

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 1 February 2012

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Senior Lecturer (Professor P Geoghegan), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Bursar (Professor D Lloyd), Mr R Bartlett, Professor S D C Barrett, Ms R Barry, Dr M Bouroche, Dr O Braiden, Professor M A Coffey, Mr F Cowzer, Professor W J Dowling, Mr J Gallagher, Professor H Gibbons, Professor R Gilligan, Professor J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Professor N Marples, Ms L Miller, Ms N Murray, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor E J O'Halpin, Professor D O'Neill, Professor H J Rice, Professor D M Singleton.
<i>Apologies</i>	Ms M O'Connor.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College, Treasurer.
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer, Vice-Provost for Global Relations. Director of the Science Gallery (Dr M J Gorman) (for item BD/11-12/138) Chair of the Board of the Science Gallery (Dr C Horn) (for items BD/11-12/138) Academic Secretary (for item BD/11-12/139 (iv)) Director of Buildings (Mr P Mangan) (for item BD/11-12/140) Chair of Population Health Medicine (Professor J Barry) (for item BD/11-12/140) Dr E O'Dell (for item BD/11-12/146)

SECTION A

BD/11-12/133 Minutes

- (i) The minutes of the meeting held on 7 December 2011 were approved and signed subject to the following amendment:

Minute BD/11-12/100 START Update

At the top of page 5 point (c) was amended to read "the process auditing of areas in the Administrative, Technical and Support areas which will be necessary to progress their integration with Academic and Research areas will not be done in a manner which will compromise the progress of the GeneSIS and FIS projects".

- (ii) Consideration of the minutes of the meeting held on 25 January 2012 was deferred until the next meeting of Board.

BD/11-12/134 Matters Arising

A number matter arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/11-12/135 and 136 below).

BD/11-12/135 Communications Strategy (see minute BD/11-12/101 of 7 December 2011)

The Provost advised Board that the financial aspects of the Communications Strategy had now been approved by the Finance Committee.

BD/11-12/136 Academic Contracts (see minute BD/11-12/119 Of 7 December 2011)

In response to a query, the Board noted that negotiations were on-going with the Department of Education and Skills in relation to the Student Tutor Scheme.

BD/11-12/137 Provost's Report

The Vice-Provost for Global Relations advised Board that the College had been invited to nominate three students to be Olympic torch bearers and to participate in the celebrations when the torch is carried through Dublin on 6 June 2012. The Board noted that the three students had been selected in consultation with the Dean of Students, the President of the Students' Union, the President of the Graduate Students' Union and the President of DUCAC.

BD/11-12/138 Science Gallery International

The Chair, Dr Horn, and the Director, Dr Gorman, of the Science Gallery, present by invitation, attended for this item. Dr Gorman invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 24 January 2012, which had been circulated together with the following documentation:

- (i) Memorandum and Articles of Association of Science Gallery International;
- (ii) Agreement between the College and Science Gallery International;
- (iii) Intellectual Property Licence between the College and Science Gallery International;
- (iv) Risk analysis and completed checklist for the establishment of separate legal entities;
- (v) Heads of Terms of Network Membership Agreement.

He advised Board that since its opening four years ago the Science Gallery had been very successful in terms of public engagement and that visitor numbers had far exceeded those which were first predicted. The Board noted that the Science Gallery had also gained significant international media attention and had been approached by a number of international Universities who wish to replicate the science gallery model in their own cities.

The Board noted that following such expressions of interest, the Science Galley Governance Board had developed proposals to establish a company "Science Gallery International" (SGI), which would act as a global science gallery network to facilitate the establishment of University or Research Centre based science galleries and to co-

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

ordinate the touring of science gallery exhibitions among the members of the network. Dr Gorman advised Board of the philanthropic donation of €1 million received in December 2011 to fund the establishment of SGI, noting that it is hoped that eight such science galleries will be established around the world over the next few years. The Board noted the advantages to the College's Science Gallery in terms of financial sustainability and the potential for an increased international profile for the College in line with the College's Global Relations Strategy. The opportunities for SGI as an international network to attract funding from large multinational companies were also noted.

In the course of a discussion, the following issues were raised by Board members:

- (i) the proposals should be in line with the College's Global Relations Strategy;
- (ii) it is important that the establishment of SGI does not negatively impact on the College's Science Gallery in terms of quality of the exhibitions;
- (iii) the College's branding should be sufficiently visible in the branding policy of SGI;
- (iv) the College should move quickly to maximise its competitive advantage in this unique area;
- (v) the College should take steps to provide maximum legal protection for the Science Gallery brand.

In response to the issues raised, Dr Gorman advised Board that discussions are underway with the Vice-Provost for Global Relations in order to ensure a co-ordinated approach between this initiative and the College's proposals to attract international students to the College. The Board noted that the College will benefit from increased visibility in targeted areas and will be recognised as the founding member of SGI in the company's branding and in the media. Dr Horn advised Board that the success of SGI will be dependent on maintaining a high level of quality in terms of exhibitions noting that monitoring of quality levels will be a priority for SGI. The Board noted that the College has taken appropriate steps to ensure legal protection of the Science Gallery brand both domestically and internationally.

The Board approved the Collaboration Agreement, the Intellectual Property Licence and Memorandum and Articles of Association for the incorporation of Science Gallery International, a company limited by guarantee without share capital.

The Board also approved the draft Terms of the Network Membership Agreement.

BD/11-12/139 eStrategy Update

The Chief Operating Officer invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 24 January 2012, which had been circulated. She advised Board of the updated position of the following four projects within eStrategy:

- (i) **Financial Information System (FIS)**
The Board noted that the FIS project is currently at the planning stage and that the College has entered into competitive dialogue with a number of companies with a view to compiling a short list of suppliers in the near future.
- (ii) **Human Resources**
The Chief Operating Officer advised Board that the resources had now been fixed to deliver the individual projects within the HR work-stream.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

(iii) **Enterprise Architecture**

The Board noted that implementation of the project will require a combination of IS Services resources and external experts due to the complexities involved in combining over 60 individual IT systems. The Chief Operating Officer advised Board of the associated risks with project integration such as this and confirmed that implementation would not take place until the risks had been properly reviewed.

(iv) **GeneSIS**

The Academic Secretary, present by invitation, referring to the Audit Committee's report to Board (minute BD/11-12/095 of 7 December 2011 refers) welcomed the Committee's findings noting that its recommendations had given an impetus to address the issues raised. She advised Board of the recent difficulties in maintaining ownership of the project and stated that the issue had been escalated through the appropriate channels resulting in the vendor appointing a new project manager. The Board noted that progress has been made on the implementation plan and that the completed plan had been delivered at the end of stage one.

The Academic Secretary advised Board that all information on academic courses had been compiled and that Stage Two is entering into the test phase which will be carried out in a stable test environment in order to limit the impact on the College system. The Board noted that Stage Three will see the online admissions system go-live and that this represents the highest risk to the admissions processes across the College. The Board also noted that harmonisation of Academic Regulations must be completed before Stage Four can begin and that work had commenced in this regard.

The Academic Secretary advised Board of the project achievements to date and noted the need for a dedicated building to provide a one-stop-shop for all student services. The Board noted the details of the project budget, the timeline for payment of the vendor and the monitoring processes in place to ensure adherence to the project timeline.

In response to the issues which had been raised by the Audit Committee at the last Board meeting (minute BD/11-12/095 refers), the Chief Operating Officer advised Board that while progress had been made in relation to the project plan and project ownership, quality assurance issues had yet to be fully addressed. The Board noted that a strong project governance structure was in place to ensure that the project is closely linked to the College and that the input of academic areas is a key aspect of the project.

In response to queries raised by Board members, the Chief Operating Officer and Academic Secretary clarified a number of issues including that:

- (i) It is expected that Stage Two of the GeneSIS project will be ready to go-live by the end of February;
- (ii) financial data containing actual and projected expenditure will be included in future reports;
- (iii) both the GeneSIS and FIS projects are essential to the success of the START project and neither initiative will negatively impact on the other;

- (iv) when further information is available on the project-related change management processes, the College will engage with the necessary Trade Union groups.

The Board noted the memorandum from the Chief Operating Officer as presented and the report from the Academic Secretary and the confirmation that the Audit Committee report had been accepted by the Project Sponsor and the Project Board.

The Provost thanked the Chief Operating Officer and the Academic Secretary.

BD/11-12/140 Institute of Population Health

Professor Barry and the Director of Buildings, present by invitation, attended for this item. The Director of Buildings invited Board's attention to a presentation outlining the proposals to purchase the upper three floors of a property in Tallaght to accommodate the Trinity College Institute of Population Health. He advised Board that the proposals had been approved by Executive Officers, the Estates Committee and the Finance Committee.

The Board noted the physical description of the property, its favourable location in terms of proximity to the hospital entrance and public transport links and the opportunity to place College branding on the outside of the building. The Director of Buildings advised Board that the approximate cost of fitting-out the building to meet the College's requirements is €2.5 million which is in line with the cost of other projects of a similar nature. He also advised that the purchase price of the building had been the subject of a long negotiation process and the College has benefited from the overall fall in market price of properties, noting that the asking price is now less than that advised to the Finance Committee.

Professor Barry advised Board that the Institute of Population Health would engage in health and clinical research as well as teaching. Noting the recent prominence of population health issues in the new government Strategy for Health, he further advised Board and that, as the area spans many disciplines and is linked with clinical practice, the Institute will be able to take advantage of the fact that the lower floors of the building are expected to be occupied by the HSE for primary care purposes, including the GP practice linked to the College's Department of Public Health and Primary Care. The Board noted that a Steering Group will be established along with Scientific Advisory Groups depending on the areas of research as well a Community Consultative Forum. The Board also noted that it is intended that the Institute will engage in qualitative and quantitative research in collaboration with other Disciplines and Schools within the College as well as other with universities.

In response to a query, the Treasurer advised Board that the Institute remains within the remit of the School of Medicine and does not have Trinity Research Institute status. The Board noted that the capital expenditure would be supported by an up-front contribution of €1.5 million from the School of Medicine and resources available to the School from future additional non-EU student intake to meet this financial commitment over the next five years.

The Board noted the concern expressed by Professor O'Neill surrounding the School's decision to divert future non-EU student fees generated by additional international students towards the cost of the building rather than using it to fund additional

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

teaching staff. In response to Professor O'Neill's comment that this decision had not been communicated to members of the School, Professor Barry advised Board that the principle of non-EU fees being used to fund the capital acquisition had been approved by the School Executive and that the capacity of the School to accept additional non-EU students had been confirmed. The Secretary agreed to refer Dr O'Neill's concerns about the decision-making process in relation to this initiative to the Head of School.

In response to queries raised by Board members, the Director of Buildings clarified a number of issues, including that:

- (i) the College will have access to all common access routes to the building;
- (ii) a shared services agreement will govern security, heat, light, waste disposal and all other utilities for the building and will also deal with the maintenance of the common areas such as the roof;
- (iii) there will be a list of excluded uses for the floors in the building not occupied by the Institute;
- (iv) the College has approached the HSE in relation to procuring possible funding for the Institute;
- (v) extensive negotiations have taken place in relation to the purchase price and the College has been advised that the price per square meter is in line with current market prices.

The Board approved the proposals to purchase the upper three floors of the property in Tallaght to house the Trinity College Institute of Population Health and the execution of the Heads of Agreement, subject to clarification of the financial arrangements by the Provost or at a future Board meeting if required.

BD/11-12/141 Singapore Institute of Technology (SIT)

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 27 January 2012, which had been circulated. She advised Board that further to the discussion which had taken place at the previous Board meeting (minute BD/11-12/103 of 7 December 2011 refers) all outstanding contractual matters had now been resolved. She further advised Board that the proposals for the delivery of a BSc in Occupational Therapy had been approved by Council (Actum CL/11-12/074 of 18 January 2012 refers) and that the proposed Collaboration Agreement provides for the contractual arrangements for Occupational Therapy and the Physiotherapy which were approved at the previous Board meeting. The Board noted that the College's obligation in relation to data protection would be provided for within the Collaboration Agreement and that provisions for an alternative dispute resolution process are provided for in a separate confidential Arbitration Agreement.

In response to a query, the Senior Lecturer advised Board that the College had satisfied itself that the proposed collaboration with SIT met with the College's ethical policy and that the civil and academic rights of students and staff were protected to the fullest extent possible under the terms of the Agreement.

Noting that the collaboration with SIT is in line with the College's Global Relations Strategy the Board approved the proposals for the BSc in Occupational Therapy. The Board also approved the Collaboration Agreement and the Arbitration Agreement as presented, subject to minor drafting amendments and a satisfactory review by Singapore Tax and Accounting Professionals.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Provost thanked the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the staff in the Treasurer's Office and Secretary's Office for their contribution to the negotiation of the Agreements.

BD/11-12/142 Promotion Procedures - Revision (see Actum CL/11-12/071 of 18 January 2012)

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, invited Board's attention to a memorandum, dated 23 January 2012, which had been circulated. She advised Board that during the academic year 2008/09 a working party, chaired by the then Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, was established to look at possible improvements to the Senior Promotions process, at the request of the Senior Promotions Committee (SPC). The Board noted that the working party concluded their work in Michaelmas term 2011 when the SPC approved its recommendations, including:

- (a) the revised membership of the SPC;
- (b) the passing of senior administrative promotions to another committee;
- (c) a new Clinical promotion process with the relevant Schools making recommendations to the SPC;
- (d) a process to allow the Faculty to review applications in the first instance;
- (e) the introduction of interviews for Professor and Associate Professor candidates;
- (f) the review of the promotion application form.

In response to a query about consultation with the Trade Union in developing the revised procedures, the Provost invited Board's attention to the membership of the working party which included two IFUT representatives. Noting comments from Board members in relation to the varying treatment of research and teaching activity within the current criteria, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the examination of promotion criteria and related weightings did not form part of the terms of reference of the review by the working party. The Board noted the importance of providing feedback to unsuccessful candidates and also noted that any appeal of a decision at Faculty level would be handled within the overall established appeals system.

In response to a query, the Vice-Provost advised that while it would only be possible to promote candidates within the parameters of the Employment Control Framework and maintain the required junior and senior grade ratio, there would be scope for promotions and that the final capacity would be determined in due course.

The Board approved the proposals as presented subject to clarification of the role of all relevant Schools in the procedure for Clinical promotions and agreed that should candidates be unsuccessful in one year they would be allowed to supplement their application in the following years rather than making a fresh application each time they apply. Noting that the Chair of the Faculty level review would ensure that the process would be implemented correctly in accordance with fair procedures, the Board also agreed that an Academic Staff Association representative would be included at the Faculty review stage at the grade equivalent to the candidates under consideration.

BD/11-12/143 Pro-Chancellorship

The Registrar advised Board that Dr Mary Henry had been nominated as Pro-Chancellor of the University to replace Sir Anthony O'Reilly whose term of office had expired.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/11-12/144 Visitors - Appeal and Matters referred

The Secretary advised the Board of the outcome of a recent appeal to the Visitors against a decision of the *ad hoc* Senior Promotions Appeals Committee, noting that the Visitors had made a number of recommendations in relation to the promotions process which have now been included in the revised procedures. The Secretary also advised that the Visitors had refused to hear two cases: one surrounding an industrial relations issue as the same case has also been brought before an external judicial forum and a second relating to an undergraduate academic appeal which the Visitors determined was unarguable and bound to fail.

BD/11-12/145 Panel of Enquiry

The Secretary advised Board of a recent student disciplinary case which had been appealed to the Panel of Enquiry. The Board accepted the Chair's refusal of jurisdiction to hear the student case due to the particular circumstances of the case not being provided for in the Statutes. The Board noted that the student may now appeal the case directly to the Visitors.

BD/11-12/146 Statutes Schedules - College Treasures (see Actum CL/11-12/078(i) of 18 January 2012)

Dr O'Dell, present by invitation, invited Board's attention to a memorandum from the Registrar, dated 16 January 2012, which had been circulated. He advised Board that as part of the Library's participation in the Museum Standards Programme for Ireland it is necessary to clarify the description of the College Treasures contained in the 2010 Consolidated Statutes. The Board noted that it is proposed to amend Section 9 of the Chapter on the College Community to allow the insertion of Schedule 4 which will provide the necessary description of the collections.

In response to a number of queries raised by Board members, Dr O'Dell advised Board that a general statement of the Treasures is all that is required and that the wording included in the list is not intended to be comprehensive. The Board also noted that listing the Treasures in this way does not restrict the College from using them to support teaching and research in the normal way. In response to a query, the Board noted that an inventory of the College Art Collection is available and is used for insurance purposes.

The Board approved the proposals as presented and agreed to seek the Assent of the Fellows and the Approval of the Visitors to the amendment of Section 9 of the Chapter of the Statutes relating to the College Community, and to adopt a new Schedule 4 to that Chapter.

BD/11-12/147 University Council

The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 18 January 2012 subject to further comments covering CL/11-12/071, 077, 078 (i) 091, 092, 093, noting in particular:

CL/11-12/077 Academic Appeals

The Board confirmed the decision of the University Council in respect of the minutes of the Academic Appeals Committee for Graduate Students (Research) of 1 December

2011 and 10 January 2012 and the minutes of the Academic Appeals Committee for Graduate Students (Taught) of 19 December 2011.

CL/11-12/092 Nominations of Appointment

In response to a query the Secretary advised Board that all appointments had been made in accordance with the Board approved policy.

SECTION B

BD/11-12/148 Equality Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Equality Committee from its meeting of 22 November 2011.

BD/11-12/149 Estates Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Estates Committee from its meeting of 17 January 2012.

BD/11-12/150 Finance Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 27 January 2012.

BD/11-12/151 Library and Information Policy Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Library and Information Policy Committee from its meeting of 16 January 2012.

BD/11-12/152 Student Services Committee

The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meeting of 10 November 2011.

SECTION C

BD/11-12/153 Senior Fellowship

The Board noted that the Senior Fellows had co-opted Professor W Coffey and Professor G Clayton to Senior Fellowship.

BD/11-12/154 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 18 January 2012, as circulated.

BD/11-12/155 Senate Business - Degree Titles (see minute BD/11-12/052 (iii) of 12 October 2011)
The Board noted that the Senate at its last meeting had changed the abbreviation of the degree of Bachelor in Acting from 'B.Hist' to 'B.Histr'.

CL/11-12/156 Institutional Review of Irish Universities - Institutional Self-Assessment Report
The Board noted a memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 24 January 2012, with report.

CL/11-12/157 Prizes and Other Awards

- (i) **Ekenhead Scholarship**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Tutor, circulated, dated 5 December 2011.
- (ii) **Lucy Gwynn Prize Committee**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 24 January 2012;
- (iii) **Additional Gold Medal Award 2011**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 24 January 2012;
- (iv) **Other Awards**
The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Senior Lecturer, circulated, dated 25 January 2012.

CL/11-12/158 Annual Reports and Financial Statements - Year ended 31 December 2011

The Board noted annual reports and financial statements from the following:

- (i) Haughton Institute;
- (ii) National Institute for Bioprocessing Research and Training Limited (NIBRT);
- (iii) HEAnet;
- (iv) IRIS Electronic Information Services Limited.

BD/11-12/159 Science Gallery International - Interim Board

The Board noted and approved the members of the interim Board:

Dr C Horn *chair*
Professor V Cahill
Mr F Naughton

BD/11-12/160 Trinity Ball 2013

The Board noted and approved the request of the Central Societies Committee for Trinity Ball in 2013 to take place on Friday 5 April 2013.

BD/11-12/161 Tutorship

The Board noted and approved the Senior Tutor's recommendations for the following appointments to tutorship:

Mr C Condon (half chamber)
Ms M Leahy (full chamber)

BD/11-12/162 Disciplinary Committee (Student) - 2011-2012

The Board noted a memorandum from the Registrar, circulated, dated 10 January 2012 and approved the membership of the Committee for 2011-2012.

BD/11-12/163 Headships of Schools

The Board noted and approved the following appointments:

- (i) **School of Business**
Professor J Quinn (Lecturer in Business Studies): Head of School from 3 January 2012 to 2 July 2015
- (ii) **School of Medicine**
Professor J Barry (Professor of Population Health Medicine (2009)): Interim Deputy Head of School from 1 February to 12 July 2012.

The Board agreed that in future the Academic grade of the staff member who has been elected Head of School should also be reported to Board.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date: