appeals that the Ad hoc Appeals Committee has upheld. In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that once the appeals process has ended the College will consider the appropriate time to commence the new promotion process.

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and advised Board that he had requested that the Equality Committee produce a similar report in relation to the applications for Fellowship.

**BD/12-13/246 Provost's Report**

The Board noted an update from the Provost on the following items:

(i) Landscape Process

The Board noted that the minutes of the meeting with the HEA on 14 February 2013 were awaited and that the Provost is in discussion with Executive Officers in relation to the principles, including governance arrangements, upon which the College would engage in a cluster;

(ii) Heads of Bill to amend the Universities Act, 1997

The Secretary advised Board that under the Government's legislative programme it is estimated that the Bill will be published in late 2013, noting

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

that other legislation may be of priority to the Government at the moment. The Provost confirmed that the College is maintaining its position in relation to the Heads of Bill and that the published Bill may contain provisions such as an enhancement to the Visitor system, which the College already has in place, noting that this could be advantageous to the College;

(iii) Leiden Rankings

The Board noted that the College had been ranked 9<sup>th</sup> in Europe and 48<sup>th</sup> in the world in the recently published Leiden rankings. The Board noted that the College does not make any payment to any ranking facilitator;

(iv) Public Service Agreement

The Board noted that the College could face reputational risk due to industrial relations disputes should agreement not be met between the government and the trade unions on the terms of the second Public Service Agreement.

**BD/12-13/247 Board Response to Audit Committee**

The Treasurer/Acting Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 20 March 2012, which had been circulated. He advised Board that the memorandum contained the Executive Officers' response to issues identified in the Audit Committee Report to Board in December 2012, noting that each recommendation had been assigned to a member of Executive Officers.

Noting that following consideration by Board, the response will be presented to the Audit Committee, the Treasurer/Acting Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to the responses on the following issues:

(i) **Governance Overview**

The College has made efforts to further strengthen its governance structures and is committed to full compliance and adherence to relevant legislation and to the Governance of Irish Universities Sectoral code.

(ii) **Major Initiatives**

The Board noted under the START process a Project Management Office will be established and in the interim, a Project Management Office, located in IS Services and reporting to the START project, will oversee the management of the E-Strategy projects.

(iii) **GeneSIS**

The response is considered under a separate minute (see minute BD/12-13/270 below).

(iv) **Accounting Treatment of Trust Funds and the Foundation**

The Board noted that the College has voluntarily agreed to adopt the UK Statement of Recommended Practice and will include the Trust Funds and the Foundation accounts in the 2011-2012 College Consolidated Accounts.

(v) **Financial Statements - US GAAP Accounts**

The Board noted that this issue has now been resolved.

- (vi) **Pension Fund Issues**

The Board noted that the College is engaging with the HEA in an effort to acquire the necessary evidence to provide to KPMG which would allow them to issue an unqualified audit opinion associated with the recognition of an asset to meet the College's pension liability, which has now been taken over by the State.
- (vii) **Review of Human Resources Department**

The Board noted that a Human Resources strategy is currently being developed which will assist with the issues raised.
- (viii) **Remuneration Issues**

The Board noted that outstanding issues from the C&AG Report (Report 78) in relation to alleged excess remuneration and compliance with the ECF have been finalised. The Board also noted that the on-going issues surrounding pay grades were now closed as recently advised by the C&AG and that the current School of Medicine policy will ensure that all future appointments are progressed in line with College and Faculty HR policies and are considered at the School Executive as appropriate.
- (ix) **Outside Earnings**

The Board noted that further engagement by Executive Officers is necessary in order to ensure that a clearer policy is in place in relation to external engagement by the academic community.
- (x) **Health and Safety Processes in College**

The Board noted that the College Safety Committee are addressing the findings of the Internal Audit report.
- (xi) **Review of the Disability Service**

The Board noted that progress is being made with Schools and Administrative Units towards compliance with the accessible information policy.
- (xii) **Review of Trinity Research and Innovation**

The Board noted that the Dean of Research is addressing the issues surrounding the reliance on external funding and the approach taken to non-research contracts.
- (xiii) **Space Utilisation**

The Board noted that the Director of Buildings Office is exploring ways to ensure the most up to date space information is actively managed and is made available to decision makers at all times. The Board also noted the role of the Space Allocation Sub Group which will make recommendations to the Executive Officers. With regard to space utilisation, the Board noted that the Director of Buildings Office was commencing a pilot study on selected accommodation.
- (xiv) **Risk Management Process in College**

The Board noted that significant progress has been made in embedding risk management into College processes and that further work was required to simplify the process.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

(xv) **Internal Audit Function**

The Board noted that an allocation has been made under the ABC process for additional resources.

