Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 27 March 2013

Present
Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor G J Lacey), Professor S D C Barrett, Professor M Bouroche, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Professor E Drew, Mr R Dunne, Mr D Frost, Mr G J Garrahan, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Mr M J McAndrew, Professor J F McGilp, Professor N Marples, Ms N Murray, Professor C O’Farrelly, Professor D O’Neill, Professor M Ó Siochrú, Professor H J Rice.

Apologies
Chief Operating Officer, Vice-President for Global Relations, Dr O Braiden, Mr D Ferrick, Mr J Gallagher, Ms A Ní Chonaire

In attendance
Ms S Mac Bride.

(ex officio)
Secretary to the College, Treasurer.

(by invitation)
Dean of Research (for BD/12-13/214)
Dean of Students, Director of the Careers Advisory Service (for BD/12-13/215)
Senior ABC / FECP Accountant (for BD/12-13/216)

BD/12-13/203 Statutory Declaration
Mr Garrahan made the statutory declaration as required under the 2010 Consolidated Statutes.

BD/12-13/204 Declaration of Interest
There were no declarations of interest made.

BD/12-13/205 Minutes
The minutes of the meeting held on 27 February 2013 were approved subject to the following amendments:

(i) BD/12-13/183 (i) Landscape Process
The Board approved the revised minute as tabled.

(ii) BD/12-13/186 Quality (i) Implementation Plan for the Director of Buildings Area
The second last sentence in the first paragraph was amended to read “In response to a number of queries, the Chief Operating Officer advised that
space allocation will be facilitated through a corporate services division delivered through the START process and the needs of key stakeholders, including student-led organisations, should be considered in all decisions relating to space allocation."

(iii) **BD/12-13/186 Quality (ii) Provost’s Report to Board for Human Resources**

Point (c) in the second paragraph was amended to read “recommendations 11 and 12 which are indicated as low priority have a high cost implication for the College if not implemented and should be re-categorised as medium priority;”. The following point was added to the end of the second paragraph “(g) there are stresses on the systems, due to a number of different projects progressing at the same time, which should be taken into consideration when reviewing deadlines and requirements”.

(iv) **BD/12-13/187 Commercialisation Report**

The following point was added at the end of the third paragraph: (f) due consideration should be given to the services supplied for staff and students.

---

**BD/12-13/206 Matters Arising from the Minutes**

Several matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/11-12/207, 208, 209, 211, 212 below).

In response to a query in relation to Board decisions, it was noted that the Board Callover of decisions is currently circulated. It was agreed that the Board Outcomes document would be also circulated on a confidential basis to Board members with the minutes of the previous meeting.

**BD/12-13/207 Provost’s Report (i) Landscape Process (see minute BD/12-13/183 of 27 February 2013)**

In response to a query, the Provost confirmed that the Minutes of the meeting with the HEA of 14 February 2013 will be circulated to Board members once finalized.

The Board noted Professor Barrett’s disappointment regarding the decision of the Church of Ireland College of Education to transfer its links from the College to Dublin City University.

**BD/12-13/208 Planning Group Report No 8 (7) Human Resources Strategy (see minute BD/12-13/185 of 27 February 2013)**

In response to a query, the Provost confirmed that the Human Resources Strategy will be presented to Executive Officers and to the START team for consultation before being presented to the Human Resources Committee and Board for approval.

**BD/12-13/209 Trinity Foundation Report - November 2012 (see minute BD/12-13/182 of 27 February 2013)**

In response to a query, the Vice-Provost advised Board that she had consulted with the Interim Head of the School of Medicine in relation to a query regarding fundraising activity referred to in the School of Medicine’s submission for quality review purposes. The Board noted that the enquiries into the matter are on-going and that it is hoped

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*
that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer will be in position to provide an update on the matter to Board members at the next meeting.

BD/12-13/210 College High Level Risk Register (see minute BD/12-13/181 of 27 February 2013)
The Board noted an update from the President of the Students’ Union in relation to the Tutorship Scheme.

BD/12-13/211 Quality (ii) Provost’s Report to Board for Human Resources (see minute BD/12-13/186 of 27 February 2013)
In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that all issues raised by Board members in the course of the discussion including consideration of the establishment of an industrial relations forum will be addressed in the context of the Human Resources strategy, which will be presented to Board for approval in due course.

BD/12-13/212 Ad hoc appeals committee - Senior Promotions 2012: Report and Recommendations (see minute BD/12-13/202 of 27 February 2013)
The Board noted that a call for promotions will not be initiated until the current round, including the outcome of appeals, has been concluded. In response to a query regarding the number of appeals, the Provost advised Board that this round of promotions had included a newly introduced Faculty process and that this may have led to an increase in the number of appeals. The Board noted that the process for receiving feedback had involved a more discursive aspect than in previous years when the feedback to applicants had been based on their scores. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer agreed to table a report on statistics relating to promotion applications at the next meeting of Board, noting that this will include a breakdown in relation to gender.

BD/12-13/213 Provost’s Report
The Board noted an update from the Provost on the following items:

(i) START
The Bursar advised Board that four townhall meetings have taken place in order to inform staff of the plans for implementation of reform of Administrative, Technical and Support Areas and how their specific areas will fit into the individual planned projects.

The Board noted that the individual projects will be implemented though a number of work-streams; namely Academic Services sponsored by the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Corporate Services sponsored by the Chief Operating Officer, Financial Services sponsored by the Treasurer, the Provost’s work-stream sponsored by the Provost and an Enabling work-stream sponsored by the Bursar. The Provost’s work-stream will capture any areas under START which fall outside the remit of the other work-streams. In addition to being sponsored by the relevant Officer each of these streams has a dedicated Project Manager charged with progressing the program within their division. The Bursar advised Board that each work-stream will go through an organizational design phase followed by a planning for change phase, an implementation phase and embedding phase, noting that a high level of consultation with staff will take place at each phase.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
The Board noted that it is envisaged that phase one will be completed by October 2013 and that phase two will be completed by 2014. The Board also noted the composition of the implementation team which contains a balance of internal resources with knowledge of the College and external resources with change management, process excellence and program and project management expertise.

In the course of a discussion Board members raised concerns that the College is placing strain on the system by implementing multi-strategies, particularly in the context of the on-going implementation of the GeneSIS project and the Academic Registry structure. It was also noted that assigning a staff member from IS Services as the START PMO may place a strain on resources in IS Services.

The Bursar advised Board that the START process will assist the implementation of GeneSIS and changes to the Academic Registry and that the START PMO’s role involves coordinating the project groups and having oversight of all issues to avoid problems arising.

The Provost thanked the Bursar for his presentation.

(ii) Heads of Bill to amend the Universities Act, 1997
The Provost advised Board that contacts are on-going with the Minister and the Department of Education & Skills and that he will continue to monitor the situation and keep Board advised of developments on a regular basis.

In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that any changes to the composition of the College Board would require an amendment to the Trinity College, Dublin (Charters and Letters Patent Amendment) Act, 2000 and that at present the Heads of Bill does not make reference to changes to the composition of University Governance Boards.

(iii) Landscape Process
The Provost advised Board that the Minutes of the meeting with the HEA of 14 February 2013 will be circulated to Board members once finalized. He further advised that a paper will be prepared by the Executive Officers on the principles, including governance arrangements, upon which the College would engage in a cluster. The Board noted that this paper will then be presented to Board in light of the Government’s proposals for clusters once published, noting that at present it is difficult to predict what such proposals may contain.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the College is in the process of developing its on-going collaborative relationships under Landscape, with one initiative focussed on initial teacher education involving UCD, NCAD and MIE, and the other focussed on enhancing specific collaborations with UCD. In this regard, individual Schools were seeking suitable avenues for collaboration including the School of Nursing and Midwifery, the School of Engineering and the School of Physics.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
BD/12-13/214 Research Matters

The Dean of Research, present by invitation, invited Board’s attention to a memorandum, dated 19 March 2013, which had been circulated, under the following headings:

(i) Research Strategy Implementation Plan
The Dean of Research advised Board that progress is on-going in identifying suitable themes for multi/interdisciplinary areas in which College is well positioned to have significant impact internationally. The exercise would inform the next College Strategic Plan.

(ii) Research Funding Diversification
The Board noted that under the College’s Research Funding Diversification Strategy a total of nine Research Programme Officers are being supported and are deployed locally in Schools and Trinity Research Institutes.

(iii) Innovation and Entrepreneurship Strategy
The Dean of Research advised Board that a high-level strategy for Innovation and Entrepreneurship in College focusing on the opportunity for the School of Business to play an integrative role within College is currently being developed. The Board noted that a number of new activities in this area have also been undertaken. For example, a student-focused company incubator/accelerator programme has recently been launched on a pilot basis with the support of College alumni and friends. The “Launch Box” programme will provide a three-month summer residency in the incubator for a set of projects chosen in a competition open to all students and recent graduates and supported by the “Trinity Angels” network.

(iv) SFI Funding
The Board noted that the College has recently been awarded 15 SFI Investigator awards and 14 SFI Project awards equivalent to 44% of the available national funding for the programme. The Dean of Research advised that the College had recently been awarded funding to host the “Centre for Next Generation Localisation (CNGL)”, an SFI Centre for Science Engineering and Technology (CSET) focusing on intelligent content. This award represents a renewal of the original CNGL CSET award, which was hosted by Dublin City University. The Board noted that the College has also been successful in the recent call for the SFI Centres programme, under which the “Advanced Materials and Bioengineering Research Centre (AMBER)” has been funded.

In the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

(a) were options other than the School of Business considered to play an integrative role in College innovative activity;
(b) the College should link the themes identified in its Research Strategy Implementation Plan with the themes identified by potential funding agencies;
(c) the establishment of Research Programme Officers is a positive step for the College and it is hoped the initiative will be expanded to include more positions;
(d) the College will require more resources to engage larger projects with the European Institute of Innovation and Technology.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
In response to the issues raised, the Dean of Research advised Board that internationally many Universities have a mechanism to co-ordinate innovation between Schools and in this case it is thought that the School of Business can facilitate this role, noting that a potential site on the College campus has been identified. The Board noted that the objective of identifying research themes across the College is to allow it to be in the best position internationally to attract funding and that the level of participation in the process has been high, noting that the College has a wider research portfolio than those recognized by funding agencies. The Dean of Research advised Board that a second call for proposals for Research Programme Officers had taken place and it is hoped that these positions will become self-financing in the future leading to more positions being created. The Board noted that the College will participate with the European Institute of Innovation and Technology as an associated partner in the area of Energy. The Board noted that the College plans to participate in the European Institute of Innovation and Technology initiatives in energy and ICT.

The Provost thanked the Dean of Research for his presentation.

Following a discussion on the Board’s role in overseeing the implementation of the College Research strategy, the Board noted that the Research Committee is a committee of Council. The Board agreed that the current exercise of identifying priority research themes in the College would inform the context of the next College Strategic Plan, as would the Innovation and Entrepreneurship Strategy which is being prepared.

The Board agreed that the Dean of Research should present a report to Board on a more frequent basis.

BD/12-13/215  Careers Advisory Service – Graduate Employment Outcomes
The Dean of Students, present by invitation, invited Board’s attention to a memorandum, dated 8 March 2013, which had been circulated. She advised Board that the Student Services group uses a three-stage model to align its support of students through their time in College: orientation, retention, and progression. The Board noted that it is in this context that the report addresses the ways in which the College prepares its students, throughout their time here, to progress to employment or to further their education after completing their undergraduate or postgraduate degree or diploma.

The Dean of Students advised Board that the report presents data of the percentage of graduates employed in Ireland and overseas and is broken down on the basis of undergraduate and postgraduate, noting that Trinity graduates are more likely to go overseas to gain employment than their counterparts in other Irish Universities. The Board noted the percentages of graduates who had gained employment following completion of a primary degree compared to universities in the UK and in Ireland, noting that it is possible that more graduates from Trinity proceed to post-graduate education than from other universities. Board noted that 17% of postgraduates are still seeking employment, in comparison with 7% of undergraduates.

During the course of a discussion the following issues were raised by Board members:
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
(ii) the HEA’s position in relation to the pension credit is cause for concern;
(iii) the College must place greater focus on the generation of non—exchequer income;
(iv) the issue of reductions in State funding to higher education is one of national importance and the public should be made aware of the affects they are having on services;
(v) the deterioration in the staff/student ratio should be highlighted and attempts should be made to set it at a fixed ratio;
(vi) engagement with Schools regarding reserves should take place with individual Heads of School in the context of the next annual budgetary cycle;
(vii) the student number projections should be clarified;
(viii) the cost of promotions should be factored into the estimates.

In response to the issues raised the Treasurer advised Board that due to a number of variants it has not been possible to quantify the possible impact on the College under the proposed terms of the new Croke Park Agreement at this time. The Provost advised Board that the College is in on-going discussions with the HEA and Department of Education & Skills in relation to the pension related matters and that they must be managed in a strategic manner. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the staff/student ratio is under review on an on-going basis. She further advised that, as indicated in the Planning Group Report presented to Board at its previous meeting, the intention is not to withdraw reserves from Schools but to leverage these reserves more effectively and that this decision in principle has been discussed with the Heads of School. The Board noted the concerns regarding the current accuracies regard student number to the level of fees full paid up. Mr Creedon, Senior ABC / FECP Accountant, present by invitation, advised Board that estimated costs for promotions had been factored into the financial projections.

The Board approved the Financial Estimates for 2012-13 and agreed that 2013 Calendar Year Estimates be presented for submission to the HEA in the Funding Statement format as part of the annual accountability and budget meeting to be held in May 2013. The Board noted the 2013-2014 Projections as presented and agreed that the College will plan for a balanced budget through the ABC process.

**BD/12-13/217 Board Response to Audit Committee**

The Board agreed to postpone this item until the next Board meeting.

The Provost advised the Board that a report on GeneSIS will be presented at the next meeting of Board including an externally procured quality assurance review, which is currently being conducted.

The Board noted an update from the Treasurer in relation to the view from the C&AG that the Trust Fund and Trinity Foundation Financial accounts be included in the College’s consolidated accounts. The Board noted a communication strategy which will be implemented in the future in relation to the Trust Funds. The matter will also be considered at the next meeting of the Audit Committee.

**BD/12-13/218 Scholarship 2013**

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*
The Senior Lecturer invited Board’s attention to a memorandum, dated 27 March 2013, which had been tabled. He stated that ninety Scholars were proposed for election on Trinity Monday, of whom ten were Foundation Scholars.

**BD/12-13/219 University Council**

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 13 March 2013 subject to further comments covering CL/12-3137, and 138 and in particular:

**CL/12-13/122 (ii) Tutorship Scheme**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that College has been in extensive discussions with the Department of Education & Skills about the payment of an allowance to Tutors in recognition of the extra duties they take on. Despite College’s best efforts the Department has instructed College to cease payment of an allowance for Tutorship. The Board noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer has been working with the Senior Tutor and four representatives of the Tutors at varying stages in their academic careers to develop alternative mechanisms to recognise the contribution of Tutors and to support them in the performance of their tutorial duties. A Tutorial Service Fund has been established, to be administered by the Senior Tutor, which is accessible to all Tutors and to the nine postgraduate advisors. The TSF will allow for Tutors to access research materials, teaching support (with the agreement of the Head of School) or IT equipment. It is accepted that chamber size is too large and the intention is to recruit and appoint an additional 25 tutors to enable full chambers to be reduced to 80 students and half-chambers to be reduced to 40 students.

In response to a query the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer confirmed that the proposals had been discussed with the Treasurer and that they mirror supports given to others in similar roles. She also clarified that teaching support has been included in the model because it was not possible to include provision for a sabbatical which was favoured by the Tutors.

**BD/12-13/220 National Digital Research Centre**

Under Any Other Urgent Business, the Provost invited Board’s attention to the memorandum from the Dean of Research, dated 26 March 2013, which had been tabled. The Board noted and approved the nomination of the College Secretary as the College’s representative on the Board of the National Digital Research Centre.

**SECTION B**

**BD/12-13/221 Coiste na Gaeilge**

The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Coiste na Gaeilge meeting of 19 March 2013 as presented, noting in particular:

4- Second Irish Language Scheme

Mr Dowling, Chair of Coiste na Gaeilge advised Board that the Committee has approved the second Language Scheme and recommended it to Board. The Board noted that this document, drafted on foot of a request received from the Minister for Arts, Heritage and the Gaeltacht, sets out a series of commitments by Trinity College to improve bilingual services over the three-year period from July 2013 to June 2016. As this is the College’s second language scheme, the commitments made in the first

**Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings**
Board Minutes of 27 March 2013

language scheme (2010 to 2012) remain in place. Once the scheme is approved by Board, it will be submitted to the Minister for his consideration.

Mr Dowling advised Board that some concern had been expressed at Coiste na Gaeilge in relation to the Irish language residency scheme on campus. The Board noted that traditionally in recent years, 12 to 16 places have been set aside for this scheme noting that there are a further 18 places in Trinity Hall. Mr Dowling further advised that while great appreciation was expressed for the support received over recent years from the Accommodation Office and Registrar of Chambers, Coiste had requested that he, as Chair, convey to the Board its concern over the uncertainty in regard to the precise number of places available on campus from year to year. The Board noted that Coiste also underlined the importance of having a single designated house for the Irish language scheme, so that the students on the residency scheme could be together.

The Board approved the Second Language Scheme as presented and agreed that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer will consider the recommendation from Coiste na Gaeilge in relation to the Irish language residency scheme.

BD/12-13/222 College Safety Committee
The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the College Safety Committee meeting of 19 October 2012 and 11 December 2012 as presented, noting in particular the revised Terms of Reference of the Committee.

BD/12-13/223 Equality Committee
The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Equality Committee meeting of 22 January 2013 as presented, noting in particular:

Eqal/12-13/13 Part-Time Student Service Provision
The Board noted that the Committee has been liaising with the Dean of Students in relation to extending student services to part-time and evening students.

BD/12-13/224 Estates Committee
The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Estates Committee meeting of 12 February 2013 as presented.

BD/12-13/225 Finance Committee
The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting of 20 February 2013 as presented, noting in particular:

FN/12-13/50 Trinity Research Institutes Policy
The Board noted and approved the Trinity Research Institutes Policy as presented.

SECTION C

Including any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
BD/12-13/226  Board Callover
The Board noted the Callover, as circulated.

BD/12-13/227  Higher Degrees
The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 13 March 2013, as circulated.

BD/12-13/228  Students’ Union - Elections 2013
The Board noted that the following had been elected:
  President:        Mr Tom Lenihan*
  Welfare Officer:         Mr Stephen Garry*
  Education Officer:       Mr Jack Leahy*
  Communications Officer:     Ms Leanna Byrne
  Entertainments Officer:    Mr Sean Reynolds

*to serve on Board in 2013-2014

BD/12-13/229  Representation - Douglas Hyde Gallery Board
The Board noted and approved the nomination of Professor L E Doyle as a representative of the College on the Board of the Douglas Hyde Gallery with effect from 27 March 2013 four years, in place of Ms D O’Donovan.

BD/12-13/230  Prizes and Other Awards - Calendar Entries - School of Social Sciences and Philosophy
The Board noted and approved memoranda from the School Administrator, circulated, dated 20 February 2013:
  (i)  Dermot McAleese Teaching Award;
  (ii) Patrick Keatinge Undergraduate Prize.

BD/12-13/231  Central Applications Office - Changes to the operations of the CAO
The Board noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 21 February 2013.

BD/12-13/232  Related Entity Financial Reporting
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Treasurer, circulated, dated 20 February 2013, together with the following reports:
  (i)  The Haughton Institute - audited Financial statements for the year ended 31 December 2011;
  (ii)  IRIS Electronic Information Services Limited - report and Financial Statements for the year ended 31 December 2011.

BD/12-13/233  Committee on Student Conduct and Capacity
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 19 March 2013, together with a revised version, tabled.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
SECTION D
In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed: .................................

Date: .................................