Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 30 January 2013

Present

Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor G J Lacey), Professor S D C Barrett, Professor M Bouroche, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Professor E Drew, Mr R Dunne, Mr D Ferrick, Mr D Frost, Mr J Gallagher, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Mr M J McAndrew, Professor J F McGilp, Ms N Murray, Ms A S Ní Chonaire, Professor C O’Farrelly, Professor D O’Neill, Professor M Ó Siochrú.

Apologies

Dr O Braiden, Ms J Byrne, Professor N Marples, Professor H J Rice.

In attendance

Ms S Mac Bride.

(ex officio)

Secretary to the College, Treasurer.

(by invitation)

Chief Operating Officer, Vice-President for Global Relations.

The Chair of Trinity Foundation (for BD/12-13/149)
The Director of Trinity Foundation (for BD/12-13/149)
Dean of Students (for BD/12-13/151)
Professor E O’Dell (for BD/12-13/153)

BD/12-13/140 Declaration of Interest

(i) The Treasurer declared that he had a potential conflict of interest in relation to Agenda item A.5 (iii). The Board agreed he would remain present for the item;

(ii) Mr Frost and Ms Murray declared that they were both staff members in IS Services and could have a potential conflict of Interest in relation to Agenda Item A.5(ii). The Board agreed that they would remain present for the item;

(iii) The Secretary declared that he had a potential conflict of interest in Agenda item C.3. The Board agreed he would remain present for the item;

(iv) The Chief Operating Officer declared that she had a potential conflict of interest in Agenda item A.8. The Board agreed that she would abstain herself from the meeting for the item.

BD/12-13/141 Minutes

(i) The minutes of the meeting held on 5 December 2012 were approved and signed subject to the following amendments:

BD/12-13/103(ii) Global Relations Strategy
The reference to “Vice-Provost for Global Relations” was amended to read “Vice-President for Global Relations”;

**BD/12-13/108 Commercialisation**
The reference to “the Douglas Hyde Museum” in the third last paragraph of the minute was amended to read “the Douglas Hyde Gallery”;

**BD/12-13/118 Library and Information Policy Committee**
Under the heading LIPC/12-13/07 Review of Legal Deposit the following text was inserted “The Board agreed that the Project Sponsor for the Review of Legal Deposits would be invited to update Board in due course.”

(ii) The minutes of the meeting held on 23 January 2013 had not been circulated and were deferred until the next Board meeting.

**BD/12-13/142 Circulation of Board Agenda and Documentation**
In response to a query, the Secretary advised that it was generally planned to circulate the Board agenda and documentation one week in advance. However on occasions the circulation was delayed somewhat due to late receipt of documentation and in order to avoid the need for separate multiple circulations. Every effort is made to avoid late circulation of papers by limiting such supplementary circulations to urgent exceptional items.

**BD/12-13/143 Matters Arising from the Minutes**
Several matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/12-13/144, 145, 146, 147 below).

**BD/12-13/144 Audit Committee – Annual Report for 2012 (see minute BD/12-13/104 of 5 December 2012)**
In response to a query the Treasurer advised Board that Executive Officers will present a formal response to Board on the recommendations contained in the Audit Committee Annual Report in the new future, probably at the meeting on 27 March 2013.

**BD/12-13/145 Trust Funds and Trinity Foundation – C&AG Request (see minute BD/12-13/104(iii) of 5 December 2012)**
The Board noted that the newly appointed Interim Director of Communications and Marketing is liaising with College Officers in order to develop a communications strategy surrounding the Trust Funds.

**BD/12-13/146 University Council (see minute BD/12-13/111 of 5 December 2012)**
The Board agreed to seek clarification in relation a specific Academic Title referred to in the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 21 November 2012 noting the need to ensure proper governance over such issues.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*
**BD/12-13/147 Mid-term Review of the Strategic Plan (see minute BD/12-13/107 of 5 December 2012)**

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board’s attention to the final published version of the Mid-term Review of the Strategic Plan, which had been tabled. The Provost congratulated the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and her staff for their work on the Review, noting that this will provide the basis for the College’s next Strategic Plan 2014-2019.

**BD/12-13/148 Provost’s Report**

The Board noted an update from the Provost on the following items:

(i) **Mid-term Review of the Strategic Plan**

The Board noted the challenges currently facing the College as outlined in the foreword of the Mid-term Review of the Strategic Plan;

(ii) **Research Funding**

The Board noted the recent success of a number of the College’s Academic Community in winning research awards and funding from RIA, SFI, ERC and other sources;

(iii) **European Universities Association Governing Board**

The Board noted that the Provost had been nominated for a forthcoming election to a position on the Governing Board of the European Universities Association;

(iv) **Correspondence from the Minister for Education & Skills**

The Board agreed that any correspondence from the Minister for Education & Skills addressed to the Board of the College would be circulated to all Board members.