In the course of a discussion, the Provost advised Board that a policy for project management of large projects will be presented to Board in the next few months. The Board noted that under the START process the Space Allocation Sub-Committee has now become a sub-group of Executive Officers and consists of the Faculty Deans and the Bursar, noting that requests for space are dealt with on a case-by-case basis. In response to a query, the Bursar advised Board that the work on the design and structure of the College Project Management Office is on-going and that it is important that it is properly positioned within the College structure to ensure the resource can be optimised. The Treasurer/Acting Chief Operating Officer advised Board that he is currently engaging with the Director of Trinity Foundation in order to pursue a pro-active communication strategy surrounding the Trust Funds.

Noting the importance of bringing clarity to the area of outside earnings, the Board agreed to consider how best to progress a policy on external engagement between the Academic community and third parties.

The Board noted the report as presented and agreed that it should be presented to the Audit Committee. The Provost thanked the Treasurer/Acting Chief Operating Officer for his comprehensive report.

**BD/12-13/248 Quality Review**

The Provost invited Board's attention to the reports on the quality reviews and implementation plans of the following areas carried out in accordance with the quality assurance procedures for administrative areas:

(i) **Library (see Actum CL/12-13/151 of 17 April 2013)**

Noting the request from the Chair of the Library and Information Policy Committee that the item be deferred until the next meeting of Board to allow the Committee to present their views of the report, the Board agreed that, while it would not be appropriate to defer Board's consideration of the report as it is not the role of Principal Committees to review such reports in advance of Board, the views of the Library and Information Policy committee on the report will be presented to Board at the next meeting.

The Bursar agreed to consider under the START process comments from Board members on the need to clarify the role of Principal Committees.

The Provost advised Board that the quality review of the Library had been undertaken by three eminent reviewers who had considerable experience of University libraries. He further advised that the reviewers had recommended that there be no delay in recruiting a new Librarian and recognised that the proposed reporting line of the Librarian under the START process was appropriate. The Board noted that the Reviewers had advised that great care be taken during the Legal Deposit Review, that communication strategies need to be improved and that a new budget should be established from commercial activity to support Library services.

The Provost advised Board of his recommendations for the area following the review and to the Reviewers' recommendations on areas such as the development of an implementation plan, the development of a Library Strategic Plan to link into the new College Strategic Plan and the need to continue with the philanthropic efforts in conjunction with Trinity Foundation. The Board noted that the student body had expressed their satisfaction with the Library and its services.

During the course of a discussion, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the process to recruit a new Librarian has commenced, noting that the names of the external assessors are being finalised and that advice is being sought as to when is the most advantageous time to advertise the position. Welcoming the report, the Vice-President for Global Relations advised Board that the Library was both the centre of academic and student life and a major asset for the College's philanthropic and commercial strategies given the reputational profile of the Library internationally. She advised Board that in order to ensure this continues to be the case it is vital that the College both invest in the human resources and infrastructure of the Library and protect the Legal Deposit system. The Board noted the importance of developing adequate communication strategies for the Library and that an ABC meeting has been arranged with the Acting Librarian in order to assess future budget needs.

In response to a query, the Provost clarified that the Chair of the Library and Information Policy Committee would not partake in the Legal Deposit Review as, although this was included in the Reviewer's recommendations, it does not fit within the governance structures of the College and could impinge on the oversight role of the Library and Information Policy Committee.

The Board approved the recommendations, noting that an implementation plan will be prepared by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and Acting Librarian and will be presented to Board in due course.

(ii) **HR Implementation Plan**

The Provost invited Board's attention to the Implementation Plan for Human Resources, which had been circulated. Noting the recommendations, he advised Board that the Implementation Plan presented the proposed actions, timeframe and responsible individual for implementing each action. The Board noted that a draft HR Strategy had been presented to the START Taskforce for consideration and that the issue of communication within HR will be addressed through the development of a structured approach to internal HR communications.

During the course of a discussion, the Board noted concern that progress be made to further assist staff understand the promotion process for non-academic staff. The Chair of the Human Resources Committee advised Board that this issue is under review and a sub-group had been convened to address the issue. In response to a query, the Provost clarified that the establishment of a Committee for trade union consultation and negotiation was under consideration but that agreement had not been reached on this issue to date.

The Board approved the Human Resources Implementation Plan as presented.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*

The Board agreed that the Secretary would communicate to the Director of Human Resources the need to:

- (a) include a reference to discussions with trade unions at point 9;
- (b) readjust the level of priority from low to medium in accordance with the Board's recommendation at the previous meeting;
- (c) readjust the timelines in accordance with the level of priority of each item.

**BD/12-13/249 START Update**

This item was deferred until the next meeting of Board.

**BD/12-13/250 Student Experience Annual Report**

This item was deferred until the next meeting of Board.

**BD/12-13/251 Annual Report of the College 2011-2012**

The Secretary invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Communications Officer, which had been circulated together with a number of amendments to the report, which had been tabled. The Board in particular noted the sections on the student experience and new College initiatives, which are new sections of the report.

The Board approved the report as presented, noting that it will be published online only which will represent a significant saving.

**BD/12-13/252 University Council**

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 17 April 2013 subject to further comments covering CL/12-3/151, 160, 161 and in particular:

**CL/12-13/144 Undergraduate Course Proposal: Bachelor in Science in Radiation Therapy in conjunction with the Singapore Institute of Technology**

The Board noted the approval of the Bachelor in Science in Radiation Therapy in conjunction with the Singapore Institute of Technology.

**CL/12-13/146 Legal Deposit Review Report.**

The Board agreed that the actum be amended to reflect the position that the Chair of the Library and Information Policy Committee does not have personal conflict of interest regarding participation in the Legal Deposit Review but rather that in its oversight role the Library and Information Policy Committee may independently comment on the report in accordance with best governance practice. +

**CL/12-13/148 Proposal for Student Evaluation System**

The Board noted that the issue of administering the Student Evaluation System has been re-opened with the Undergraduate Committee as the Quality Office is not in a position to provide resources to facilitate the system. The Senior Lecturer agreed to provide Board with an update at the next meeting.

**CL/12-13/149 Admission of Students from Northern Ireland**

The Board noted the amendment to the College's admission policy to treat students from Northern Ireland in the wider context of proportionality of the whole island of Ireland in light of their status under Article 2 of the Constitution of Ireland. The Provost thanked the Senior Lecturer and the College Solicitor for their contribution to this change in policy.

**BD/12-13/253 Board and Council Documentation**

The Board agreed that all Board and Council documentation should be thoroughly proof read. The Board agreed that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer would communicate to the Faculty Deans the need to formalize the reports presented in Section D of the Board agenda.

**SECTION B****BD/12-13/254 Audit Committee**

The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Audit Committee meeting of 9 April 2013 and the amended Terms of Reference as presented, noting in particular:

**AD/12-13/56 Update on GeneSIS**

The Board noted the views of the Audit Committee in item BD/12-13/270 below.

**AD/12-13/57 Liaison with the Comptroller and Auditor General**

The Board noted that the C&AG have confirmed that when the Trust Funds are included in the College Consolidated Accounts that no information on individual donors would be disclosed. The Board also noted that the C&AG had confirmed that the issue of non-Review Body allowances had now been resolved with the Department of Education and Skills and that it was agreed that these allowances were in the nature of core pay.

**BD/12-13/255 Finance Committee**

The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting of 20 March 2013 as presented.

**BD/12-13/256 Library and Information Policy Committee**

The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Library and Information Policy Committee meeting of 11 March 2013 as presented, noting in particular:

**LIPC/12-13/28 Terms of Reference**

The Board noted that the Committee's Terms of Reference will be reviewed following the review of the role of Principal Committees which will be undertaken as part of the START process.

**LIPC/12-13/30 Library Annual Report**

The Board noted the implications of the reduction in the non-pay budget on Library services. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that reductions were necessary in light of the College's decision to achieve a balanced budget and that further reductions may be necessary. The Treasurer advised Board that the effects of the reduction in budget will be taken into account in the context of the ABC process.

**BD/12-13/257 Student Services Committee**

The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Student Services Committee meeting of 6 February 2013 as presented, noting in particular:

**SS/12-13/40 Annual Reports**

The Board noted the annual reports from the following areas:

- (i) The College Health Service;
- (ii) The Disability Service;
- (iii) The Careers Advisory Service;
- (iv) The Day Nursery and Crèche;
- (v) Sports and Recreation;
- (vi) The Student Counselling Service;
- (vii) The Senior Tutor's Office.

The Board noted the implications of the reduction in budget to all student service areas and the increase in demand for these services, exacerbated by an increased diversity in the student body, especially of overseas students. The Board also noted that the Day Nursery had not filled its quota of places this year, due to a mismatch between supply/demand.

**SECTION C****BD/12-13/ 258 Board Business**

The Board noted the Callover and Outcomes as circulated.

**BD/12-13/259 Higher Degrees**

The Board noted and approved Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 13 March 2013.

**BD/12-13/260 Proctors' Lists for Spring Commencements**

The Board noted and approved that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 16 April 2013.

**BD/12-13/261 Schedule of Board and Council Meetings 2013-2014**

The Board noted and approved and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 23 April 2013.

**BD/12-13/262 Prizes and Other Awards - Reid Entrance Exhibition - Proposal to change the Criteria**

The Board noted and approved and approved a memorandum from the Admissions Officer, circulated, dated 22 March 2013;

**BD/12-13/263 Annual Report of the Library 2011-2012 and Strategic Targets 2012-2013 (see Actum CL/12-13/151 of 17 April 2013)**

The Board noted the Annual Report of the Library 2011-2012 and Strategic Targets, as circulated.

**BD/12-13/264 Annual Reports 2011-2012 - Student Services (see Minute SS/12-13/40 of 6 February 2013)**

The Board noted and approved the following reports, referred to in the Minutes of the Student Services Committee, circulated, dated 6 February 2013 (see Minute BD/12-13/257 above):

- (i) College Health Service  
<http://www.tcd.ie/collegehealth/service/research-reports.php>
- (ii) Careers Advisory Service  
[www.tcd.ie/Careers/downloads/Current\\_Annual\\_Report-Work.pdf](http://www.tcd.ie/Careers/downloads/Current_Annual_Report-Work.pdf)
- (iii) Careers Advisory Service - First Destination  
[www.tcd.ie/Careers/downloads/Current\\_Annual\\_Report-Stats.pdf](http://www.tcd.ie/Careers/downloads/Current_Annual_Report-Stats.pdf)
- (iv) Careers Advisory Service - Civic Engagement Annual Report  
[www.tcd.ie/Careers/downloads/Current\\_Annual\\_Report-CivicEngagement.pdf](http://www.tcd.ie/Careers/downloads/Current_Annual_Report-CivicEngagement.pdf)
- (v) Sports and Recreation  
<http://www.tcd.ie/Sport/assets/pdf/Annual%20report%20sport%202011-12.pdf>
- (vi) Student Counselling Service  
[www.tcd.ie/Student\\_Counselling/research-reports/Annual-Report-2011-2012.pdf](http://www.tcd.ie/Student_Counselling/research-reports/Annual-Report-2011-2012.pdf)
- (vii) Senior Tutor's Office  
[www.tcd.ie/Senior\\_Tutor/pdf/Annual%20Report%20STO%202011-12.pdf](http://www.tcd.ie/Senior_Tutor/pdf/Annual%20Report%20STO%202011-12.pdf)

**SECTION D**

**In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.**

Signed: .....

Date: .....