**BD/12-13/149 Trinity Foundation Report – November 2012**

Mr Healy, Chair of Trinity Foundation, present by invitation, invited Board’s attention to a memorandum, dated 9 November 2012, which had been circulated. Mr Healy advised Board that he was pleased that the Foundation had an opportunity to report to Board twice a year due to need for both entities to be closely aligned in their objectives. He advised Board that he had taken over the role of Chair of the Foundation in June 2012 noting his belief in investment in third level education as a mechanism for Ireland to solve its current financial crisis. The Board noted the importance of relationship building between the College and the donors in the work of the Foundation and that the College needs to invest time in these relationships in order to see a return. Mr Healy praised the dedication and work of the Foundation Board members and advised Board he believed that the Foundation fund raising levels are at a higher level than other institutions in Ireland, noting however that no formal statistics exist to support this and that there is a need for formal benchmarking in the sector.

Mr Sparrow, Director of Trinity Foundation, present by invitation, advised Board that the College had a long history of benefitting from philanthropy and that this is based on the relationship between Academics, Schools and the donors and it is the College’s responsibility to nurture these relationships into the future. He advised Board of the level of fund raising for the current year, the target set for the coming year and the associated costs noting that the average cost of fund raising in the UK is 22%
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

In the course of a discussion the following issues were raised by Board members:
(i) there should be a clear link between College governance and the Foundation’s objectives;
(ii) the College should ensure that all sources of funding are ethically sound and adopt an appropriate ethics policy;
(iii) there should be clear channels of communication between the Foundation and Schools and Faculties and within Schools and Faculties;
(iv) the Foundation should focus on building relationships with current students who will eventually become alumni;
(v) fundraising targets should be realistic and not unachievable;
(vi) conferences on campus offer an opportunity to target returning alumni;
(vii) there is a need to ensure that communication with alumni is targeted appropriately;
(viii) the Foundation should closely link with the College’s Global Relation Strategy;
(ix) it would be useful to benchmark the Foundation’s activities against those in other Colleges in the UK and US.

In response to the issues raised Mr Healy advised Board that the Foundation requires the College to make continued investment in resources to support the work of the Foundation and to signal to the College Community the importance of this work. Mr Sparrow advised Board that ethical issues are discussed with relevant Academics in cases of individual donations and that the Foundation is currently guided by the College’s Ethics Policy. The Board noted that the Trustees of the Foundation are currently in the process of considering a Code of Governance & Ethics for non-profit organisations with a view to adopting it in September 2013. The Board further noted that the College Secretary will liaise with the Trustees and request that the Foundation present their proposed ethics principles on sources of funding to the Board in due course.

Mr Sparrow advised Board that the Foundation liaises with the Academic community through Heads of Schools and that relationship building with the current student body is matter of priority for 2013. The Board noted that the return in terms of philanthropy from investment in alumni relations is usually 15-20 years and that in order to engage with alumni, the most successful way is to engage other alumni to champion the cause at the event. Mr Sparrow advised that the current targets for fundraising are challenging but achievable and the Foundation are linking with Global Relations in order to capitalize on this opportunity and expand the College’s global profile and sources of philanthropy. Mr Healy advised Board that the Foundation is taking part in a UK survey and is hopeful of persuading more participants from Ireland in order to provide some benchmarking in the sector.

The Provost thanked Mr Healy and Mr Sparrow.

BD/12-13/150 Quality
The Provost invited Board’s attention to the reports on the quality reviews and implementation plans of the following areas carried out in accordance with the quality assurance procedures for administrative areas:
(i) **Review of Director of Buildings Office**

The Chief Operating Officer invited Board’s attention to the Provost’s report to Board for the Building’s Office, dated November 2012 which had been circulated. She advised Board of the Provost’s recommendations to Board for the area following the review and to the Reviewers’ recommendations on areas such as strategic planning, procurement strategy and space management. It was noted that the name of office does not represent the activities undertaken by the Office and all of its operations and processes and that it should be re-named. The Board also noted the Reviewer’s recommendation to restructure the Office along functional lines to provide greater clarity. The Chief Operating Officer advised the Board of the Reviewers’ recommendation to manage outsourcing carefully, to further invest in training in the Office and the need for a College-wide project management policy.

During the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

(a) the needs of stakeholders should be considered in all decisions relating to space allocation;
(b) the College needs a structure which can take advantage of property opportunities when they arise;
(c) some perhaps virtual method of payment for space used by Schools/Units should be introduced;
(d) a help desk system similar to IS Services should be introduced;
(e) there should be greater oversight on space and building allocation.

In response to the issues raised the Chief Operating Officer advised Board that decisions regarding space allocation are not taken by one person and that the views of all parties concerned are taken into account. The Bursar advised Board that decisions would be taken by the Space Allocation Committee which is a sub-committee of Executive Officers noting that he is in consultation with the Chair of the Estates Committee regarding future governance of the committee. The Chief Operating Officer advised Board that she intends to explore the installation of a Helpdesk and charging function for the Director of Building’s Office.

The Board approved the recommendations of the Provost as presented.

(ii) **IS Services Implementation Plan.**

The Chief Operating Officer invited Board’s attention to the Implementation Plan for IS Services, which had been circulated. She advised Board that progress is being made on the College’s IT Strategy and it is hoped that proposals will be presented to Board in the near future. The Board noted the plans to address the recommendations, in particular that IT project management will be governed by the overall College’s Project Management policy, once introduced. The Chief Operating Officer advised that while some IT functions will be centralized others will remain within Schools where it was more effective to do so. The Board noting that the issue of outsourcing technical support services is being considered and there has been evidence of other Universities doing this successfully. The Board noted the plans to

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
address the Reviewers’ recommendation for investment in skills and professional development in the area and the need to prioritise the introduction of wireless internet across the campus. The Board also noted that the proposed implementation plan will see the introduction of a Chief Information Officer in accordance with the START process.

In response to a number of queries raised the Chief Operating Officer clarified the following issues:
(a) there is no intention to centralize all specialized research IT functions;
(b) there is no intention to charge students for the IS Services drop in centre;
(c) there is a need to balance protecting the reputational risk of the College through increased IT security and open-source;
(d) the Senior Lecturer and the Dean of Graduate Studies have established a taskforce to review the e-learning environment which would involve undergraduate and post-graduate students.

The Board approved the IS Services Implementation Plan as presented noting that the governance role of the Library and Information Policy Committee will be advanced through the START process.

(iii) Treasurer’s Office Implementation Plan
The Chief Operating Officer invited Board’s attention to the Implementation Plan for the Treasurer’s Office, which had been circulated. She advised Board of the plans to address the eight recommendations put forward following the review of the area which will address the organisational structure of Treasurer’s Office, introduce agreed bi-annual goals, introduce KPI’s, balance compliance requirements, support budget holders and support the implementation of FIS in Schools focusing on communication and change management. The Board noted that the main aim of the implementation plan is to allow the Treasurer more time to focus on financial planning, analysis and risk management in his role as Chief Financial Officer of the College.

The Board approved the Implementation Plan as presented.

BD/12-13/151 Orientation Review
The Dean of Students, present by invitation, invited Board’s attention, by way of presentation, to a memorandum dated 22 January 2013, which had been circulated. She advised Board that in accordance with the College’s Strategic Plan and recommendations in the Hunt Report the College intends to establish more structured methods of easing the transition of new students both undergraduate and postgraduate into the College Community.

The Board noted that due to a change in student profile a very high level of orientation is essential to the retention of students. At present there is no single oversight of the current orientation process and at present students are provided with varying levels of information from multiple sources sometimes leading to duplication and information overload. Noting that the objective of the orientation review is to provide a strategy and implementation plan to provide an appropriate and appropriately delivered student-centred orientation process for new College entrants, the Dean of Students advised that a wide level of consultation had taken place before

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings.

the Higher Education Authority January 2013’. In relation to the HEA document the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer referred the Board to the list of institutions contained therein noting that the College will be seeking clarity on this list particularly in relation to the reference to the Dublin University Dental Hospital which currently is linked to the College’s Dental School as set out in the College’s Landscape submission.

During the course of a discussion some Board members expressed concern regarding part of the content of the HEA document and whether the pursuit of a cluster-based approach to collaboration among institutions on a regional basis was in the best interest of the College and its objectives and reputation. In response to a query, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that a taskforce had been established to develop proposals for the implementation of a single institute of teacher education which is intended to be a dispersed institute in the first instance. The Board noted that the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer was also liaising with the Faculty Dean and with the Head of the School of Education to establish what leadership role the College can play in this new institute.

In response to a query, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the Minister for Education & Skills has indicated that there will be a high threshold will be met in establishing the proposed Technological University of Dublin, noting that the College is opposed to the proposed name as it may infringe on the College’s intellectual property rights and branding.

The Board agreed that following the meeting with the HEA on the 14 February 2013 a further discussion on the matter would take place and that the interim Director of Communications and Marketing would be involved in any necessary communications strategy.

The Chief Operating Officer withdrew from the meeting

BD/12-13/153 Master in Arts (jure officii) (Actum CL/12-13/082 of 16 January 2013 refers)

The Registrar invited Board’s attention to a memorandum, dated 4 January 2013, which had been circulated. She advised Board that the degree of Master in Arts jure officii (MA jo) is the means by which members of College can become members of the University, and in particular can become members of Senate, which is the highest decision-making body in the University. The Board noted that on foot of a query in relation to the eligibility of part-time staff, the Statutes Schedules Working Party considered the current rules relating to the award of the degree of the MA jo and it became apparent that a revised Calendar entry was required to address inconsistencies which had come to light.

Professor O’Dell, member of the Statutes Schedules Working Party, present by invitation, advised Board of the proposed amendments to the current Calendar entry Part 1 Pg E4 Section 9, Section 10 and Section 11 which will have the following effect:

(i) each relevant category of staff has its own, appropriately drawn, provision; and the new academic titles have been used throughout;

(ii) the revised section 9 deals only with permanent full-time members of the staff of the College and University;

(iii) section 9, subsection (a), includes the Chief Operating Officer;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings
(iv) section 9, sub-section (d), includes the 2004 decision relating to Chief Technical Officers, Chief Medical Scientists, and Senior Experimental Officers;
(v) section 9, sub-section (e), reduces the qualifying period of long service by non-academic, non-administrative staff from forty years to thirty five;
(vi) section 10 adopts the eligibility of permanent part-time members of the academic staff to be members of the electorate for the election of the Provost for the purposes of eligibility for the MAjo; and
(vii) section 11 re-states the rules for permanent full-time members of the academic staff in related or associated institutions.

The Board, noting the views of Board members to consider the eligibility of other categories of academic staff in the future, approved the proposals as presented.

The Provost thanked the Registrar and Professor O’Dell.

*The Chief Operating Officer rejoined the meeting*

**BD/12-13/154 Procedure for Retention of Academic Staff**
The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board’s attention to a memorandum from the Senior Academic Promotions Committee, dated 21 January 2013, which had been circulated. She advised Board of the proposal to amend the College’s Retention Procedures to allow consideration of the case for promotion of European Research Council (ERC) awardees outside the annual process. The Board noted the merit in this proposal given that it is common that awardees are approached by other institutions due to the mobility of ERC grants.

During the course of a discussion Board members expressed the importance of ensuring equal recognition for teaching and research as well as the need to ensure that the proposal does not negatively affect the morale of those whom it will not apply to. Recognising the importance of retaining high achieving Academics and research funding in the current economic climate the Board approved the proposal as presented.

**BD/12-13/155 Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees**
The Board approved the nomination of the Advisory Committee on Honorary Degrees, as presented by the Registrar.

**BD/12-13/156 University Council**
The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 16 January 2013 subject to further comments covering CL/12-3/082, 095 and in particular:

**CL/12-13/079 New Admission Procedure to Joint Honors Programmes**
The Board noted Professor Barrett’s support for the Senior Lecturer’s proposals for a new admission procedure to Joint Honors Programmes.

**CL/12-13/080 Admission to Medicine - Changes to HPAT**
The Board noted the recommendations approved by Council to ameliorate the effect of repeating the HPAT test.

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*
BD/12-13/157  **Student Universal Support Ireland (SUSI)**  
Under Any Other Urgent Business, in response to a query the Treasurer advised Board that students will not be financially penalised due to the on-going backlog in the Government SUSI grant system.

BD/12-13/158  **Secretary’s Office Implementation Plan**  
Under Any Other Urgent Business, in response to a query the Secretary advised Board that the Secretary’s Office Implementation Plan, as approved by Board, will be implemented in the very near future.

**SECTION B**

BD/12-13/159  **Finance Committee**  
The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting of 19 December 2012 as presented, noting in particular:

**FN/12 - 13/34 Postgraduate Fees and Undergraduate Non-EU Fees 2013/2014**  
The Board noted that EU and non-EU Postgraduate Fees and other non-EU Fees for the academic year 2013/14 would remain at 2012/13 levels. The Treasurer advised Board that the decision in relation to setting fees annually would in future be taken early in Michaelmas Term. The Treasurer agreed that he would liaise with the Students’ Unions in relation to the proposed timelines.

BD/12-13/160  **Library and Information Policy Committee**  
The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Library and Information Policy Committee meeting of 14 January 2013 as presented.

BD/12-13/161  **Student Services Committee**  
The Board noted and where a decision was required approved proposals in the minutes of the Student Services Committee meeting of 10 December 2012 as presented.

**SECTION C**

BD/12-13/162  **Pro-Chancellors of the University (see BD/12-13/030 of 12 September 2012)**  
The Board noted that the following had been elected by the Senate as Pro-Chancellors of the University of Dublin:

(i) Susan Jocelyn Bell Burnell, DBE, BSc (Glas), PhD (Cantab), ScD (Dubl) (hc), FRS, FRAS;
(ii) Edward Joseph McParland, MA (Dubl, Cantab), MSc (NUI), PhD (Cantab), FRIAi (Hon), MRIA, FTCD (1984).

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*
BD/12-13/163  Board Callover
The Board noted the Callover, as circulated.

BD/12-13/164  Business Meeting of the Senate - Degree of M.A. (*jure officii*)
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 23 January 2013.

BD/12-13/165  Higher Degrees
The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 16 January 2013, as circulated.

BD/12-13/166  Sealings
The Board noted Sealings, as circulated (see Appendix 1 to this Minute).

BD/12-13/167  Bequests and Benefactions - Establishment of Prizes - School of Social Sciences and Philosophy
The Board noted and approved memoranda from the School Administrator and approved related Calendar entries, as circulated:

(i) Prize in Philosophy - Marion Kornreich Memorial Prize on the Senses
(ii) Prizes in Sociology
   (a) John Jackson Memorial Prize;
   (b) Sociology Dissertation Prize;
   (c) Sociology Trinity Alumni Prize.

BD/12-13/168  Prizes and Other Awards
(i) School of Medicine - Studentships 2012-2013
   The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Programme Manager, School of Medicine, circulated, dated 3 January 2013;
(ii) Additional Gold Medal
   The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 21 January 2013;
(iii) Lucy Gwynn Prize - Committee
   The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies, circulated, dated 21 January 2013.

BD/12-13/169  Reporting from External Bodies
The Board noted a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 11 January 2013.

BD/12-13/170  Annual Report 2011-2012 - Treasurer’s Office
The Board noted the Annual Report of the Treasurer’s Office at the link below:

*Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings*
BD/12-13/171 Principal Committees - Human Resources Committee - External Member (BD/12-13/017 of 12 September 2012 refers)

The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 22 January 2013 and approved the nomination of Mr P Donohoe, Human Resources and Operations Directors, BWG Foods.

BD/12-13/172 Science Gallery International - Global Network Membership Agreement

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 30 January 2013.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed: ..........................................

Date: .............................................
Appendix 1 to Minute BD/12-13/166

Sealings

7 November 2012

Aviva Insurance Europe SE
Counter-Indemnity

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Counter-Indemnity Bond between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of the Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Aviva Insurance Europe SE in respect of customs and excise bond for temporary importation for 24 months of a PI F-206.S Hexapod Precision Alignment System for use in CRANN.

3 December 2012

Carroll Foods Limited
Licence Agreement – Café Service in the School of Nursing and Midwifery, D’Olier Street

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Licence Agreement between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of the Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Carroll Foods for the provision of a café service in the School of Nursing and Midwifery, D’Olier Street from 3 September 2012 for a period of three years.

3 December 2012

Magnetic Solutions Limited
Share/Stock Transfer Form

The Seal of the College was put to a Share/Stock Transfer Form to transfer twenty-six thousand, four hundred (26,400) Ordinary Shares in Magnetic Solutions Limited to Tokyo Electron Limited through its subsidiary Tokyo Electron Europe Limited from the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of the Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin.

Magnetic Solutions Limited
Indemnity & Undertaking for Lost Share Certificate

The Seal of the College was put to a Form of Indemnity & Undertaking for Lost Share Certificate in respect of 26,400 Ordinary Shares of €0.01269738 each (the ‘Shares’) in Magnetic Solutions Limited by the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of the Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin.

20 December 2012

Unit 2.8, Trinity Technology and Enterprise Centre
Dechtire Design Limited

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate for a Lease between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of the Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Dechtire Design Limited of Unit 2.8 of the Trinity Technology and Enterprise Centre, The Tower, Pearse Street, Dublin 2.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings